

ISSN 2353-2912

1(3)2015

Ateneum-Szkoła Wyższa w Gdańsku

Forum Filologiczne

ATENEUM

Ateneum Philological Forum

INTERACTIONS

INTERAKCJE



Gdańsk 2015

Komitet Wydawniczy:

prof. zw. dr hab. Edmund Kotarski (przewodniczący), prof. nadzw. dr hab. Zdzisław Aleksander,
prof. nadzw. dr Hanna Dubrzyńska, dr Małgorzata Godlewska,
prof. nadzw. dr hab. Marcin Krawczyński, prof. nadzw. dr hab. Henryk Olszewski,
prof. zw. dr hab. Waldemar Tłokiński, dr Bartosz Wiśniewski, dr Paweł Wojciechowski.

Komitet Naukowy Czasopisma *Forum Filologiczne Ateneum*:

Filologia angielska

Prof. Desmond Graham, The University of Newcastle, Newcastle upon Tyne (Wielka Brytania)
Prof. zw. dr hab. Roman Kalisz, Wyższa Szkoła Języków Obcych w Świeciu (Polska)
Prof. Henryk Kardela, Uniwersytet M. Curie-Skłodowskiej w Lublinie (Polska)
Prof. Tom Napieralski University of Colorado, Colorado Springs (Stany Zjednoczone)
Prof. Piotr Stalmaszczyk, Uniwersytet Łódzki (Polska)

Filologia włoska

Prof. Mercedes Arriaga Florez, Universidad de Seville (Hiszpania)
Prof. Dario Tomasello, Università degli Studi di Messina (Włochy)
Prof. Maria Rosaria Vitti-Alexander, College Nazareth-Rochester (Stany Zjednoczone)

Filologia hiszpańska

Prof. Antonio Pamies Bertrán (Universidad de Granada) (Hiszpania)
Prof. Luis Luque Toro (Università Ca' Foscari, Venezia) (Włochy)
Dr Lucía Luque Nadal (Universidad de Córdoba) (Hiszpania)

Recenzja tomu:

Prof. nadzw. dr hab. Adriana Biedroń, Akademia Pomorska (Polska)
Prof. Ignacio Perez Pascual, Universidade da Coruña (Hiszpania)
Prof. Maria Cleo Tato Garcia, Universidade da Coruña (Hiszpania)

Redaktorzy Naukowi: dr Małgorzata Godlewska i prof. nadzw. dr hab. Hadrian Lankiewicz

Redaktor języka angielskiego: Ross Aldridge

Redaktor języka hiszpańskiego: Fernando Torrens

Redaktor języka włoskiego: Linda Balistrelì

ISSN 2353-2912

© Copyright by „Ateneum-Szkoła Wyższa” w Gdańsku 2015
Pierwotna wersja czasopisma drukowana.

Adres Redakcji:

„Ateneum – Szkoła Wyższa” w Gdańsku, ul. 3 Maja 25A, 80-802 Gdańsk
e-mail: wydawnictwo@ateneum.edu.pl

Wydawnictwo

Ateneum – Szkoła Wyższa w Gdańsku

Przygotowanie do druku: Violetta Pastwa

Projekt okładki: Katarzyna Krawczyńska

Druk i oprawa: SOWA Sp. z o.o., 01-209 Warszawa, Hrubieszowska 6a
Nakład 100 egz.

Spis treści

Słowo wstępne	5
Monika RYMASZEWSKA, Monika CISŁO-ROBSON	The power of gesture: A brief look on nonverbal communication..... 7
Maria DEMBSKA, Grzegorz GRZEGORCZYK	Shaking hands with buildings – cognitive ecology and embodiment in the language of architectural reviews: A case study 21
Arkadiusz JANCZYŁO	Cultural identity, language and narrative 35
Angelika KITOWSKA, Hadrian LANKIEWICZ	Defining attitudes towards language learning: Autonomy and second language major..... 47
Natalia KŁODNICKA, Anna SZCZEPANIAK-KOZAK	Culture shock in the narrative approach: A portrait of two Britons living in Poland 65
Łukasz KĘPCZYŃSKI	Direct Method as an alternative to “coursebook teaching” in a contemporary language classroom..... 79
Aleksandra KRAWCZYK	Teachers’ professional competence: FL teacher education in Poland 91
Daniel SŁAPEK	Equivalenza in atto: Alcuni processi traduttivi al livello lessicale-sintattico..... 105
Daniel SŁAPEK, Carlos Pitel GARCIA	¿Por qué la lingüística cultural? 119
Ewa DATA-BUKOWSKA	Zapomniane mapowanie, tożsamość tłumacza i emocje w przekładzie 129
Katarzyna RYBIŃSKA	Il personaggio di Fiammetta nelle creazioni boccacciane..... 153
Maša GUŠTIN, Lilianna KALITA	Pod pręgierzem cenzury – „półkownicy” kina radzieckiego..... 171

Słowo wstępne

Przekazujemy Państwu kolejny tom naszego czasopisma o dość enigmatycznym tytule, który wybrany został nie bez kozery. Szeroko rozumiana ponowoczesność nie charakteryzuje się całkowitym brakiem prawdy, jakby to mogło na pozór się wydawać, ale jej uwikłaniem w relacje z innymi prawdami. Nowe paradygmaty myślenia porzucają więc poszukiwanie rzeczy ostatecznych, niezmiennych i zawsze prawdziwych, do czego dążyli idealiści, lecz nakazują podążanie za zmianą, dzięki której rzeczy ukazują się nam w nowym świetle. Heraklitowe *panta rhei* – zmiany jako centralnego elementu wszechświata – znalazło zwolenników w najnowszych teoriach psychologicznych, socjologicznych i humanistycznych, ale także, co zakrawa w pewnym sensie na ironię, w dziedzinach nauki tradycyjnie badających materię stałą jak fizyka czy nauki biologiczne. Słynne równanie Einsteina $E=mc^2$ dowodzi, że esencją świata jest energia, a ta, w przeciwieństwie do materii, jest zawsze w ruchu, nieuchwytna, względna, rządzona prawami fizyki kwantowej. Relatywność rozważań humanistycznych stała się więc cechą transwersalną wszelkich badań oferujących jedynie prawdy półostateczne.

Refleksja nad językiem, a zwłaszcza tzw. zwrot dyskursywny w naukach społecznych i humanistycznych, dodatkowo uwikłała wszelkie poszukiwania w nieokiełznany wymiar językowego obrazu świata. Nie zastanawiamy się już czy świat jako taki istnieje, ale raczej w jaki sposób jawi się naszej świadomości i jaki mamy do niego dostęp. Okazuje się, jak utrzymuje Baudrillard, że znak pierwotny nie reprezentuje już rzeczy takimi jakie są, lecz zastępuje samą rzeczywistość, tworząc *simulacra*. Żyjemy więc w sieci relacji znakowych symulujących rzeczywistość. Innymi słowy widzenie świata jest skażone sposobem w jaki o nim mówimy. Dzięki językowi, czy też dyskursowi, wchodzimy w interakcje, które odsuwają nas od podszewki świata i jedyną rzeczą, która nam pozostaje jest badanie właśnie tych interakcji.

Artykuły zawarte w tym tomie odwołują się, w sposób mniej lub bardziej świadomy, do tak rozumianych założeń szeroko rozumianych badań dyskursywnych zarówno w odniesieniu do teorii jak i metody (Jorgensen i Phillips, 2002). Przyjmując, że to właśnie dyskurs tworzy społeczne światy i znaczenia, nowy paradygmat odrzuca wszelki uniwersalizm, esencjalizm i strukturalność, uwypuklając językową działalność człowieka jako to, co konstytuuje wszelkie

reprezentacje świata i tożsamości człowieka w obrębie interakcji czysto znakowych, jak i wychodzących poza nie do konstruktów społecznych i biologicznych. Czytelnik znajdzie tu całe spektrum interakcji w jakie wchodzi człowiek w poszukiwaniu prawdy o świecie, od komunikacji niewerbalnej poprzez rozważania ekolingwistyczne w zakresie relacji języka i architektury, zagadnienia tożsamości kulturowej, do tłumaczeniowych badań interjęzykowych, glottodydaktyki naznaczonej duchem czasu oraz obrazowania literackiego czy filmowego jako interakcji społecznej. Wspólnym mianownikiem dla tych wszystkich rozważań jest konstrukcjonizm społeczny, w którym prawda pozostaje już zawsze rezultatem interakcji.

Edytorzy

Monika RYMASZEWSKA
Ateneum – Szkoła Wyższa w Gdańsku,
rymaszewska.monika@gmail.com

Monika CISŁO-ROBSON¹
the.robson.clan@gmail.com

The power of gesture: A brief look on nonverbal communication

Summary

Language has multitude of definitions and typologies. Initially considered a “God-given” tool, it was for long defined with reference to its verbal properties rather than its function to convey the total message, not necessarily that embraced by words. Yet, with the Saussurean distinction between language and communication, language found its position vis à vis communication thus divided into two dimensions – verbal and nonverbal. The distinction between what is verbal and nonverbal message is not, however, free from inconsistencies. While verbal communication consists in more than just spoken language, all spoken language does not automatically qualify as verbal. This chapter offers an overview of the approaches to nonverbal communication in the perspective of its verbal counterpart. I will provide a number of arguments to support the assumptions that nonverbal messages, and particularly gestures, are much more powerful and communicative than the verbal ones, which might be rooted in their prelinguistic image schematic nature.

Keywords: nonverbal communication, verbal communication, gesture, Nonverbal Communicative Intelligence, image schemas, education, speech

Verbal versus Nonverbal Communication

Burling (1993) uses an interesting allegory to indicate the difference between verbal and nonverbal communication by comparing them respectively to a digital and analogue system (Burling, 1993, p. 28). The reason for the analogies might be the amount of mental effort put in creating a message: while new verbal utterances can effortlessly be created, a new nonverbal symbol requires substantial intellectual involvement. In fact, within the most evident differences between verbal and nonverbal communication is the fact that nonverbal cues lack syntax.

¹ The paper is the result of a cooperation between the mentor and the student within the framework of a diploma seminar at Ateneum University in Gdańsk.

In other words, while speech is clearly structured, uses modifiers and discourse markers, nonverbal communication demands a lot more additional information to be accurately interpreted. Moreover, verbal communication is able to place events in time frames – past, present, future – and is capable of telling stories, making arrangements and describing things. It can thus be assumed that nonverbal communication is limited in its ability to relay depth and details. Yet, certain unverballed cues are not categorised as nonverbal by default (Burling, 1993). For instance, deaf signing might be categorised as nonverbal communication as it lacks audible qualities. Yet, Burling (1993, p. 30) argues that “deaf signs form a contrastive system as do the words of a spoken language” and he further states that as sign language is acquired through cognitive efforts similar to speech, it consequently represents verbal communication”. Also, certain properties of intonation and word stress may be assumed verbal. If a Chinese man angrily shouted at a person who does not speak Chinese, it would be the tone of his voice that translated his anger, not his words.

The above observation brings about a question whether nonverbal communication can be used in the absence of its verbal counterpart. Burling advocates that messages can be transmitted to different recipients when devoid of verbal speech. He describes a scene he observed when while waiting for a bus at the University of Michigan. A young woman was scanning the random faces of the people gathered at the bus stop as she was exiting the bus. A few moments later her gaze suddenly fixed on someone and a smile illuminated her face. He deduced that it was not a sibling nor a relative she had spotted, but rather her sweetheart. It was apparent that the young lady had communicated with both the young man she recognized, as well as the onlookers. Burling says that “to me, a bystander, it expressed something about the kind of individual addressed, even though I had not, at that moment, seen him. The smile of recognition, we can presume, was an expression of the young woman’s emotion...” (1993, p. 28). Evidently, much can be learnt from observing nonverbal communication exclusively.

Similarly, Meyerhof illustrates the use of verbal communication devoid of its nonverbal sibling when she invites the reader to imagine receiving a telephone call from a complete stranger and asks what the reader would be thinking about whilst on the phone call (Meyerhof, 2006, p. 54). Indeed, Meyerhof answers the question by paraphrasing Chambers as follows: “when you talk to someone, you start to form opinions about them, sometimes solely on the basis of the way they talk” (Chambers at al., 2003 in Meyerhof, 2006, p. 54). Consequently, as assumptions are created based on the way people speak, our outlook towards language differences determines our attitude towards people. Essentially, the way someone speaks can express volumes to the listener. Is it a man or a woman? Is the

person a native speaker or not? To what demographic category does the person belong? In the same way, a person might also have strong feelings or prejudice towards individuals belonging to certain social or cultural groups (Meyerhof, 2006, p. 54). In essence, a person can draw both mental pictures and opinions of others, without ever laying eyes on them, by using information received from verbal utterances only. On the other hand, Burling (1993, p. 32) illustrates how verbal and nonverbal message balance each other referring to the previously discussed telephone conversation. In this scenario the caller is acquainted with the recipient and needs to convey a message which is both important and emotional. Moreover, according to Burling, the fact that neither the caller nor the recipient can see each other makes the prospect and execution of verbalising the message that much more difficult. Hence, he maintains that our words, when deprived of their nonverbal companions, are less effective than when they are used in unison.

Interestingly enough, the use of a verbal message can be at times particularly more productive than that nonverbal. Consider the Swiss adventurer who, when criticising the Europeans in Haiti for their use of bastardised French, received the following response: “There are a thousand things one dare not say in French, a thousand voluptuous images which one can hardly render successfully, which the Creole expresses or renders with infinite grace” Meyerhof (2006, p. 29). Indeed, the way people speak or even utter a single word can reveal many truths about them. Meyerhof (2006, p. 14) paraphrases Wucker’s tale of how Haitians were identified during an ethnic cleansing campaign in the Dominican Republic by the way they uttered the letter /r/. The Dominican soldiers would hold up an item whose name contained the consonant /r/ and whoever could not pronounce the letter in a certain way was executed. Meyerhof then uses a biblical example: after the Ephraimites lost a battle against the Gileadites, the survived Ephraimites attempted to disguise themselves amongst the local Gileadites. In order to separate the Ephraimites from the Gileadites, those suspected of being Ephraimites were asked to say the word shibboleth. The Ephraimites articulated /s/ instead of /ʃ/ and, in the same way as the above-mentioned Haitians lost their lives when discovered.

Nonverbal message tells the truth

Given that verbal and nonverbal message are both dimensions of human inborn hereditary communicative capacities, one may wonder which skill was developed as first. Chomsky takes on an evolutionist approach by advocating that the ‘sensory motor system’ – which includes all nonverbal communicative cues

developed before spoken or verbal communication (Chambers et al., 2013, p. 10). However, Gleitman argues that “if we are right, the unconscious, rapid, and incremental speech machinery is not wholly or even predominantly conception first and speech only thereafter (...) rather the representations constructed by the visual-attentive and linguistic-conceptual systems may be integral all along the line” (Gleitman et al., 2007 in Chambers et al., 2013, p. 11). Henley (1973, p. 3-4) demonstrated how nonverbal behaviour establishes power with the psychiatrist draw a nonverbal line in the sand by which the patient knew exactly where the boundaries were and who was on which side. This could have been done with words while the meaning was perfectly communicable without uttering a sufficiently well-constructed verbal message. Furthermore, Chambers et al. explains that Chomsky considers the use of verbal communication to be of no more importance than body language (Chambers et al., 2013, p. 10).

In contrast, Henley (1973, p. 3) challenged the view by claiming that “the evidence is that the nonverbal message greatly overpowers the verbal one, an estimate is that it carries 4.3 times the weight” (Argyle et al., 1971 in Henley, 1973, p. 3). Foreigners making verbal errors whilst communicating in a foreign tongue do not get judged, rather native listeners accommodate them and anticipate certain verbal mistakes. However, the same cannot be said for nonverbal mistakes. Since nonverbal communication is less susceptible to conscious control due to its inherited disposition, people naturally feel awkward when foreigners violate their nonverbal codes (Kirsch, 1979, p. 416). Additionally, Burling reinforces Henley’s idea by claiming that nonverbal cues often reveal deceit or falsehood. He furthermore explains how saying one thing whilst expressing something different in a nonverbal way makes people take you for a liar, owing to the fact that people will give greater credibility to the nonverbal message rather than the verbalised one (Burling, 1993, p. 32). On the other hand, it must be emphasized that although nonverbal communication is poor at concealing deceit, it is more effectively used in transmitting emotions and intentions. Mehrabian’s rule of personal communication commonly called 7%-38%-55% rule leans towards the assumption that listeners tend to believe the body language in case the verbal message is incongruent. Mehrabian (2009) explains this phenomenon with the tendency to appeal to facial liking in 55% of total liking, whereas vocal liking and verbal liking takes 38% and 7% respectively.

Nonverbal Communicative Intelligence

While the concept of intelligence has taken on numerous frames, nonverbal communicative intelligence (NCI) deserves a particular attention. Communicative

intelligence is then understood as a kind of ability that translates all communicative signals, be they verbal, nonverbal or any other type (De Ruiter and Levinson, 2008, in Chambers et al., 2013, p. 12). Even so, Burling argues that “however much is built in, plenty remains to be learnt” and he continues that the digital or verbal plane of language inherently requires more learning than does the analogue or nonverbal dimension (Burling, 1993, p. 29). The conception started with a study by De Ruiter and Levinson 2008 (Chambers et al., 2013, p. 12) who maintain that humans have inherited a cerebral structure that incorporates, in the words of De Ruiter and Levinson, “communicative intelligence”. The NCI concept covers a set of skills that build up our capacity for interacting with the environment with a systematic use of nonverbal signals such as gesture, tone of voice or even a manner of breathing. NCI is then not simply body language, but an ability to send and interpret nonverbal signals and forecast the behaviour of others by means of understanding our own nonverbal patterns. Already in the 70s. Henley (1973, p. 3-4) used Haley’s (1962) portrayal of the psychiatrist-patient interaction to highlight the dramatic effect of nonverbal cues. Firstly, the patient takes up a supine position whereas the psychiatrist is seated behind the patient. Thus, the psychiatrist is physically situated above and behind the patient. Obviously, this seemingly innocent practice makes the patient feel inferior by physically being lower than the psychiatrist. Moreover, he/she feels dominated, as well as intimidated, by not being able to see the psychiatrist’s reactions when he/she responds, thereby creating insecurity in the patient. Lastly, the psychiatrist’s words get blown out of proportion due to the patient’s helpless disposition.

NCI in education

In 1973 Henley pointed out that in society greater importance were placed on verbal communication than on nonverbal communication. Little has changed till now. Thus, while children are equipped with verbal communicative tools at school, no attention is paid to nonverbal communicative skills. What is more, children do not get taught how to examine various types of mimicry, body language and gazes. She admits, while nonverbal communication is learned in everyday life, and is similar to children’s language before enrolling in school, this does not discount the fact that there are individuals who do not know what certain gestures, gazes and body language mean. However, Michael Grinder, the author of popular ENVoY techniques for management, believes that non-verbal skills are the key to success in the classroom. The 32 skills presented in his collection for pedagogy make a practical manual for teachers in that they both

contribute to their professional development and can be utilized in peer coaching. Grinder claims that proper non-verbal communication techniques increase students' concentration and efficiency during lessons, boost their energy for the day, and strengthen the teacher-student relationship, which is believed the most powerful factor in education. The list of expected outcomes of using ENVoY skills include "fewer disciplinary incidents, improved student attendance, higher student grades, higher staff morale, and a lower level of staff burn-out". In sum "teachers who systematically utilize the full range of non-verbal management skills are able to reinforce consistent and fair parameters while preserving their relationships with each student, regardless of unique learning styles or cultural backgrounds" (Grinder, 1996). But it seems that teachers skilled in NCI not only easily establish rapport with their students but also are able to use selected nonverbal patterns to receive particular student behaviour. Among factors that have the greatest influence on student learning Marzano (2003 in Zoller, 2007) emphasizes three:

1. The teacher's content expertise
2. The teacher's skill at instructional design and delivery
3. The teacher's skill in classroom management

The author then puts forward an assumption that nonverbal communication is in the core of classroom management and while teachers in this study had no training in nonverbal communication, they showed distinctive patterns of communication. By identifying the patterns, the teacher can learn to control them and use them with conscious intention in order to increase his/her influence on student behaviour.

The author's assumptions was based on various research in Japan, the Netherlands, Australia, the Czech Republic, and the United States and proposed in Third International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) (1999). The finding thus were gathered in the cross-cultural perspective and showed that certain nonverbal patterns were characteristic for all teachers regardless of their place of origin, though teachers in Japan, the Netherlands, and the Czech Republic often implemented the similar "patterns of high expectation" manifested with the teacher standing still and maintaining direct eye contact and breathing low abdominal while expecting an answer. All nonverbal patterns however proved to have a range of implementation and a baseline frequency – quite an important point in terms of understanding cultural norms of communication.

The power of gesture

The common definitions of “gesture” are far from precise. They tend to be either limited to or like to embrace numerous phenomena which blur their distinctiveness from other nonverbal forms like “emblems”. Kendon (1972) contrasted gestures from “emblems” by introducing the term “gesticulations” to refer to signals created for the current necessity, idiosyncratic and not driven by convention – which is the key property of emblems. In this fashion McNeill (1992) distinguished the following types of gesture:

- 1) Pictorial gestures
 - Iconics: gestural picture of the utterance
 - Metaphorics: abstract picture of the utterance (can be culturally specific)
- 2) Discursive gestures
 - Beats (match discrete verbal elements to the discourse as a whole)
 - Deictics: pointing gestures (the verbal equivalent are pronouns or demonstratives)

Consequently, the ‘Kendon’s Continuum’ has been proposed to distinguish gesture from speech in terms of semiotic modes they represent. This was conveyed through a series of comparisons among various kinds of gestures as well as distinctions between gesticulations and linguistic codes (including ASL and other signed languages), which brought about the following assumptions (McNeill, 1992):

- In gestures, meanings are global: the parts of the gesture derive their meanings from the meaning of the gesture as a whole. In speech, the presentation is analytic and combinatoric. Separately meaningful morphemes are combined according to grammatical rules to make up the whole.
- The form of the gesture is idiosyncratic and lacking specific form-meaning conventions. Speech is socially-constituted and held to conventions of form meaning pairings.
- The gesture is imagistically formed while speech is formed by arbitrary signifier-signified conventions.

Goldin-Meadow (1999) admits that gesture takes on a language-like form in terms of structure and thus may efficiently substitute speech with its communicative function. Yet, gesture as an accompaniment to verbal message turns to have a more imagistic and analogue form, being a method for conveying unspoken thoughts for speakers as well as a communication tool for listeners. However, Kirsch observed that gestures in themselves do not carry as much weight, rather it is the verbalisation that gives the nonverbal signal significance: “gestures are

ordinarily not used in a vacuum. They usually are produced in conjunction with other forms of communication” Kirsch (1979, p. 418). On that note, it is worth considering how certain gestures are not visualised, but rather verbalised. These include telling a person that you will keep your fingers crossed – that is to wish good fortune – or to keep their chin up – that is, to stay strong – without physically crossing your fingers or lifting the person’s chin (Kirsch 1979, p. 418). Also, McNeill and Duncan’s (2000) observations on a set of gestures that accompany speech show that gesture and speech are related to one another and systematically organized in terms of that relation. They form “meaningful, often non-redundant combinations with the speech segments with which they synchronize” (2000, p. 142). What is more, gestures manifest unique semiotic properties such as idiosyncrasy (they are often created locally by the speaker and driven by the meaning). Furthermore, the meaning of gestures is determined by the whole-part relation in that meanings of the features of gestures are motivated by the meaning of the whole. McNeill calls this property “global”, while at the same time finds gestures “synthetic” in the sense that the gesture and speech combine to form one meaning system two distinct semiotic architectures. His study already brought the following set of assumptions:

- Gestures and speech happen at the same time
- Gestures and speech can do the same thing
 - Gestures and speech can be semantically co-expressive (they present a meaning concurrently, i.e., he bends it way back (gesture of bending tree back)
 - Speech and gesture can be complementary (they present different aspects of meaning, i.e., she chases him out again (gesture of swinging weapon)
- Gestures and speech develop in parallel in language acquisition
 - Gesture: iconic > metaphoric > discourse-referring
 - Speech: referential > descriptive elaboration > discourse-structuring
- Gestures and speech are both similarly targeted by aphasia
 - Broca’s aphasia: telegraphic speech; iconic gestures
 - Wernicke’s aphasia: fluent but incoherent speech; metaphoric/beat gestures (McNeill 1992)

In recent years the study of gesture has become energized. The International Society for Gesture Studies and a journal *Gesture* (Kendon and Müller (eds.)) offer the empirical basics and theoretical perspective to regard gestures as a means for understanding of the nature of language. McNeill (2000, 2005) insists on what he concludes in *The Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics* (pdf version) “The word ‘gesture’ covers a multiplicity of communicative movements, primarily but not always of the hands and arms. Often, gestures are assumed to comprise

a channel distinct from speech, but careful investigation challenges this traditional view. Gestures and language are best thought of as a single system, larger than either language or gesture as traditionally assumed“ (McNeill, 2014).

The cognitive perspective

The power of and readability of gesture may lie in what Cognitive Linguistics calls “image schemas”, i.e., the fundamental patterns for human understanding, whereby bodily behaviour is assumed as the preliminary capacity for linguistic skills. The concept of image schema lies at the core of any research on mental operations and processes governing cognition. These pre-conceptual schematic structures provide patterns that enable us to understand and reason about the world, as well as make sense of our experience. They are highly abstract general knowledge structures by means of which we organize our experience and understanding at the level of bodily perception and movement. In other words, image schemas are unspecific enough to serve repeatedly in order to identify numerous similarly structured experiences or perceptions. They are dynamic recurrent patterns ordering our perceptions, conceptions and actions, thanks to which we construe our knowledge structure and comprehend reality. Neisser (1976) deems a schema a part of the nervous system comprising an active array of physiological structures and processes (Johnson, 1987, p. 20). As such, these cognitive and experiential mechanisms also underlie syntactic and semantic structure of language. Johnson (1987) emphasizes that the experiential schemas have gestalt structure, i.e., they form coherent, meaningful, and irreducible wholes: “they are a principal means by which we achieve meaning structure. They generate coherence for, establish unity within, and constrain our network of meaning” (Johnson, 1987, p. 41). The internal structure of gestalts, however, is not of atomic building-block type. Lakoff (1987) notes that basic-level concepts are richly-structured mental images, with parts psychologically more complex than the whole itself. The basic logic of gestalts consists in the configurations of their parts. According to Johnson, schemas represent basic (possibly inborn) conceptual mechanisms enabling people to make sense of the world already from the stage of infancy. Anderson (1980) emphasizes their analogy to physical processes or operations whereby we transform image structures in the way we scan and manipulate physical objects, though we are not aware of the processes that operate within them and easily take them for granted. In simple words, a schema defines objects and relations within a concept or a combination of concepts. Again, schemas are preconceptual and cannot be analyzed with the rules of logic.

Body and mind are conceptualized as two contingent structures to the extent that the body is seen as manifestation of the properties of the mind (mental, intellectual or emotional), i.e., they are perceived as contained inside the body in a purely physical sense. In other words, our conceptualization of both physical and abstract concepts is rooted in our physical experience and thus mental schemas are also embodied. Johnson (1987) highlights their pre-conceptual nature which is rooted in our bodily perception and movement. For example, our perception of the world via the characteristics of our body allows for the pervasive schema of CONTAINMENT. We view (though subconsciously) our body as a bounded three-dimensional container with in-out orientation and an ability to move. Wilcox (2004) provides a study on how these cognitive phenomena reveal themselves in American Sign Language (ASL). Deaf people, for example, use a gesture at the forehead to refer to the mind as a container filled with knowledge and experience, which represents the CONTAINER schema. The forehead is systematically used to metonymically represent such concepts as remember, understand, opinion, or open-mind (Wilcox, 2000, p. 107). Signs made round the back of the head, on the other hand, mean unconscious thought or hidden information. This may support the assumption that people activate a schematic process of transferring objects inside a container when they refer to acts of understanding, remembering or noticing things.

Linguistic research has developed certain conceptions and tools which can account for the psychological and mental capacities of language users. Gibbs and Colston (1995) provide some findings from psycholinguistics, cognitive psychology and developmental psychology which support the claims about image schemas and their transformations, as well as the connections between perception, thought, and language. The studies on representational momentum points to the role of image schemas in mental functioning (Freyd and Finke 1984). In an experiment, after having observed static pictures of an object rotating in one direction, participants tended to recollect the final position of the object as shifted toward the direction of motion. The bodily perspective we take on to interact with the world Lakoff and Johnson call phenomenological embodiment (1999, p. 36). They also postulate the notion of neural embodiment, which refers to mechanisms within neural circuitry responsible for certain phenomenological properties concepts (such as colors) have (1999: 36). They provide an attempt at recognizing what neural mechanisms give rise to spatial-relations concepts. In their view, a computational neural model accounts for the topological and orientational properties of certain image schemas. Basic level concepts emerge in the visual system in the brain as outcomes of motor movement, gestalt perception and mental imagery. So the same neural system is engaged in both perception and conception of phenomena.

Besides, findings by Ramachandran and Gregory (1991) claim the “filling-in” architecture inside the brain, which plays a central role for recognizing the notion of containment (discussed in Lakoff and Johnson, 1999, p. 40). Powerful spatial character of image schemas may result from the specific neural activity in the brain pertaining to visual perceptions. According to the Neural Model, we arrive at spatial-relations concepts (encoded in prepositions) via the capacities for vision and negotiating space, whereas bodily movement gives rise to the motor schema (yielding verbs) (Lakoff and Johnson, 1999, p. 39). Farah et al. (1988) hypothesize that visual representations may be processed in two anatomically distinct cortical systems: one responsible for representing the appearance of objects, the other – location of objects in space. This may explain why blind people are capable of spatial conceptualization and thus image-schematic thinking. The theory of embodied cognition might help in discussions over the nature of nonverbal behavior and their properties.

Conclusion

Whenever a sentence is vocalized the speaker involves a number of body behaviours by which the hearer interprets the speaker’s intention. Although plenty of nonverbal symbols are culture-determined, research tends to prove that symbolic messages are innate in character, pre-linguistic, mostly unconscious and for that reason considered more trustable than their verbal counterpart. With numerous functions of nonverbal means such as to clarify ideas, to emphasize importance, control others or strengthen the verbal transfer, the most powerful impact on communication has their expressive and persuasive character. Thus, the contribution of nonverbal cues to the total meaning of a discourse is enormous and observation plus accurate interpretation of the gestures and facial expressions might be an invaluable key to understanding. This ability recently termed “nonverbal communication intelligence” has already been appreciated in education. I believe that further inquiry into the neural and biological determinants of psycholinguistic capacities of humans will bring substantial evidence for multidimensionality of nonverbal cues.

References

- Anderson, J. R. (1980). *Cognitive Psychology and Its Implications*. San Francisco: W. H. Freeman.
- Argyle, M., Alkema, F., Gilmour, R. (1971). The communication of friendly and hostile attitudes by verbal and non-verbal signals European. *Journal of Social Psychology*, 1(3), 385-402.

- Berlin, B. (1992). *Ethnobiological Classification Principles of Categorization of Plants and Animals in Traditional Societies*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Berlin, B., Kay, P. (1969). *Basic Color Terms: Their Universality and Evolution*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Burling, R. (1993). Primate Calls, Human Language and Nonverbal Communication, *Current Anthropology*, 34(1), 25-33.
- Chambers, J. K., Schilling, N. (2013). *The Handbook of Language Variation and Change*. Second edition. Malden: Blackwell Publishing.
- Chambers, J. K., Trudgill, P., Schilling-Estes, N. (2003). *The Handbook of Language Variation and Change*. Malden: Blackwell Publishing.
- Farah, M., Hammond, K., Levine, D., Calvanio, R. (1988). Visual and spatial mental imagery: Dissociable systems of representations. *Cognitive Psychology*, 20, 439-462.
- Freyd, J., Finke, R. (1984). Representational momentum. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition*, 10, 126-132.
- Gibbs, R., Colston, H.. (1995). The cognitive psychological reality of image schemas and their transformations. *Cognitive Linguistics*, 6, 347-378.
- Gleitman, L., January, D., Nappa, R. & Trueswell, J. C. (2007). On the give and take between event apprehension and utterance formulation. *Journal of Memory and Language*, 57(4), 544-569.
- Goldin-Meadow, S. (1999). The role of gesture in communication and thinking. *Trends in Cognitive-Sciences*, 3(11), 419-429. Retrieved from [http://www.cell.com/trends/cognitive-sciences/pdf/S1364-6613\(99\)01397-2.pdf](http://www.cell.com/trends/cognitive-sciences/pdf/S1364-6613(99)01397-2.pdf).
- Grinder, M. (1996). *Envoy: Your Personal Guide to Classroom Management* (3rd edition). Mga Publishing Consortium. Retrieved from <http://www.michaelgrinder.com/class-list/envoy-personal-guide-to-classroom-management/>.
- Henley, N.M. (1973-74). Berkley Power, Sex and Nonverbal Communication, *Berkeley Journal of Sociology*, 18, 1-26.
- Johnson, M. (1987). *The Body in the Mind: the Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press.
- Kirsch, M. S. (1979). Non-Verbal Communication Across Cultures, *The Modern Language Journal*, 6(8), 416-423.
- Lakoff, G. (1987). *Women, Fire and Dangerous Things: What Categories Reveal about the Mind*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Lakoff, G., Johnson, M. (1999). *Philosophy in the Flesh: The Embodied Mind and its Challenge to Western Thought*. New York: Basic Books.
- Kendon, A. (1972). Some relationships between body motion and speech. In A. Siegman & B. Pope (eds.), *Studies in Dyadic Communication*, 177-210. New York: Pergamon Press.
- Marzano, R. J., Marzano, J. S., Pickering, D. J. (2003). *Classroom Management That Works: Research-Based Strategies for Every Teacher*. Alexandria: Association for Supervision & Curriculum Development.

- McNeill, D. (2014). *Gesture: A Psycholinguistic Approach 1*. Retrieved from McNeill, D. (2005a). *Gesture and Thought*. Chicago: University Of Chicago Press.
- McNeill, D. (2005). *Thought, Imagery, and Language: How gestures fuel thought and speech*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- McNeill, D., Duncan, S. D. (2000). Growth points in thinking for speaking. In D. McNeill (ed.), *Gesture and language*, 141-161. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- McNeill, D. (1992). *Hand and mind: What gestures reveal about thought*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/239533349_GESTURE_A_PSYCHOLINGUISTIC_APPROACH_1.
- Mehrabian, A. (2009). "Silent Messages" – A Wealth of Information About Nonverbal Communication (Body Language). *Personality & Emotion Tests & Software: Psychological Books & Articles of Popular Interest*. Los Angeles: self-published.
- Mervis, C., Rosch, E. (1981). Categorization of natural objects. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 32, 89-115.
- Meyerhof, M. (2006). *Introducing Sociolinguistics*. Retrieved from <http://www.tandfebooks.com/>.
- Neisser, U. (1976). *Cognition and Reality*. San Francisco: W. H. Freeman.
- Ramachandran, V. S. (2004). *A Brief Tour of Human Consciousness*. New York: Pi Press.
- Ramachandran, V. S. Gregory, R. L.. (1991). Perceptual filling-in of artificially induced scotomas in human vision. *Nature*, 350, 699-702.
- Rosch, E. (1975). Cognitive Representations of Semantic Categories. *Journal of Experimental Psychology (General)*, 104, 192-233.
- de Ruiter, J. P., Levinson, S. C. (2008). A biological infrastructure for communication underlies the cultural evolution of languages. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 31(5), 518-518.
- Wilcox, P. P. (2000). *Metaphor in American Sign Language*. Washington, DC: Gallaudet University Press.
- Wilcox, P. P. (2004). A cognitive key: Metonymic and metaphorical mappings in ASL. *Cognitive Linguistics*, 15-2, 197-222.
- Zoller, K. (2007). Nonverbal Communicative Intelligence For Classroom Management. Retrieved from <http://www.sierra-training.com/articles.htm>.

Maria DEMBSKA
Uniwersytet Gdański,
m.k.dembska@gmail.com

Grzegorz GRZEGORCZYK¹
grzegorz.grzegorczyk@ug.edu.pl

Shaking hands with buildings – cognitive ecology and embodiment in the language of architectural reviews: A case study

Summary

The relationship man establishes with his environment is far from static with interactivity and language playing central role in it. This sense-saturated coordination appears to be a result of man contacting his construction design through and in the body immersed in its environment, or as Hutchins (1995) puts it, “in the wild”. We consider architecture a cognitive phenomenon which in order to be discussed requires a reference to the web of mutual dependence between man as creator and building as concept locked in linguistic interactivity. In this chapter, by employing the enactivist stance we postulate that humans and architecture remain in a dynamic and mutual linguistic coordination and communication which results in conceptualising buildings and other architectural design in bodily terms despite belonging to opposing worlds of living vs. non-living. We will demonstrate it by analysing relevant samples of language from architectural press.

Keywords: language, metaphor, interactivity, embodiment, cognition, architecture

Introduction

Man's approach to architecture has been changing over the years and now with new trends in cognitive sciences we discover new ways of understanding its nature. The title of the present paper draws on the famous words from Juhanni Pallasmaa, a Finnish architect and academic professor whose views on architecture bear phenomenological stigma. He sees architecture as “the art of reconciliation between ourselves and the world, and this mediation takes place through the

¹ The paper is the result of a cooperation between the mentor and the student within the framework of a diploma seminar at the Department of Applied Linguistics and Translation Studies of Gdańsk University.

senses” (Pallasmaa, 2005, p. 75). For Pallasmaa “bodily intimate contact with the city” is one of prerequisites for architecture to communicate its archetypal identity. In order for interactivity to occur the body has to maintain its physical contact with the surroundings, it has to be allowed for concrete confrontation with buildings, monuments and other man-made structure:

I confront the city with my body; my legs measure the length of the arcade and the width of the square; my gaze unconsciously projects my body onto the facade of the cathedral, where it roams over the mouldings and contours, sensing the size of recesses and projections; my body weight meets the mass of the cathedral door, and my hand grasps the door pull as I enter the dark void behind. I experience myself in the city, and the city exists through my embodied experience. The city and my body supplement and define each other. I dwell in the city and the city dwells in me (Pallasmaa, 1992, p. 144).

In his call for multiscalarity and multisensuality of architecture Pallasmaa points at its embodied, embedded, extended, enacted and affected nature, which places our discussion of the man-architecture relationship in the domain of cognitivism in its dynamic version. Although the crux of our interest here is predominantly embodiment, the remaining four elements of cognition as inextricably connected and permeating one another will naturally be within the orbit of our argument. The communicative contact man and architecture develop brings language to the fore as a domain in which interactivity is established. What we understand through language here is a sense-saturated linguistic activity which constitutes an arena for meanings to be organised. An expression of this can be found in the way humans write, speak and talk about architecture, or more precisely, their perception of it. The kind of metaphor we use in these linguistic activities evidences the embodied nature of sense-making in our contact with architecture. Our confidence is that whatever sense and meanings are made, or in short, whatever cognition occurs as a result of man contacting his construction design, begins in the body immersed in its environment, or as Hutchins (1995) puts it, “in the wild”. Architecture in this approach becomes a cognitive phenomenon and any discussion of the language used to talk about it points to the web of mutual dependence between man as creator and building as concept locked in mutual linguistic interactivity as elements of a cognitive ecosystem. In other words, cognition like language, is not located in the brain (or mind?) but happens in the agent's physical environment by means of physical artefacts. Interestingly, a human individual in the person of the architect contributes to creating his own physical surrounding by creating some of its artefacts. Then as cognizing agent he

off-loads cognitive work onto these (and other) making his body and the environment parts of his cognitive system.

Our aim in this text will be to demonstrate that despite belonging to opposing worlds of living vs. non-living humans and architecture remain in a dynamic and mutual linguistic coordination and communication which results in conceptualising buildings and other architectural design in bodily terms. For us, architecture is a concrete, multimodal entity, experienced through the sensorimotor skills, and for that reason, when people describe architecture (when languaging), they use metaphors of embodiment as a primary means of communication and sense-making. We will demonstrate it by analysing relevant samples of language from architectural press. This will serve us in explicating how architecture 'speaks' to man and how these two parties establish a space of cognition characterised by embodiment and reflected in language as the main arena for meaning organizing. The main stumbling block might be the fact that architecture can either be seen as an abstraction or as a non-living participant of the dyad, which should eliminate biology of cognition as a methodology for our discussion. Interestingly, some studies suggest (e.g. Burgess, 2014) that artificial cells can translate chemical messages to modify the behaviour of bacterial cells. They are considered useful as non-living biological sensors. Modification requires establishing a domain of consensus in the process and as a result of ontogenic reciprocal structural coupling (Maturana 1978a). There is some similarity between this mechanism and man-architecture tie in that human cognition can be stimulated by the architectural design being an element of individual's environment. Buildings are the produce of neuronal brain activity which gain a life of their own through conceptualising them as having its own body and ontology, in which they speaks, moves, hears, feels, etc. In their physical representation they become subjective experience of the human body existing in space and modulated by the facets of the environment. This experience is in the linguistic domain.

Metaphor, languaging and embodied cognition

There is a substantial body of evidence in text corpora that the way people conceptualise architecture and language about it is strictly determined by the embodied nature of cognition. Cognition is a term referring to all aspects of conscious and unconscious mental function, particularly, the mental events and knowledge involved in tasks ranging from 'low-level' object perception to 'high-level' decision-making tasks (Evans, 2009). The notion of embodied cognition proposes the view that this mental function is largely dependent on the bodily

experiences of movement and senses which form the foundations of the human conceptual system (Lakoff & Johnson, 1999). The embodied character of communication rests entirely on languaging (in Maturana's sense – clarified below) reflecting physical experience. As we stated above, language defined by Maturana is a biological phenomenon taking place in a relational (consensual) domain, as a manner of living, and not a phenomenon of the operational and structural dynamics of the nervous system. In his view, “our existence as human beings takes place in our operation in language” (Maturana, Mpodozis, & Letelier, 1995), human brains think in language. He claims also, that the observer creates a description of reality through his or her interactions (including interactions with and through instruments) which he calls ‘languaging’ (Maturana, 1978b). In this understanding, language becomes a physical and empirical domain instigating the process of semiotic mediation, it “spreads between people who draw on experience” (Cowley, 2012, p. 11).

One of the linguistic artefacts exemplifying the embodied aspect of cognition is metaphor (cf. Caballero, 2006). Metaphor, although often considered simply figures of speech, they “aren't just ways of talking, they are ways of thinking” (Casasanto & Gijssels, 2015, p. 327). Metaphor in language is a verbal representation of a concept based in sensorimotor experience (Lakoff & Johnson, 2003) hence its clearly embodied nature which is further referred to by Lakoff and Johnson as “(...) the system of conceptual metaphors is not arbitrary or just historically contingent; rather, it is shaped to a significant extent by the common nature of our bodies and the shared ways that we all function in the everyday world.” (Lakoff & Johnson, 2003, p. 246). A metaphor can therefore be called embodied, when it uses patterns obtained in human physical experience to organise more abstract understanding (Škara, 2005).

Lakoff and Johnson argue that primary metaphors, i.e. the foundational metaphors through which the conceptual integration into compound metaphors takes place (Evans, 2009), generally have an experiential basis. They build their argument on the theories of Johnson and Grady (2002) stating that the primary metaphors emerge in early childhood, when two domains are first experienced simultaneously (e.g. learning what is in a box by looking inside, or feeling affection and warmth while being held) and later differentiated into metaphorical sources and targets (Lakoff & Johnson, 1999). Many primary metaphors are explained in this manner:

- IMPORTANT IS BIG – for a child big things, e.g. parents, are important and have an influence on them;
- AFFECTION IS WARMTH – feeling warmth while being held affectionately;

- UNDERSTANDING IS GRASPING – getting information about an object by grasping and manipulating it;
- MORE IS UP – observing rise and fall of levels of piles and fluids as more is added or subtracted (Lakoff & Johnson, 1999).

From the presented examples it transpires that primary metaphors can be based both in the sensory experience and in movements of the body.

The concepts of spatial relations, such as container schema, front/back, up/down, in/out which have been described as embodied in the previous chapter constitute a basis for many conceptual metaphors. Most of these are what Lakoff and Johnson call orientational metaphors, e.g. HAPPY IS UP; SAD IS DOWN, HEALTH AND LIFE ARE UP.

Some most obvious instances of embodied metaphors are the metaphors which use the body and human sensorimotor experience as its concrete source domain. As described by Škara (2005), in the concept BODY IS A CONTAINER the body is conceptualized as a space which contains many entities: mind, soul, thoughts, emotions, words. They are described with terms related to air and water, by analogy with the functions of the body. With the front/back schema, the available or known ideas and concepts related to the future are seen as entities in front of the body, while the unknown or past are seen as in the back of it, as human senses are dominantly directed forward (Škara, 2005). Similarly, the senses can also serve as a field of reference for conceptual metaphors, i.e. KNOWING IS SEEING, EMOTIONAL EFFECT IS PHYSICAL CONTACT. A special instance of the metaphors referring to the body and mind is personification, which conceptualizes something non-human with traits and abilities of a human. Each personification differs in terms of the aspects it includes, picking out different characteristics or ways of perceiving a person in order to describe phenomena in terms that can be understood on the basis of human motivations, goals, actions and features (Lakoff & Johnson, 2003). In the most extreme examples, metaphors can also be embodied on the neural level. Such seems to be the case of image metaphors, which map one conceptual image onto another. According to Lakoff and Johnson (2003), when we imagine seeing a scene, our visual cortex is activated. This shows that the reasoning of the mind uses the structures of the sensorimotor system.

Samples of embodied metaphor in Polish architectural reviews

In order to illustrate the embodied character of cognition in architecture and the role of metaphor in linguistic interactivity in this field we will present some samples from a small collection of building reviews found in a monthly

architectural magazine *Architektura. Murator*. This magazine enjoys fairly wide circulation and popularity among professionals. We selected representative texts from six random editions of the magazine on the grounds of their length and their treatment of the building as a whole, and not only in terms of technical solutions. In order to establish a method for identification of metaphors in the collected texts, the MIP – Metaphor Identification Procedure developed by the Pragglejazz Group. The MIP consists of four steps (Dorst & Kaal, 2012, p. 53):

1. Read the entire text.
2. Determine the lexical units in the text
3. For the determined units:
 - a. For each lexical unit, establish its meaning in context.
 - b. For each lexical unit, determine if it has a more basic contemporary meaning in other contexts than the one in the given context.
 - c. Decide whether the contextual meaning contrasts with the basic meaning but can be understood in comparison with it.
4. If yes, mark the lexical unit as metaphorical.

The general idea of the procedure was adopted, with a simplification in the second step: the texts were not divided into separate lexical items (most frequently, single words), but considered on the syntactic level, in the context of phrases or whole sentences. Having collected the relevant samples of metaphors we moved on to recognising the cognitive mapping behind each phrase. When possible, we abstracted the mapping in line with the list developed by the Cognitive Linguistics Group from the University of California, Berkeley (Espenson, Goldberg, Lakoff, & Schwartz, 1991). In other cases we tried to define the mappings in a similar manner. If applicable, we further categorised the metaphors depending on the aspect of embodiment they were based on.

An object of architecture is a complex work to construe in that it engages almost all the senses, sight, touch, hearing and smell, and requires movement and action in order to get to know the whole of the building. As all those sensorimotor experiences are used to build the conceptual system, shaping the way we think and talk about man-made structure. In the 12 analysed building reviews, we found 170 examples of conceptual metaphor. The following table presents the number of instances per category.

Metaphor	Number of instances	% of occurrence
Personification	30	18,2%
Image metaphors	20	11,8%
Container metaphors	14	8,2%
Motion metaphors	14	8,2%
Sound metaphors	12	7,1%
Organic metaphors	8	4,7%
Touch metaphors	7	3,5%
Sight metaphors	4	2,4%
Balance metaphors	2	1,2%
Other	59	34,7%
Total	170	100,0%

Fig. 1: Frequency of occurrence of metaphor realisations

The listed categories include previously discussed aspects of embodiment present in conceptual metaphors. The inclusion of image metaphors may seem inconsistent with the classification, as the instances listed refer to different source domains, however, as it was argued above, mapping the images activates the visual cortex in a manner similar to actually seeing a scene (Lakoff & Johnson, 2003). Therefore, the category was included as a separate case of embodied metaphor. We will now move on to presenting some categories of embodied cognition in architecture as exemplified in metaphor.

Spatial relations and motion

As noted above, the capacity of human senses and motor skills limit and structure the way people conceptualize spatial relations (Lakoff & Johnson, 1999). Metaphors related to this aspect were present in the studied corpus in three categories: container schema (IN-OUT relation), FRONT-BACK AND BALANCE. Here are some examples of metaphor using this relationship:

Nowe skrzydło budynku wypełniło niezabudowaną dotąd część działki

BOUNDED REGIONS ARE CONTAINERS

[Bryła] Wpasowuje się w przestrzeń

BOUNDED REGIONS ARE CONTAINERS

Both presented metaphors are instances of the BOUNDED REGIONS ARE CONTAINERS, which allows regions in space to be conceptualized as containers.

The posture of human body is such that we see and interact with people and our environment using the front part of our body (Škara, 2005). Therefore, the front is usually mapped at a part of an object or region we are most likely to interact with. Such is the case in the examples:

tworząc przestrzenie tête-à-tête istniejącej zabudowy...

BUILDINGS ARE LIVING ENTITIES

... placu Wolności, na który spogląda wielkie oko szklanej ściany głównego holu.

BUILDINGS ARE LIVING ENTITIES

In the given examples, the front, street facades of the buildings are presented as having faces or eyes.

The importance of balance comes from the posture regarded as typical of the body, that is, upright position (Škara, 2005). From this notion humans derive the categories of directions such as up-down, left-right, over-under.

... masywny cokół dodawał bryle stabilności, pomagał stać.

BUILDINGS ARE LIVING ENTITIES

Przeciwwagą dla warsztatowego charakteru jest tu plastikowa ściana...

TRAITS ARE OBJECTS

In the examples above, the key elements of the building and its design are presented as providing balance for the whole object.

Individual's understanding of a building is, to a large extent, by moving in space. (Caballero, 2006). Therefore, metaphors referring to movement are frequently present in the analysed set, collected from the building reviews. Collected examples include mostly verbs and participles conveying motion:

... [dziedziniec] przebijający pierzeję

BOUNDED REGIONS ARE CONTAINERS

Obiegające salę teatralną i sznurownię przypory

BUILDING ELEMENTS ARE LIVING ENTITIES

... budynek niejako chce wzlecieć.

BUILDINGS ARE LIVING ENTITIES

Static buildings and building elements are described as moving, mirroring human movement through their space.

Senses

Our main argument in this text is that human understanding of the world is mediated through the senses, and consequently, our projections of the world is limited by them. We create our own cognitive map of the environment through and in sensory experience. This relation is prominent in descriptions of architectural objects, which, as concrete entities, are perceived through the senses. It is commonly believed that the sight is the most prominent of the senses, as it gives more information than other senses and combines and overlaps with all of them (Škara, 2005). The examples found in the corpus referred to seeing as connecting or bringing closer:

... nowe połączenia widokowe

SEEING IS CONNECTING

mogą wizualnie przybliżyć poszczególne części śródmieścia

VISUAL FIELD IS CONTAINER

Although not directly connected with sight as a domain involved in the mapping, image metaphors nevertheless arise from visual experiences. They are mappings of two mental images onto one another (Lakoff, 1987). As they refer to various domains, it is often difficult to generalise the mapping into a wider conceptual metaphor, as can be seen in the examples:

...sala teatralna jest jak jasna perła otoczona ciemną i szorstką muszlą ...

ROOM IS PEARL IN SHELL

...w tym chaosie jaśnieje trójkątny żagiel białej elewacji.

TRIANGULAR FACADE IS SAIL

uzyskano wrażenie groty wykutej w litej skale.

ROOM IS CAVE

Luksusowa, architektoniczna broszka wieńcząca dzieło ...

PROTRUDING ROOM IS A BROOCH

Metaphors of this kind are most readily understood within the classic theory of metaphor, however, they also conform with the general theory of conceptual metaphor.

In terms of perceiving architecture, "hearing structures and articulates the experience and understanding of space" (Pallasmaa, 2005, p. 49). Sound and echoes are very important in judging the scale or character of space, but it can also evoke the association of the building with a musical composition:

Struktura całego zespołu oparta jest na naprzemiennym rytmie pełnych i transparentnych traktów.

BUILDINGS ARE MUSICAL PIECES

Grafitowe ściany (...) melodyjnie grają z (...) pasami balkonów.

BUILDINGS ARE MUSICAL PIECES

... zaskakuje współbrzmienie budynku Renato Rizziego ze zlokalizowanym niedaleko Teatrem Wybrzeże ...

SIMILARITY IS HARMONY

The recognized sound-related metaphors were mainly instances of the metaphorical schema ARCHITECTURAL PRACTICE IS MUSICAL PRACTICE.

Despite the frequent view of vision as the most important sense, it can be argued that all the senses can actually be considered extensions of touch – as specializations of skin (Pallasmaa, 2005). In the examples featured in the analysed collection, touch was present mainly in the context of the building's relation to its environment:

Fasada konsekwentnie trzyma się linii zabudowy...

PROXIMITY IS HOLDING

... [foyer zwrócone] w stronę placu i związane z nim bardzo odczuwalną osią.

VISUAL CONNECTION IS MATERIAL CONNECTION

Personification

The use of personification in building reviews refers back to the general view presented throughout this paper, i.e. that cognition and categorization being its part, are directly tied to and constrained by our sensorimotor abilities. As people, we are not able to adopt conceptual systems other than human, so it can be logically inferred, that we perceive abstract entities and inanimate objects in human terms. In the collected examples, different possible traits of character were mapped, depending on the context and described building:

... budynek zbyt śmiało ingeruje w panoramę historycznego miasta

Budynek ASP łączy w sobie różne temperamenty.

Pierwszym kontekstem jest nobliwa miejska pierzeja ...

Jej akustyka uwodzi, dysponuje mocą i precyzją zarazem.

Ta „rozmowa” dwóch ścian wewnątrz ulicznych ...

Conclusion

As argued in this chapter, the metaphors structuring the human conceptual system are rooted in the sensorimotor experiences of the human body, either by ascribing traits of a concrete entity or experience to abstract notions, or by employing direct personification. The human experience of architecture is first and foremost conducted by sensorimotor interaction with the architectural object, which results in it being very often conceptualised through embodied metaphors. When seeing the building, walking towards, next to, or through it, the experience is driven by the body and the senses, therefore, the linguistic expression of this experience includes metaphors based in spatial-relations concepts and uses the body as the source domain. This is then reflected in languaging about the experience thus gained.

The examples of conceptual metaphors identified in the collected texts illustrate the influence of embodiment on the conceptual metaphors used in the building reviews in Polish architectural journalism. As the work of architecture is experienced “in its fully embodied material and spiritual presence” (Pallasmaa, 2005, p. 44), it engages both physical and mental structures in order to express the experience in language. Although personification as a special case of embodied metaphor seems to occur most frequently in the analysed material, appearance of other types cannot escape our notice either. In order to establish a more accurate percentage of representation of particular categories within the corpus, a more widespread study is, however, recommended.

References

- Burgess, D. J. (2014). “Communication from the non-living world”. *Nature Reviews Genetics* 15, 442
- Caballero, R. (2006). *Re-Viewing Space*. Berlin, New York: Mouton De Gruyter.
- Caballero, R., & Paradis, C. (2013). “Perceptual landscapes from the perspective of cultures and genres”. In: R. Caballero, & J. E. Diaz Vera (Eds.) *Sensuous Cognition. Explorations into Human Sentience: Imagination, (E)motion and Perception* (77-108). Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter Mouton.
- Dorst, A. G., & Kaal, A. (2012). ”Metaphor in discourse. Beyond the boundaries of MIP”. In: F. MacArthur, J. L. Oncins-Martínez, M. Sánchez-García, & A. M. Piquer-Píriz (Eds.) *Metaphor in Use: Context, Culture and Communication* (51-68). Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing.
- Espenson, J., Goldberg, A., Lakoff, G., & Schwartz, A. (1991). *Master Metaphor List. Second Draft Copy*. <http://araw.mede.uic.edu/~alansz/metaphor/METAPHORLIST.pdf> Accessed 18.06.2016,
- Evans, V. (2009). *Leksykon językoznawstwa kognitywnego*. Kraków, Universitas.

- Grady, J. & Johnson, C (2002). "Converging evidence for the notions of subscene and primary Scene". In: R. Dirven & R. Pörings (Eds.) *Metaphor and Metonymy in Comparison and Contrast*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter. 533-554.
- Hutchins, E. (1995). *Cognition in the Wild*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press
- Knowles, M., & Moon, R. (2006). *Introducing Metaphor*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Lakoff, G. (1987). "Image Metaphors". *Metaphor and Symbolic Activity*, 2(3),219-222.
- Lakoff, G. (1993). "The Contemporary Theory of Metaphor". In :W. A. Ortony, *Metaphor and Thought* (202-251). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lakoff, G., & Johnson, M. (1999). "How the Embodied Mind Challenges the Western Philosophical Tradition". In: G. Lakoff, & M. Johnson *Philosophy in the Flesh: the embodied mind and its challenge to Western thought* (1-129). New York: Basic Books.
- Lakoff, G., & Johnson, M. (2003). *Metaphors We Live By*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Maturana H. R. (1978a) Cognition. In: P. Hejl, W. Köck & G. Roth (Eds.) *Wahrnehmung und Kommunikation* (29-49). Frankfurt: Peter Lang.
- Maturana, H. R. (1978b) "Biology of Language: The epistemology of reality". In: G. Miller & E. Lenneberg (Eds.) *Psychology and Biology of Language and Thought*. 27-63). New York: Academic Press.
- Pallasmaa, J. (1992). "Identity, intimacy and domicile: Notes on the phenomenology of home". Proceedings of *The Concept of Home: An Interdisciplinary View' Symposium*, 21-23rd August, Trondheim, Norway.
- Pallasmaa, J. (2005). *The Eyes of the Skin. Architecture and the Senses*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley.
- Schwarzer, M. (1999). "History and Theory in Architectural Periodicals: Assembling Oppositions". *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* , 58 (3). 342-348.
- Škara, D. (2005). "The Linguistic Landscape of the Human Body". In: D. Škara, *Vocabulary, Culture, Cognition* (19-56). Zadar: Sveučilište u Zadru.

Cultural identity, language and narrative

Summary

Katan's (2008: 70-73) take on culture through Hall's 'Iceberg Model' (1959/1990) has grasped many academics in their attempts to explain differences between cultures. Although it is difficult to disagree with the concept in principle, there is room for further exploration. Culture is not a fixed structure that occupies a certain space and time, but is subject to constant shifts leading to its structure being reshaped. Therefore, trying to define cultural groups as performing certain actions (technical function of the iceberg) in pre-agreed ways (formal function) because of certain beliefs (informal function) fails in three ways. The agency in selecting **what** should be the subject of cultural education and **who** should provide the education. If people from the same cultural community act differently in the same situation, which act can then be defined as typical for that culture and why? The third element refers to the founding **values** of culture. They are also dynamic, which adds to the difficulty in defining which value-based behaviour belongs to a culture and which does not. Culture and, by extension, cultures are fuzzy constructs that have so far successfully escaped a robust and solid definition due to their inherently unpredictable ways.

Keywords: agency, culture, Iceberg Model, identity, language, metanarrative, narrative, norms

Introduction

When culture is subject to analysis, for instance, for translation reasons, one finds a network of relations, e.g. one culture being under influence from other cultures. The shape of a culture is always the result of a particular and unique 'history of life' (Schneider, 1988, p. 123), and the people who live within that culture make this history. Wherever there are human beings there is always unique experience (individual and collective) that shapes points of view, beliefs, concepts, institutions, approach in its general sense, which then give form to individual and collective life of the people within that cultural community.

If then culture is to survive, it must be cultivated and cherished by its members, passed from person to person, from generation to generation, from community to community, and so on. What follows from this is the question of when and where a culture starts, where its beginning is, and, by extension, where it will end. Viewed in this way, culture can be said to take on the form of a narrative, or a story, and we, its agents, are story tellers passing it onto our descendants, whether fully consciously or not.

It does not need explaining that each human being follows several narratives in their lives, and thus belongs to several cultural institutions. One may be a human being and share different human qualities with other humans. Simultaneously, the same person being a man may be defined through whatever it is that shapes male culture. Furthermore, that man may be a father and therefore share qualities of parenthood or fatherhood culture on top of their professional activity, which will also be culturally defined and shaped. It can be said that culture has no fixed division or way of classification which appears in line with the view that one subscribes to several narratives, as a result of which one belongs to more than one culture at a time.

Many theories have been suggested in an attempt to define and categorise culture, yet none admits that it has successfully captured its nature. Among the many definitions the one which will be the main focus of this essay is the proposition by Katan (2008, pp. 70-73), and which is based on the 'Iceberg Model' fostered by Hall (1959/1990) with its 'technical', 'formal' and 'informal' functions of culture. Although Katan presents a comprehensive view with which it is difficult to disagree in many aspects, there are, nevertheless, issues that would benefit from further clarification and analysis. The tools of analysis employed in this essay are narrative theory and the construction of identity. The former shall facilitate a more detailed examination of what constitutes a culture, and the latter will facilitate a more comprehensive understanding why cultures differ from one another.

Theoretical framework

As already mentioned above, the two main tools that shall be adopted in this essay to analyse Katan's idea of culture are narrative theory and the construction of identity. To begin with, a brief overview of the two concepts is proposed with a particular emphasis on how they shall be used in the analysis here.

The theory of narrativity, as elaborated by Somers and Gibson (1994, pp. 37-99), lends itself well to defining culture due to the fact that, in explaining the world, it accounts for the rich diversity of perspectives, positions and systems within groups of people, e.g. society, which belong and/or display some common features. The narrative includes in itself bodies as small as individuals and local communities and as big as societies and even whole continents at any given time. The authors propose dividing the theory into four main types of narratives which can roughly be classified as individual and group, where I shall assume that the individual consists in 'ontological' and the group in the three other, namely, 'public', 'conceptual' and 'metanarrative' (1994, pp. 61-3). The classification of the

four narrative types under two meta-headings will serve to promote a view that a culture consists in a network of relationships between the individual and the group in a broad sense. The narrative has been similarly defined in the social sciences to analyse and describe the reality in a dichotomous way of 'particularistic versus generalisable', 'description versus theory' (Somers and Gibson, 1994, pp. 38).

Furthermore, it can be postulated that culture is itself a form of narrative, on the grounds that every culture can be said to have begun in the past and presents as a cohesive whole set in a context which can be analysed, explained and told. Culture, furthermore, is a web of interpersonal, inter-institutional, conceptual, etc. relations and as such provides more data to create more stories which then may be assimilated within the same culture to allow the implementation of changes and/or cultivating tradition. By extension, the complexity of the relations allows individuals to subscribe not just to one story, but to several at a time.

The other major notion applied in the analysis here is the construction of identity. This aspect shows a very strong connection with culture and narrative through the fact that an individual's identity is deeply rooted in the stories they create and develop about themselves and/or are told by others about themselves. All stories, however, appear within and reflect the cultural background of the people who tell them. Essentially, they are rooted in personal as well as collective experience, knowledge, skills, etc. Thus the individual's identity can be said to be very much culture-specific and as such is one of the ways people in one culture differentiate themselves from people in another culture. As can be inferred, therefore, people use stories they tell and/or hear about themselves in order to form their own identities.

The notion of culture is so central to the creation of identity that it has been subject to extensive research in social psychology. The research by McGuire et al. (1978) presented by Schneider (1988, p. 125) serves as an illustration of this mutual interdependence. In the study, people in a multi-ethnic environment were asked to identify themselves. One of the identity factors that was most often listed was their ethnic origins which the subjects used as one of the most characteristic traits to differentiate themselves from others in that environment. This suggests a strong link between ethnicity and cultural identity, whereby the latter seems to be dependent on the former as one of the constitutional factors.

It can be suggested hence that differences between people are a very strong indicator of self-identity. The idea of being different to other people is central to one's perception of themselves and the world around. Without culture thus identity, whether individual or collective, would be difficult, even impossible, to create. Does that mean, however, that identity is something one obtains or maybe more arrives at in the course of one's life? Is it something one can achieve at some

point and then wake up one morning and say 'Right. I have it now.' and then live on within the same identity for the rest of their life? Baumeister (1986) suggests that identity is construed upon continuity as well as unity in one's behaviour over time. This allows identity to be viewed as a continual process which evolves over time rather than a state, as the stories one tells and subscribes to may and do cause one to alter their views. However, one common element remains unchanged: a person will always perceive themselves as distinct from others. Everybody has their own personal history of life as well as own traits of character that differentiate them from other people.

Unlike Katan's rather static and monolithic image of culture, the notions of narrative and identity allow us to perceive culture as a dynamic construct which is constantly shaped, developed, negotiated and renegotiated, defined and redefined within a community. It can hence be inferred that culture, narratives and identity constitute a unified whole and are thus inseparable. The three complement one another and are interdependent on the grounds that people have a natural tendency to attempt to figure out what happens around them, try to make sense of all events they experience. In other words, every single happening, situation, incident, event, memory, etc. constitutes a piece of puzzle in the self-identification jigsaw.

Agency

The first issue in Katan's (2008, p. 70-73) view which is the subject of analysis in this essay is the notion of agency in learning a culture. Katan (2008, p. 70) advocates the idea that a culture, particularly in its 'technical' function, is acquired by way of instruction. There are two questions that immediately spring to mind and which are left out in Katan's proposition:

1. Who or what provides instructing?
2. On what grounds is it possible to select what a person should learn about their culture?

It is acceptable to suggest that one acquires their culture from their family, friends, school, environment, media, religion, etc. Even institutions transmit cultural knowledge to members of a community. If we come to accept that institutionality, just like a human being, is another form of life by way of argument proposed by Benjamin (1923) whereby everything that has been created has an 'afterlife' and may influence other beings with which it comes into contact, it is possible to include institutions as instructive bodies that shape one's personal (hi)story.

However, this diversity of agents raises two other sub-issues. First of all, from the point of view of narrative theory, every human being has their own unique 'history of life' (Schneider, 1988, p. 123) through which one perceives and interprets what happens around and to them. The perception hence shapes one's understanding, approach, view, etc. of the world, which then becomes the basis upon which one creates own stories about the world. Since one's history of life is unique and individual, the content of the stories told by them, though within the same culture, will just as much be personal, subjective, unique and individual. Therefore, every agent that instructs one about culture will bring in something new and different into the learning of a culture. If agents' instructing may be said to transfer different messages, another issue arises, namely, how we can ensure that what one is acquiring is one and the same culture.

With the above in mind it is a relevant question to ask whose instructing one should follow in order to acquire the culture one lives in. If everybody has their own unique experience, how is it possible for a community to create their own, common culture, promote the same values, perceive the world around in the same or similar ways by members of that culture? Here, Hall's (1959/1990) Iceberg model lends itself well to explain the phenomenon. He perceives culture through the use of language within a community. Also, Whorf (1956) claims that language shapes the way a community views reality. If we accept this view, it is obvious then that the language a community utilises forms the ways they view the world around. Language serves to be a common filter through which narratives are created and expressed. This could explain why different cultures have different expressions, idioms, sayings and proverbs to categorise notions such as time, space, relationships, 'me' versus other people, etc. e.g. Eskimos have several names for snow.

However, in psychology, social psychology in particular (Schneider, 1998, pp. 157-9), there is a strong disagreement as to whether it is language that shapes thinking or thinking forms language. There seems to be a lack of empirical evidence that would transparently determine which way is true. For the purposes of this essay it shall be accepted that an individual comes into a reality that is already shaped in one way or another and that they come to live in a community that has already been created, whose values have been established and are promoted in a given way, and hence language it uses has been developed and is applied in a particular way. It is easy then to comprehend that an individual's use of language is shaped through the way the community use it, and the way it is used reflects the way it has developed in that community. This is how Hall's (1959/1990) idea of culture immersed in the water of language shall be interpreted in this essay.

By a similar token to agency, it remains to be clarified in Katan's (2008, p. 71) elaboration whose culture translators are to spread throughout their work. Hall's iceberg model as discussed by Katan (2008, pp. 70-3) presents as a plain, monolithic paradigm from which the existence of a construct like e.g. English culture versus other cultures can be inferred. Although practicalities of such an approach may be multiple, in reality this is far from the truth.

One of the simplest arguments against that view is the fact that there are many countries in the world that have English as the main or second official language. Does this mean that they all belong to the English culture? What does English culture imply then? Is the mere fact of using English a sufficient factor to belong to that culture? The construct of English culture in its own right appears irrelevant in this context.

Language through time and space

Another example, not so obvious, which appears to challenge Hall's iceberg model may be seen in Table 1.

TABLE 1: Use of <i>have</i> in different standard varieties of English						
		<i>1</i>	<i>2</i>	<i>3</i>	<i>4</i>	<i>5</i>
a)	Have you been there?	I	I	I	I	I
	Had you been there?	I	I	I	I	I
b)	Have you any money?	I	I	0	0	0
	Have you got any money?	I	I	I	I	0
	Do you have any money?	0	0	0	I	I
c)	Had you any money?	I	I	0	0	0
	Had you got any money?	I	I	I	I	0
	Did you have any money?	I	I	I	I	I
(...)						
e)	Had you a god time?	I	0	0	0	0
	Did you have a good time?	I	I	I	I	I
(...)						

I = occurs; 0 = does not occur

Column 1 gives the usage typical of perhaps most Scottish and Northern Irish speakers; column 2, the usage of many northern (particularly Lancashire, but not Liverpool) and older southern English speakers; column 3, the colloquial usage of most younger southern English speakers; column 4, the usage of certain younger educated British speakers, particularly in formal styles – which may show American influence; column 5 shows typical North American usage.
(Hughes and Trudgill, 1987, pp. 25-6)

Adapted from Graddol, et al. (2001).

If we take into consideration a translation project, it is clear that even a simple English sentence like “Have you got any money?” poses a cultural issue. It can be inferred hence that even within a single ‘linguacultural model of the world’ (Katan, 2008, p. 72) there exist geographical divergences as to the use of language. The idea of culture as monolith as promoted in Hall’s iceberg model (1959/1990) just as equally tends to create doubts and uncertainty as it is of assistance in the general perception of the world.

One of the key dilemmas Hall’s model creates in the context of the data in Table 1 concerns the translator and their decisions in translation. Let’s assume along Hall’s view that culture is immersed in language. If we come to accept that the translator is a mediator of cultural difference (Sturge, 2008, p. 67), they are faced then with the problem which culture they are to translate: English, Scottish, Irish or perhaps British in general? It is a valid question here whether a construct like British or English culture exists at all. The data in Table 1 appears to support the view that the notion of English, just as British English, in terms of the English or British culture appears to be irrelevant here due to the linguistic divergences between different parts of England, let alone Britain.

The question remains whether the translator should render the regional variety in the target text at all. Apart from the question of obligation, the question of possibility arises whether the local geographical difference in this particular English grammar use can be transferred and reflected in the target language. Since it can be inferred here that language use is shaped within time, space and community, Hall’s iceberg model yet again proves invalid to explain this issue. It fails to account for regional varieties of language use as it displays no quality enabling us to incorporate the idea of change in culture.

In the context of Table 1 it may be difficult to talk about a difference in time and its effect on language development between particular sentences. But as for space, it becomes clear that we have to do with various geographical areas even within the same country, the UK, where language use has been shaped and developed in accordance with local preferences and conventions of those areas, e.g. Scotland or Northern Ireland. It can be offered as a conclusion that even small communities incorporated in bigger cultural constructs appear to be distinguished by their language use. This could suggest that a community have their own cultural narrative that they subscribe to and which may be different from that of the bigger culture they are embedded in. The data in Table 1 essentially promotes the idea that there is no such thing as a straightforward monolithic community that could together as one subscribe to the same values at the same time and in the same way so as to establish a culture.

Thus, it effectively appears that culture, narratives and identity, through occupying all areas of society, tend to divide seemingly unified groups into yet smaller cultural communities. The division process seems never to stop and may pose communication problems when one least expects it. In its attention to detail understood as the particular, narrative theory provides a more comprehensive and holistic look at the problem of local linguistic and cultural differences. As already explained, people create and tell stories which are rooted in the people's identity. Further, people's identity appears to stem from how they perceive the world around through the prism of time, place, personal experience, language, history, stories of other people, institutions, concepts accepted as appropriate within their communities, and many other factors. A closer look at those factors from the historical and sociological points of view may shed more light onto how and why geographical location plays such an important role in the development and use of language and culture. This issue, however valid and relevant, remains beyond the scope of this essay.

Norms and Practices

The third issue in Katan's (2008, p. 72) view of culture that is worth examining is the relevance of 'norms, rules and conventions' at the level of 'formal culture'. According to him and Vermeer's definition in Snell-Hornby (2006, p. 55) which Katan advocates, culture contains what one must know and learn so as to be able to assess if members of their culture behave appropriately.

Again from the narrative point of view, the question here relates to the origins of such norms. Norms are a construct of a community and as such they are created to regulate certain practices within that community. The issue here is that Katan's idea infers that norms are culture related and members of that culture are able to assess what is normal and acceptable.

Let us then take into account the construct of the Catholic narrative, or rather Catholic culture, which, according to the iceberg model, can mean that the Catholic community have their own values, beliefs, opinions, hierarchy, norms, language, or rather jargon, music, architecture, literature, rituals, customs, communication, and all other aspects that form a culture. The Catholic culture seems so extensive and incorporates so many various people and peoples throughout the globe that most Catholics at the same time belong to many other different cultures, and despite this fact they are able to reconcile various and distant aspects of their cultures within the Catholic narrative.

Within the Catholic culture there exists a tradition not to eat meat on Fridays. The idea comes from the dogma that Jesus was crucified on that day of the

week. Some local Catholic churches and/or communities promote the idea that meat is prohibited on Fridays and whoever consumes it commits a sin. In other parts of the Catholic culture the idea of fasting on Friday is totally at the discretion of individual members or local churches and it is only implied that if one wants to make some physical sacrifice one may for example refrain from eating meat on Fridays. However, it does not constitute a norm or a rule.

The problem here is that different parts of a culture may follow the same normative act differently over time or in different geographical locations, which makes the idea of unified, plain culture as presented by the iceberg model irrelevant one more time. It could be further advocated that no culture is plain and unified and that is what accounts for an assumption that all prescriptive theories of society, communication and culture are irrelevant. Culture is not something which can easily fit any ready-made prescriptive category. As a dynamic construct under constant negotiation, redefinition, development, evolution, etc. the notion of culture requires a category, if such, that will display the same dynamic quality that would capture and account for the element of change in culture.

The narrative point of view, however, well accounts for such dynamism and change. The existence of personal and collective narratives at any level of the public life within a community may successfully explain differences in approach to a norm in different spheres of a given culture. For instance, one such collective narrative in the case of Friday fast in the Catholic culture is well illustrated by the fact that in some areas the church grants dispensation to the followers from Friday fast on condition that it be compensated in the form of alms for the poor.

Conclusions

It appears from the analysis above that the notion of culture and cross-cultural communication, and translation being one form of such communication, is embedded in a process more complex than the one presented by Hall (1959/1990) in his iceberg model of culture.

The complexity of the notion of culture may be claimed to stem partly from the fact that it is transmitted through a multitude of agents, each of whom have their own stories that shape their view on the world, though it may and usually does appear in line with the general view promoted by their culture. Where there are two agents there are at least two stories to be told. Whether a third person subscribes to one or the other, or yet none of them and creates their own, is a personal matter that is shaped by their own experience and the way they perceive and identify themselves within that culture.

The multiplicity of stories and identities as well as experiences that shape them is another factor that does not allow a culture to be viewed a single plain body of beliefs, opinions, views, practices, structure, traditions etc. A culture may display a general tendency to promote some aspects more than others in relation to other cultures, but it always remains in the domain of the dominant versus minor tendencies. This relationship is absent from Hall's iceberg of culture but may well be accounted for through the narrative approach.

Finally, the notion of norms and rules in a culture, as in terms of what is acceptable and what is not in a culture, may vary from person to person. The idea of conventions is hence far from the simple dichotomy of white versus black. It is decked into all shades of grey that occupy the gap in between. What is acceptable today does not have to be acceptable tomorrow. Or what is acceptable in this town or village or local community, may be found to be frowned upon in another.

As the final conclusive remark it is proposed in this essay that there may virtually be no limits as to how far the world can be divided, categorised and classed in terms of different cultures. Possibly, one could assume that the smallest unit that can be named culture is a single being, perceived as a living being (person) who exists in a culture, or an inanimate object that helps to create that culture. This view, however, may prove faulty if we accept that a culture is a set of shared, consciously or unconsciously, values. In order to survive culture has to be cultivated and cherished, passed from person to person, from generation to generation, from community to community, from country to country, and so on. In this context a single unit seems to have no real power to create and maintain their own culture. They can only belong to and express through their life a bigger notion than themselves.

Viewed from the narrative perspective, culture can be said to have no fixed division or way of classification which appears in line with the view that one subscribes to several narratives and thus one may belong to more than one culture. It can be further inferred that what constitutes a whole unified indivisible element in one culture may actually require two or more sub-elements to be created in another culture, which requires further analysis beyond the scope of this essay.

References

- Baumeister, Roy F. (1986) *Identity: Cultural Change and the Struggle for Self*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Benjamin, Walter (1923) 'The Task of the Translator', in Marcus Bullock and Michael W. Jennings (eds) *Selected Writings Volume 1: 1913-1926*, Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.

- Graddol, David, Dick Leith and Joan Swann (2001) *English History, Diversity and Change*, London and New York: Routledge.
- Hall, Edward T. (1959/1990) *The Silent Language*, New York: Doubleday.
- Hughes, Arthur and Peter Trudgill (1987) *English Accents and Dialects: an introduction to social and regional varieties of British English*, 2nd edition, London: Edward Arnold.
- Katan, David (2008) 'Culture', in Mona Baker and Gabriela Saldanha (eds) *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies* (Second, Extended Edition), London & New York: Routledge, pp. 70-73.
- McGuire, William J., Claire V. McGuire, Pamela Child and Terry Fujioka (1978) 'Salience of Ethnicity in the Spontaneous Self-Concept as a Function of One's Ethnic Distinctiveness in the Social Environment', *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 36(5): 511-520.
- Schneider, David J. (1988) *Introduction to Social Psychology*, San Diego, New York, Chicago, Austin, Washington D.C., London, Sydney, Tokyo, Toronto: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Publishers.
- Snell-Hornby, Mary (2006) *The Turns of Translation Studies*, Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Sommers, Margaret R and Gloria D. Gibson (1994) 'Reclaiming the Epistemological "Other": Narrative and the Social Constitution of Identity', in Craig Calhoun (ed.) (1994) *Social Theory and the Politics of Identity*, Oxford: Blackwell.
- Sturge, Kate (2008) 'Cultural Translation', in Mona Baker and Gabriela Saldanha (eds) *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies* (Second, Extended Edition), London & New York: Routledge, pp. 67-70.
- Whorf, Benjamin (1956) *Language, Thought, and Reality*, New York: Wiley and M.I.T.

Angelika KITOWSKA
Hadrian LANKIEWICZ¹
Uniwersytet Gdański,
lania.angelika@wp.pl
hadrianlank@interia.pl

Defining attitudes towards language learning: Autonomy and second language major

Summary

The main purpose of the paper is to apply the concept of autonomy with a special reference to attitudes towards language learning, as worked out by Wilczyńska (2002), to define whether students of applied linguists, majoring in two foreign languages, English and German, display the potential for autonomous behavior in language learning. Additionally, the authors aim at compiling an instrument for measuring attitudes towards language learning, as defined by Wilczyńska (ibid.). They verify the reliability of the proposed instrument with the use of statistical methods. The outcomes of the paper strictly concern the relationship between learners' autonomy and their competence of a given language with a claim that the higher command of a foreign language, the more probable the autonomy-oriented attitude towards its learning.

Keywords: autonomy, language acquisition, attitudes

Introduction

Autonomy has recently taken on a growing importance in the field of language teaching, or more precisely language learning methodology (Benson, 2001). In spite of the fact that autonomy has relatively short history in language education, it has also a crucial meaning for second language acquisition. A sign of its significance is the amount of books and articles dedicated to autonomy as well as many projects and conferences connected to the topic. On the one hand, autonomy is very important because it is regarded to be the final goal of language learning. On the other hand, autonomous learning seems to be an equivalent to effective learning (Benson, 1997, p. 18). Moreover, as Boud (1988, p. 18, in Benson, 1997, p. 4) asserts: "a fundamental purpose of education is assumed to be

¹ The paper is the result of a cooperation between the mentor and the student within the framework of a diploma seminar at the Department of Applied Linguistics and Translation Studies of Gdańsk University.

to develop in individuals the ability to make their own decisions about what they think and do". Autonomy certainly meets this objective.

Consequently, elaborating on the idea of Wilczyńska (2002) regarding language learning attitudes, the authors aim at compiling a tentative instrument for defining students' attitudinal profiles towards foreign language learning. The instrument's reliability and validity is checked on the basis of a pilot study and statistical measures. The main objective of the paper is to define whether students of applied linguistics, majoring in two foreign languages, display autonomy-oriented attitudes and possibly verify the hypothesis that autonomous attitudes towards foreign language learning may be related to the level of language competence.

Attitudes towards language learning

Referring to her didactic experience, Wilczyńska suggests that the communication skills in foreign languages and corresponding to them learning skills are deeply rooted in the students' personal dispositions. Those personal dispositions determine the attitudes towards foreign languages and the possibly the ultimate level of the command of that language (Wilczyńska, 2002, p. 51). According to Wilczyńska, the attitude is a foundation for developing language competences. Therefore, it is essential to present the definition of an "attitude". In relation to foreign languages, Wilczyńska (2002, p. 53) describes the attitude as: "[...] a specific range, aims and style of acquiring and using the foreign language knowledge and skills in connection with the opinions on the nature, status and sense of communication activities, and with the (positive or negative) attitudes towards foreign language learning"². Wilczyńska distinguishes four main attitudes towards language learning, namely: autonomy-oriented attitude, reflection-oriented attitude, ability-oriented attitude and memorization-oriented attitude³.

Autonomy-oriented attitude

The most prominent features of autonomy-oriented attitude are great efficiency in the foreign language, independence from one's mother tongue patterns and personal, creative approach to a foreign language (Wilczyńska, 2002, pp. 51-67). What is more, students showing off this kind of attitude acquire a foreign language in a really personal way. The process of acquisition proceeds in accordance with

² All Polish to English translations in this paper are done Angelika Kitowska.

³ This is a rough translation of original notions worked out by Wilczyńska (2002) in Polish.

the will, awareness and personality of the learner. The acquired language is being shaped and molded by students. As a result of working with a foreign language, learners absorb it completely and make it their own form of communication. They integrate the language into themselves and subordinate it to their own actions and plans. Autonomous learners do not only speak the language, but they use it to achieve their own goals. Their knowledge of a foreign language is certainly active. In the area of foreign language learning, it is treated as a means of personal expression. It could be said that a foreign language becomes an inseparable part of the learner and instead of the process of learning, there is a process of personal integration of language. Moreover, students exhibiting the autonomy-oriented attitude are often characterized by cultural openness and language development strictly connected with their needs. What is crucial, the student exhibiting the autonomy-oriented attitude has a completely new, rebuilt linguistic identity (in a form of the bilingual identity) (ibid.).

Reflection-oriented attitude

The most important feature of the reflection-oriented attitude are: personal, creative approach to a foreign language, passive knowledge of it, and connected with it is the domination of one's mother tongue. Learners of this characteristic subordinate the language to their own actions, plans and needs. They use a foreign language in order to achieve their own goals. Moreover, they are concentrated on the personal integration of the foreign language with language skills developed in a very conscious way. Nevertheless, in using a foreign language, the students adopt the mentality of their mother tongue and native cultural patterns. The language learning process is based on internal translation with mother tongue expressions being overriding (Wilczyńska, 2002, pp. 51-67).

Achieving the fluency in the reflection-oriented attitude is connected with a serious danger of interference in all life areas. The students with this kind of attitude often speak reflectively and always relate to their mother tongue by internal translations. The learners' reflection does not concern the unique character of a foreign language. It should be called into question if the student is interested in the language at all. It all causes serious limitations to the spontaneous use of a foreign language (Wilczyńska, 2002, p. 61). For the reflection-oriented learners it is easy to acquire the linguistic knowledge, even at the cost fluency. It is a consequence of reflective linguistic actions. They must, therefore, put a great effort to learning and create their own effective learning strategies (Wilczyńska, 2002, p. 62).

Ability-oriented attitude

The most important features of the ability-oriented attitude are, similar to the autonomy-oriented attitude, great efficiency in the foreign language and independence from one's mother tongue patterns. What differs these two attitudes, is the fact that the ability-oriented attitude is of more imitative character (Wilczyńska, 2002, pp. 51-67). A foreign language is for the learner only an external thing. The students use basically foreign language patterns, thereby limiting their personal creativity. Furthermore, they adopt the entire verbal, paraverbal and often also mental and cultural patterns of a foreign language. The students' knowledge of a language is admittedly active, but it is concentrated on the language perfection and error avoidance, which makes the spontaneous use of language difficult. The process of learning languages in the ability-oriented attitude is often described as a linguistic sport (*ibid.*).

According to Wilczyńska (2002, p. 61) the fluency in the ability-oriented attitude makes no sense, unless someone loves learning languages only to lose oneself in it and become someone else. Since the languages and the culture are inseparable, there is quite a big possibility of enculturation. A lasting fascination with a foreign language can result in the acculturation and possible deculturation from the initial culture, as a result of upsetting the balance between the two language systems (Wilczyńska, 2002, p. 62).

Furthermore, the ability-oriented attitude is strictly connected with language four main skills, namely, listening, speaking, reading and writing (Uso-Juan & Martinez-Flor, 2006, pp. 18-19). However, it often happens that language skills are not "integrated in actual language use" and although learners are proficient users of a language and achieve excellent exam results, they lack other competences, as feel for language, linguistic creativity, ability to speak spontaneously, or to direct their own learning processes.

Memorization-oriented attitude

The most essential features of the memorization-oriented attitude are the passive knowledge of the foreign language, an imitative approach to it, and the domination of one's mother tongue. The students are strongly dependent on their mother tongues. Moreover, for the students exhibiting memorizing-oriented attitude a foreign language is only a school subject, a material that should be learned and mastered. A foreign language is for the learners an external subject of a mental-intellectual character. Even at the level of proficiency, the students are just reconstructing and quoting learned phrases. It is still a "foreign" language for

them, used as a as a tool. What is more, the students limit their personal creativity by using the foreign language patterns. They are concentrated on a foreign language correctness and error avoidance. Furthermore, the students perceive a foreign language as something given, perfect, ideal and indisputable for non-native speakers. Among the learners showing off the memorization-oriented attitude there is an observable, characteristic cult for a foreign language and a tendency for hypercorrectness and limited spontaneity. What is important, the foreign language dominates the learner. It must be mentioned that it is really difficult for those learners to become advanced users of this language (Wilczyńska, 2002, pp. 51-67).

Additionally, the memorization-oriented attitude can be successfully presented by learning language by heart. It means learning “set sentences, dialogues, and texts by heart” (Doff, 1988, pp. 78-79). Although memorizing can be useful to learn material that is “fixed and limited”, for instance, a list of irregular verbs, languages are not fixed and limited so there is little place here for learning by heart. Even if memorizing prefabricated dialogues enables people to give responses, it does not prepare them for real communication (ibid.).

Research

The purpose of the research to define attitudes of the respondents towards foreign language learning resorting to the above mentioned types of attitudes elaborated by Wilczyńska (2002, pp. 51-67). An instrument for measuring attitudes, compiled by the authors, is designed to assess whether they exhibit an imitative or creative approach to language learning and whether their language knowledge is passive with the strong dependence on their mother tongue or active and independent from their vernacular. The target group consists of 30 students of an applied linguistics course at the University of Gdańsk. All of them are graduate students majoring in two foreign languages. Since they are studying both English and German and their native language is Polish, it may be stated that they are multilingual users. They all have been learning English and German at least for three years. However, all respondents have learnt both foreign languages longer than this. Drawing on the questionnaire, it may be stated that the average number of years of learning English among the target group amounts to 12 years, while the average number of years of learning German is 8 years. Moreover, according to Polish standards for graduates of second language major, they are supposed to represent C1 level of Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (MNiSW). Nonetheless, judging by the questionnaires of the respondents, the proficiency level of both languages in the target group is highly diversified and

many students evaluate it as much lower than C1 level. Although gender and the age of the respondents, in the authors' opinion, does not correlate with the research results, it may be worth mentioning that out of 30 participants, there is only one male. The respondents are aged between 21 and 23 years old.

The research basic instrument is worked out, administered and processed pursuant to guidelines formulated by Dörnyei (2003). The questionnaire is chosen as an elicitation technique for this study mainly because of the possibility to administer it in a big group of people and the opportunity of processing data in an impartial and effective way. Furthermore, the authors of this paper are aware of the possibility of its low reliability the instrument were invalid (Dörnyei, 2003, pp. 10). However, to avoid the aforementioned problem, the authors decides to verify the validity of the test with a reference to statistical measures. All research stages are designed to meet the assumptions of triangulation, which is the strategy to implement two or more research methods or techniques in order to guarantee the validity and reliability of research outcomes (Golafshani, 2003, pp. 602-603).

Hypothesis

Taking into consideration the fact that the respondents are advanced learners, the authors of the research assume that the majority of them should display the autonomy-oriented attitude. However, it is believed that the attitudes of the respondents may be varied, as they represent different personalities and various levels of language competence. Additionally, the authors presume that the students' attitudes toward language learning are strictly connected with their level of proficiency. Therefore, these multilingual respondents, are predicted to be more autonomous in languages in which the level of their language skills is higher.

Analysis

The main outcome of the research is the fact that 15 out of 30 participants responded to the questions differently for two different foreign languages, the option allowed for the construction of the instrument (see the appendix). However, only 10 respondents seem to represent two different attitudes towards language learning. Moreover, 30% of the questioned perform the autonomy-oriented attitude. Two respondents represent the reflection-oriented attitude, eight respondents the ability-oriented attitude and only one of them the memorization-oriented attitude. In the case of the students with two different attitudes, there are four combinations of attitudes. The most popular consists of the autonomy- and ability-oriented attitudes and is performed by five learners.

The next group contains the ability- and memorization-oriented attitudes and is represented by three participants. An additional combination consists of the autonomy- and memorizing-oriented attitude and the autonomy- and reflection-oriented attitude, both exhibited by only by one person each.

As to the construction of the questionnaire, every question is asked with an aim. The first question is asked with the objective to define respondents' creativity. The situation when a student cannot express themselves properly and tries to explain the idea in different way, even if it lasts longer, is a sign of a creative approach to foreign language. It shows also a personal attitude to the language and willingness to communicate. A language is a way of expressing one's thoughts, ideas and concepts and the speaker should be determined to achieve their goal.

The second question is connected with personal approach to foreign language. The authors of the questionnaire believe that somebody who changes their opinion because of their language skills, does not have a personal connection with the language. They subordinate their objectives to the language.

The third question concerns the choice between correct (grammatically and stylistically) speaking and interesting speaking. It is undeniable that more creative people would choose the latter option. It is believed that autonomous learners concentrate more on the meaning than the form of their utterances.

The fourth question examines the need for creativity among the participants. They are asked to mark if they prefer learning fixed phrases or expressions, which can be easily used in a sentence or to learn single words, from which they have to build new expressions. It can be easily observed that people who prefer to learn whole phrases represent the imitative approach to foreign language, while the questioned who like learning single words and create own expressions are creative users of language.

The fifth question pertains to learners' objectives. The respondents are requested to decide what their priorities are: exam requirements and school standards or their own interests. The autonomous learner is claimed to direct their own learning process and select the learning content accordingly to their interests.

The sixth question is asked to find out if the participants use grammatical structures which they do not know. The creative learner tries to use different structures and attempts to use things which they are not adept at. Thus, the most preferable answer would vary from 'strongly disagree' to 'slightly disagree' on the scale.

The seventh question examines the use of internal translation by the respondents. The author states that the learner who before saying or writing something in foreign language, thinks how it would sound in their mother tongue and then translates into to target language, does not represent the autonomous-

oriented attitude. Moreover, internal translation is also a sign of a dependence on the native language.

The eighth question concerns foreign language grammatical structures which do not occur in the respondents' mother tongue. The examples of such structures are, for instance, Present Perfect Tense in English or Zustandspassiv and Vorgangspassiv (two different forms of passive voice) in German.

The ninth question is connected with the efficiency in foreign language and active or passive knowledge of it. Naturally, an active way of using language is represented by more autonomous learners. The respondents are asked to mark if it is impossible for them to feel so comfortable speaking in a foreign language as in their mother tongue, even if they have good language skills and know all needed vocabulary,

The tenth question connects with the idea of self-marginalization (Kumaravadivelu, 2003, pp. 165), which means accepting the foreign language without a critical approach and putting oneself in a worse position than native speakers. The tenth question presents the situation of speakers who are stressed when they talk to the native speakers because they feel that their language skills are much worse than theirs. Furthermore, the concept of self-marginalization indicates low autonomy (Lankiewicz, Wąsikiewicz-Firlej, Szczepaniak-Kozak, 2016).

The eleventh question concerns translating a difficult text into native language in order to understand it without problems. Although this statement may seem to be similar to the question No. 7, there is one major difference. Question No. 7 is connected with creating utterances and the internal translation. The situation described in question No. 11 is when the student reads a difficult text, and even if they know all vocabulary, they do not understand the idea of it. However, when they translate it into their mother tongue, they understand it correctly. Such a situation is a sign of a great dependence on the native language and the impossibility to understand foreign utterances without translating them. This indicates, obviously, the lack of autonomy.

The twelfth question examines the ability of the respondents to understand the idea of a text without translating all unknown words. The authors assume that an autonomous learner will translate all unknown words later, only to improve their vocabulary.

The thirteenth question is concerned with an attitude toward language as a subject. The respondents are asked to mark to what extent they agree or disagree that learning language is similar to other school subjects (for example, chemistry) in the sense that it is a thing that should be learnt and used.

The fourteenth question tries to elicit students' opinion on the correlation between language and culture. The statement to consider is that it is only our native culture and language which form us as people and other languages and cultures we learn do not exert such a big influence on us.

Verification of the outcomes

All respondents taking part in the verification stage of the research, namely the interview, were asked the same general questions. Additional questions were used only to make things more clear or to let the participants' express themselves more freely. What is important, the interview was carried out in Polish, the respondents' native language to allow for a more general character of their answers (pertaining to both languages: English and German). All general questions used in the survey are inspired by Wilczyńska's article about attitudes towards language learning (Wilczyńska, 2002, p. 56). In the following analysis, due to space limitations, we present only the most important parts of the questionnaire summarizing students' responses. Basically, the participants were asked four main questions:

- How would you describe your relation to a foreign language? Do you perceive it as an external subject or as an integral part of your personal resources connected with your own, lifelong objectives?
- How do you perceive your status in communication with other people, including native speakers? Do you think that you are an equal partner in building interactions or do you resign from an active role and concentrate mainly on correct speaking?
- How would you describe your linguistic operations? Is foreign language a medium of your internal speech or do you rather perform an internal translation, resorting to your native language?
- Do you control yourself when you speak freely or do you rely on your feel for language?

The first respondent, a person with the autonomy-oriented attitude is a female student, who has been learning English for 14 years and German for 13 years. She describes her English language skills as advanced and German language skills as proficient. Both questionnaire and interview responses of that student indicate autonomous attitudes. She maintains that she is learning foreign languages for herself and it brings her satisfaction. What is more, she claims that languages are related to her identity, shaping it due to a frequent use of them. On

the other hand, in her opinion, her personality features have also an influence on her relation with foreign languages. When it comes to her contacts with native speakers, she admits to feel sometimes a little bit embarrassed but she always tries to learn a lot from them, discussing linguistic and cultural issues. Although, an autonomous learner is expected to feel fully comfortable in contact with native speakers, sometimes personality features like modesty shape the relation, which is the case for this student. Moreover, the autonomy-oriented respondent says that she feel no barriers between her and other foreign language speakers and has no problems asking questions or starting conversations. She claims not to use an internal translation when creating an utterance. The respondent showing off autonomy-oriented attitude always tries to use new expressions, sometimes experimenting a bit to put into practice her feel for languages. All the mentioned things are characteristic of the autonomy-oriented learner.

The reflection-oriented attitude is represented by a female student, who has been learning English for 15 years and German for 11 years. Her levels of English and German, in her opinion, are both upper-intermediate. She believes that the languages have become parts of her identity and personality since she started to communicate with other people in these languages. Earlier she perceived languages only as external subjects. It is then easy to observe that there is a process of a personal integration of language in this attitude. She admits to create “beautiful sentences in mind” before saying them and often makes mistakes while saying them. She claims that she also tries to control herself when she speaks to avoid mistakes. That can be interpreted as a limitation of spontaneous use of a foreign language. What is more, asked about a language in which she learns difficult things, she admitted to choose her native language in such a situation to understand the content better even if it pertains to foreign language issues. She was also asked a question if she sometimes creates expressions, based on her mother tongue and she confirmed it. The dependence on the native language can be, thus, observed in her attitude. However, she exhibits a load of linguistic creativity and claims that not knowing some words, she tries to explain them in a different way to make herself understood. Although the student seems to be still developing and probably becoming more autonomous in her languages, it must be stated that she still represents the reflection-oriented attitude.

The ability-oriented attitude is represented by a female student, who has been learning English for 11 years evaluating her skills as advanced and German for 5 years defining its level as upper-intermediate. Asked about her relation with a foreign language, the respondent says that “a person does not change according to language learning but according to the profits which it brings”. The ability-oriented learner is not sure, if the language moulds her as a human. Thus, it may

be concluded that foreign language is perceived more as an external subject. When it comes to communication with native speakers, she claims to have gained the confidence in contact with them. However, she states that she has problems talking in a foreign language with non-natives, as she feels being “judged” by them. In the survey, the student mentions making mistakes when talking to other people, the factor which sometimes stresses her. Although she deems that it is not a problem for her that she makes mistakes, she mentions it a few times, the fact which may be ascribed to a dream of a linguistic perfection. The ability-oriented student mentions also avoiding some structures which she is not sure of in order not to make mistakes. On the other hand, she claims that there are structures she has mastered well, using them frequently. Hence, it may be concluded that she prefers to imitate the language of native speakers.

The memorization-oriented attitude is represented by a male student, who has been learning English for 10 years and German for 6 years. He describes his both foreign language skills as advanced. In his relation with foreign language, the student underlines the fact that he uses those languages every day, at the university and with his friends. He learns them to have better prospects for the future. The language is, thus, treated as a subject, knowledge of which has many advantages. In contacts with native speakers, the memorization-oriented learner admits to be worse. Moreover, he feels uncomfortable in contacts with natives being afraid of making mistakes and less fluent than native speakers. He admits that when he talks or writes in a foreign language, he creates utterances in his mother tongue and then translates them into the target language. This, however, happens less frequently, as he becomes more fluent in a foreign language. He also knows that sometimes he uses language calques from his mother tongue. The domination of native language is clearly seen in the respondent’s attitude. Furthermore, he claims that sometimes he tries to use new structures but he must be sure to know them well. This could be a sign of the imitative approach of a language.

Findings and discussion

As the analysis shows, attitudes towards language learning among second language major students are diversified. The expectation that the majority of the respondents should exhibit the autonomy-oriented attitude is not acknowledged. The authors draw a conclusion from the 30% score representing the autonomous attitude among such students. Firstly, the levels of proficiency and language skills among the respondents are highly varied. Although most of them have learnt languages for the same period of time, at least for three years, they have learnt the

same material and have passed the same exams, their language skills, according to their evaluation, range from Intermediate to Proficiency Level of language skills (Common European Framework of Reference for Languages). Though, some low levels of language competence were rather a surprise, since all of the respondents are supposed to present C1 level of both language skills (MNiSW). However, if the respondents' language skills are of various levels, their attitudes must differ as well. Despite the fact that advanced students are more likely to be autonomous than beginners because their feel for language is much more developed, some people will never become fully autonomous, even if they are adept at languages. Alternately, some people can represent the autonomy-oriented attitude already at the start of their language learning. Hence it cannot be expected that all our respondents are by rule autonomous since the autonomy seems to be shaped by personality features an attitudes as well as an educational environment and personal objectives.

Nonetheless, an important outcome of the research is the fact that a third of the respondents represent two different attitudes towards language learning on account of the level of language competence. What seems to be crucial is that the participants with only one attitude assessed their skills of both languages at the same levels. In contrast, the skills of the respondents with two different attitudes diverged significantly. Moreover, the principle, which seemed consistent throughout the research is that the more autonomous attitude always corresponds with the higher level of proficiency. Thus, it may be concluded that the attitude towards language learning is inevitably connected with the level of language skills in a particular language. As mentioned before, higher level of abilities does not necessarily entails autonomy. However, it is observable that the attitude towards foreign language learning may be predicted by proficiency level. As Lankiewicz states (2007, p. 110) it would be more reasonable to perceive autonomy accordingly to different areas, namely somebody can be autonomous in one discipline, while in the other less capacious to make their own decisions. Hence, pursuant to Lankiewicz (2007), it may be claimed that autonomy is not an inborn capacity but it can be acquired and performed to a greater or lesser degree in different areas, including different languages. This claim is to some extent confirmed by respondents exhibiting two different attitudes. Wilczyńska (2002, p. 56) argues that although the attitudes are characterized by high stability, it is possible that they change, either influenced by the teacher or by the student themselves. Thus, there are some possibilities to interpret the results of the students with two attitudes. Firstly, language learning attitudes may be shaped by students experiences and the process of learning. Secondly, the two different

attitudes are conditioned by language competence. Thirdly, the autonomy-oriented attitude is also shaped by a psychological profile of the learner.

Conclusions

Despite the fact that autonomy is claimed to be an inborn disposition of the learner regardless of culture (Kirtikara, 1997), relying on the research analysis and findings, it may be acknowledged that autonomy is strictly connected with the learner's language skills. The authors believe that autonomy is not an inborn capacity (Thomson, 1996) because it is impossible to be autonomous in a discipline of which we know very little. Although "yellowbeaks" cannot be autonomous in particular areas, it does not imply the fact that professionals and advanced learners are always autonomous in their disciplines. Furthermore, it is feasible to represent two (or more) attitudes towards language learning. In such a situation, the more advanced in a foreign language somebody is, the more autonomous attitude they represent. However, it may happen that some people will find it difficult to represent the autonomy-oriented attitude simply because of their psychological construction. This, in turn, however, attitudes may be conditioned by learning experiences shaped by institutional schooling robbing students off their natural predisposition to be autonomous (Dickinson, 1997).

References

- Benson, P. (1997). "The philosophy and politics of learner autonomy". In: Benson, P. , Voller, P. (eds.). *Autonomy & Independence in Language Learning*. London and New York: Longman. 18-34.
- Benson, P. (2001). *Teaching and Researching Autonomy in Language Learning*. Harlow, London and New York: Longman.
- Boud, D. (1988). "Moving towards autonomy". In: Boud, D. *Developing student autonomy in Learning*. London: Kogan Page. 17-39.
- Common European Framework of Reference for Languages. http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/Cadre1_en.asp [E.D. January 18, 2017].
- Dickinson, L. (1997). "Culture autonomy and common sense". In *Autonomy 2000: The Development of Learning Independence in Language Learning*. Conference proceedings, Bangkok: King Mongkut's Institute of Technology Thonburi.
- Doff, A. (1988). *Teach English: A Training Course for Teachers : Teacher's Workbook*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Dörnyei, Z. (2003). *Questionnaires in Second Language Research. Construction, Administration, and Processing*. The United States of America: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

- Golafshani, N. (2003). "Understanding reliability and validity in qualitative research". *The Qualitative Report*, 8(4), 597–607.
- Kirtikara, K. (1997). "Autonomy rediscovered". In *Autonomy 2000: The Development of Learning Independence in Language Learning*. Conference proceedings, Bangkok: King Mongkut's Institute of Technology Thonburi, pp. 93-100.
- Kumaravivelu, B. (2003). *Beyond methods : macrostrategies for language teaching*. The United States of America: Yale University Press.
- Lankiewicz, H. (2007). „Autonomia – nadzieje i ograniczenia”. In: Wiśniewski, J. (red). *W dialogu języków i kultur*. Warszawa: Lingwistyczna Szkoła Wyższa w Warszawie. 103-111.
- Lankiewicz, H., Wąsikiewicz-Firlej, E., Szczepaniak-Kozak, A. (2016) "Insights into language teacher awareness with reference to the concept of self-marginalization and empowerment in the use of a foreign language". *Porta Linguarum* 25, ss. 147-161.
- MNiSW. 2012. Załącznik nr 29 do rozporządzenia Ministra Nauki i Szkolnictwa Wyższego z dnia 17 stycznia 2012. Standardy kształcenia dla kierunku studiów Filologia.
- Thomson, C. K. (1996). "Self-assessment in self-directed learning: Issues of learner diversity". In R. Pemberton et al. (eds.). *Taking Control: Autonomy in Language Learning*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, pp. 77-91.
- Usó-Juan, E. & Martínez-Flor, A. (2006). "Current Trends in the Development and Teaching of the four Language Skills". In: Jordens, P. *Studies on Language Acquisition 29*. Berlin and New York: Mouton de Gruyter. 3-25.
- Wilczyńska, W. (2002). "Podmiotowość i autonomia jako wyznaczniki osobistej kompetencji komunikacyjnej". *Autonomizacja w dydaktyce języków obcych: doskonalenie się w komunikacji ustnej*. Poznań: Wydawnictwo Naukowe UAM. 51-67.

Appendix

ATTITUDES TOWARDS LANGUAGE LEARNING (questionnaire)

This is not a test so there are no "right" or "wrong" answers. Please respond to the statements sincerely as only this will guarantee the success of the research. Although you are asked for your name (only to have a possibility to contact you in case of further research), your answers are absolutely confidential.

Following are a number of statements, express your opinion by putting an 'X' in the box that best matches the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement concerning the process of foreign language learning. If you feel that your answers would differ with respect to English and German, please mark it by putting 'E' for English and 'G' for German.

1. If I can't express myself properly because I don't know some words, I try to explain my thoughts in a different way, even if it lasts longer.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

2. When I am asked about my opinion and I know it would be too difficult linguistically to explain it, I decide to say something easier, even if it isn't completely true about me.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

3. When I talk, it is more important for me to speak correctly (grammatically and stylistically) than to speak interestingly.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

4. I prefer learning whole phrases or expressions, which I can easily use in a sentence to learning single words, from which I have to build new expressions.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

5. When I learn a foreign language, the priorities for me are exams requirements or school standards, not my own interests.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

6. When I don't know some grammatical structures, I try not to use them.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

7. Before I say or write something, I first I try to formulate it in my mother tongue and then I translate it to the foreign language.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

8. I have problems with using foreign language grammatical structures which don't occur in my mother tongue (e.g. Present Perfect Tense).

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

9. It is impossible for me to feel comfortable speaking in a foreign language as in my mother tongue, even if I have good language skills and I know all needed vocabulary.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

10. I am stressed when I talk to the native speaker of a language which I am learning because I know that my language competence is somehow limited in comparison to theirs.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

11. When I read a difficult text, I translate its sentences to my mother tongue. Then I understand that text without problems.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

12. I understand the idea of the text without translating all the words I don't know. I may translate them later only to improve my vocabulary.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

13. Foreign language learning is just like learning any other school subject (e.g. chemistry, maths). In a sense it is a material that should be learnt and used. The assumption that foreign language is something more, e.g. gaining new identity is rather far-fetched.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

14. In my opinion, it is our native culture and language which form us as people. Other languages and cultures we learn don't have such a big influence on us.

Strongly Disagree *Disagree* *Slightly Disagree* *Partly Agree* *Agree* *Strongly Agree*

ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS

1. Your name and email contact (if possible?)
.....
2. How long have you been learning English?
.....
3. How long have you been learning German?
.....
4. How would you evaluate your English language skills?

Beginner *Elementary* *Intermediate* *Upper-intermediate* *Advanced* *Proficiency*

5. How would you evaluate your German language skills?

Beginner *Elementary* *Intermediate* *Upper-intermediate* *Advanced* *Proficiency*

Thank you very much for your help!

Natalia KŁODNICKA

University of Gdańsk

nataliakl@interia.eu

Anna SZCZEPANIAK-KOZAK¹

Adam Mickiewicz University in Poznań

szczepaniakkozak@amu.edu.pl

Culture shock in the narrative approach: A portrait of two Britons living in Poland

Summary

This paper aims to present the phenomenon of culture shock assuming the narrative approach. Firstly, its authors delve into the topic of culture shock and the narrative study, i.e., a recent methodology in linguistic and education studies. These theoretical ruminations are followed by a presentation of the methodology and findings of an exemplary study involving two British expatriates who experienced the phenomenon of culture shock in Poland. This way the authors attempt to portray how individual features, life situation and previous intercultural experience may affect the intensity of culture shock.

Keywords: culture shock, narrative study, expatriate, personal experience, Poland

Introduction

Travelling across countries is inextricably connected with accumulating experiences and feelings. However, not all sojourners are aware of the fears and emotions which are the consequences of their decision to leave the motherland. In fact, everybody suffers from culture shock but the intensity of this experience differs considerably from person to person and depends on internal and external factors. This paper aims to present the phenomenon of culture shock assuming the narrative approach. Firstly, its authors delve into the topic of culture shock and the narrative study being a recent methodology in linguistic and education studies. These theoretical ruminations are followed by a presentation of the methodology, conduct and findings of a case study involving two British expatriates who experienced culture shock during their stay in Poland. This way the authors attempt to portray how individual features, life situation and previous

¹ The paper is a cooperative endeavor between a mentor and a student based on the diploma paper submitted at the Applied Linguistics and Translation Studies of the University of Gdańsk.

intercultural experience may affect the intensity of culture shock and at the same time present evidence that the narrative study has much to offer in building our understanding of this phenomenon.

Culture Shock

One of the earliest definitions of culture shock comes from Oberg (1954, p. 1), who describes it as a mental illness which people staying beyond the borders of their native country experience; in his own words: “the anxiety that results from losing all [...] familiar signs and symbols of social intercourse”. A few years later Hall (1959/1980, p. 156) expands on this definition and proposes that culture shock results from one’s being exposed to unfamiliar incentives from new surroundings. He puts forward that culture shock is due to the “removal or distortion of many familiar cues that one encounters at home and the substitution for them of other cues which are strange”. Adler (1975, p. 13) elaborates on Hall’s definition and completes it with the reaction of the sojourner: “a set of emotional reactions to the loss of perceptual reinforcements from one’s own culture, to new cultural stimuli which have little or no meaning, and to the misunderstanding of new and diverse experiences”. In later years new attempts to define culture shock were made, e.g., Hofstede, 1997; Gesteland, 1999, Hampden-Turner & Trompenaars, 2000; Hofstede & Hofstede, 2005, but they have not invalidated the theoretical soundness of the definitions offered by Oberg and Hall.

In some theoretical approaches culture shock is presented as just one of the acculturation phases that a sojourner undergoes when in a new country or culture. Hofstede and Hofstede (2005, pp. 323–324) define acculturation as all alterations in feelings, termed the acculturation curve, that one experiences when in contact with a foreign culture. Four main phases are differentiated on the acculturation curve: euphoria, culture shock, acculturation and stable state. The first phase on the way to acculturation, according to Hofstede and Hofstede (2005, p. 323), is euphoria sometimes called “the honeymoon phase”. In most cases this is a short period characterized by the enthusiasm about travelling and spending time in a new place. The second stage, i.e., culture shock, is a period when everyday life begins in the new place abroad, which is often accompanied by problems. Acculturation, the third phase, starts when one becomes accustomed to the cultural conditions abroad, which takes place when a person notices local values, rules and customs and tries to act upon them. A person that has acculturated in the new environment also feels a part of the new society. Acculturation is never finished but with time it turns into the stable state, in which the sojourner’s attitude toward the new culture is set as positive, negative or neutral. All in all,

despite many factors which lead to the differences in the courses of particular expats' adaptation, generally, cultural shock is the most visible stage, whereas acculturation is the longest one.

Most sojourners experience the feeling of confusion because abroad they meet people representing different, often obscure, cultural values, practices or beliefs. Consequently, during longer stays abroad people experience diversified emotions both positive, like excitement or curiosity, and negative, like frustration or depression (cf. Mikułowski-Pomorski, 2006, pp. 278–279; Szczepaniak-Kozak, 2007, 2011, 2012a). Some other undesirable side effects are eating and sleeping disorders, apathy, experiencing unduly vulnerable feelings or bad temper, and/or mental disorders (Szczepaniak-Kozak, 2007, p. 47). Other symptoms include: homesickness, boredom, withdrawal, irritability with little provocations, sense of being cheated, hypersensitivity to perceived criticism, depression, stereotyping host nationals, or hostility towards host nationals (cf. Seelye & Seelye-James, 1995, p. 4).

Generally, it is believed that factors such as the position one holds in the host country and the reason for the visit influence to a great extent the intensity of one's culture shock. However, Berry (1997; cited in Kopic, 2006, p. 113) suggests that "there are very likely to be individual differences in the psychological characteristics that a person brings to the acculturation process, which means that not every person would necessarily participate in the process to the same extent". However, Seelye and Seelye-James (1995, p. 4) reject the function of individual personality and emphasize other important aspects such as the particular situation in which one finds oneself; on their words: "Most recover within a few years, but recovery is gradual. It makes little difference whether the sojourner is an American terrified by the traffic patterns of Guatemala or Guatemalan perspiring with claustrophobic anxiety in the subways of the New York City" (Seelye & Seelye-James, 1995, p. 4). Furthermore, Hofstede and Hofstede (2005, p. 325) put forward that not everybody is in equal measure capable of learning intercultural communicative competence:

Persons with unduly inflated egos, a low personal tolerance for uncertainty, a history of emotional instability, or known racist or extreme left- or right-wing political sympathies should be considered bad risks for a training program that, at its core, assumes people's ability to distance themselves from their own cherished beliefs. Such persons are probably unfit for expatriation anyway; if a family will be expatriated, it is wise to make sure that the spouse and children, too, have the necessary emotional stability.

The intensity of culture shock depends to a considerable degree also on one's psychological characteristics (Berry, 1997; cited in Kopic, 2006, p. 113). Measuring multicultural effectiveness and factors, especially those related to personality, is even more complex than defining the notion of the socio-cultural adaptation abroad. For example, Van der Zee and Oudenhoven (2001) conducted research investigating students' success abroad with a special focus on measuring personality dimension. Their Multicultural Personality Questionnaire has scales for: Cultural Empathy, Openmindedness, Emotional Stability, Social Initiative and Flexibility. In their view, Cultural empathy, defined as the capacity to clearly project an interest in others as well as to obtain and to reflect a reasonably complete and accurate sense of another's thoughts, feelings, and/or experiences (Van der Zee & Oudenhoven, 2001, p. 279), becomes the fundamental factor contributing to a satisfying and effective stay abroad.

All in all, people who travel abroad experience culture shock in different ways and to different degrees. Although it is especially noticeable in the initial stage of their visit to a foreign country, culture shock often determines the whole process of their acculturation and/or the way they perceive the host culture.

The Narrative Approach

The narrative approach arose from some researchers' dissatisfaction with those anthropological and communication studies that relied heavily on generalizing theories, factors and variables, which at the same time disregarded details of stories that people offer to researchers, for example, during interviews (Bochner, 1994, pp. 28–29). According to Hoepfl (1997; cited in Johnson & Christiansen, 2008, p. 31), it is a type of qualitative research which offers the researcher an opportunity to interpret the investigated phenomenon in context-specific settings. Thus, it also enables exploring personal factors related to the subject matter. Additionally, as Johnson and Christiansen (2008, p. 34) postulate, it bases on the specific situation of an individual and therefore, as stated by Strauss and Corbin (1990; cited in Hoepfl, 1997, p. 17), it delivers information that could not be arrived at by any other means or procedures. This way it is suitable when researchers want to take into account individual differences and individual variables pertaining to their research questions.

The narrative approach is based on the idea of a person telling his or her life story or a story about some selected period or event, together with the feelings and interpretations attached to it. Hence, in this research orientation a researcher very often analyses "a spoken or written text giving an account of a series of events occurring over time and integrated into a plot" that a particular person considers

worth relating with reference to the research topic, hypothesis or orientation (Gersten & Søderberg, 2010, p. 247). Such an account is often called a story. That explains why it is useful for exploring culture shock. Most sojourners are able to account episodes or misunderstandings, often anecdotal, which they experienced and which committed to their memory. The methodological usefulness of narrative studies also rests on the fact that they concentrate on many factors and apply, as mentioned by Johnson and Christiansen (2008, p. 35), wide-and deep-angle lens. Furthermore, the narrative approach is based on the concept that the events and emotions narrated must be understood from the perspective of the person who accounts it. This is why, apart from stories, most often this approach uses interviews, self-reports or languaging as the research techniques. More on the narrative approach in Szczepaniak-Kozak (2012a, b; 2014)

The basic argument in favor of applying the narrative story to understand culture shock is that humans are not repositories of facts or information only. Most of what is learnt or experienced, including culture shock, is kept in memory wrapped with subjective interpretations and emotions which accompany a particular event and some afterthoughts, reflections/thoughts also gathered in discussion with others. This is why, in order to reveal not only facts from research participants' life but also emotions and interpretations, a more empathetic approach is necessary, which the narrative study enables. On frequent occasions, the act of narration also constitutes an opportunity to understand one's cultural identity in the process of self- or co-construction. As aptly captured by Gersten and Søderberg (2010, p. 250):

Aspects to focus on would include attempts at pinpointing the narrator's own identity constructions and shifts in these as well as his/her images of other cultures. Here, narratological analysis is able to throw some light on cultural identifications, alliances, and oppositions in the stories told by expatriates.

Additionally, to the hearer-researcher the narrative approach enables gaining insight into a very individual experience and its interpretation, and also understanding paths to personal meaning and sense.

For the reasons mentioned above, this research orientation and method, substantiated as an interview study, was assumed in the research whose methodology, conduct and findings are presented in what follows.

The research

This section investigates intercultural experience and its meaning making in two British expatriate academic teachers' stories (called Respondent 1 and 2, R1 and R2

respectively). Both of the respondents are single males whose native country is the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland. They are middle-aged academic teachers. R1 is younger and originally comes from England whereas R2's native land is Northern Ireland. R1 has stayed in Poland since the 1990s while R2 since 2005, which means most probably both of them have entered the stable stage of their acculturation in Poland. R2 emphasizes that he has not still decided to stay permanently in Poland, and even a few years ago he was still considering coming back to the UK. R1 has not settled for good yet either and he admits to be still in migration/transition. To illustrate, he spent three years in Poland, then came back to England for two years and arrived in Poland again. In fact, neither of the respondents rejects the possibility of returning to their home country in future. Finally, the significant difference between their backgrounds is that R2's sister used to live in Poland. Whereas R1 does not have any family member that lives or has lived in Poland.

As mentioned above, their intercultural experiences are explored by means of a structured interview. The interviews were conducted in English with both participants separately in one of the classrooms of the University of Gdańsk (Poland) in year 2015. They lasted about twenty minutes each. They were recorded and then transcribed. To facilitate data interpretation, the interviews were of the structured type (see Appendix). This was so also because the second author of the paper was a novice researcher so she needed a tool to standardize the questioning process. This standardization also helped to lessen the risk of the researcher bias, and thus to increase the reliability and validity of the findings (Dipboye, 1994, pp. 90–91). Finally, the questions were grouped to make the differences between the participants in chosen walks of life more visible.

The Study Aims and Research Questions

The main aim of the present research was to find out if, and how, the personal experience, character features and other individual factors affect culture shock of the study participants. The study had also a descriptive goal of portraying sufficiently their experience of living in the foreign country, here Poland. This is why the interview questions centered on the interviewees' private life and career. The following research questions were generated prior the commencement of the interviews. They relied on the previous research of the first author of this paper (Szczepaniak-Kozak, 2012a, p. 145):

RQ 1: How much were the respondents prepared to their stay in Poland?

RQ 2: What were their expectations of their stay in Poland?

RQ 3: What was their proficiency in the Polish language at the commencement of their stay?

RQ 4: What kind of cultural dissimilarities do they notice between British and Polish culture?

RQ 5: What kind of challenges did they experience during their stay in Poland?

RQ 6: What facilitated their acculturation in Poland?

Data Analysis

Below the collected data are analyzed following the research questions presented above.

RQ 1: Neither of the respondents declared being well prepared for their stay abroad. They were not familiar with Polish culture at the time of their arrival. R1 had some basic knowledge of historical facts as he had studied history. R2 does not recall reading any publications about Poland. Instead, he watched Polish movies, e.g., “The Decalogue” and “The man of marble” that depict some aspects of Polish culture and history. At that time he considered them depressing.

RQ 2: The respondents had different expectations of their stay in Poland. Both of them admit to having stereotyped Poland and Poles. R1’s words are:

Well, yes I suppose you know, when I first came... These first six months... I didn’t know I would stay longer and even when I left in 2008 I didn’t know I would come back again. I suppose I had some experiences before staying this time. I remember... even after these six months in Kielce which was a bit of the biggest shock, coming to Gdańsk was then much easier. Even after six months because I knew a little bit Polish, I was used to basic things like food and where to eat...you know, things like that. And mmm... it was... more... it can sound rude... it was more modern than I expected. I had some stereotypes about Eastern Europe, some of them are true but lots of them weren’t.

R2 responds:

I’d never been to Poland before I decided to stay. I didn’t know what to expect. I knew, people were telling me, to bring jeans, to sell them in the street and make a fortune. I knew that. I suspected that wasn’t true but I generally had no idea. I knew that the stereotypes couldn’t be all true and they weren’t. Some of them were, things like cheap vodka and people drinking vodka all the time.

Both R1 and R2 admit to have had some stereotypes but R1 was better informed about the Polish reality of those times. Therefore, he might have felt

more secure because when he decided to stay for a longer period, he was already quite accustomed to the life conditions in the host country.

RQ 3: When asked about their proficiency in the Polish language at the beginning of their stay in Poland, R1 answered that he had not learnt Polish before coming to Poland similarly to R2. He did an extensive summer course, but never studied over a longer period. In contrast to R1, R2 never did a language course, and instead relied on his sister for the first six months. All in all, neither of them is satisfied with their language skills in Polish or considers that communication in Polish is unproblematic to them.

RQ 4: Cultural similarities between the native and host country are perceived from quite a different perspective by each respondent. Although R1 notices some similarities between Polish and English culture, i.e., both are European, he stresses the fact that Eastern Europe and English speaking countries are still quite apart but not as much nowadays as it used to be, i.e., in 2005, when he came to Poland. Most probably, he means that cultural practices or heroes are becoming similar rather than deeper layers of cultural representations. R2 does not see any similarities and highlights that it was the exact reason why he chose Poland. He wanted to work in a place which is culturally different; on his own words (R2): "I think that was the idea to come to a place where I don't have to connect to the culture too much. I wanted to shut myself off."

RQ 5: As to challenges the respondents faced in their foreign environment, they both recalled stories about "little things" they had problems with. However, these experiences must have meant a lot to them since they have sunk into their memories. R1 recalls:

I was able to buy the tickets and communicate but I made a mistake with the preposition, it was quite funny, perhaps, but you know, it didn't stop me, or prevent, from buying the ticket. So these are quite small things, I think.

R2 recalls:

Little things like trying to cope in a shop, trying to buy normal things in a shop. I remember I had a friend who smoked as well at the time and we had a little moment of triumph when we bought what we call a flint for a lighter. The lighter stopped working and we realized that it was the little flint inside and we checked in a dictionary and it said "stone". So we would go to a *kiosk* and they would give us a brick but when we got what we were looking for we were both very happy but I would say it was quite childish, that little triumph, at that age of life.

As can be concluded from the participants' stories, the obstacles they came across concern shopping and communication but they did not treat them as

failures but rather as funny or anecdotal situations. As far as more serious difficulties with functioning in Poland are concerned, most of the time they stemmed from the respondents' poor language skills in Polish. To illustrate, R2 says:

Dealing with secretaries and practical things, going to the city hall and office where most people still don't speak English... these are big barriers to organizing your life. Socially it's not a problem because I mostly socialize with young Poles who speak good English but in practical terms... yeah, it's a big barrier for me – the language.

RQ 6: As to the factors, or rather agents, which/who facilitated their acculturation, both of the respondents admit that they were supported by a small circle of people. Similarly to the findings obtained by Szczepaniak-Kozak (2012a, p. 155), this research testifies to the argument that establishing a network of (new) friends enables successful daily existence. R1's words are:

Having colleagues who I worked with, English speaking colleagues, and I have, not at first, but now I have a Polish girlfriend who speaks perfect English. So, the biggest barrier is, I think, the language, of course. And having people to help you in practical situations with the language and organizing things makes a big difference... and explaining things sometimes. One of my colleagues helped, when I first arrived, he took me to the tax office to do my *PIT form* when I first arrived. And there were also things like that he helped me with. I couldn't have done these things without help, and you know, with basic Polish it's very difficult.

R2 recalls:

One, I had a sister here, two my job was in English. I lived in a *hotel asystencki* for two years so it wasn't really like living in Poland at all. Family bounds... my brother in law still, when I arrived, he still didn't speak English so I couldn't talk to him much. Then, when I did talk to him, I discovered that I didn't actually like him. People were generally friendly. Like everyone else, there were times when I paid too much for a taxi because they knew I was a foreigner and things like that. I think that living with other foreigners helped.

At the same time their stories indicate that personality features count as well. For example, R1 assumes a more open attitude towards the hosts and he wants to become a member of the host society by building relationships with new people. Although R1 perceives himself as an introvert and tends to avoid getting to know new people, he always tries to be friendly. R2 emphasizes that the way he copes with new situations and people depends on his estimation if he is going to like the person or not. When asked about the ability to face stressful situations, both men admitted that generally they can cope well then but, as R1 confesses, he

had to learn how to control his stress. These pieces of information support the widely-known tenet that the reactions to new situations experienced in an unknown environment, e.g., the host country, are conditioned by the sojourner's personality to a considerable degree. A quite important difference that can be observed between the two participants is their tolerance of the fact that they do not have a complete knowledge of how to behave in some situations. R1 mentions being embarrassed and feeling awkward quite often whereas R2 says, it depends on a particular situation but most of the time he does not take others' opinion of him to heart. Finally, both questioned men consider themselves to be people who can easily adapt to new situations. R1 admits to have learned how to be more flexible. This aspect of their personalities can be surely regarded as an important contributor to the success of their acculturation process in the new environment.

Summary of Findings

It can be deduced from the analysis presented above that the narrative approach enabled a considerable probe into the individual intercultural experience of the study participants. That could not have been achieved with the use of any other method. At the same time, the findings of the narrative interviews carried out by the authors seem to be compatible with the ecology metaphor in studying language acquisition as put forward by Kramsch (2002, p. 3). In her view, the ecology metaphor "captures the dynamic interaction between language users and the environment as between parts of a living organism, seems to offer a new way of bringing together frames from various disciplines to illuminate the complex relationship under investigation." This substantiates the way this research has been carried out. The respondents were namely asked questions regarding the relation between their own experiences and the situation they found themselves in.

At the same time the research findings presented in the previous section constitute another piece of evidence supporting the thesis that although certain symptoms of the respondents' culture shock are common, in fact personality and individual experiences leave their stamp on their way to acculturation in Poland. Each respondent answers each question in a different way, which is conditioned by his attitude, character features and individual factors. They give contrasting answers when asked about the connection between their native and host culture, things they dislike about the host culture, or factors that help them to assimilate.

One thing the respondents have in common is their understanding that most of their initial problems were related to their language incompetence in Polish. Similar findings were obtained by Szczepaniak-Kozak (2012a, p. 147–155) in her

study of female Dutch expatriates in Italy. Very quickly and rightly they attributed the causes of their initial failures to their low competence in the Italian language and unconsciously sensed that its mastery would enable them a more comfortable and peaceful life by controlling the events and people around them. Additionally, this way both these studies validate the rightness of the definition of interpersonal competence put forward by Wiemann and Kelly (1981, p. 292), i.e., “Interpersonal competence is essentially found in relational contexts in which individuals have sufficient power over their own actions and the actions of others that they may set, pursue, and achieve the interpersonal objectives deemed necessary for a mutually satisfying exchange with their social environment”. The above stands in agreement also with Kramsch’s (2002, p. 2) stance that language plays a significant role in the process of acculturation and social relationships:

The focus is not on the way symbolic systems are acquired, and grammatical and lexical paradigms are used to encode reality, but on the way language practices are organized within members of a community of language users. As novice members learn from more expert members how to use language accurately and appropriately, they enact social relationships and other sociocultural phenomena that will make them into expert members (ibid.).

Although Kramsch (2002, p. 2) points out that there is a difference between language socialization and acquisition, its influence on the assimilation process is still visible: “Whereas the success of language socialization is full acculturation and assimilation into the language-speaking community, the success of language acquisition is full mastery of the linguistic and communicative aspects of the language, not primarily assimilation into the relevant speech community.” This is evident in our respondents. They do not evaluate their own language skills in Polish as good enough to successfully function on the everyday basis in Poland, which adds to their dissatisfaction with their level of adjustment to the new environment. It is evident that from the beginning of their stay they realized that they were greatly dependent on the people surrounding them, and that in order to manage everyday life, they needed their support, advice or at least their favor.

Final Remarks

Today short or long stays abroad for professional or educational reasons have become a part of life of a growing number of people virtually from all corners of the world. From an individual perspective, i.e., that of an expatriate, the stay abroad is a critical life experience. The same applies to local persons in contact with the foreigner. In the majority of cases the greatest problems come from the

involved persons' inability to understand the value system, the worldview of the other or to apply a different perspective, i.e., from differences in cognitive aspects. Such an interpretation is becoming almost a cliché nowadays but despite the fact that the related notions are so difficult to define, they appear in multiple studies as the ones which constitute the greatest barrier (cf. quantitative, longitudinal research results by Ward & Kennedy, 1999). Right after these come problems related to communication and daily functioning, e.g., organizing one's stay abroad, daily chores and dealing with matters in institutions, especially administrative, educational, health and financial ones.

It has been demonstrated in this paper how the narrative approach can be applied to provide insight into expatriates' cultural encounters and their process of culture learning. This should always be done with a word of caution, i.e., as researchers we can never be sure to what extent the narration we have been told has been modified or rationalized, consciously or unconsciously. This is why the present authors realize that they are not entitled to put forward any definite or generalizing conclusions to the research basing on the limited empirical material gathered. This is probably the greatest weakness of the presented methodological practice. The data obtained are very individual in character and prohibit drawing inferences or speculations with regard to how much common the cases studied are typical of greater populations. Part of this lack of authorization lies in the nature of the narrative as a research method. This is to say that narratives will always be concentrated on unique experience of an individual, which escapes easy categorizations. However, the narrative approach stood the test and proved it can provide a very deep insight into ongoing human experience, which cannot be rightly measured or portrayed by the more traditional scientific method.

References

- Adler, P. S. (1975). The transitional experience: An alternative view of culture shock. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology, 15*(4), 13-23.
- Bochner, A. P. (1994). Perspectives on inquiry II: Theories and stories. In: M. L. Knapp, & G.R. Miller. (Eds.), *Handbook of interpersonal communication* (pp. 21-41). Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Dipboye, R. L. (1994). Structured and unstructured selection interview: Beyond the job-fit model. *Research in Personnel and Human Resources Management 12*, 79-123.
- Gesteland, R. (1999). *Różnice kulturowe a zachowania w biznesie. Marketing, zarządzanie i negocjacje w różnych kulturach*. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo Naukowe PWN S.A.
- Hall, E. T. (1959/1980). *The silent language*. Garden City, New York: Doubleday.
- Hampden-Turner C. & A. Trompenaars (2000). *Siedem kultur kapitalizmu*. Kraków: Dom Wydawniczy ABC.

- Hoepfl, M. C. (1997). Choosing qualitative research: A primer for technology education researchers. *Journal of Technology Education*, 9(1), 47-63.
- Hofstede, G. (1997). *Cultures and organizations. Software of the mind*. London: McGraw Hill.
- Hofstede, G., & G. J. Hofstede (2005) *Cultures and organizations. Software of the mind*. New York, San Francisco, Washington: McGraw-Hill.
- Gersten, M., & A.-M., Søderberg (2010). Expatriate stories about cultural encounters: A narrative approach to cultural learning process in multinational companies. *Scandinavian Journal of Management*, 26, 248-257.
- Johnson B., & L. Christiansen (2008). *Educational research: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Kosic A. (2006). Personality and individual factors in acculturation. In: D. L. Sam, & J. W. Berry (Eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of acculturation psychology* (pp. 113–128). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kramsch, C. (2002). *Language acquisition and language socialization. Ecological perspectives*. London, New York: Continuum
- Mikułowski-Pomorski, J. (2006). *Jak narody porozumiewają się ze sobą w komunikacji międzykulturowej i komunikowaniu medialnym*. Kraków: Universitas.
- Oberg, K. (1954). *Culture shock*. Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill.
- Seelye, H., & A. Seelye-James (1995). *Culture clash*. Lincolnwood: NTC Business Books.
- Strauss, A., & J. Corbin (1990). *Basics of qualitative research*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Szczepaniak-Kozak, A. (2007). The phenomenon of culture shock. *Licentiatas, (VIII)*, 43-51.
- Szczepaniak-Kozak, A. (2011). Cross-cultural communication in a profit oriented institution: A case study of a foreign investment company in Poland. In: C. Badstübner-Kizik (Ed.), *Posener Beiträge zur Angewandten Linguistik* (pp. 121-134). Berlin: Peter Lang.
- Szczepaniak-Kozak, A. (2012a). The narrative approach: The individual perspective in intercultural meetings. In: Lorenzo-Modia, M. J., & A. Szczepaniak-Kozak (Eds.), *From life to text: Building linguistic and cultural identity* (pp. 128-158). La Corunna, Piła: Wydawnictwo PWSZ w Pile.
- Szczepaniak-Kozak, A. (2012b). Constructing the picture of linguistic reality: An overview of research methods in applied linguistics. *Garozza. Revista de la Sociedad Española de Estudios Literarios de Cultura Popular*, 12, 189-202.
- Szczepaniak-Kozak, A. (2014). Languaging a sojourner's experience: Narrative accounts of learning a foreign language abroad. In: Lankiewicz, H., & E. Wąsikiewicz-Firlej (Eds.), *Languaging experiences: Learning and teaching revisited* (pp. 130-156). Newcastle upon Tyne, UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Van der Zee, K., & J. Van Oudenhoven (2001). The multicultural personality questionnaire: Reliability and validity of self and other ratings of multicultural effectiveness. *Journal of Research in Personality*, 35, 278-288.

- Ward, C., & Kennedy A. (1999). The measurement of sociocultural adaptation. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 23: 4, 459-677.
- Wiemann, J. M., & Kelly C. W. (1981). Pragmatics of interpersonal competence. In: C. Wilder-Mott, & J. H. Weakland (Eds.), *Rigor and imagination* (pp. 283-297). New York: Praeger.

Appendix

The narrative session questions

- RQ 1: Were you familiar with Polish culture before you came to Poland?
- RQ 2: Had you been to Poland before you decided to stay? What are the differences between what you had expected and what you found in Poland?
- RQ 3: When did you start learning Polish? How do you evaluate your knowledge of Polish? How do you evaluate your communication skills in Polish?
- RQ 4: How much is your native culture similar to that of Poland?
- RQ 5: Did you have any cultural experiences at the beginning of your stay in Poland that are worth telling? Do you think that the knowledge of Polish makes the assimilation process in Poland easier and raises the feeling of society affiliation?
- RQ 6: What factors/agents facilitated your assimilation? How do you cope with new situations and new people? How do you feel and react? How do you react to stress? Can you face stressful situations with composure?

Direct Method as an alternative to “coursebook teaching” in a contemporary language classroom

Summary

Teaching foreign languages has for years been dominated by coursebooks, which can and are treated as separate methods. Except being very useful and comfortable tools, because on the one hand coursebooks provide teachers with a ready-made set of activities, and on the other save the time required for lesson preparation to the minimum, coursebooks pose a very dangerous threat, depriving teachers of their creativity and students of their individuality. In his chapter, the author tries to situate his own experience with direct techniques within the realm of contemporary language teaching. His intention is to redefine the concept of method in the context modern classroom, as well as to recommend a recovery of the not-so-forgotten direct techniques in tandem with physical exercise of TPR.

Keywords: Direct method, TPR, postmethod, coursebook, GTM, Audiolingualism

Introduction

Every coursebook is a blessing in disguise. On the one hand, it gives us, teachers, a ready-made set of materials, easily applicable in a sequence of classes. On the other hand, however, in it lies a huge temptation to fall in a rut in our work and become overdependent on the activities neatly presented in coursebooks. Also, every coursebook has a predictable, step-by-step structure, which in consequence may contribute to students' feeling of boredom.

In the following chapter, we suggest an alternative to coursebooks and a stable, or at least occasional recourse to Direct Method, together with TPR techniques. This suggestion is based on an observation, that even in a contemporary classroom, those 'old' teaching mechanisms can find their place.

Audiolingualism as a “mother” of contemporary methods

The word method has its origin in ancient Greek and means a path. A method, in general, is a conscious use of specific tools oriented to perform a certain task. A teaching method covers various activities of both a teacher and students, which results in an understanding of new issues and getting at least basic skills associated with the issues (Okoń 1992, p. 3).

For years, language specialists have sought ways to create the most efficient methods. In the sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, students had to study the Latin language in schools (Richards and Rodgers 1999, p. 3). The general approach during the times was teaching Latin grammar and translation. Teachers in their school work focused on aspects of translation, grammar rules and writing short texts. With this method, the classes consisted simply in memorizing grammar and spelling rules explained by the teacher, so the student could translate classical texts. Furthermore, long vocabulary lists were learned and translated. Grammar was taught deductively. The skills developed were reading and writing. The teacher used the students' mother tongue (L1) and not the target language (L2). Thus, the teacher was the authority and students were relegated to a passive role.

Several attempts to introduce alternative methods in teaching the Latin language were proposed; however, the Grammar-Translation Method dominated the teaching of foreign languages from the 1840s to the 1940s (Richards, J. C. and Rodgers, T. S. 1999, p. 6). Although its primary focus is to teach writing and reading, not communication, interestingly, Grammar-Translation Method is used in some parts of the world also nowadays.

In the twentieth century, with the development of transportation and escalation of international contacts, communication became increasingly more important than text comprehension in language teaching. At the time the first conversation books arose. The creation in 1886 of the International Phonetic Association contributed positively to support oral language teaching of L2. Furthermore, spoken language became the subject of vital concern of scholars, as well as teaching was conducted through conversation and dialogue practice.

The Audiolingual Method, also known as Army Method, emerged in the US during World War II. In this method, new content was presented through spoken language. Work with oral utterances was mostly based on repetitive memorization and assimilation of structures. Intonation, pronunciation, rhythm and accent were also stressed, making the student speak identically to a native. Errors were avoided at all costs. After listening skills were mastered, oral production was worked on, and only later writing was taught.

Three aspects were present in this method: linguistic structuralism, as linguists previously selected content provided by native informants and presented it in a specific sequence. Content was graded according to the principles of the strong version of contrastive analysis of languages, very popular at the time. Audiolingualism was also influenced by behaviorism, which is based on the premise that learning occurs primarily through the process of mechanical habit formation and, finally, by the educational technicality, supported by the technical resources appearing to assist in listening and repetition of the selected content.

With the advent of Audiolingual Method, many other methods were created, mostly having some things in common, especially the theory of language and theory of language learning. Similarly, the contemporary focus of these methods is not on grammar and translation, but on communication. According to Douglas Brown (2002, p. 9), “[...] the method is a unified set of techniques to be generalized across a wide variety of contexts and audiences”. In this view, methods are developed a priori. Brown also declares that a method is quite defined at the beginning, but during its progress becomes less clear. In reaction to this conception of the method, the author proposes a principled approach in which teaching techniques are based on the context and on well-established principles of language teaching and learning beyond a particular method.

The role and work with a coursebook as an autonomous method in the context of contemporary foreign language teaching

In recent times, there has been developed the concept of postmethod. In short, the concept refers to a situation when the teacher does not use a particular method to teach foreign languages, but the teacher elaborates, as Martin Peris (2009, p. 43) says, theories, practices and effective learning techniques on his own and in his own specific context of teaching. Here we face a critical, autonomous teacher, trained to spontaneously plan instruction and to improvise on the spot.

The postmethod brought greater coherence to the principles developed by the communicative language teaching: students were seen as protagonist in the learning process, the social dimension of learning was stressed. Also, the classroom was a perfect space for enhancing communication and learning skills, attention to the interaction needs of students was attracted, etc.

Kumaravadivelu (1994, p. 29) suggests that while a method is defined by a unique set of theoretical principles and a single set of classroom procedures imposed on classroom teachers, the postmethod is known as the development of a single set of classroom practices the by teachers themselves, adapted to their own

identities, teaching styles, and most importantly, designed to suit the specific context in which they teach.

Somewhere between the two extremes, a particular method and a postmethod, a coursebook is located, as a tool used to teach foreign languages. A coursebook in the teaching of foreign languages has been the teaching basis for teachers worldwide. The literature on the use of textbooks is abundant. Also, there has been considerable debate among educators and experts about the role of textbooks. According to Hutchinson and Torres (1994, p. 315-328), the role of books in times of change is invaluable. Textbooks can serve as an instrument of modifications and alterations to classroom teachers. In short, a book gives teachers and students a core for teaching and learning. On the other hand, ensures methodological support and opportunities for review and preparation classes.

One of the principal problems with coursebooks nowadays, is that many teachers tend to work more with it than with other educational resources. Simancas (1998, p. 78) believes that in most cases schoolwork is based on a textbook – they are seen as representatives of knowledge within the pedagogical action.

Moreover, the use of a coursebook in teaching foreign languages has many other disadvantages. First, textbooks undermine teacher autonomy. It is common for teachers to base their schoolwork too much on coursebooks. Furthermore, coursebooks are used without reflection and book activities are not alternated with activities from other sources, to adjust teaching to the individual needs of students. Our observations show that many teachers use books too strictly. Richards (1998, p. 125-140) notes that this turns teaching into a very controlled process, depriving teachers of their abilities. Similarly, flexibility and spontaneity are reduced and teachers often lose their skills and creativity. Furthermore, textbooks have the same format unit after unit. As a result, teachers teach the same types of activities and tasks in the same order. This quickly degenerates into boring and repetitive classes, with the students becoming gradually apathetic and bored with learning.

Each class is unique, and that's probably the most important aspect that should be accounted for before the right choice of teaching materials is made. A class consists of a number of individuals with different skills and experiences. Therefore, only the teachers themselves should be responsible for the exploitation of material in their classes. Each student is different in terms of attention, motivation and needs. An activity or piece of material that is particularly appropriate for one student, may not be suitable for another.

The Direct Method – a historical outline and a modern application

Lambert Sauveur (1826-1907) developed with his friend Gottlieb Hennes a French course called Hennes-Sauveur course. That course was based on two ideas: the questions asked during the course must have been genuine and cohesive (Hawatt, 1984, p. 201). Also, one question resulted in another; students learned from the context and predicted the course of a conversation. Sauveur said that the foreign language could be taught without translation or use of the native language if the meaning was transmitted directly through demonstration and action. These principles provide the basis for what became to be known as the Direct Method.

The method became well known in the United States through its use by Sauveur and Maximilian Berlitz in commercial language schools. The cardinal principles of Direct Method are:

- classroom instruction was carried out exclusively in the target language,
- only everyday vocabulary and sentences were used,
- communication skills were built around carefully graded questions and answers exchanged between teachers and students, in small and very intensive classes,
- grammar was taught through induction,
- new language items were introduced orally,
- vocabulary was taught specifically through the use of action (also mimics, drawings, etc.),
- correct grammar and pronunciation were stressed,
- teachers always had to be native speakers of the language taught.

Although the method was criticized, on the one hand for the absence of a theoretical and methodological solid base, on the other, because of the obligatory participation of a native teacher and the use of target language, Direct Method paved the way for a more communicative approach and represented an important step forward in the history of language education. Direct Method resulted in the Audiolingual Method, which gained popularity after the Second World War and which we have mentioned above, at the beginning of the chapter.

Interestingly, although Direct Method has evolved over time in other methods based on the new theories of language and language acquisition, this method has not totally disappeared. In the 1960s, Robin Callan developed Callan Method in England. The method is based on an approach that is very similar to Audiolingual Method; mainly the behaviorist approach, which sees language

acquisition as a mechanical process in which the language is considered to a structure. Judging by the number of websites advertising the method, it still remains very popular, especially in Poland, England and Italy. Among the similarities between the Callan Method and Direct Method, there is a development of grammar skills in an inductive way, development of oral skills through teacher – student question-answer exchanges, language learning is seen as an imitation of mother tongue learning.

A few years ago, Blended Learning System was created in Poland as a direct development of the Callan Method. The similarity between the Callan Method and BLS is so great, that it is possible to consider BLS an extension of the Callan Method. The changes introduced to BLS are based on several additional features, such as an e-learning platform, updated vocabulary, and more student-friendly grammar explanations.

Although Direct Method has developed into several other teaching phenomena, it is also present in its pure form in various schools of foreign languages not only in Poland but also in Spain and other countries. Underneath there is a Direct Method advertisement present on a webpage of a language school from Spain:

The Direct Method of learning foreign languages is not very known and used in our city but has more than 100 years old and is used worldwide. It is a method used correctly, is efficient, accurate, fast and effective way to learn to manage in different languages in an increasingly globalized world.

Our teaching team has been working with this method in several Spanish cities years. Given the many advantages of the method, we have implemented in our center of San Sebastian, where we are pioneers in this methodology. This method works that language from an oral approach. We teach students to English comunicarseen. However, we also provide support for those students who want to work on grammar. This method is valid for any level of English (La Academia de Idiomas).

A different example is a quote from a website of a foreign language school in Chile:

In BridgeEnglish™ we use a communicative approach and a direct approach in all our classes. This allows our students and teachers to think and communicate in English, without translation involved. With our "English Only Policy", our students learn English quickly and naturally (Bridge English – English language Center).

Finally, following is a website that advertises Direct Method used in a language school in Colombia:

Fortunately, there is now a much better way to learn English as a second language. Using DIRECT METHOD FOR ENGLISH you can learn English quickly and easily, with the great advantage that the vocabulary will not be forgotten. Knowing vocabulary, sentence construction is easy and you can learn English in a fraction of the time compared to traditional methods of teaching.

The Direct Method of teaching foreign languages, also known as natural method, based on the principle of teaching the language through the exclusive use of the language studied (Aviation English).

Combining Direct Method and physical exercise as a direct technique in vocabulary teaching

One of the techniques most commonly used to teach new vocabulary is the presentation of isolated words. It is also popular to request students to repeat each word, often several times, immediately after introducing the word. These techniques are not efficient, as Shaw Nicolás Gynan says:

When introducing new vocabulary, it must be remembered to present it in full, simple and short sentences. The words presented should be related to some semantic fields (movements, animals, furniture, clothing, tools, and cutlery). This makes the language easier to acquire. The first example given has to do with animals, so that it is a thematic unit (translated from Spanish by Łukasz Kępczyński. Gynan S. N. 71).

Direct Method has as its main objective the avoidance of translation and grammatical explanation in the mother tongue. Not that the translation itself is bad, but if you have to translate what is presented in the target language (L2), it means that the student cannot understand it, consequently indicating that the language level is too advanced to facilitate the acquisition of the tongue. This would be a violation of the PRINCIPLE $i + 1$, proposed by Krashen (1985), in which the information presented in the second language (represented by i) should be only slightly more advanced than the current level of student knowledge. Overuse of translation can make students attend less to the information presented, since he knows that there will be a further explanation. The result may be that students pay less attention to what is said in the target language, which is a waste of time.

As Norbert Schmitt writes (2000, p. 135), the use of physical exercise helps evocate and learn vocabulary. Asher (1977) developed this concept into a full methodology, which is particularly suitable for teaching beginners.

TPR (Total Physical Response) is based on the theory that students are able to learn a language naturally, whether it is a native language or foreign languages.

Babies learn their first language through conversation with their parents. Parents talk to their children and children assimilate what their parents say to them, physically reacting to their instructions. Then, when children have received sufficient input and are ready, start to “play” with the language themselves. According to this TPR, teachers instruct students and they react with body movements. It is said to be effective because students can concentrate on listening to instructions, and are not required to speak, so that new structures are easier to assimilate.

A typical TPR activity could include instructions such as "walk up to the door", "open the door", "sit down", etc. Students have to carry out the instructions physically. There is a good chance that the activities can be both entertaining and stimulating at the same time.

It is also obvious that children like to move during the learning process. However, in order not to discourage them, the teacher, when introducing new vocabulary, needs to pronounce it clearly and slowly.

A series of very basic activities that combine Direct Method and physical exercise can start with the teacher standing up and saying "get up". This is the presentation of a phrase to learn. Secondly, the teacher says: "Get up" and while saying it, he stands up together with the students. This stage is called practice. The final stage is called verification, in which the teacher tells students: "stand up" and using his hands makes students stand up.

As a follow-up, students need to start talking. Using the example of *getting up*, the teacher can ask students a series of open and closed questions. The first question might be: “Are we getting up?”, and while rising, all students answer: "Yes, we are getting up". Then, after a previous introduction of the word *sit down*, the teacher says: “Are we sitting down or are we standing up?”. The students respond: "we are getting up". An example of an open question might be: "what are we doing", followed by the students responding: "We are getting up".

We can without much difficulty teach a foreign language directly, without translation or grammatical explanation in the mother tongue. At first, the teacher can name objects in the classroom. It is a simple activity, but requires preparation. Each new word is best presented in a grammatical structure. Some teachers prefer to present the words in isolation, something that does not help the student acquire syntax. Another advantage of having the words in grammatical structures is that the student learns the word in a context.

All the objects in the classroom must be named, so an environment conducive to learning is created in the target language. The objects in the classroom can be taught directly, thus avoiding the native language. From time to time it can be necessary to translate a word or phrase into the mother tongue,

especially at the beginning, but the goal should be to develop an understanding directly in the target language.

Once the objects and people in the classroom have been named, the teacher can diversify the linguistic universe by presenting concepts or objects from outside the classroom through drawings and photographs. In schools, where there are technological means, we have access to images via the Internet, but there are places where such means are not yet available.

The teacher still has options that are not very costly. Many schools have gardens with plants and trees. It is important to leave the classroom and include a full linguistic analysis of the phenomena that are available to see and touch. For students it is a ludic experience and significantly contributes to their linguistic and cognitive development.

To teach students the world beyond their school, the teacher can collect magazines and cut out images. Also children themselves can draw images on sheets of paper. These can serve to introduce into the classroom object names that are not within the school building. The image file can be composed of folders with labels of semantic categories, such as "people", "animals", "feelings" and so on.

Tracy Terrell (Jack C. Richards, Theodore S. Rodgers, 2001, p. 166), as a professional well familiar with the natural approach, also eager to use direct techniques, was an advocate of the image file and used it in his workshops, as he taught Greek to his students effectively. An important advantage that images have is that they can be used as tools for direct learning.

Unfortunately, there are weaknesses inherent in this approach. First, from a purely practical point of view, it is very unlikely that a teacher can attract the students' attention for more than a few minutes, before the activities become repetitive and tedious for students. Secondly, it is very difficult to give instructions without using the imperative, so the language input is largely limited to this unique formula. Thirdly, the relevance of some of the structures used in TPR activities to the student's needs in the real world is questionable. Finally, the transition from a listening and responding stage to oral production could be feasible in a small group of students, but seems to be problematic when applied to a class of 30 students, for example.

In defense of the approach, however, it should be emphasized that it was never the intention of its first creators to extend it beyond beginner level. Also, it is not to be expected that a course designed around the principles of TPR follows an exclusive program; as Asher himself suggested, TPR should be used in conjunction with other methods and techniques. In terms of the theoretical basis of the approach, the idea of listening before speaking, and the students speaking

only when they are ready, resembles elements of the Natural Method developed by Stephen Krashen (Widodo, 2004, p. 241).

Conclusions

Although Direct Method was developed years ago, it seems likely that, given some changes and improvements, it can still be successfully used in a contemporary class. On the one hand, there is our own experience with the Direct Method, which has been an important element of our teaching endowment for many years now. For many students, it has been the only way of instruction we have used. Although we have seen that some students appeal more to traditional, coursebook education, many students have considered Direct Method to be the only method they wanted to work with. Furthermore, our experience is based only on teaching adults using Direct Method. As we have written earlier, one of the main premises of Direct Method is that we learn in a natural way, the same way children learn their mother tongue. While learning a language, we first listen, then speak, read and finally write. If this is a true premise, in all probability children should respond better to direct techniques than adults, because the gap between the time they learned their mother tongue and the time they learn L2 is much lower than in adults.

References

- Aviation English, <http://www.aviationenglishcolombia.com/Metodo-Directo27.php> (accessed March 19, 2015).
- Bridge English – English Language Center, <http://www.bridgeenglish.cl/metodologia> (accessed March 10, 2015).
- Brown, D. H., 2002. *English language teaching in the "post-method" era: Toward better diagnosis, treatment and assessment*. In Richards, J. C. and W. A. Renandya, (Eds.), *Methodology in language teaching* (pp. 9-18). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gyanon, S. N., *Metodología de Enseñanza de Lenguas: Teoría y Práctica*, <http://myweb.facstaff.wvu.edu/sngynan/methods.pdf> (accessed March 26, 2015).
- Harmer, J., 2007. *The Practice of English Language Teaching*. Longman – Pearson Education.
- Howatt, A. P. R., 1984. *A History of English Language Teaching*. Oxford University Press. Oxford.
- Hutchinson, T. and Torres, E., 1994. *The textbook as agent of change*. *ELT Journal* 48.4:315-328.
- Krashen, S. D., 1985. *The Input Hypothesis: Issues and Implications*, New York: Longman.

- Kumaravadivelu, B., 1994. *The postmethod condition: Emerging strategies for Second/foreign language teaching*. TESOL Quarterly, 28, 27-48.
- La Academia de Idiomas, <http://www.laacademiaidiomas.com> (accessed March 19, 2015).
- Okoń, W., 1992. *Słownik pedagogiczny*. Warszawa: PWN.
- Peris, M., 2009. *Los modelos pedagógicos y la praxis en el aula*. Simposio 25 años de ELE, organizado por el Instituto Cervantes en Madrid.
- Richards, J. C. and Rodgers, T. S., 2001. *Approaches and Methods in Language Teaching*. Cambridge University Press.
- Shmitt, N., 2000. *Vocabulary in Language Teaching*. Cambridge University Press.
- Simanicas, K., 1998. *Algunos Criterios para el análisis de textos escolares de Geografía*. Revista.
- Widodo, H. P., 2004. *Pengajaran English for Young Learners (EYL) melalui Games, Nursery Rhymes, Songs, and Storytelling*. TEKNOBEL.

Teachers' professional competence: FL teacher education in Poland

Summary

Teaching is one of the professions in which professional development is crucial. A successful teacher is the one who realizes the complexity of the didactic processes and understands that the teacher's role is not only restricted to performing in front of the class and transmitting the knowledge to a group of their students, but it is rather their constant quest for their higher competence and better pedagogical, linguistic and extra-linguistic skills. Successful teaching, finally, is a continuous improvement and the development of creative thinking and acting in both the teachers and the students. This article is to lead all readers to asking themselves a question whether teachers are born or made. Hopefully, the readers will also be led to a reflection whether the Polish system of FL teacher training is sufficient.

Keywords: education, teachers, teacher-training, higher education, competences, professionalism

Introduction

Innovation, a constant need for better, more efficient ways of teaching and a constant quest for a higher competence characterise the teaching profession. It is generally known that new methods usually set new principles and open new perspectives in human education and human development. The teachers do not only take responsibility for their own professional actions, but also for the general development of their students in the area of the teachers' subjects. In this article teachers' professional competence will be discussed followed by a short discussion on how the FL teacher education is organized in Poland.

Teachers' professional competence

In any profession one needs 'professional competence' (Wallace, 1991, p. 58, Wilczyńska, 2002, p. 74). In the case of teachers the spectrum of necessary competences is large, especially that as Woźniewicz (1986, p. 249 as cited in Szalek 2004, p. 73) notices, a good teacher must be a good actor to manage the classroom

activities. Such a teacher possesses adaptation skills as well as paralinguistic and extra-linguistic skills that enable them to play different roles depending on the classroom needs. Małgorzata Taraszkiewicz (1996) adds that a teacher uses not only their competence in the professional work, but also their personality. She believes that teacher education that is focused on the development of methodological competence needs to give priority to the development of creative thinking and creative acting.

Komorowska (1978, p. 145) notices that the fundamental elements of the FL teaching profession are a teacher's charisma and their professional competence that consists of pedagogical skills and fluency in a foreign language since these aspects of their competence affect different aspects of a student's personality. And thus Komorowska (1978, p. 145) claims that while a teacher's pedagogical skills take responsibility for a student's cognitive development connected with language competence, a teacher's fluency in the foreign language is responsible for a student's affective growth. Komorowska (1999, p. 82) elaborates on this issue, yet the competences that Polish teachers are expected to gain in the process of their training will be described in detail in section 3.5., in which the teacher education system in Poland is presented.

Wallace (1991, p. 58) also uses the term '*professional competence*' indicating that it may be approached from two perspectives. The first understanding of 'professional competence' is purely formal and refers to the possession of the minimum requirements necessary to perform certain professional tasks. Explaining that term in the light of the teaching profession, it describes the competence gained following a teacher education course, and proved by a relevant certificate. "In this sense 'professional competence' is a fixed hurdle; once it has been successfully passed over, there is no going back on it except in very exceptional circumstances" (Wallace 1991, p. 58). Therefore Wallace (1991, p. 58) suggests that this certificate-proved competence, also referred to as 'professional adequacy' should be called '*initial competence*' which he also metaphorically compares with a point of departure. Wysocka (2003, p. 11), who agrees with Wallace (1991) upon the definition of 'professional competence', clarifies that professional competence should be treated in terms of a dynamic process which only starts when a young and inexperienced teacher enters the teaching profession.

The other type of professional competence that Wallace (1991, p. 58) distinguishes is "*a moving target or a horizon, towards which professional travel all their professional life but which is never finally attained*". He makes clear that in this sense competence is no longer only adequacy or proficiency in a given teaching field, but it is 'expertise'. Moreover, Wallace (1991, p. 58) indicates a number of variables that shape this competence, among which there are society's

expectations, the examination system and requirements, the school curriculum, methodology and the teacher's private interests and sense of responsibility. Therefore teacher's competence should also cover techniques on how to develop their initial competence.

Peter James (2001, p. 4-5) claims that what makes a teacher an effective and competent professional are professional knowledge, professional skills, attitudes to teaching and education. Although the author concentrates mainly on primary and secondary school language teachers, and treats higher education teachers marginally, he claims that all teachers have professional knowledge on entering a teacher training programme. According to James (2001, p. 4-5) this knowledge is made of implicit and tacit 'personal theories'. To explain the term he quotes Tann's (1993, p. 55) definition of the concept, according to which such personal theories are a "*set of beliefs, values, understandings, assumptions – the ways of thinking about the teaching profession*" (Tann 1993, p. 55 in James 2001, p. 4).

James (2001, p. 5) believes that personal theories play a crucial role in a teacher's professional output. First of all, personal theories let teachers analyse their experience from the past and current professional life. Secondly, they influence teachers' actions in the classroom. Finally, personal theories are responsible for a teacher's comprehension of 'public theory', that Eraut (1994, p. 70) and James (2001, p. 5) perceive as the network of ideas or principles either widely presented in books and critical literature or presented and spoken about in the class, which in the case of FL teachers refer to what a language is and how it is learned by students.

Teacher's competence also covers a wide range of skills, among which one can distinguish subject matter skills, methodological skills, social and decision-making skills and, last but not least, enabling skills (James 2001, p. 5-6).

James (2001, p. 5) notices that "*Subject matter skills, such as language competence, or the use of the target language in class, are self-evidently of vital importance for language teachers*". He adds that although language teachers pay a great deal of attention to their language competence, their methodological skills, covering lesson planning, students' error correction, and so on are equally important. However, a teacher's competence also depends on social skills, particularly encouraged by social constructivist principles, by which we mean interactive skills. Finally, a teacher's competence would not be complete without enabling and decision-making skills. While by the former we understand skills "which facilitate career-long teacher learning" (James, 2001, p. 7), the later are preoccupied with the constant need to take decisions. In fact the question of enabling skills is also analysed by Eraut (1994, p. 73), who believes that a teacher

needs to be equipped with an ability to theorise, which is crucial for the improvement of teaching practice.

While Wallace (1991, p. 58) uses the term '*professional competence*', from a Polish background Werbińska (2004, p. 15) operates the term 'professional knowledge' and claims that this lies at the root of the teaching profession. Although we can see some parallels between James's (2001) and Wallace's (1991) and her points of view, Werbińska (2004, p. 15-27) in fact states that a teacher's knowledge is complex as it is supported by such scientific disciplines as linguistics, psycholinguistics, psychology and pedagogy, and in consequence it comprises numerous types of knowledge: linguistic, methodological, psychological and pedagogical, normative, experiential and general knowledge. Though Werbińska (2004, p. 15) admits that the scientist have not reached any consensus concerning the exact constituents of a teacher's knowledge, Jastrzębska (2005, p. 102) notices that a teacher's profession demands multidimensional and interdisciplinary competence as it involves the interaction of different types of knowledge as well as differentiated types of skills.

What some methodologists call 'competences', others may describe as 'skills'. Giving those terms a more global view, they all describe the features, behaviour and our expectations of a good teacher. As stated by Komorowska (2005, p. 114) a good FL teacher is characterised by good interaction and pedagogical skills, and both good language and FL teaching skills. A skilled teacher is friendly and praises students rather than criticises them. Komorowska (2005, p. 114-115) adds.

Marek Szalek (2004, p. 71, 72) following Witt (1987, p. 34) states that apart from theoretical knowledge a FL teacher needs perceptual, communicative and organizational skills. According to Szalek (2004, p. 72) one of the most crucial communicative skills is teacher's ability to operate their voice characterised by marking the moods and emotions of speech as well as choosing the right pace of speech. This, however, he admits, strictly depends on a teacher's fluency in the foreign language, which, as he further clarifies, also affects the atmosphere in the classroom as the teacher with high language competence is self-confident, fluent and their competence builds in students the sense of success as they understand the fluent foreign speech.

Szalek (2004, p. 73) additionally concentrates on novice teachers and suggests that an important competence that teachers should have, but often miss at the beginning of their career is the knowledge of 'teacher's talk' which stands for the typical classroom phrases necessary to conduct a foreign language class.

The Council of Europe (Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, teaching, assessment, p. 144) suggests that teacher should moreover realise that importance is given to numerous aspects of their profession

including teaching skills, classroom management skills, teaching styles, knowledge and ability to convey sociocultural information, intercultural attitudes and skills, and, what has not been mentioned by any methodologist so far, an ability to handle students' individuality.

From a Polish background graduate teacher's competences were defined by Antoni Dębski (2002, p. 259) who claims that a professional teacher needs to be equipped in four competences that prepare him for different social roles. The competences expected by Dębski (2002, p. 259) cover the following: fluency in the foreign language, competence in teaching a foreign language, translation competence and intercultural competence.

The spectrum of teachers' competences is expected to be broad and versatile. One of the competences that should characterize a teacher, and a FL teacher in particular, is intercultural competence which helps teachers produce interculturally competent students.

Zawadzka (2004) and Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007) agree that according to recent trends in teacher education, teachers should be equipped with intercultural competence, and turning a teacher into a cultural mediator is one of the duties of the system.

To wrap our discussion up let us follow the observation by Alfes (1982, p. 25), Grigorian (1984, p. 77), Woźniewicz (1987, p. 61) and Szalek (2004, p. 73) who express their conviction that a teacher's competence in the foreign language builds students respect for the teacher and the prestige which professional teachers may be given by students and society.

FL teacher education in Poland

In Poland a significant growth of interest in foreign languages and FL education was largely dictated by the country's political and social transformation initiated in 1989. The early 1990s brought interest in West-European languages resulting in an enormous demand for foreign language teachers. In consequence much attention was given to professional skills and abilities that teachers were supposed to have in order to supply Polish schools and students with an efficient FL education (Zawadzka 2004, p. 57).

It does not mean though that before the turning-point of our country's political history FL education was neglected. Lucyna Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2005, p. 39) notices that foreign language teacher education in Poland is rooted in the philological education provided by the universities, which in the 1990s was enriched with a new model of education referred to as 'training' that concentrated mainly on the thorough methodological training of future FL teachers. She

believes that the introduction of the new 'training' model significantly affected teacher education in Poland because it incorporated the forms of education already used in universities such as lectures, seminars and practical classes, a novelty in a form of workshops focused on activating students was introduced.

However, it is necessary to state that regardless of the political situation or ideologies, Poland, like other European countries search for optimal FL teachers' training procedures (Aleksandrowicz-Pędich 2007, p. 41).

Elżbieta Zawadzka (2004, p. 58) critically approaches the Polish education system from the 1980s which, as she makes clear, was largely concentrated on Marxist ideology and ignored the philosophical aspect of education and marginally treated the discipline and bad behaviour problems. Komorowska (1999a, p. 10-11) illustrates that period with numbers of qualified FL teaching staff. At the beginning of the 1990's in Poland there were 4500 qualified teachers of West-European languages who were employed mainly in secondary schools. 1200 of them were English teachers. According to Komorowska (1999a, p. 11) due to the free market economy there was a growing need for fluent and proficient West-European language users, and as a result, the number of FL teachers decreased as the qualified staff found more attractive job offers and prospects. An analysis of the demand for FL teaching staff demands proved that in the early 1990s 20.000 West-European language teachers were needed, which led to novelties in the teacher training system.

Zawadzka (2004, p. 57) notices that the need to quickly educate the FL teaching staff, which emerged as a result of political changes, pushed away from teacher education divagations connected with the problems that accompanied the teacher training process. The major aspects of the teacher education process were analysed by glottodidactics experts having sound philological training, who being teachers-practitioners were, however, lacking in sufficient psychological and pedagogical knowledge. By the same token, the newly trained FL teaching staff were deprived of knowledge about students' psychological development, interpersonal contacts, and problem solving skills. Thus teacher education in the 1990s was limited to intense FL and didactic training. Yet it was already in the early 1990s that Kwiatkowska (1991, p. 28) observed the threat that such rapid teacher training focused on professional language skills might deprive the teaching profession of its essential humanistic value.

Lucyna Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007, p. 40) states that these days the modern world relies on two major models of foreign language teacher training: education in the mother tongue or education in the target language. However, she notices that while the former model dominates in West Europe, in Poland FL

teachers are educated in the target language with the vast majority of subjects being conducted in the foreign language.

Such a mode of FL teacher preparation seems to meet the educational goals proposed by Dębski (2002, p. 256). He claims that in Polish schools of higher education curriculums aim at teachers' fluency in a foreign language accompanied by proper preparation for the teaching profession. Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2005, p. 41) comments that while in the traditional model of teacher education there was a balance of literature studies and linguistic studies enriched with some FL teaching methodology, these days, the latter component of education is given equal importance as literature and linguistics.

Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007, p. 40) sees, though, that the system of education with all classes conducted in the target language may have some drawbacks. While students are focused on mastering their target language fluency, the intellectual value of the classes may, in some cases, be worryingly low as the learners tend to have insufficient command of the language, and as a consequence, they absorb the knowledge passed on by their teacher trainers in a limited way. In this model of education, Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007, p. 41) indicates, large emphasis is put on the improvement of students' FL practical skills and foreign language teaching methodology, the latter of which in particular aims at preparing them well for the teaching profession.

As Zawadzka (2004, p. 56), Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2005, p. 39) and Zbigniew Możejko (2009: 256) point out, these days FL teachers in Poland are educated on five year MA philological courses or three year BA courses. While Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2005, p. 39) states that there are three basic courses to get FL teaching qualifications, which she calls 'a five-year system' a 'three-year system' and a '3+2 system', Zawadzka (2004, p. 56) observes an increasing tendency among students to complete a BA course in order to continue education for the MA diploma. Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007, p. 41) calls this variety in the ways of educating teachers a 'significant diversification' adding that not only are Polish teacher trainees offered education through daily courses in prestigious universities but also extramural courses. Confirming the existence of prestigious universities as well as the higher education centres of minor importance, Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007, p. 41) admits in Poland we can hardly talk about unified teacher education standards. Moreover Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2005, p. 40) notices that due to the enormous number of higher education colleges it is impossible to establish a single, standard graduate's profile which would precisely describe the spectrum of their competences. Yet she admits that regardless of the teacher training institution, teacher training courses in Poland concentrate on six major areas of study: foreign language practical language skills, literature,

linguistics, cultural studies, methodology, and finally psychology combined with elements of pedagogy.

Zawadzka (2004, p. 56), too, notices that there are large differences in the courses and the programmes and syllabuses among the different colleges and universities in our country. She supports her observation with data concerning the general number of teaching units in German Philology course in different universities around the country. And thus, Zawadzka (2004, p. 57-58) states that Wrocław University offers to its students a total of 2044 teaching units, while Warsaw University 2580, Lublin University has 2670 and Bydgoszcz University only 3135 teaching units. What is more, the time to cover the Methodology course also significantly differs depending on the educational institution and spreads from 240 teaching hours in Gdańsk University to 330 in Zielona Góra.

Komorowska (1999b, p. 80) notices that teaching practice is an indispensable element of teacher education. She believes that although gaining teaching experience in private and foreign language schools by teacher-trainees is advisable and welcome, it also needs to be gained by observation and teaching performed in public schools in the range of between 150 and 270 teaching units.

Yet we cannot ignore the practical language training in teacher education. Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (1999, p. 23) observes that training students to achieve the highest possible level of practical skills in the target language remains the fundamental element in philological training, since it evokes general respect for teachers' qualifications. Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (1999, p. 24) also indicates that Polish institutions that educate teachers cope with the problem of unequal foreign language competence among first year students. Therefore the Ministry of Education (MEN) created a curriculum for teacher training colleges that covers 20 teaching units of practical language education including Reading, Listening, Speaking, Writing, Grammar and Phonetics, supported by some additional subjects as Integrated Skills, and so on. In the opinion of Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (1999, p. 24) English Philology at universities gathers more elite students than teacher training colleges, which accept, what she calls 'the masses' or the 'hoi-polloi candidates'.

Zawadzka (2004, p. 59) claims that Polish higher education training in foreign philology courses does not fulfill students and social expectations. She believes that the courses should be more interdisciplinary and allow students a choice of subjects. Her research conducted among students proved that they also see the need for more detailed cultural studies and prolonged teaching practice.

Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007, p. 41-42), interested in both intercultural teaching and intercultural teacher training, expresses her regret that the intercultural aspect of FL teacher education is hardly allowed in teacher training

courses, and draws our attention to the fact that university and college training courses for FL teachers usually miss 'intercultural communication' as a separate and independent curriculum subject. A new tide in FL teacher education, preached at Białystok University, offers teacher trainees a chance to elaborate on that aspect of teacher education by writing BA or MA theses in the field of intercultural communication and intercultural teaching.

As stated by Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007, p. 42), in Poland, as in other European countries, FL teachers are encouraged to take part in post-graduate courses which aim at integrating FL teaching with intercultural training. Aleksandrowicz-Pędich (2007: 42) gives an example of training organised in Poland in 2001 by the British Council in cooperation with the Goethe Institute during which all classes were conducted simultaneously in three languages: Polish, English and German. As she further explains, the main assumption of that training was to indicate to FL teachers the importance of non-verbal communication and the role of intercultural components in the use of a foreign language.

The teacher education system in Poland sees a need to produce interculturally competent teachers. Roman Lewicki, Magdalena Białek and Anna Gackowska (2006, p. 8) explain that one reason for that is rooted in the fact that foreign language teachers are in an overwhelming majority the representatives of monolingual and mono-cultural countries and therefore may miss intercultural competence. Lewicki (eds. 2006, p. 8) notices that teachers with full qualifications are encouraged to take part in international projects that help them to enhance their qualifications, and thus the projects are a form of additional teacher training. The project that is given as an example is an international project called COALA (Communication and language awareness among pre-school teachers). Not only did the project offer intercultural training to the teachers, but it also helped universities and teacher training colleges coordinate the already existing and offered types of training (Lewicki et al. 2006, p. 8).

Although in this ongoing chapter we have already presented selected views on teacher competences, let us now concentrate on teachers as final products of the teacher training system in Poland, and the competences that Polish foreign language teachers possess when they graduate from Teacher Training Colleges, universities, and other schools of higher education, which provide students with the education necessary to enter the teaching profession.

Komorowska (1999b, p. 82) states that teacher training standards in Poland provide the graduates with competences that can be dichotomized into general competences and detailed competences.

The general aims of teacher education, and thus the general competences that teacher-graduates are to possess refer to interpersonal, social and

communicative skills which enable teachers to formulate clear and logical utterances, distinguish between facts and opinions and work successfully, both individually and in a team, to prevent conflicts in the classroom, and if they come into being, to solve them.

Komorowska (1999b, p. 82-83) describes four detailed areas of competences of a Polish FL teacher-graduate:

1. The teacher's level of proficiency in a foreign language reaches at least to the CAE level,
2. The teacher is equipped with a knowledge of the history and culture of the foreign language speaking area, literature and linguistic knowledge,
3. The teacher has basic pedagogical and psychological knowledge that helps to prevent students' psychological disorders, reasons for students' failures and run all necessary school administration,
4. The teacher is equipped with a thorough methodological knowledge and practical methodological skills that include:
 - approaches to FL acquisition and methods of FL teaching
 - numerous didactic techniques that can be adopted in all types of schools: primary, junior high-school and secondary school
 - ability to select optimal teaching materials, techniques, etc. for a given class
 - self-observance ability that leads a teacher to further professional development
 - independence in making pedagogical decisions with reference to the professional knowledge
 - academic skills that help a teacher gain further professional education and scientific degrees.

Komorowska (1999b, p. 80) concludes that to meet all the above requirements, the teacher education in Poland is completed with a BA or MA thesis that should also reflect all teacher's competences.

Conclusions

It seems that regardless of the country or the system in which the teaching staff are trained, there is always a lot of scope for the system's improvement and for mastering the teachers' pedagogical skills and language competence. Any critical reaction to the teacher-training practices, courses and programmes, both in-service and pre-service, may result in creating new trends and bringing new educational perspectives. Therefore, in their education, teachers should be made

aware of the fact that their constant professional development is essential, and the teachers' intellectual and professional growth can be demonstrated not only by improving their FL skills (also at the universities or in the schools of higher education) and by relying on other teachers' experiences, knowledge and theories, but also by gaining the ability and an ambition to make their own contributions to the foreign language teaching and FL teacher education.

References

- Aleksandrowicz-Pędich, L., Komorowska H. (eds.). 1999. *Kształcenie nauczycieli języków obcych w Polsce*. Foreign Language Teacher Education In Poland. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu w Białymstoku, Białystok.
- Aleksandrowicz-Pędich, L. 1999. Nauczanie praktycznej znajomości języka, In: Aleksandrowicz-Pędich, Lucyna, Komorowska Hanna (eds.). 1999. *Kształcenie nauczycieli języków obcych w Polsce*. Foreign Language Teacher Education In Poland. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu w Białymstoku, Białystok.
- Aleksandrowicz-Pędich, L. 2002. "Cross-cultural communicative competence in teaching English as a foreign language: research project in four European countries (Estonia, Hungary, Iceland and Poland)", In: Siek-Piskozub, Teresa, (ed.). 2002. *European Year of Languages 2001*. Uniwersytet im. Adama Mickiewicza, Poznań.
- Aleksandrowicz-Pędich, L. 2005. *Międzykulturowość na lekcjach języków obcych*. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu w Białymstoku, Białystok.
- Alfes, L. 1982. 'Der Lehrer als Motivationsfaktor – whatever the method used'. English 1, 22-27.
- Dębski, A. 2002. "Po co studiować dzisiaj filologię obcą? Słowo o curriculum studiów neofilologicznych i kompetencjach absolwenta", In: Język trzeciego tysiąclecia II, volume 2, pp. 257-262. *Polszczyzna a języki obce: przekład i dydaktyka*. Tertium, Kraków.
- Raut, M. 1994. *Developing Professional knowledge and competence*. Falmer Press, London.
- Grigorian, S. 1984. *Miedodiczieskije rekomendacii po psichologii obuczenija innostrannym jazykam w szkole*. Moskowskij gosudarstwiennyj piedadagogiczeskij instytut, Moskwa.
- James, P. 2001. *Teachers in Action*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Jastrzębska, E. 2005. *Zintegrowane kształcenie nauczyciela języków obcych.*, In: Zawodniak, Joanna, Katarzyna Trychom- Cieślak. 2005. *Integracja w nauczaniu języków obcych*. Oficyna Wydawnicza Uniwersytetu Zielonogórskiego, Zielona Góra.
- Komorowska, H. 1978. *Sukces i niepowodzenie w nauce języka obcego*. WSiP, Warszawa.
- Komorowska, H. 1999a. Kształcenie nauczycieli języków obcych w Polsce- osiągnięcia i trudności, In: Aleksandrowicz-Pędich, Lucyna, Komorowska Hanna (eds.). 1999. *Kształcenie nauczycieli języków obcych w Polsce*. Foreign Language Teacher Education In Poland. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu w Białymstoku, Białystok.

- Komorowska, H. 1999b. Kształcenie nauczycieli języków obcych – potrzeby i propozycje rozwiązań. In: Aleksandrowicz-Pędich, Lucyna, Komorowska Hanna (eds.). 1999. *Kształcenie nauczycieli języków obcych w Polsce*. Foreign Language Teacher Education In Poland. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu w Białymstoku, Białystok.
- Komorowska, H. 1999. "Successful teaching: how to achieve it, how to assess it". *Network* 2/2 pp. 3-9.
- Komorowska, H. 2005. *Metodyka nauczania języków obcych*. Fraszka Edukacyjna, Warszawa.
- Komorowska, H. (ed.).2009. *Kształcenie językowe w szkolnictwie wyższym*. Academica, Warszawa.
- Kwiatkowska, H. 1991. *Koncepcja pedagogicznego kształcenia nauczycieli*. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Warszawskiego, Warszawa.
- Lewicki, R., Białek, M, Gackowska, M. (red.). 2006. *Kompetencja międzykulturowa w kształceniu nauczycieli języków obcych na potrzeby edukacji wczesnoszkolnej. Teoria i praktyka*. Oficyna Wydawnicza Atut, Wrocław.
- Możejko, Z. 2009. Z badań nad kształceniem zawodowym i językowym przyszłych nauczycieli języka angielskiego. In: Komorowska, Hanna. (red.).2009. *Kształcenie językowe w szkolnictwie wyższym*. Academica, Warszawa.
- Szałek, M. 2004. *Jak motywować uczniów do nauki języka obcego?*. Wągros, Poznań.
- Tann, S. 1993. *How Student Teachers Learn*. RoutledgeFalmer, London.
- Taraszkiewicz, M. 1996. *Jak uczyć się lepiej czyli refleksyjny praktyk w działaniu*. CODN, Warszawa.
- The common European framework of reference for languages: Learning, teaching, assessment*. 2001. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Wallis, M, 1991. *Training Foreign Language Teachers*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Werbińska, D. 2004. *Skuteczny nauczyciel języka obcego*. Fraszka edukacyjna, Warszawa.
- Wilczyńska, W. 1999. *Uczyć się czy być nauczonym? O autonomii w przyswajaniu języka obcego*. Wydawnictwo Naukowe PWN, Warszawa-Poznań.
- Wilczyńska, W a. (red.), 2002. *Autonomizacja w dydaktyce języków obcych. Doskonalenie się w komunikacji ustnej*. Wydawnictwo Naukowe UAM, Poznań.
- Wilczyńska, W. b. (red.), 2002. *Doskonalenie się w komunikacji ustnej*. Wydawnictwo Naukowe UAM, Poznań.
- Wilczyńska, W. 2002. "Osobista kompetencja komunikacyjna", In: Wilczyńska W. b. (ed.). 2002. *Doskonalenie się w komunikacji ustnej*. Poznań: Wydawnictwo Naukowe UAM.
- Witt, N. 1987. "Emocjonalnoje wozdziejstwije riezci uczieliia innostrannogo języka". *Innostrannyje języki w szkole* 6.p.34-37.
- Woźniakowski, W. 1992. *Glottodydaktyka w świetle zjawiska bilingwizmu naturalnego*. Zakład Narodowy im. Ossolińskich – Wydawnictwo, Wrocław.
- Woźniakowski, W. (red.), 1992. *Modele komunikacji międzyludzkiej*. Wydawnictwa Uniwersytetu Warszawskiego, Warszawa.

- Wolniewicz, W. 1987. „Statut preopawatielia w swiecie położeń komunikatiwno-diejatielnošnego podchoda w obuczeniu ruskomu jazyku”. Przegląd rusycystyczny. Zeszyt 1-2, p. 234-249.
- Wysocka, M. 2003. *Profesjonalizm w nauczaniu języków obcych*. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Śląskiego, Katowice.
- Zawadzka, E. 2004. *Nauczyciele języków obcych w dobie przemian*. Oficyna Wydawnicza Impuls, Kraków.

Equivalenza in atto: Alcuni processi traduttivi al livello lessicale-sintattico

Abstract

Con il presente testo si intende analizzare alcune tecniche adoperate dal traduttore al livello lessicale-sintattico che servono a raggiungere l'equivalenza globale tra il testo originale e la sua traduzione. Verranno quindi presentati i processi traduttivi come trasposizione, modulazione, adattamento, omissioni e aggiunte, nonché il concetto stesso di equivalenza (tra cui equivalenza diretta, indiretta, idiomatica). Il testo ha soprattutto un carattere didattico: si vuole dimostrare ai futuri traduttori attraverso quali passaggi traduttivi si manifestano vari tipi di equivalenza.

Parole chiave: equivalenza, analisi della traduzione, didattica della traduzione

Introduzione

Fino alla seconda guerra mondiale i teorici della traduzione, loro stessi traduttori, si limitavano solitamente a riflettere sul proprio lavoro. Le teorie finivano quindi per dichiararsi a favore della traduzione letterale o libera. Distintamente schierati tra i fautori della fedeltà formale e i fautori della libertà illimitata (*sourciers* e *ciblistes* nei termini di Jean-René Ladamiral; 1986, pp. 33-42) i traduttori si sono concentrati soprattutto sulla giustificazione delle loro scelte personali invece che sull'elaborazione di alcune leggi o regole generali (anche oggi molti lavori di carattere traduttologico hanno un simile obiettivo). A partire dagli anni Cinquanta nel pensiero teorico comincia a dominare un obiettivo pedagogico. Si studiano quindi i testi delle traduzioni che i secoli precedenti hanno messo a disposizione per capirne i passaggi traduttivi e arrivare a un certo *savoir-faire*. Con Georges Mounin la riflessione sulla traduzione diventa ancora più scientifica (anche se Mounin stesso inizia *Les belles infidèles* con una frase piuttosto scoraggiante: *Tous les arguments contre la traduction se résument en un seul: elle n'est pas l'original*; 1995, p. 17) e comincia a formarsi una vera e propria disciplina.

Negli anni Sessanta Eugene Nida mette in rilievo il concetto più importante nella teoria della traduzione (e allo stesso tempo il concetto più problematico), vale a dire l'equivalenza. Egli ne distingue due tipi: equivalenza formale (della forma

linguistica) e dinamica (di senso, di stile e di effetto), dove la seconda è più importante, perché – come dice – il lettore della traduzione dovrebbe reagire al testo tradotto nella stessa maniera in cui ha reagito anche il lettore del testo originale (per la nozione di equivalenza si veda il seguito). Sempre negli anni Sessanta viene pubblicata l'opera Jean-Paul Vinay e Jean Darbelnet intitolata *Stylistique comparée du français et de l'anglais* (1958) con cui la traduttologia si avvia a un approccio descrittivo (o contrastivo). Il teorico della traduzione osserva *a posteriori* diverse traduzioni per confrontare il testo tradotto con la sua versione originale e per poter descrivere dettagliatamente vari procedimenti del passaggio traduttivo (sulle teorie di cui sopra si veda p.es. Podeur, 2002, pp. 10-22).

Nelle pagine che seguono intendo presentare alcune tecniche adoperate dal traduttore nel corso del suo lavoro. Il testo ha quindi il carattere analitico, ma soprattutto didattico: vorrei dimostrare ai futuri addetti alla traduzione attraverso quali passaggi traduttivi si manifestano vari tipi di equivalenza. Il modello d'analisi che – a mio parere – adempie al meglio a tale funzione riparte il testo in tre livelli: lessicale-sintattico, stilistico e socio-letterario. Secondo Monica Adamczyk-Garbowska, l'autrice dello stesso modello, nel caso delle traduzioni, oltre ai rapporti interni tra questi livelli, è più importante il rapporto tra il livello del testo originale e il livello della traduzione, quindi in altre parole: la realizzazione di un tale rapporto nella lingua d'arrivo (Adamczyk-Garbowska, 1988, pp. 30-31).

Chiaramente su tutti i livelli si realizzano certi processi traduttivi e tipi di equivalenza che portano infine all'equivalenza globale del testo (supponendo che questa sia stata raggiunta). Visto il limite puramente tecnico delle pagine del testo, mi limiterò a presentare i processi traduttivi propri del livello lessicale-sintattico. Il detto problema verrà illustrato ed esemplificato con i brani tratti dai testi teatrali di Achille Campanile accompagnati dalle loro traduzioni polacche proposte dall'autore del presente testo¹.

Processi traduttivi

Al livello lessicale-sintattico vengono analizzate le seguenti questioni (*ibid.*, p. 31): comprensione del testo originale, omissioni, aggiunte, traduzione degli idiomi, dei neologismi, dei giochi di parole, deformazioni linguistiche, lessico ed espressioni di carattere culturale, linguaggio settoriale ecc. In tal modo, per scopi didattici sarà

¹ I brani sono tratti dalla raccolta *L'inventore del cavallo e altre quindici commedie* (Milano: Rizzoli 2002); la traduzione polacca della raccolta *Wynalazca konie i inne ko(ń)medie* è nella fase di preparazione; i frammenti che nella versione originale cominciano da un nuovo capoverso vengono distinti da una barra (/); le parti del testo che illustrano un dato problema traduttologico vengono sottolineate.

utile la classificazione proposta da Michel Ballard (1984), che distingue tre tipi di equivalenza (messi in evidenza grazie al confronto tra le forme linguistiche):

a) equivalenza diretta (traduzione letterale, calco, prestito): consiste nel riportare nel testo della traduzione la struttura, la nozione, l'espressione o la forma con un'unità analogica, quasi identica;

b) equivalenza indiretta: si manifesta quando due lingue per esprimere una stessa idea coinvolgono diverse forme (paragonabili però). Questo tipo di equivalenza rivela una certa analogia tra le lingue nonostante le loro differenze morfo-sintattiche (Vinay e Darbelnet chiamano questo tipo di rapporto "traduzione obliqua" e ne evidenziano alcuni procedimenti traduttivi, tra cui: trasposizione, modulazione, adattamento (Podeur, 2002, pp. 20-21); si veda il seguito).

c) equivalenza idiomatica: che riguarda le strutture fisse, cliché, idiomi, proverbi, espressioni idiomatiche. In questo caso tali espressioni vengono considerate un insieme indivisibile, per cui vengono (o meno) sostituite da un altro insieme equivalente.

Equivalenza diretta – traduzione per corrispondenti: questo tipo di traduzione si basa, come dicono Alicja Pisarska e Teresa Tomaszkiwicz (1996, p. 123), sulla ricerca sistematica dei corrispondenti della lingua di partenza, cioè si limita a una certa trascodificazione del materiale linguistico (laddove la lingua d'arrivo lo permette). Lo scopo principale di tale processo traduttivo è la maggiore fedeltà possibile alla forma dell'originale. Il traduttore ricorre alla trascodificazione soprattutto nel caso delle parole concrete, degli elenchi di parole o dei termini tecnici. Vediamone alcuni esempi:

a) parole concrete (bisogna ricordare che, anche se nelle due frasi confrontate appaiono equivalenti diretti, non è sempre possibile conservare la stessa forma di tutta la frase. Con i corrispondenti diretti si possono quindi formare frasi diverse dal punto di vista sintattico. Negli esempi che seguono le parole appartengono alla categoria dei sostantivi. L'equivalenza diretta si realizza, però, anche nel caso di altre categorie grammaticali):

it.: DITRETTORE (*a Virginia*) Virginia, siamo in una prigione! / VIRGINIA Appunto. Vorrei alleggerire un po' l'impressione. Mattia, ricoveratevi i guanti.

pl.: DYREKTOR (*do Wirginii*) Ależ Wirginio, to jest więzienie! / WIRGINIA Otóż to! Chciałabym nieco złagodzić wrażenie. (*Do Macieja*) Macieju, załóż rękawiczki.

b) elenco di parole (nel caso dei testi teatrali tale tecnica si manifesta spesso nelle didascalie, dove l'autore del testo originale elenca diversi oggetti che vanno presentati sul palcoscenico):

it.: Il cortile d'una prigione. In fondo, una tenda impedisce di vedere cosa c'è dentro. A sinistra, cartelli: «Stampa», «Autorità», «Scienziati». Poltrone e piante ornamentali, messe per l'occasione. È notte e la scena è illuminata da riflettori.

pl.: Więzienny dziedziniec. W głębi zasłona ukrywa nieznanne wnętrze, z lewej strony afisze: „Prasa”, „Władze”, „Uczni”. Fotele i rośliny ozdobne przygotowane specjalnie na okazję. Jest noc, scenę oświetlają reflektory.

L'ordine delle parole elencate non è sempre mantenuto. Ciò succede, ad esempio, per motivi fonologici (o prosodici), quando una data successione dei suoni sembra migliore (secondo il traduttore) della pronuncia delle parole riportate nell'ordine originale. Nell'esempio che segue la parola più lunga è stata posta come l'ultima.

it.: [...] In seguito intendo arrivare a produrne anche turchini, verdi e rossi. (*Presenta il terzo quadro*)

pl.: [...] W przyszłości planuję rozpocząć produkcję serii czerwonej, zielonej i ciemnobłękitnej. (*Przedstawia trzecią tablicę.*)

c) termini tecnici: anche nei testi letterari appaiono termini tecnici (addirittura più spesso di quanto si possa immaginare). Il traduttore deve allora affrontare il compito di “rintracciare” il termine in diversi testi specialistici, dizionari tematici o in altri simili sussidi:

it.: SEGRETARIO Forse è guasta la spirale. (*Prende l'orologio e l'esamina.*) / YVONNE (*prendendo l'orologio*) Io credo che bisogna cambiare il bilanciere. / POETA (*prende l'orologio*) Oppure è necessario riparare la molla.

pl.: SEKRETARZ Może zepsuł się włos? (*Bierze zegarek i sprawdza.*) / YVONNE (*bierze zegarek*) Moim zdaniem trzeba wymienić balans. / POETA (*bierze zegarek*) Albo naprawić sprężynę.

d) corrispondenti contestuali: quando un dato termine ha diversi significati (accezioni riportate nel dizionario) è possibile scegliere il suo equivalente solo in base al contesto in cui esso appare. In questo caso il termine nella lingua d'arrivo si dice corrispondente contestuale o, in altre parole, corrispondente attualizzato contestualmente (Pisarska & Tomaszewicz, 1996, p. 124). Già nei frammenti di sopra troviamo simili termini (punto 2.1.b), dove 'autorità' (secondo PSWP: autorità *f*1. władza, zwierzchność *f*[...] 2. powaga *f*, znaczenie *n*, autorytet *m* [...]) 3. *sport.* przewaga 4. *fpl* le ~ władze *fpl*, przedstawiciele władzy [...]) viene tradotta come 'władze', quindi come la quarta accezione (il traduttore può tradurre la parola con un corrispondente adatto grazie al contesto, cioè al fatto che nella zona indicata dal cartello «Autorità» si siederà uno dei protagonisti del testo – Il Ministro della Pubblica Istruzione).

Equivalenza indiretta. A questo punto ricorro alla classificazione delle operazioni traduttive proposta da Vinay e Darbelnet (1958; come sopra), nonché alle trasformazioni linguistiche secondo Edward Balcerzen (riduzione, inversione, sostituzione, amplificazione; Balcerzan, 1998, p. 27).

Trasposizione: è il procedimento traduttivo che consiste nel sostituire una parte del discorso, o una categoria grammaticale, con un'altra categoria grammaticale. La trasposizione concerne tutte le parti del discorso (nome, aggettivo, pronome, verbo ecc.), tutte le categorie sintattiche (soggetto, predicato ecc.) nonché tutti i periodi e paragrafi, le loro unificazioni e scissioni (Podeur, 2002, p. 35). Le trasposizioni delle parti del discorso più ricorrenti sono:

▫ trasposizione nome – verbo

it.: RIDABELLA È quello che dicevo io un momento fa a Teresa. Le parole precise. / Sospiri.

pl.: RIDABELLA Tak też powiedziałam Teresie. Dokładnie moje słowa. / Wzdychają.

▫ trasposizione nome (qui locuzione avverbiale: preposizione + nome) – aggettivo

it.: SEGRETARIO (prende posto e legge con voce d'oltretomba) Ordine del giorno della seduta straordinaria dell'Accademia di Scienze, Lettere ed Arti:

pl.: SEKRETARZ (zajmuje miejsce i czyta grobowym głosem) Porządek obrad nadzwyczajnego posiedzenia Akademii Nauk Matematyczno - Przyrodniczych, Humanistycznych i Sztuk Pięknych:

▫ trasposizione nome (qui locuzione avverbiale: preposizione + nome) – avverbio

it.: TELECRONISTA Qual è il vostro motto? /CARNEFICE (con bella fierezza) «Decapita chi capita. Così nessuno si scapita.»

pl.: SPRAWOZDAWCA Jaka jest pańska dewiza? / KAT (dumnie) „Nie trać głowy, sam ci ją utracę”

▫ trasposizione avverbio – verbo

it.: MARCANTONIO (rivolgendosi alla figlia) Teresa, scusa, puoi venire un momento di là?

TERESA Con permesso. (Via con Marcantonio)

pl.: MAREK ANTONIUSZ (do córki) Przepraszam Tereso, czy mogę cię prosić na moment?

TERESA Za pozwoleniem. (Odchodzi z ojcem.)

▫ trasposizione aggettivo – avverbio

it.: Strette di mano lunghe, vigorose e silenziose. Poi la signora Jone via. Intanto Teresa ha aperto i telegrammi e li passa ai vicini, che li scorrono scuotendo il capo con tristezza e se li passano.

pl.: W ciszy, długo i energicznie wymieniają uściski dłoni, po czym pani Jone wychodzi. Tymczasem Teresa otwiera depesze i podaje je sąsiadom. Ci przeglądają listy kiwając głowami, podają je sobie nawzajem.

Modulazione: Mentre la trasposizione riguarda i processi traduttivi al livello morfosintattico, la modulazione è un'operazione sulle categorie del pensiero, la quale operazione dimostra come i parlanti di diverse lingue percepiscono la realtà circostante in modo diverso. Secondo Josiane Podeur (2002, p. 76) le modulazioni possono essere classificate in base alle tre figure retoriche fondamentali, quali metafora, metonimia e sineddoche.

Modulazione e metafora: La metafora, in linea di massima, è *lo spostamento di senso per similitudine, cioè la similitudine abbreviata*² (*ibid.*, p. 77). La modulazione riguarda il cambiamento del secondo termine di questo tropo. Podeur distingue i seguenti tipi di tale procedimento traduttivo: metafora > altra metafora, metafora > similitudine, metafora > assenza di metafora. Vediamo qualche esempio:

a) modulazione metafora – similitudine

[it.:] Salotto in casa di Tito. Tito ha la veste da camera sui pantaloni della marsina; sfoglia un giornale. In fondo, Battista il domestico, in frac, sta impalato sotto la porta in attesa di ordini.

[pl.:] Salon w domu Tytusa. Tytus w podomce i spodniach od garnituru przegląda gazetę. W głębi, przy drzwiach, stoi nieruchomy jak słup lokaj Baptysta. Ubrany we frac czeka na polecenia.

b) modulazione metafora – assenza di metafora

it.: OSVALDO Ma perché ha alzato gli occhi al cielo? Perché gemeva, con un'espressione di dolore? / LOLA Perché mi faceva male il dente mio.

pl.: OSVALDO To dlaczego zwróciła pani oczy ku niebu? Dlaczego ból rysował się na pani twarzy? / LOLA Ponieważ mnie też bolał ząb.

Modulazioni metonimiche: La metonimia è lo scambio dei significati che sono contigui, è una sostituzione di tipo «il bicchiere» per «il contenuto del bicchiere»³. In questo caso non si tratta di una somiglianza tra due elementi (come

² Podeur presenta inoltre diversi passaggi che portano dalla similitudine alla metafora (*ibid.*, p. 78): similitudine esplicita: *l'ignoranza di questa ragazza è pari all'ignoranza di un asino*; similitudine implicita: *questa ragazza è ignorante come un asino*; metafora *in praesentia*: *questa ragazza è un asino*; metafora *in absentia*: *quest'asino*.

³ Fra i tipi più frequenti di metonimia troviamo: causa per effetto: *ho una bella mano – ho una bella scrittura*, effetto per causa: *una valle di lacrime – un luogo di sofferenza*, contenente per contenuto:

sopra) ma di “un’associazione dovuta ad una compresenza nell’esperienza” (*ibid.*, p. 91).

a) la metonimia luogo/abitante (o contenente/contenuto)

it.: LUI (*c.s.*) Non mi mandi all'inferno, se le dico una cosa.

pl.: ON (*jak wyżej*) Coś panu powiem, tylko proszę mnie nie wysłać do diabła.

b) una caratteristica per un'altra

it.: JONE Mi ci tirano per i capelli. Debbo vedere che a due giorni di distanza dalla morte del mio genero, i suoi amici vengono qui e, per suprema irrisione al dolore di mia figlia, si mettono a piangere un altro; mentre il corpo del mio povero genero è, direi quasi, ancora caldo.

pl.: JONE Nie mogę w to uwierzyć! Dwa dni po śmierci Pawła, tak zwani jego przyjaciele przychodzą do naszego domu, i drwiąc z cierpienia mojej córki, opłakują kogoś innego, podczas gdy ciało mojego biednego zięcia, rzec by można, jeszcze nie ostygło.

c) la sineddoche/l'antonomasia

Nella sineddoche (metonimia di tipo *pars pro toto*) e nell'antonomasia (scambio di tipo il nome proprio per il nome comune e viceversa) lo scambio del significato implica un rapporto di inclusione tra due termini:

it.: MARCANTONIO (*rivolgendosi alla figlia*) Teresa, scusa, puoi venire un momento di là? / TERESA Con permesso. (*Via, come un automa, con Marcantonio*)

pl.: MAREK ANTONIUSZ (*do córki*) Przepraszam Tereso, czy mogę cię prosić na moment? / TERESA Za pozwoleniem. (*Odchodzi z ojcem*).

Adattamento: Quando nel corso della traduzione il traduttore trova un lessema che evochi una realtà culturale che non ha alcun corrispondente nella cultura del ricevente secondario (nel senso più ampio di questo vocabolo), egli deve a volte servirsi di immagini diverse che comunque trasmettano il messaggio (pensiero/idea) o l'immagine proposta dall'autore originale. In tal caso il traduttore non lascia al lettore il compito di comprendere una realtà che appartiene a un'altra cultura, “ma interviene sostituendo i concetti o fenomeni familiari al lettore del testo di partenza con altri familiari al lettore del testo d'arrivo” (Podeur, 2002, p. 113).

A titolo di esempio, è difficile tradurre in polacco i termini che riguardano la struttura dei penitenziari italiani, quando la stessa struttura dei carceri in Polonia è talmente diversa:

bevo una tazza – bevo il contenuto di una tazza, autore per opera: oggi leggiamo Manzoni – oggi leggiamo un'opera di Manzoni.

it.: MINISTRO Bravo, bravo. Vedo anche operatori cinematografici e telecamere. Bravo direttore. Vi manderò all'ergastolo. / DIRETTORE Grazie, eccellenza. / MINISTRO So che da tempo lo desiderate.

pl.: MINISTER Brawo, brawo! Widzę, że są także operatorzy filmowi. Brawo, panie dyrektorze. Postaram się o pańskie przeniesienie do zamkniętego zakładu karnego. / DYREKTOR Dziękuję, ekscelencjo. / MINISTER Wiem, że od dawna pan o tym marzył.

Il termine *ergastolo* in italiano indica: luogo dove vengono reclusi spec. ergastolani (secondo il dizionario DeMauro). Il sistema carcerario polacco non distingue tali penitenziari, per cui nella versione polacca il traduttore ha sostituito il termine *ergastolo* con *zamknięty zakład karny*, in polacco – il carcere destinato ai delinquenti pericolosi e recidivi in cui la loro libertà di movimento è molto limitata.

Per simili motivi scompaiono nella traduzione i termini del dialetto napoletano:

it.: POZIAKOFF Se profittassimo dell'assenza del Presidente per fare una taraballa? / POETA Ottima idea. / Tirano fuori i necessari strumenti: tamburelli, fisarmoniche, putipù, tricche-balacche, ecc., e, abbandonati i rispettivi seggi, danzano con grande calore una tarantella napoletana.

pl.: POZIAKOW Może wykorzystamy nieobecność Przewodniczącego. Co powiecie na małą poleczkę? / POETA Świetny pomysł. / Wyciągają potrzebne instrumenty: tamburyny, akordeony itd. Zerwawszy się z miejsc, z wielkim zapalem i bez ładu, tańczą polkę.

Come vediamo nel testo della traduzione i lessemi che indicano gli strumenti musicali tipici napoletani (*putipù*, *tricche-balacche*) sono stati eliminati e il nome della danza *tarantella* (“danza popolare di antica origine, tipica dell’Italia meridionale, dall’andamento molto vivace, eseguita a coppie con accompagnamento di tamburello”; secondo DeMauro) è stato sostituito con *polka* – anche questo un ballo vivace e festoso, tanto più noto ai lettori polacchi.

Equivalenza: Secondo Vinay e Darbelnet l’equivalenza è “procedimento che rende conto di una stessa situazione ricorrendo a una espressione interamente diversa” (Podeur, 2002, p. 21), cioè cerca di rendere un’espressione idiomatica nella lingua di partenza con un’altra espressione del genere nella lingua d’arrivo. Nella classifica di M. Ballard, che ho proposto come la principale distinzione dei tipi d’equivalenza al livello lessicale-sintattico, questo tipo di operazione si troverà tra i processi traduttivi portanti all’equivalenza idiomatica (di cui in seguito).

Equivalenza idiomatica: riguarda espressioni idiomatiche, locuzioni, frasi fatte, costrutti linguistici stabiliti e radicati in una lingua (o meglio: il fatto di come

vengono tradotti). Il rapporto tra il testo originale e la sua traduzione può, quindi, realizzarsi in maniera seguente:

- a) l'espressione idiomatica ha una struttura identica (o quasi) in ambedue le lingue:
- it.: TELECRONISTA Con meraviglioso sangue freddo, il condannato si lascia rader la nuca prima dell'esecuzione. Per questa operazione viene usato il famoso rasoio elettrico «Raspa a sangua», che offrirà sabato prossimo nel secondo programma la canzone Porgimi l'altra guancia.
- pl.: SPRAWOZDAWCA Zachowując zimną krew, skazany pozwala przed cięciem ogolić sobie kark. W tym celu zostaje użyta znana maszynka elektryczna „Tnij a zatnij”, której producent sponsoruje audycję „Nadstaw drugi policzek”, transmitowaną w najbliższą sobotę w programie drugim.

Anche se il polacco e l'italiano appartengono a due famiglie linguistiche diverse, nelle due lingue ritroviamo numerosi fraseologismi identici (dal punto di vista strutturale e semantico). Negli esempi sopra indicati il traduttore ha reso l'espressione *sangue freddo* con lo stesso insieme di parole in lingua polacca: *zimna krew* (l'unica differenza riguarda la posizione dell'aggettivo che in polacco sta davanti al nome, in italiano viene invece posposto). Oltre alla stessa struttura lessicale le due espressioni sono uguali dal punto di vista semantico ('a sangue freddo': a mente fredda, con fredda determinazione, senza scomporsi (secondo DeMauro); 'z zimną krwią': bez emocji i będąc w pełni świadomym tego, co się robi (secondo WSJP).

La struttura identica dei costrutti idiomatici può risultare dai frequenti contatti tra le nazioni o dalla comune eredità culturale e storica dei loro parlanti, come nel caso dell'espressione biblica *porgi l'altra guancia* ≥ *nadstaw drugi policzek* (quindi perdonare, non vendicarsi, non usare la violenza). Le parole prese dal Vangelo di Matteo sono diventate unità fraseologiche in molte lingue europee (es.: inglese: *turn the other cheek*, francese: *tendre l'autre joue*, tedesco: *die andere Wange hinhalten*, spagnolo: *dar la otra mejilla*).

- b) il significato dell'espressione idiomatica originale viene reso tramite un'altra espressione idiomatica propria della L2 (è questo il procedimento che Vinay e Darbelnet chiamano equivalenza),

it.: IL VECCHIERELLO Vuoi dire che se ritornassimo indietro nel tempo... / LA VECCHIERELLA Scapperei a gambe levate. / IL VECCHIERELLO E io girerei a largo, se t'incontrassi, come tanti anni fa su questa banchina. / LA VECCHIERELLA Bisognava addirittura non dirsi una parola.

pl.: STARUSZEK Chcesz powiedzieć, że gdybyśmy cofnęli się w czasie... / STARUSZKA Uciekałabym, gdzie pieprz rośnie. / STARUSZEK A ja omijałbym tę ławkę szerokim łukiem, żeby tylko nie spotkać cię jak przed laty. / STARUSZKA Nie trzeba się było w ogóle odzywać.

Come vediamo, le espressioni idiomatiche italiane che non hanno corrispondenti nella lingua polacca sono state sostituite con espressioni differenti dal punto di vista lessicale/sintattico ma affini semanticamente. Così per esempio *piantare in asso* (lasciare bruscamente, all'improvviso qcn.; DevotoOli) nella traduzione polacca viene reso con *zostawić {kogoś} na lodzie* (nieoczekiwanie opuścić kogoś w trudnej sytuacji, zostawić kogoś bez pomocy; secondo SSF). Con queste unità fraseologiche il traduttore ha voluto mantenere lo stile dell'originale nonché l'effetto umoristico che il testo primario provoca per l'appunto grazie alle unità prese in esame.

Quando non è possibile riprodurre un'espressione fraseologica nella lingua d'arrivo (tale espressione idiomatica nella L2 non esiste, ha una sfumatura del significato diversa, o semplicemente non c'è un'altra espressione idiomatica che renda il significato dell'espressione nella lingua dell'originale) il traduttore è costretto a rendere la frase con un costrutto di carattere non idiomatico.

c) un'unità fraseologica viene tradotta con un costrutto di carattere non idiomatico,

it.: PERTUSIUS Direi, se non temessi di fare dello spirito di cattiva lega, che è l'unico modo perché mettano la testa a posto. Buona questa. (Ridendo convulsamente) Santo Dio!... Santo Dio!...

pl.: PERTUSIUS Nie chciałbym, żeby zabrzmiało to jak żart w złym guście, lecz to chyba jedyny sposób, żeby wybić im z głowy głupoty. A to dobre. (*Śmieje się spazmatycznie.*) O mój Boże!... mój Boże!

d) nel testo della traduzione appare un'espressione idiomatica al posto di una frase non idiomatica.

È anche possibile che l'espressione idiomatica appaia esclusivamente nel testo della traduzione. Ciò succede perché una tale espressione nella L2 può rendere meglio (secondo il traduttore) il messaggio primario, corrisponde allo stile del testo (per esempio serve a esprimere l'ironia ecc.) o per altri motivi. È sempre il traduttore a decidere come rendere un'unità di traduzione nella lingua di arrivo. Riporto due esempi del fraseologismo di cui manca il testo originale.

it.: PELAEZ (*piangendo*) Ma non posso trattenermi. / SIGNORA PELAEZ Sforzati. Eccola.

pl.: PELAEZ (*placząc*) Nie potrafię się powstrzymać. / PANI PELAEZ Weź się w garść. Już idzie.

it.: OSVALDO (*guardando verso il suocero, signor Marcantonio che siede in un angolo*) Avete visto il suocero? Tenetelo d'occhio che non commetta qualche sciocchezza irrimediabile. A me fa paura quel suo aspetto come inebetito.

pl.: OSVALDO (*patrzy w stronę teścia, pan Marek Antoniusz siedzi w kącie*) Czy ktoś widział mojego teścia? Miejcie go na oku, bo jeszcze zrobi jakieś głupstwo. Ten jego tępy wyraz twarzy przyprawia mnie o dreszcze.

In questi casi l'uso dei fraseologismi polacchi viene motivato dalla loro espressività più forte rispetto alle strutture solo verbali.

Omissioni e aggiunte: L'omissione (o riduzione in termini di Edward Balcerzan; 1998) consiste nel non tradurre un dato elemento del testo originale o nel sostituire un dato elemento con un altro diverso dall'originale. È ovviamente la tecnica più dannosa cui il traduttore ricorre solo nei casi estremi (p.es. nelle traduzioni dei giochi di parole che risultano intraducibili). Il traduttore può anche aggiungere un nuovo elemento riguardo al testo originale per mantenere la proporzione dell'informazione (Pisarska & Tomaszewicz, 1996, p. 139). Le due tecniche non riguardano solo grandi parti del testo. Anche su livelli inferiori, quindi paragrafi, frasi o sintagmi, possono verificarsi simili cambiamenti (per evitare inutili ripetizioni, cacofonia, pleonasmii, o per altri motivi), come nel seguente frammento:

it.: La trasmissione è offerta dalla casa Libe, produttrice delle famose compresse contro il mal di testa. Signori, chiedete sempre Libe!

pl.: Transmisja sponsorowana jest przez firmę Libe, producenta znanych tabletek przeciwbólowych. Drodzy państwo, *w aptekach* proście o Libe! [è stato aggiunto il complemento di stato in luogo].

Tra i processi traduttivi che modificano la detta proporzione dell'informazione distinguiamo ancora la compensazione, cioè l'introduzione di un elemento d'informazione in un altro passo del testo della traduzione rispetto al testo originale (*ibid.*). Per "l'elemento d'informazione" non s'intende soltanto l'informazione stretto senso. La compensazione può riferirsi anche a diversi procedimenti stilistici (figure retoriche ecc.):

it.: GAIUS Ah, come scienziato sì, è la prima volta. Come, diciamo così, uomo, e come cittadino, ci fui, se ben ricordo, nel '30 per un *oculato peculato*. Nel '31, per *furto con destrezza*; fu un'operazione sfortunata. In sostanza mi mancò...

pl.: GAIUS Ach, jako naukowiec. Tak, po raz pierwszy. Jako człowiek, obywatel, że się tak wyrażę, miałem okazję odwiedzić więzienie w 30 roku, o ile dobrze pamiętam, za *sprytne malwersacje*, potem w 31 za *brak pomysłu w rabunku*. To była nieszczęśliwa operacja. W sumie zabrakło mi...

(La rima (provoca l'effetto umoristico) che nelle versione italiana appare nel primo elemento della catena: *un oculato peculato* [...] *furto con destrezza* nel testo della traduzione si trova nel secondo elemento: *sprytne malwersacje* [...] *brak*

pomyślunku w rabunku. In tal modo il traduttore ha mantenuto le caratteristiche comiche dell'originale.)

Per raggiungere l'equivalenza globale tra il testo originale e la sua traduzione l'autore secondario deve adoperare diverse tecniche traduttive su vari passi e livelli del testo (Adamczyk-Garbowska parla a questo proposito di un certo avvicinamento della traduzione al testo originale; 1988, p. 37). Il traduttore deve inoltre rendersi conto dei condizionamenti extralinguistici (contesto, cultura ecc.) che influiscono tanto sul testo originale quanto sul testo della traduzione. Può darsi che la ripartizione dei livelli d'analisi sembri artificiale, se non altro perché tra i singoli livelli sussistono numerosi legami. Una certa semplificazione risulta comunque indispensabile, almeno dal punto di vista analitico e didattico, invece le nozioni di equivalenza proposte da Ballard insieme alle operazioni linguistiche evidenziate da Vinay e Darbelnet che illustrano il procedimento traduttivo al livello lessicale-sintattico impegnate all'interno del modello analitico di Adamczyk-Garbowska sembrano un punto di riferimento di grande valore e utilità.

Conclusione

Partendo quindi dalle operazioni al livello più basso del testo è possibile notare numerose somiglianze tra due sistemi linguistici (in questo caso tra italiano e polacco) come ad esempio lo stesso campo semantico delle unità linguistiche o una simile struttura sintattica (si veda l'equivalenza diretta). Allo stesso tempo le differenze tra i sistemi messi a confronto fanno sì che il traduttore debba ricorrere a vari procedimenti creativi, il cui scopo è di produrre un testo conforme all'originale quanto al contenuto, alla forma, allo stile, alla funzione e infine al cosiddetto *génie de la langue*. Il traduttore cerca, dunque, di creare un testo che sia accessibile al futuro lettore secondario – il lettore della traduzione – dal punto di vista delle sue conoscenze e aspettative, quindi conforme al cosiddetto bagaglio cognitivo del ricevente.

Nel corso del XX secolo si è verificato un certo distacco tra ciò che viene chiamato la teoria e la pratica della traduzione. Alcuni ricercatori preferivano esaminare soprattutto i problemi di carattere teorico, trascurando di prendere in considerazione il processo traduttivo concreto e individuale e, allo stesso tempo, i traduttori esercitavano il loro mestiere senza una conoscenza teorica qualunque. Oggi la teoria e la pratica vengono considerate come due prospettive della stessa realtà, perciò tutte le traduzioni messe in atto non dovrebbero essere prive di un pensiero teorico. I frammenti della traduzione presi in esame sono chiaramente, come tutte le traduzioni di questo tipo, soltanto una proposta, una versione che potrà subire diversi cambiamenti e perfezionamenti. Il lavoro del traduttore

assomiglia, a quanto pare, alla creazione di un'opera artistica – qualora l'artista sia contento della sua opera, ciò significa che le sue capacità creative sono esaurite.

Bibliografia

- Adamczyk-Garbowska, M. (1988). *Polskie tłumaczenia angielskiej literatury dziecięcej*. Wrocław: Ossolineum.
- Balcerzan, E. (1998). *Literatura z literatury. (Strategie tłumaczy)*. Katowice: Śląsk.
- Ballard, M. (1984). *La Traduction: de la théorie à la didactique*. Lille: P.U.L.
- Darbelnet, J., Vinay, J.P. (1958). *Stylistique comparée du français et de l'anglais*. Paris.
- Campanile, A. (2002). *L'inventore del cavallo e altre quindici commedie*. Milano: Rizzoli.
- Koller, W. (1979). *Introduction a la science de la traduction*. Heidelberg.
- Ladmiral, R.L. 1986. Sourciers et ciblistes [in:] *Revue d'esthétique*. N.12. 33-42.
- Mounin, G. 1955. *Les belles infidèles*. Paris.
- Nida, E.A. 1964. *Towards a science of translation*. Leiden: E.J. Brill.
- Pisarska, A., Tomaszewicz T. (1996). *Współczesne tendencje przekładoznawcze*. Poznań: Wydawnictwo UAM.
- Podeur, J. (2002). *La pratica della traduzione. Dal francese in italiano e dall'italiano in francese*. Napoli: Liguori.

Dizionari:

- PSWP: Meisels W. (1986). *Podręczny słownik włosko polski*. Warszawa: Wiedza Powszechna.
- DeMauro: Dizionario De Mauro Paravia on line: <http://www.demauroparavia.it/>.
- DevotoOli: Devoto. G., Oli G. C. (2001). *Il dizionario della lingua italiana*. Firenze: Le Monnier.
- SSF: Kubiak-Sokół A. (2007). *Szkolny słownik frazeologiczny*. Warszawa: PWN.
- WSJP: *Wielki Słownik Języka Polskiego*; on line: www.wsjp.pl.

Daniel SŁAPEK

Uniwersytet Wrocławski
Ateneum – Szkoła Wyższa w Gdańsku
daniel.slapek@uwr.edu.pl

Carlos Pitel GARCÍA

Uniwersytet Jagielloński
Ateneum – Szkoła Wyższa w Gdańsku
carlos.pitel@uj.edu.pl

¿Por qué la lingüística cultural?

Summary

The present article presents some methodological assumptions of the anthropological linguistics, i.e. to linguistic research which emphasize the cultural conditioning of human linguistic activity. Starting with a brief outline of the Polish school of cultural linguistics, it promotes the positive attitude in humanistic research work, i.e. an open, antyparadigmatic and interpretative attitude. This attitude can be found in G. Godlewski's and C. Geertz's anthropology.

Keywords: anthropological linguistics, paradigm, language, culture

El lenguaje es una práctica social que sirve para expresar el significado. Como una práctica o una institución social, el lenguaje es “intersubjetivo”, “convencional” y “normativo”. En otras palabras el locus primario del lenguaje es una colectividad y no es individual; las formas lingüísticas emergen históricamente (convención) gracias a la aceptación de la comunidad (normatividad). Además, la “expresión de los significados” es la comunicación de los significados intersubjetivamente disponibles así como el intento para expresar significados sin precedentes, es decir, los significados que rompen las reglas (Pawelec, 2008, p. 107).

Problemas de la lingüística

Para empezar reformularemos a M. Augé: el primer problema de la lingüística es su propio nombre. Este mismo autor se refirió a la antropología con palabras semejantes (Augé, 1979, p. 9): aludió a la multitud de nombres y definiciones de esta corriente de investigación y, asimismo, “al lugar [de dicha corriente] en el campo de las humanidades y las ciencias, que está relacionado con la definición de

sus propios límites [...]” (Krawczak, 2006, p. 9). Aquí el problema lo interpretamos de otra manera. No se preocupa por la variedad ni por la denominación de las ramas de la lingüística (como, por ejemplo, estructural, generativa, cognitiva, etc., ya que todas están bajo un mismo signo “lingüística”), sino que se interesa más bien por lo que realmente significa la denominación como tal (puesto que el problema de los límites en la actualidad ha de abordarlo también nuestra disciplina¹).

Se sabe de qué se ocupa la lingüística: se ocupa del lenguaje². No obstante, si adoptamos una definición antropológica del lenguaje, comprobamos que probablemente, para los lingüistas, solo en un pequeño grado, la lengua es “una práctica social”, si bien poco a poco esta concepción va siendo aceptada por un círculo de lingüistas cada vez más amplio (especialmente por aquellos que pertenecen a una generación más joven). Sin embargo, aparte de las premisas filosófico-metodológicas declaradas, con frecuencia no se sigue la práctica investigadora correspondiente. En la tradición académica, entre otros en la didáctica, a pesar de lo apuntado todavía bajo el nombre lingüística se esconde principalmente la lingüística autónoma, que identifica el “lenguaje” con un sistema de signos modelado sin tener en cuenta las circunstancias de su empleo por el sujeto hablante. Merece la pena investigar los programas de asignaturas como “Introducción a la Lingüística” o “Lingüística General”. Según creemos, se comprobará que el mayor acento (y por lo tanto más horas didácticas) se pone en la lingüística autónoma o, más precisamente, estructural (la lingüística generativa aquí puede ser considerada como estructural, obviamente sin sus presupuestos mentalísticos).

Entonces, si la lingüística no examina el lenguaje de acuerdo con la definición mencionada, su propio nombre puede parecer injustificado. Creemos que merece la pena distinguir ya en la misma denominación entre el espectro más amplio de las ciencias lingüísticas (por no recurrir al término marcado de lingüística) y la gramática³. La lingüística autónoma sería entonces gramática – uno de los campos de lingüística, pero desprovista ya del status de “la lingüística”, por

¹ Citaremos aquí sólo un fragmento de la definición de lingüística de K. Polański: “Hay que subrayar que el límite evidente entre el aspecto lingüístico y los aspectos no lingüísticos de las investigaciones sobre la lengua no se pueden precisar, en especial hoy en día cuando existe, entre otras, una tendencia característica de integración de las ciencias” (Polański, 2003, p. 279).

² Aquí parafraseamos a C. Geertz. Él también se refería a la antropología (Geertz, 2000).

³ De hecho, el propio término *gramática* es tan ambiguo como el de *lingüística*. Basta citar aquí el texto de F. Grucza (1992) en que el autor analiza el significado de este término en la tradición glotodidáctica. Aquí por sistema gramatical entendemos “descripción de procedimientos morfológicos y reglas (normas) de conexión (procedimientos sintácticos) cohesionada internamente mediante relaciones estrictamente determinadas” (Polański, 2003, p. 208).

los motivos antes mencionados. Esta división de las investigaciones sobre la lengua (aquí en sentido amplio) no es nada nuevo. Como ejemplos señalamos la distinción entre autonomía y heteronimia de la lengua. La primera tiene que ver con el sistema de la lengua (modelo, objeto formal); la segunda, con la lengua determinada “ecológicamente”, es decir, en relación con hechos externos a la lengua (demográficos, geográficos, políticos etc.⁴, cfr Wąsik, 1997). O la diferencia entre segregación (la lengua como “un ser en sí y para sí mismo”, es decir, autonomía de la lengua) e integracionismo (orientado pragmático-lingüísticamente, antropológicamente, a la comunicación, cfr Korzyk, 1999, pp. 10-14). Dicotomías similares probablemente podrían multiplicarse.

El estructuralismo en la lingüística supuso, con el comienzo del siglo XX, por así decirlo, un triunfo de la ciencia: la lingüística por fin delimitó su propia metodología, lo que la transformó en una disciplina independiente. Sin embargo, esta metodología ha provocado de hecho la pérdida de un área de interés real, que creemos, es el ser humano. La lingüística es, a pesar de todo, una ciencia que estudia al ser humano de la misma manera que la filosofía, la antropología o la psicología, y en efecto con todas ellas se entrelaza desde el principio. A su vez, el lenguaje “acompaña” o “participa” en muchas formas de la actividad humana, casi “vive” su propia vida, es la *energeia* de Humboldt, una actividad, non gustaría decir incluso más, una actividad cultural. Como consecuencia “[...] las funciones vitales del lenguaje no pueden reducirse a operaciones intelectuales ni a la organización, recopilación y transmisión de información” (Godlewski, 2008, pp. 82) ni tampoco a su estructura interna.

El lenguaje es, sobre todo, un fenómeno cultural que tiene una base y un potencial cultural; que define la cultura y al ser humano como un individuo cultural; que precisa la realidad de la experiencia humana en formas que, por un lado, superan las determinaciones biológicas, y, por otro, sobrepasan las limitaciones de la privacidad del individuo. Tratado de esta forma el lenguaje no se corresponde con la perspectiva de la lingüística estructural: la mejor forma de investigarlo parece el enfoque antropológico (ibidem, p. 83).

El autor de la cita destaca además la importancia de los análisis interculturales, sin los cuales la propuesta de ideas generales sobre el lenguaje sería al menos difícil. Las investigaciones lingüísticas en tal caso se basarían en el

⁴ Los rasgos ecológicos de la lengua, entre otros, son: el lugar en la clasificación genética y tipológica, el origen de la lengua y sus “portadores”, la estructura demográfica, la historia de la lengua y sus “portadores”, la estandarización, la cultura, la política de la lengua, las funciones sociales, el apoyo planeado para el desarrollo de la cultura de la lengua, etc. (Wąsik, 1997).

relativismo cultural, y con ello los fenómenos ausentes en la cultura del investigador resultarían evidentes y, en consecuencia, susceptibles de análisis. Estamos completamente de acuerdo con esta opinión.

Merece la pena hacer aquí referencia de nuevo al enfoque integral mencionado anteriormente, más precisamente a “la lingüística comunicativa integral” según la versión presentada por K. Korzyk (1999). Este autor, al igual que R. Harris, destaca la participación del sujeto hablante, su actitud (verbal y no verbal) en la situación comunicativa concreta (en la interacción social). El sujeto que se comunica de un modo creativo emplea “un espacio comunicativo” porque el significado de un signo lingüístico (las expresiones del lenguaje, pero también todos otros tipos de signos) está indeterminado. La comunicación es “la (re)construcción de los significados” en la consciencia de los interlocutores. Desde esta perspectiva, la manera de organizar los elementos de la realidad comunicativa mencionada en “un conjunto significativo” depende del hablante, y “sobre la influencia que las reglas ejercen sobre el hablante de su propio idioma, no deciden sus propiedades, sino la manera en que los interesados tratan estas reglas” (ibidem, p. 24). Creemos que el camino para considerar de este modo la comunicación nos conduce en primer lugar a las reglas (en gran medida a las reglas culturales de la actividad lingüística) puesto que, antes de interpretar la participación o la contribución del sujeto hablante, creemos que sería conveniente saber qué entendemos por relación individual.

Si nos inclinamos todavía un poco más hacia la lingüística cultural, es por la siguiente razón: el enfoque cultural prescribe la búsqueda en la actitud lingüística de ciertas normas, reglas, repetibilidad cultural; en el enfoque comunicativo, creemos, sería necesario tratar por separado cada uno de los casos de los actos de comunicación. Quizás nuestra formación académica nos ha transmitido la convicción científica de que “lo científico se debe medir con el rigor de las regularidades detectadas” (Godlewski, 2008, p. 74). Estas regularidades (culturales) son las que al menos intentaríamos detectar. La opción por la lingüística comunicativa o la cultural tiene más bien que ver con la decisión individual de cada lingüista particular. Subrayamos de nuevo que en ambos casos consideramos que los fundamentos teóricos son razonables, y que los enfoques son, a nuestro juicio, complementarios. Así que puede ser que no sea necesario elegir entre la lingüística cultural y la comunicativa.

La escuela polaca de la lingüística cultural

A. Dąbrowska reconoce cinco fuentes de la lingüística cultural (creemos que no sólo en Polonia). Estas son: 1) las ideas de W. Humboldt, entre ellas, la de “espíritu de las naciones”, 2) la lingüística antropológica americana (aquí la autora se refiere sobre todo a la hipótesis de Sapir-Worf), 3) el neohumboldtismo de J. Trier y L. Weisgerber, 4) la interdisciplinariedad de las humanidades contemporáneas, 5) el cognitivismo (Dąbrowska, 2005, pp. 142). Estamos de acuerdo con los puntos 1-3. En estas tradiciones seguramente se pueden encontrar orígenes de la lingüística cultural, pero no incluiríamos los puntos cuarto y quinto como fuente de las investigaciones culturales centradas en la lengua. Diríamos más bien que el desarrollo de la lingüística antropológica (cultural) ha ido acompañado de esas dos últimas tendencias señaladas por Dąbrowska, pero el propio desarrollo de la lingüística cultural ha influido asimismo en ellos.

Quede resuelta o no la cuestión de las fuentes de la disciplina discutida aquí, en el ámbito lingüístico polaco la primera definición de lingüística cultural fue probablemente la que ofreció J. Anusiewicz, para quien se trata de una ciencia que investiga la relación de cuatro elementos: el lenguaje, la cultura, el ser humano (la sociedad) y la realidad, donde “la lengua es considerada como su condición inicial, su consecuencia, su componente, su ‘correa de transmisión’, y el intérprete e interpretante que contiene lo más sustancial de la cultura”⁵(Anusiewicz, 1994, 10). Además Anusiewicz diferencia las disciplinas asociadas, entre ellas: 1) la lingüística antropológica, donde el orden de las investigaciones de la relación

⁵ Los ámbitos del interés de así definida lingüística cultural, entre otros, son (citamos por: Anusiewicz, 1994, pp. 15-16, también en: Dąbrowska, 2005, pp. 144-145): los teóricos y metodológicos aspectos de la relación lengua-cultura; la historia del problema lengua-cultura en el concepto lingüístico y filosófico de Europa y América; el estado de las investigaciones sobre el tema de la relación lengua-cultura en la lingüística y filosofía europea y americana; las funciones culturales y formativo-culturales de la lengua y de los textos; las categorías gramaticales, semánticas y pragmáticas de una lengua determinada y sus aspectos culturales; el carácter cultural de la gramática, semántica y pragmática lingüística; los aspectos culturales de la categoría investigadora “la imagen lingüística del mundo”; la etiqueta lingüística que se refiere a la lengua nacional concreta y las lenguas de determinados grupos sociales-profesionales, de entorno, de edad y más; la cultura de una nación concreta, de una familia lingüística concreta en perspectiva de los nombres locales y personales- quiere decir, el problema de la relación: onomástica-cultura; influencias ajenas en una lengua determinada y el problema de la traducción de los textos y las culturas; el destino de las palabras, palabras compuestas, proverbios, nociones, categorías gramaticales, pragmáticas y semánticas y también los campos léxico-semánticos en la historia y actualmente de una lengua determinada (en el marco cultural); investigaciones sobre los tipos sociales y profesionales de la lengua en el marco cultural; el lenguaje de las subculturas. En gran medida estos objetivos siguen siendo actuales.

mencionada es diferente: el lenguaje – el hombre (la sociedad) – la realidad – la cultura, 2) la etnolingüística que principalmente explora la relación entre el lenguaje y la cultura tradicional, 3) la antropología lingüística que estudia la relación entre la cultura – el lenguaje – la sociedad (aquí el investigador sale precisamente de la cultura), y al mismo tiempo “las propuestas mencionadas sólo (o en gran medida) pueden ser verificadas por la práctica investigadora” (ibidem, p. 11).

De hecho, los estudios sobre la relación lenguaje-cultura, realizados desde casi veinte años antes de la fecha de publicación de *Lingüística cultural* (título original: *Lingwistyka kulturowa*), han verificado la clasificación propuesta, siendo algo así como la piedra de toque de la definición de la materia. En primer lugar, ya desde el principio parecía demasiado específico diferenciar entre la lingüística cultural y la antropológica (cfr Dąbrowska. 2005, pp. 140), el orden de los elementos mencionados es probablemente un criterio demasiado impreciso. En segundo lugar, *Etnolingüística* (en polaco *Etnolingwistyka* – revista científica de Lublin), que surgió con el propósito de publicar los resultados del trabajo sobre el *Diccionario de los estereotipos y los símbolos tradicionales*, con el tiempo ha cambiado su carácter folclórico, y su redactor ha redefinido los objetivos de los autores de la publicación, que pasarían a centrarse en “el lenguaje en todas sus variedades – también la más general – en su relación con la cultura, el hombre y la sociedad” (ibidem, p. 141). En consecuencia, lingüística cultural, lingüística cultural/antropológica y etnolingüística son nombres que en Polonia se usan como intercambiables. Un caso aparte lo constituye la antropología lingüística, que proviene de la cultura y no del lenguaje (aunque probablemente también aquí no haya un límite preciso).

¿Qué ocurre con los paradigmas?

Las teorías lingüísticas del siglo XX, que surgen de una actitud científica positivista y esencialista (Godlewski, 2008, p. 74), pueden ser consideradas paradigmáticamente, es decir, a través de una descripción en la que cada propuesta tiene un programa, una fuente de inspiración, unas definiciones y una serie de relaciones con una corriente de investigación concreta⁶. G. Godlewski, usando la “metáfora de las gafas” de Wittgenstein, delimita con acierto una práctica investigadora (en esta metáfora también se inscribe perfectamente la práctica lingüística) en la que precisamente las gafas, de un tipo específico, son un atributo inseparable del

⁶ Godlewski dice directamente: “el siglo XX en las humanidades se considera, sin duda, como el tiempo de los paradigmas” (ibidem, p. 74).

investigador: en vez de aclarar sus investigaciones, las deforman y al mismo tiempo las forman, porque el investigador puede ver solo lo que le permite ver la lente que lleva (ivi; señalamos aquí la correspondencia con el mito del marco común de K. Popper).

Simultáneamente, las humanidades del siglo XX con frecuencia se han limitado al debate metodológico y filosófico, es decir, al nivel metacientífico, y el conocimiento ha sido negado por constructores teóricos cada vez más refinados que han ganado en autonomía científica y se han convertido al mismo tiempo en instrumento y objeto del conocimiento científico. En este planteamiento “resultaría difícil encontrar la expresividad de la imagen – especialmente porque el objeto desaparece – y las formas que construyen el orden, ganan en libertad, cada vez menos sometidas a verificación empírica” (ibidem, p. 75). En consecuencia, la ciencia hoy en día adopta elementos propios del acto de escribir novelas, y en el marco de la lingüística sigue estando vigente la pregunta de I. Bobrowski: “¿Qué sentido tiene cultivar una lingüística metodológicamente disciplinada si [...] las humanidades son un conjunto de (meta)novelas, y estas novelas no se corresponden con las categorías tradicionales de lo verdadero y lo falso?” (Bobrowski, 2009, p. 7; merece la pena señalar aquí que los mismos que se oponen a la narración en la ciencia frecuentemente crean narraciones similares y se limitan solo a eso)⁷.

Se resuelva o no la cuestión de la “creación novelística” y la “creación teórica” en la ciencia, se puede tener la sensación, como apunta el ya mencionado repetidamente Godlewski, que la propia ciencia ha provocado la “derrota de la cosecha que ha matado tanto las teorías como la tierra en la que crecían” y “que muchos indicios apuntan a que empieza una época post-paradigmática” (Godlewski, 2008, p. 76). Este crepúsculo de los paradigmas, afortunadamente, no significa que el humanista actual esté obligado a moverse a oscuras, o incluso, a deambular en las oscuridades de las teorías pasadas, incapaz de “encontrarse en el mundo de la experiencia humana”. La salvación para él está en la actitud cognitiva positiva (no positivista), en la cual el investigador no está obligado a la rendición total, incluso sumisa, a las ideas de un sistema teórico-cognitivo concreto, pero tampoco se le exime de su responsabilidad en la mejora del conocimiento del mundo. Citamos por Godlewski:

⁷ No queremos depreciar aquí las reflexiones metodológicas (este estudio también tiene carácter de una), sin embargo la ciencia no se debe limitar sólo a su aspecto filosófico. Un lingüista leal, como creemos, no puede perder de vista su verdadero "objeto" de investigación. No nos podemos imaginar la situación cuando se realiza una investigación sin ninguna conciencia de las ampliamente entendidas metodología o filosofía de la ciencia. Tenemos la sensación de que esto hoy en día no es una norma, sobre todo, a consecuencia de la didáctica universitaria.

Generalmente, esta actitud se caracteriza por el giro hacia la realidad – entendido, por supuesto, no ingenuamente como un “retorno a las cosas” que se alimenta de las ilusiones del conocimiento directo, sino como una reivindicación del peso de la experiencia humana y de la realidad como su correlato intersubjetivo. Implica esto la adopción de una actitud abierta que renuncia a los supuestos iniciales del objeto y del modo de investigación, pero que en cambio aplica todos los medios disponibles, cualquiera que sea su origen, para que reconozca los fenómenos del mundo humano de manera plenamente efectiva. [...] el mismo proceso de conocimiento recordaría a un arte de interpretación en el cual, sin importar la pureza de la doctrina, en cada momento se utiliza un conjunto de instrumentos y referencias que garantizan tanto la versatilidad de la visión del fenómeno como la maximización de la capacidad de entender. En realidad no se trata solo de un método, sino más bien una actitud investigadora, a la vez antidogmática y ecléctica, orientada a la superación de la parálisis cognitiva que, hoy en día, se puede apreciar en gran parte de las humanidades. (ibidem, pp. 76-77)

Esta actitud se puede identificar fácilmente en las ciencias sobre la cultura, especialmente en la antropología interpretativa de C. Geertz, cuyos supuestos fundamentales, entre otros, son: a) el pluralismo en las investigaciones sobre la cultura, b) el rechazo del universalismo de las características humanas, c) la situación privilegiada del modelo “local” de conocimiento (es decir, el conocimiento relativo a un caso concreto promovido por un investigador concreto), d) el tratamiento histórico de la construcción de las identidades y los significados culturales (ivi). Efectivamente, el enfoque de Geertz supone una nueva manera de cultivar la antropología, cuyo propósito es la “interpretación de las culturas” (bajo este título Geertz publica también una de sus recopilaciones de ensayos más conocida: Geertz, 1973). La antropología (aquí también la lingüística, cfr Bogusławski, 1986) no es una ciencia nomotética, sino una ciencia “interpretativa que tiende a la reconstrucción de los significados”; en otras palabras: debe ser “la búsqueda interpretativa de los significados culturales que funcionan en el espacio social de las culturas entendidas como formas autónomas de estar en el mundo” (Pucek, 2003, p. 16). Según este enfoque se entendería la lingüística cultural como la parte de la antropología cultural que se concentra en los significados transmitidos a través de la lengua.

En la definición de Barnard el interpretacionismo de Geertz es una antropología de “lo *local* en tensa interacción con lo *global*” (Barnard, 2000, p. 220). La investigación de la cultura comenzaría con las observaciones de unos comportamientos concretos, con su “densa descripción”, y llevaría hasta el descubrimiento de las reglas a las que estos comportamientos están subordinados,

es decir, de qué manera están inscritos en “la red de significados” de Geertz⁸. Según creemos, también en la lingüística se debe procurar “la reconstrucción del orden cultural”, y “no se trata de ningún orden universal, aplicado con carácter general, sino de un orden de acuerdos limitados, locales, que emerge como el resultado de la investigación, y no como un supuesto o una premisa” (Godlewski, 2008, p. 78). La antropología es la “afortunada” disciplina que “parece que perdió generalmente todo lo obligatorio, o al menos, lo preferencial de la paradigmaticidad” (Pucek, 2003, p. 7). Las obras de Geertz no se pueden inscribir claramente en las dicotomías clásicas, siguen estando vivas en la ciencia actual, y probablemente por eso son antiparadigmáticas. Efectivamente Bernard sugiere supuestamente que esta actitud ha señalado el nuevo paradigma del conocimiento (Barnard, 2000, p. 220); en nuestra opinión la comprensión análoga del paradigma no es ya razonable.

Probablemente la perspectiva investigadora antropológica se adoptó en el pensamiento humanista contemporáneo. Sin duda es una fuente de inspiración cada vez más frecuente. Por esa razón quizá ya es el momento de que se adopte también en la lingüística. La antiparadigmaticidad, el intento de ir más allá del ámbito investigador impuesto por la tradición académica del que el investigador procede, el reconocimiento holístico y pluralista del objeto de las investigaciones, el diálogo de los diferentes círculos científicos, son las características que deben caracterizar la actitud investigadora del humanista actual. El mito del marco común tiene una influencia negativa en la práctica científica, y por tanto se debe, al menos, tratar de superarlo. Para concluir, buscando una cierta inspiración en el campo vecino de la psicología, recordaremos las palabras de Freud: “La fe en que el conocimiento se compone sólo de argumentos científicos estrictamente probados es falsa” (1917, p. 82). La mayoría de las afirmaciones científicas, al menos en las humanidades, es solo, hasta un cierto (ojalá máximo) nivel, probable. Creemos que esto, en gran medida, se corresponde con la concepción ya mencionada de Geertz. Ciertamente el interpretacionismo permite la coexistencia de interpretaciones diferentes. Este pluralismo podría servir de inspiración y resultar próspero. Entretanto, ¿cuáles son las consecuencias que derivan de esta situación para un lingüista joven que empieza a intentar situarse en una realidad académica intrincada? ¿Qué es lo que un lingüista joven debe estudiar en el comienzo de su carrera académica? Y aquí Freud nos da una indicación (ivi): “Una de las características del modo de pensar científico es la capacidad de sentirse satisfecho con las aproximaciones a la certeza y la posibilidad de continuar el trabajo constructivo a pesar de la falta de comprobaciones definitivas”.

⁸ Adoptando este supuesto en la lingüística, diríamos que la tendencia investigadora en la lingüística comunicativa y cultural es reflexiva.

Bibliografia

- Anusiewicz, J. (1994), *Lingwistyka kulturowa*. Wrocław: Wydawnictwo UWr.
- Augé, M. (1979). *Symbole, fonction, histoire. Les interrogations de l'anthropologie*. Paris: Hachette.
- Barnard, A. (2000). *History and Theory in Anthropology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bobrowski, I. (2009). „On truth of linguistic propositions”, *Studia linguistica Universitatis Jagellonicae Cracoviensis*, 126, pp. 7-24.
- Bogusławski, A. (1986). „O pojęciu wyjaśniania i wyjaśnianiu w lingwistyce”, [In:] Nagucka R. (red.). *Biuletyn Polskiego Towarzystwa Językoznawczego*, XL. Wrocław: Ossolineum, ss. 45-51.
- Dąbrowska, A. (2005). „Współczesne problemy lingwistyki kulturowej”, *Postscriptum*, nr 2/1 (48-49), ss. 140-154.
- Freud, Z. (1917). *Vorlesungen zur Einführung in die Psychoanalyse*. Leipzig-Vienna: Hugo Heller.
- Geertz, C. (1973). *The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays*. New York: Basic.
- Geertz, C. (2000). *Available Light. Anthropological Reflections on Philosophical Topics*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Godlewski, G. (2008). *Słowo – pismo – sztuka słowa. Perspektywy antropologiczne*. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo UW.
- Grucza, F. (ed.), (1992). *Gramatyka – konstrukt intelektualny czy rzeczywistość: glottodydaktyczne implikacje te alternatywy*. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo UW.
- Korzyk, K. (1999). „Język i gramatyka w perspektywie „komunikatywizmu”, [en:] Awdiejew A. (red.): *Gramatyka komunikacyjna*. Warszawa: PWN, ss. 9-32.
- Krawczak, E. (2006). *Antropologia kulturowa. Klasyczne kierunki, szkoły i orientacje*. Lublin: Wydawnictwo UMCS.
- Pawelec, A. (2008). „Mentalizm w badaniach nad językiem”, [In:] Stalmaszczyk P. (red.): *Metodologie językoznawstwa. Współczesne tendencje i kontrowersje*. Kraków: Lexis, ss. 105-131.
- Polański, K. (ed.). (2003): *Encyklopedia językoznawstwa ogólnego*. Wrocław: Ossolineum.
- Pucek, Z. (2003). „Clifford Geertz i antropologiczny Zeitgeist”, [Introducción a la traccucción polaca de Geertz:] Geertz C., 2003: *Zastane światło. Antropologiczne refleksje na tematy filozoficzne*. Kraków: Universitas, pp. V-XXIX.
- Wąsik, Z., (1997). *Systemowe i ekologiczne właściwości języka w interdyscyplinarnych podejściach badawczych*. Wrocław: Wydawnictwo UWr.

Zapomniane mapowanie, tożsamość tłumacza i emocje w przekładzie

Summary

This article aims to show the impact of the translator's identity on the translation into L1, as an example of the cognitive mechanism of metaphor, i.e. conceptual mapping from target to source. Firstly, the validity of this approach to translation, as proposed by A. Sophi S. Marmaridou (1996) is briefly characterized and related to the Cognitive Linguistics' view of language. Secondly, the most natural expression of such a mapping – which is the disclosure of the translator's emotions in the target text – is presented. The phenomenon is illustrated by numerous translations of the same text provided by novice translators, whose renderings of the source text content (along with simultaneous interpreting) as much as possible reveal this facet of the translator's identity that can be described as his/her voice speaking in his/her own name. Finally, the issue of cognitive factors in teaching translation is discussed and suggested for future research.

Keywords: Cognitive Linguistics, conceptual metaphor, Polish/Swedish translation, teaching translation

Wstęp

W jednej ze swoich prac Kirsten Malmkjær zauważa, że w rozwoju każdej dyscypliny następuje okres stagnacji, impasu i znużenia badaczy (Malmkjær, 2008). Spostrzeżenie to wydaje się trafne w odniesieniu do współczesnej translatoologii, na której gruncie prowadzi się badania bazujące na utartych, od lat niemodyfikowanych sposobach rozumienia opisywanych zjawisk. Zdaniem norweskiej badaczki, w takiej sytuacji wskazane jest sięgnięcie do korzeni danego obszaru badawczego i prześledzenie czy może na przestrzeni lat, w ferworze naukowej dyskusji nie pominięto jakichś myśli, których przywołanie mogłyby stanowić ożywczy impuls dla nowych ujęć, zarówno na płaszczyźnie teoretycznej jak i empirycznej. Spostrzeżenie to leży u podstaw niniejszego artykułu.

Punktem wyjściowym prezentowanych tu rozważań jest teza sformułowana przez grecką kognitywistkę A. Sophię S. Marmaridou (1996) dotycząca zakorzenienia przekładu na język ojczysty tłumacza (L1) w metaforze, w przypadku której struktury pojęciowe języka docelowego ulegają nałożeniu na struktury wyjściowe, co ma swoje źródło w tożsamości przekładawcy. Zgodnie

z tym postulatem kierunek odwzorowania w tłumaczeniu zostaje określony na linii od celu do źródła (*from target to source*), co można uznać za stanowisko opozycyjne w stosunku do ujęć tradycyjnych, przyjmujących, że odwzorowanie takie następuje w kierunku od źródła do celu (*from source to target*), a więc od treści konceptualnej oryginału do tekstu przekładu.

Teza greckiej badaczki nie doczekała się rozwinięcia w dyskusji translatologicznej w ciągu dwudziestu lat, które minęły od jej wyartykułowania w latach 90-tych ubiegłego stulecia. Dobrze wpisuje się natomiast w zintensyfikowane w ostatnim czasie kognitywne badania z zakresu psychologii tłumaczenia, obejmujące zarówno procesy poznawcze leżące u podstaw przekładu, jak i jego indywidualne uwarunkowanie. Jej reaktywacja może więc rozszerzyć nasz sposób patrzenia na komunikację poprzez translację. W artykule przeanalizuję zasadność scharakteryzowanego tu pokrótce podejścia do przekładu. W tak zarysowanym kontekście przedstawię najbardziej naturalny przejaw przekładowego mapowania (lub rzutowania) cel – źródło, jakim jest ujawnianie emocji tłumacza w tekście docelowym. Zjawisko zostanie zilustrowane w oparciu o liczne tłumaczenia tego samego tekstu dostarczone przez początkujących tłumaczy, których przekłady (obok tłumaczeń symultanicznych) w maksymalnym stopniu ujawniają ten aspekt tożsamości tłumacza, który można określić mianem „jego głosu przemawiającego w jego własnym imieniu”. W tak zarysowanym kontekście podjęta zostanie także kwestia uwzględnienia czynnika naturalności poznawczej w dydaktyce przekładu¹.

Kognitywizm w translatologii

U podstaw językoznawstwa kognitywnego leży założenie, że język stanowi integralną część ludzkiego systemu poznawczego, a jego funkcjonowanie powinno być wyjaśniane w oparciu o fakty na temat pozostałych aspektów natury ludzkiego poznania, które podlega nie tylko procesom percepcji i somatycznemu doświadczeniu, ale także stymulacji społecznej (Langacker, 2009, p. 50, Taylor, 2007, p. 10). Założenie to znacząco wpływa na sposób rozpatrywania zjawisk językowych przez kognitywistów.

Kognitywne spojrzenia na język implikuje także, że jako motywowany poznawczo rozpatruje się przekład (Marmaridou, 1996, p. 51). Zgodnie z takim ujęciem za zaskakujące lub nawet niedorzeczne należy uznać twierdzenie, że

¹ Artykuł zawiera częściowo treści opublikowane w książce autorki pt. *Eksplicytacja w nieprofesjonalnym przekładzie szwedzko-polskim. Perspektywa kognitywna* (Data-Bukowska, 2016).

tworzenie konceptualizacji w tłumaczeniu może bazować na przełamaniu utrwalonych w naszych umysłach procesów (mechanizmów) poznawczych. Tymczasem taki sposób postrzegania komunikacji poprzez translację wydaje się najbardziej rozpowszechniony w naszym kręgu kulturowym i jest przekazywany kolejnym pokoleniom tłumaczy m.in. poprzez dydaktykę przekładu. Przyjrzyjmy się podstawom, na których bazuje postawiona tu teza.

Metafora jako naturalny mechanizm poznawczy

Zdaniem kognitywistów metafora zajmuje czołowe miejsce wśród mechanizmów poznawczych odpowiedzialnych za użycie, rozumienie i wyrażanie treści językowych (Marmaridou, 1996, p. 52). Umożliwia człowiekowi zrozumienie jednego rodzaju doświadczenia przez pryzmat drugiego, tj. poznanie tego, co nowe, obce i trudno uchwytnie w oparciu o to, co znane i oswojone. Dlatego w każdym języku istnieje wiele przykładów realizacji metaforycznych przeniesień (por. Lakoff i Johnson, 1988, p. 77 ff).

W funkcjonowaniu metafory jako mechanizmu poznawczego istotne jest istnienie dwóch bytów, które ulegają konceptualnemu porównaniu ukierunkowanemu na wyłonienie zachodzących między nimi podobieństw. Nie trudno zatem zauważyć, że mechanizm ten w naturalny sposób wpisuje się w sytuację przekładu, w której przenoszenie treści pojęciowej między dwoma wybranymi językami nie może następować inaczej jak właśnie poprzez ustalenie takich analogii (Marmaridou, 1996, p. 53).

To, co kluczowe w kontekście przekładu dotyczy kierunku w jakim następuje wspomniane porównywanie elementów. Przyjmuje się, że w sytuacji metaforycznego mapowania byt stanowiący podstawę porównania jest konkretniejszy i bliższy naszemu doświadczeniu. Dlatego stanowi przestrzeń (domenę) źródłową. Natomiast byt porównywany jest bardziej abstrakcyjny i konstytuuje przestrzeń (domenę) docelową (por. Evans, 2007, p. 67, Nęcka, 1997, p. 191).

Mechanizm rozdzielenia treści poznawczej na bardziej konkretną i abstrakcyjną w przypadku metafory jest automatyczny i może dotyczyć różnych domen. Jako bardziej konkretna jest także traktowana domena doświadczeń socjo-kulturowych (w tym językowych), w których funkcjonuje dana osoba i które kształtują jej tożsamość.

Kierunek od „źródła do celu” jako aksjomat w przekładzie

W przekładzie tradycyjnie przyjmuje się, że odwzorowywanie treści zachodzi na linii tekst wyjściowy (TW) – tekst docelowy (TD). Chesterman (1997, p. 8) zalicza taki sposób rozumienia funkcjonowania procesu tłumaczenia do grupy memów (*memes*), które przez lata zostały utrwalone nie tylko w powszechnym przekonaniu ludzi – użytkowników języka, ale i na gruncie badań translatologicznych. Schemat poznawczy leżący u podstaw tego, jak sam to wyraża *the source-target supermeme*, implikuje nie tylko konkretny kierunek działania tłumacza, ale również przemierzanie ścieżki z punktu A do B oraz traktowanie TW i TD jako „pojemników”, które zawierają treści pojęciowe.

Bliższe przyjrzenie się analizie scharakteryzowanego tu pokrótce schematu, którą przeprowadza Chesterman (1997, p. 8) pokazuje jak bardzo sposób postrzegania kierunku działania tłumacza został utrwalony w naszej świadomości. Fiński badacz zaznacza że, wymieniony mem implikuje wędrówkę z punktu A do punktu B. Jednak jak podkreśla, tłumaczenia nie wędrują, gdyż działanie takie zakłada opuszczenie wyjściowej lokalizacji. Tak nie dzieje się jednak z TW, który po przełożeniu na inny język zostaje w swoim naturalnym kontekście i nadal czerpie z niego treści. Jednocześnie tekst taki wkracza na nowy grunt, czyli ulega powieleniu (*replicate*), co można uznać za przejaw jego ewolucji. Ewolucja łączy się natomiast z rozwojem, co ma miejsce w przypadku każdego przetłumaczonego tekstu, ponieważ akt tłumaczenia zawsze dodaje wartości (*adds values*) do TW. Na wartości te składają się interpretacje tego tekstu dokonywane przez jego odbiorców docelowych, którzy czerpią doświadczenie z innego zaplecza kulturowego. Chesterman kwestionuje więc motoryczny aspekt memu (wyobrażenia przekładu), nie zaś kierunek działania, który stanowi jeden z atrybutów konstytuujących tę zapisaną w naszych umysłach treść pojęciową.

W kontekście niniejszych rozważań szczególnie interesujące wydaje się natomiast stwierdzenie badacza dotyczące „dodawania wartości” do TW. Jeśli następuje ono w umysłach odbiorców tłumaczenia takiego tekstu, musi także zachodzić w umyśle tłumacza, który jako pierwszy wchodzi w kontakt z oryginałem z pozycji innej kultury aniżeli wyjściowa. Zwrócenie uwagi na ten aspekt sytuacji przekładowej jest więc nie bez znaczenia. Pozwala bowiem dostrzec, że wspomniane „dodawanie wartości” nie może bazować na eksponowanym w charakterystyce memu kierunku działania „od źródła do celu”, lecz raczej na kierunku odwrotnym.

Kierunek „od celu do źródła” jako motywowany poznawczo

Zdaniem Marmaridou (1996) transfer treści, o którym mowa następuje w odwrotnym kierunku, tj. na linii cel – źródło, co jest wpisane w ludzki system kognitywny „wytrenowany” w stosowaniu metafory jako istotnego narzędzia poznawczego. Stwierdzenie to wynika z powszechnie akceptowanego faktu dotyczącego rozumienia wypowiedzi językowych jako takich. Rozumienie treści w danym języku jest bowiem zawsze indywidualne. Jest ono także w pełni możliwe jedynie dla członków konkretnej wspólnoty kulturowej. Sytuacja nie wygląda inaczej w przypadku TW, który swój pełny potencjał, ukształtowany przy pomocy wyselekcjonowanych środków językowych, może rozwinąć w umysłach rodzimych użytkowników tego języka (Marmaridou, 1996, p. 53).

Zadaniem tłumacza jest odczytanie treści pojęciowej wyzwalanej przy pomocy TW oraz sprawienie, że konceptualizacja wyjściowa będzie zrozumiała dla odbiorców docelowych. Jak zaznacza badaczka (*ibidem*), to w tym momencie daje o sobie znać zakorzeniony w naszych umysłach mechanizm metafory. Wpływa on bowiem na proces rozumienia TW przez tłumacza oraz na wykreowaną w jego umyśle koncepcję, co z kolei, w momencie transferu odciska swój ślad na tekście docelowym.

Marmaridou (1996, p. 63) podkreśla, że w sytuacji **gdy zgodność struktur między językami spotykającymi się w przekładzie** (z jakiś powodów) **nie zachodzi** w umyśle tłumacza, musi on „mentalnie powrócić” do TW, co następuje zawsze na warunkach języka docelowego, tj. z jego perspektywy. Tylko wtedy możliwe jest bowiem zrealizowanie tłumaczenia, które jest funkcjonalne pod względem komunikacyjnym. Skrajnym przejawem takiego mentalnego powrotu na linii cel – źródło jest także sytuacja całkowitego niezrozumienia TW przez tłumacza, owocuująca w pełni dowolną konceptualizacją docelową.

Scharakteryzowana tu prawidłowość bazuje na opisywanym w psychologii argumentie ubóstwa bodźca (*poverty of stimulus argument*) (por. Najder, 1997). W pewnych sytuacjach bodźce dopływające do receptorów postrzegającego podmiotu są zbyt ubogie by mógł on dokonać rozpoznania obiektów i ich porównania. Obiekt ulega takiemu rozpoznaniu tylko dlatego, że człowiek spodziewa się go, nie dlatego, że sam z siebie posiada cechy umożliwiające takie rozpoznanie. W miejscach, w których system poznawczy nie otrzymuje wystarczających danych bodźcowych uzupełnia je własnymi informacjami, tzw. wartościami domyślnymi (*default values*). W wyniku tego produkt percepcji może być bogatszy od bodźców, które docierają do człowieka. Ponadto „im uboższe dane receptoryczne, tym większe prawdopodobieństwo, że uzupełnienie będzie nieodpowiednie” a sam obiekt ulegnie przekształceniu (Najder, 1997, p. 39).

Jeśli zatem bodźce języka wyjściowego są zbyt słabe, bo z jakiś powodów tłumacz ich nie odbiera (np. ponieważ sposoby konstruowania konceptualizacji różnią się w dwóch językach i trudno jest odnaleźć między nimi zbieżności konceptualne), tłumacz zostaje zmuszony do wprowadzania takich „wartości domyślnych” czerpanych z własnego systemu pojęciowego.

Dlatego można założyć, że nawet jeśli wydaje się nam, że wyjściowo proces rozumienia TW w przekładzie wychodzi od struktur TW, poznawczo proces ten, przynajmniej częściowo, musi wyglądać inaczej, tj. zachodzić w kierunku odwrotnym: od struktur docelowych do wyjściowych, na co wyraźnie wskazują psychologiczne badania nad ludzkim poznaniem. Za tak określonym kierunkiem mapowania przemawia chociażby powszechnie akceptowany fakt, że ludzie zazwyczaj przywiązują się to tego, co uznają za własne (w sensie przekonań, wartości, opinii, itp.). Eksperymenty psychologów pokazują także, że nie zapamiętują oni postrzeganych obrazów takimi, jakie te są obiektywnie, ale takimi, jak zostały zinterpretowane przez ich umysły. Pamiętają więc interpretację i nadany danemu obrazowi własny sens. Takie „oswajanie” tego, co nowe przy pomocy tego, co znane jest nieuświadomione i w pełni zautomatyzowane (Nowak, 1997, p. 105). Następuje także podczas czytania i rozumienia tekstu. Jak trafnie wyraża to Furmanek (2006, p. 64) „the reader lets the text work in his/her cognitive baggage”.

Zwrócenie uwagi na mechanizm metafory i kierunek transferu treści poznawczej na linii cel- źródło w procesie translacji wydaje się zatem w pełni uzasadnione. Dodatkowo, co podkreśla Marmaridou (1996), pozwala wyeksponować rolę tożsamości tłumacza w procesie tłumaczenia. Wyzwalaczem poznawczego mechanizmu metafory jest bowiem to, co w procesie mediacji pochodzi od przekładowcy jako suwerennej jednostki, wyposażonej w konkretny aparat poznawczy i funkcjonującej w określonych warunkach socjo-kulturowych. To dzięki *swojej* wiedzy i doświadczeniu, „zasiedziały” w jego umyśle treści pojęciowej, jest on w stanie „oswajać” i organizować to, co nowe, bo wyrosłe na gruncie innego systemu konceptualnego.

Tożsamość tłumacza jako źródło metafory

W jakim zakresie tożsamość tłumacza wpływa więc na przekład? Zgodnie z najbardziej powszechnym ujęciem tego pojęcia wyłaniającym się z prac psychologów (por. Gałdowa 2000: 9ff), tożsamość jest indywidualną wizją własnej osoby, którą posiada każdy człowiek. Odnosi się nie tylko do jego wyglądu i zachowania, ale także do cech psychicznych. Dlatego w psychologii rozpatruje się ją w kontekście dwóch kardynalnych relacji: stosunku człowieka do samego

siebie (tożsamość osobista) i stosunku do innych ludzi w grupie (tożsamość społeczna). Co istotne, chodzi tu o mniej lub bardziej świadome lub nieświadome postawy przyjmowane przez konkretną osobę, które formuje ona przez całe życie w oparciu o pozyskiwaną wiedzę o świecie. Jednocześnie tożsamość może ulegać modyfikacji w zależności od tego, z kim przebywa dana osoba, z jakimi warunkami kulturowymi się styka, jaką posiada rolę w grupie, itd. Współzycie w grupie często zmusza więc do nakładania masek, które zapewniają jednostce akceptację. Jednak przywdziewanie maski zawsze pozostaje w konflikcie z tożsamością osobistą człowieka. Jak zauważa Gałdowa (2000, p. 12), na masce „prędzej czy później zaczynają się pojawiać rysy, gdyż niezgodność między tym, kim się jest – poczuciem własnej tożsamości – a charakterem maski zaczyna być zbyt uciążliwa”.

Kluczową rolę w procesie tłumaczenia i kształtowania TD odgrywa więc umysł tłumacza i zgromadzone tam doświadczenie konstytuujące tożsamość przekładowcy. Tekst wyjściowy wydaje się jedynie dostarczać impulsów mających na celu pobudzenie tak rozumianego systemu. Neubert (1997, p. 9) wskazuje jednak na złożoność kwestii tożsamości tłumacza jako takiej. Badacz zaznacza, że rola przysługująca tłumaczowi różni się od roli monolingwalnego użytkownika języka, co wpływa na działalność językową przekładowców. Mediator zawsze lokalizuje się w odległości od komunikujących się stron – autora i potencjalnego odbiorcy. Tak jak to ujmuje ten badacz „communication at a distance” oznacza, że od tłumacza oczekuje się, że **nie będzie włączał się do komunikacji i wzbogacał jej treści**. Ten status „outsidera” ma bez wątpienia wpływ na procesy psychologiczne zachodzące w umyśle tłumacza, których efekty mogą się ujawniać w przekładach. Z drugiej strony tłumaczenie nie łączy się z kopiowaniem struktur wyjściowych, ponieważ ze względu na różnice konceptualne zachodzące między językami działanie takie jest możliwe tylko w ograniczonym zakresie. Dlatego tłumacz musi także przyjmować postawę kreatora treści, tak jakby był jej „prawdziwym” autorem. Takie, jak określa to Neubert przeformułowywanie treści na odległość (*rephrasing at a distance*) oznacza dla tłumacza ciągłe monitorowanie transferu z uwzględnieniem TW, oczekiwań odbiorcy, jak i własnego potencjału intelektualnego (Neubert, 1997, p. 9-10).

Fakt ten w linii prostej implikuje, że poza w pełni indywidualnymi cechami, które konstytuują tożsamość tłumacza jako użytkownika języka, przekład łączy się także z istnieniem jego szczególnej tożsamości zawodowej (profesjonalnej), ukształtowanej w ramach konkretnego kręgu kulturowego i wpływającej na ostateczną wersję tekstu tłumaczenia. Słabym punktem podstawy takiego rozróżnienia jest jednak fakt, że na gruncie translatologii jak do tej pory nie wypracowano spójnego stanowiska dotyczącego tego, w jakim zakresie tłumacz może pozwolić sobie na rolę kreatora.

Meylaerts (2008, p. 94) zauważa, że tłumacza zazwyczaj postrzega się przez pryzmat profesji. Jest on bowiem w pierwszym rzędzie mediatorem, od którego oczekuje się pełnego profesjonalizmu. Rzadko traktuje się go natomiast jako ukształtowanego poznawczo i społecznie człowieka. W powszechnym przekonaniu działania tłumaczy nie powinny zatem nosić znamion kreatywności, którą w najbardziej powszechnym rozumieniu tego pojęcia utożsamia się z nowatorstwem (por. Data-Bukowska, 2011). Dominującym rysem w kwestii postawy „zawodowej” lub profesjonalnej tłumacza jest jego niewidzialność (Venuti, 1995) i bezwzględna wierność TW. Jak podkreśla Kussmaul, opinia ta uwidoczniła się już w kluczowych dla nauki o przekładzie pojęciach ekwiwalencji i adekwatności, bazujących na założeniu, że zadaniem tłumacza jest tak wierne jak to możliwe odtworzenie treści TW w tłumaczeniu (Kussmaul, 2000, p. 57). Przyjęto się także uważać, że tłumacze nie wytwarzają własnych tekstów, ale jedynie pochodne tekstów autorów oryginalnych. Przekonanie to utrwały formułowane przez lata „zalecenia” dotyczące tego jak należy tłumaczyć. Zgodnie z jednym z nich tłumaczenie jest zawsze reakcją na TW a tłumaczowi nie wolno działać autonomicznie (Wilss, 1996, p. 53).

W jaki sposób mapowanie cel – źródło ujawnia się w przekładzie?

Wyposażony w dany aparat poznawczy tłumacz w naturalny sposób aktywuje rodzime struktury poznawcze języka docelowego (ojczystego) i w oparciu o nie kategoryzuje dostępne w TW treści, co jest przejawem jego tożsamości. Kluczowe pytania, które nasuwają się w tak zarysowanym kontekście dotyczą więc tego w jaki sposób teksty tłumaczeń ujawniają funkcjonowanie metafory konceptualnej cel-źródło oraz w jakim zakresie tożsamość tłumacza, leżąca u podstaw takiego mapowania jest uwzględniana w dyskusji translatologicznej. W artykule Marmaridou (1996) można odnaleźć pewne informacje dotyczące tej kwestii, chociaż są one bardzo ogólne.

Najbardziej wyrazistym przejawem mapowania cel – źródło w przekładzie jest stosowanie konwencjonalnego sposobu obrazowania charakterystycznego dla języka docelowego w odniesieniu do treści wyjściowej. Styl języka docelowego dominuje bowiem nad stylem TW (Marmaridou, 1996, p. 56). Mechanizm ten łączy się także z opisywaną przez badaczy przekładu tendencją do standardyzacji języka w tłumaczeniu, tj. wykorzystywania przez tłumaczy jego najbardziej konwencjonalnych (wzorcowych) struktur (Englund Dimitrova, 1997, p. 63). Ponieważ wycucie rodzimej kultury i języka jest zwykle lepsze niż dostęp do

treści odmiennych kulturowo, przekład na język ojczysty tłumacza daje lepsze rezultaty niż tłumaczenie na język obcy. Zdaniem Marmaridou (1996, pp. 60-61) to także przejaw metafory konceptualnej cel – źródło w tłumaczeniu.

Spektrum wspomnianych wcześniej „wartości domyślnych” będących efektem metaforycznego mapowania, które mogą zaistnieć w tłumaczeniu jest jednak bardzo szerokie. Hermans (1996, p. 27) mówi o obecności głosu tłumacza w dyskursie i zaznacza, że głos taki staje się szczególnie interesujący, gdy jak ujmuje to sam badacz „it breaks through the surface of the text **speaking for itself, in its own name**” (Hermans, 1996, p. 27, podkreślenie E. D.-B.). Przegląd nurtów badań translatorskich prowadzonych w ostatnich dwóch dekadach umożliwia stwierdzenie o jakie treści może chodzić.

Indywidualny głos tłumacza przejawia się na płaszczyźnie szeroko rozumianej ideologii, a więc systemu pojęć społecznych, politycznych, religijnych podzielanych przez jakąś grupę ludzi (van Dijk, 2000, p. 5). Zdaniem Munday’a (2008) ideologia zawsze ma wpływ na decyzje translatorskie podejmowane w procesie mediacji i przenika do konceptualnego obrazu w przekładzie. Dlatego we współczesnych badaniach translologicznych podnosi się kwestię etnocentryczności tłumaczeń, ich uwarunkowań historycznych, dominacji (władzy), manipulacji, ironii, itp., zapisanych ręką tłumacza w konceptualizacji w TD (np. Gruszczynska, 2011, 2012; Mason, 1994; Munday, 2008; Newmark, 1997; O’Sullivan, 2003; Valerio, 2013). Treść konceptualną w przekładzie rozpatruje się także przez pryzmat feminizmu (Modrea, 2005; Leonardi, 2007; Simon, 1996). Niektórzy badacze mówią nawet o ideologii tłumaczenia, a więc świadomie wybieranej przez tłumacza perspektywie postrzegania treści wyjściowej, realizowanej podczas powstawania TD (Hsieh, 2002).

Głos tłumacza rozpatruje się także w kategoriach jego stylu. Tego rodzaju „odciski palców” pozostawione przez tłumaczy na tekstach przekładów stanowią o unikalności wykreowanej w TD konceptualizacji (np. Baker, 2000; Mikhailov i Villikka, 2001; Wang i Li, 2011). Zdaniem Boase-Beier (2006, p. 1, podawane za Wang i Li 2011, p. 1) na styl wpływają jednak nie tylko wybory na poziomie zastosowanych środków językowych dokonane przez tłumacza, ale także jego **indywidualny sposób językowej ekspresji myśli** obecny w TD. Nie jest bowiem możliwe stworzenie wypowiedzenia językowego w bezosobowy sposób. Wang i Li (2011, p. 9) wykazują, że charakterystyczny dla tłumacza sposób wyrażania się w komunikacji monolingwalnej zaznacza się także w jego przekładach.

W zarysowanym tu kontekście na wyróżnienie zasługuje także aspekt psychologiczny tworzonej konceptualizacji, związany z sygnalizowaniem w TD emocji, które stanowią nierozdzielny element tożsamości tłumacza (Furmanek, 2006). W ramach tego nurtu badań mieszczą się studia poświęcone modalności,

która jest traktowana jako językowy sposób wyrażania indywidualnego, subiektywnego i nacechowanego emocjonalnie punktu widzenia tłumacza (np. Badran, 2001). Tak rozumiany rodzaj samoekspresji tłumacza łączy się ze spontanicznością i brakiem samokontroli. Dlatego, jak można przypuszczać, zaznacza się szczególnie wyraźnie podczas tłumaczeń symultanicznych lub w tłumaczeniach adeptów przekładu, którzy nie zdążyli jeszcze w pełni wejść w rolę zawodową tłumacza. Ten rodzaj głosu tłumacza przemawiający w jego imieniu jest ciągle stosunkowo słabo poznany na gruncie translatoologii.

Ekspresja emocji w języku

Emocje można porównać do wielobarwnej tęczy, gdzie każdy z kolorów stanowi ich realizację (Falkowski et al., 1997, p. 212). Definiuje się je jako stany i procesy (podlegające zmianom w czasie) występujące wewnątrz jednostki i zależne od niej. Jako silnie związane z osobowością człowieka bardzo wyraźnie oddziałują one na odbiorcę. Powszechne jest zjawisko „zarażania emocjami” (Falkowski et al., 1997, p. 213). Można zatem stwierdzić, że ujawniając swoje emocje w przekładzie tłumacz „zaraża” nimi odbiorcę tekstu, kształtując zdarzenia, o których mowa.

Psychologowie podkreślają, że wyrażanie emocji jest podstawową potrzebą człowieka. Emocje pierwotne są wrodzone i uruchamiane automatycznie (tak jak ma to np. miejsce na widok dużego zbliżającego się do nas obiektu). W przypadku emocji wtórnych bodźce emotogenne aktywują odpowiednie struktury w korze mózgowej. Pobudzone struktury kory generują natomiast wyobrażenia związane z sytuacją emotogenną. Dopiero wyobrażenia (dzięki temu, że powstały w oparciu o indywidualne doświadczenia każdego człowieka) aktywizują struktury podkorowe (Falkowski et al., 1997, p. 218). Jak wyrażają to Falkowski et al. (1997, p. 218): „Proces spostrzegania bodźców emotogennych i uruchomienie procesu generowania wyobrażeń w takim przypadku – wymaga refleksji (niekoniecznie świadomej), odwołania się do doświadczenia, które nie jest już doświadczeniem gatunkowym, ale stanowi doświadczenie indywidualne [...]” Tym samym wzbudzone w każdym człowieku emocje są wyraźnym przejawem jego tożsamości osobistej.

Badanie obecności emocji w języku jest bardzo złożone. Autorzy prac językoznawczych podejmujących tę kwestię koncentrują się głównie na językowym nazywaniu emocji (np. Gruszczyńska, 2003, 2005; Wierzbicka, 1999). Rzadko zajmują się natomiast **ich wyrażaniem** w języku, co może być spowodowane brakiem odpowiednich materiałów badawczych (Data, 2000, p. 245). Emocje ujawniają się bowiem najwyraźniej, gdy porówna się kilka wypowiedzi odnoszących się do tego samego zdarzenia. Sytuacja wygląda

podobnie na gruncie badań nad przekładem, gdzie dominują prace bazujące na tradycyjnym modelu procesu tłumaczenia źródło – cel, a więc dotyczą realizacji językowych wykładników emocji (głównie jednostek leksykalnych) obecnych w TW w tłumaczeniach (np. Gruszczyńska, 2001).

Stany emocjonalne mogą być jednak wyrażane, komunikowane lub się przejawiać w języku (Data, 2000, p. 247). Zdaniem Furmanek (2006, p. 58) ich obecność w przekładzie ma swoje podstawy w dialogicznym charakterze tego aktu, ponieważ jak wyraża to ta badaczka: „Thinking is dialogue with oneself and reading is dialogue with the text. Translation involves both forms of dialogue”.

W przekładzie chodzi więc nie tylko o dialog tłumacza z tekstem ale także ze swoim wewnętrznym ja (*his own inner self*), co może prowadzić do wzbudzenia w jego umyśle różnych uczuć, np. podekscytowania, poczucia winy, traumy, itd., kojarzonych z jego indywidualnymi wspomnieniami, pragnieniami, doświadczeniami. Zgodnie z tym stanowiskiem odczuwane przez każdego z nas emocje są jednym z czynników stanowiących podstawę wyboru parametrów lingwistycznych, nie tylko w sytuacji monolingwalnej, ale i bilingwalnej (Furmanek, 2006, p. 60). Oznacza to, że emocje wpływają na nasze decyzje konceptualizacyjne i zostają uwzględnione w tworzonych obrazach językowych. Bez nich proces tłumaczenia byłby niekompletny.

Z drugiej strony zakres ujawnianych w ramach sytuacji komunikacyjnej emocji zależy także od kulturowego charakteru języka. Wiadomo bowiem, że jedne języki (np. japoński) preferują lakoniczny, inne zaś (np. hiszpański) nacechowany bardziej emocjonalnie sposób ekspresji (por. Furmanek, 2006, p. 62, Hurtado de Mendoza, 2008).

W tekstach pisanych emocje są jednak rzadko wyrażane w sposób bezpośredni, chociaż, co należy podkreślić, intensywność doznań w przypadku tłumaczenia, spowodowana faktem, że tłumacz zazwyczaj w ponadprzeciętny sposób przybliży się do treści TW, sprzyja uaktywnianiu bodźców emotogennych. O przejawianiu się emocji (tj. gdy nie są one wyrażane wprost) można natomiast wnioskować z językowego kształtu wypowiedzi mówiącego, często wbrew jego woli. Pauzy i przerwy w toku wypowiedzi, zaburzenia w składni, powtórzenia, mogą być spowodowane m.in. zdenerwowaniem, strachem, radością autora komunikatu, itp. (Data, 2000, p. 249) Dlatego, jak podkreśla Data (2000, p. 246) badanie emocji z perspektywy językoznawcy ogranicza się do obrazu danego stanu wewnętrznego mówiącego zawartego w znaku językowym. Autor komunikatu zawsze ukazuje też swój stan emocjonalny wartościując zjawiska negatywnie lub pozytywnie (Data, 2000, p. 249). Jak ujmuje to Furmanek (2006, p. 68): “The resistance of interpreters (the translators, uzupełnienie E. D.-B.) to use terminology in certain fields, the types of their most common errors, and their

preference for some expressions not entirely appropriate for the register required by the situation, depend not only on the level of their linguistic competence and professional experience but also on their linguistic-emotional baggage”.

Data (2000) przedstawia wyczerpujący przegląd różnych klasyfikacji językowych sposobów wyrażania emocji, które można odnaleźć w pracach wielu badaczy. Ich odtworzenie wykracza jednak poza ramy niniejszych rozważań, których celem jest jedynie zarysowanie zagadnienia obecności emocji na gruncie komunikacji poprzez translację jako przejawu mapowania cel- źródło i tożsamości tłumacza. Dlatego ograniczę się do zaprezentowania jednej z takich taksonomii, która pomoże nam wstępnie uporządkować materiał językowy zgromadzony na potrzeby analizy².

Podstawowym środkiem wyrażania emocji są wykrzykniki, które nie nazywają, lecz wyrażają różne emocje, uczucia i działania rozmówcy oraz jego stosunek do rzeczywistości. Nowakowska-Kempna (1986, podawane za Data, 2000, p. 248) wyróżnia także inne środki:

- powtórzenia wyrazów, np. *a idźże, idźże, idźże ty!*;
- używanie wyrazów i zwrotów nacechowanych ekspresywnie, np. *i znów cholera smrodzi! Wywalaj stąd!*;
- odpowiedni dobór środków leksykalnych, np. w sygnalizowaniu podziwu, antypatii, pogardy: *a dobrze no, ale ta Ela jest świnią, z taką szczerbatą* (por. Data, 2000, pp. 248-249).

Do wyrażania emocji w sposób pośredni służą także środki słowotwórcze (deminutiva, augmentatywa) (Data, 2000, p. 249).

Ekspresja emocji tłumacza jako przejaw funkcjonowania metafory w przekładzie

Ponieważ jedni ludzie są bardziej bezpośredni i ekspresyjni w kontaktach, inni bardziej formalni, tego rodzaju cechy tożsamości osobistej jest też najtrudniej kontrolować tłumaczowi. Dlatego w badaniu przyjęto, że jedną z płaszczyzn sygnalizowania emocji w przekładzie mogą być treści, których obecność trudno potwierdzić w TW. Takie uzupełnienia informacji w tłumaczeniach spełniają nierzadko funkcję emotywną (tj. służą wyrażaniu emocjonalności tłumacza) oraz ekspresyjną (tj. są nastawione na wywarcie wrażenia na potencjalnym odbiorcy).

W celu przesłedzenia w jaki sposób emocje są wyrażane przez tłumaczy przeanalizowano 34 tłumaczenia na język polski wybranego szwedzkiego tekstu,

² Należy podkreślić, że praca polskiej badaczki może także stanowić solidną podstawę pod bardziej zaawansowane analizy emocjonalnego nacechowania komunikacji językowej w przekładzie.

sporządzone przez początkujących tłumaczy, którzy nadesłali prace na konkurs translatorski organizowany przez Zakład Filologii Szwedzkiej IFG UJ w 2009 roku³. Szczegółowej analizie poddano 9 wybranych jednostek TW. Ze zgromadzonych tłumaczeń tych jednostek wyłoniono występujące w nich uzupełnienia treści, której obecności nie można potwierdzić w oryginale nawet na płaszczyźnie implicytności⁴. Łącznie zgromadzono 90 przykładów, które następnie zostały pogrupowane w bardziej szczegółowe kategorie.

Już pierwsze spojrzenie na zgromadzone tłumaczenia pozwoliło ustalić, że w zastosowanych przez tłumaczy rozwiązaniach translatorskich chodzi nie tylko o różne sposoby konceptualizowania tej samej wyjściowej sytuacji, ale także o ujawnienie stanu umysłu tłumacza i emocji wzbudzanych w nim pod wpływem treści TW. Zestawienie przykładów poniżej pokazuje, że wyjściowa konceptualizacja *Det är konstigt, det borde vara tvärtom*, którą z powodzeniem można zrealizować przy pomocy polskiego wypowiedzenia 'To dziwne, powinno być na odwrót' została w wielu tekstach tłumaczeń wzbogacona o dodatkowe treści, które zmieniają jej wydźwięk:

Killar är sådana. Det är konstigt, det borde vara tvärtom. (L: 21)

Faceci już tacy są. **Choć** to dziwne, **bo przecież** powinno być odwrotnie. [...]. (32)

[...] **Dziwne, bo przecież** powinno być na odwrót. [...]. (34)

[...] To dziwne, **przecież** powinno być **dokładnie** na odwrót. [...]. (16)

[...] To dziwne, **tak naprawdę** powinno być odwrotnie. [...]. (19)

[...] To dziwne, **ponieważ** powinno być **raczej** odwrotnie. [...]. (29)

Wyróżniono następujące typy wykładników emocji w zgromadzonym materiale. Spektrum ujawnianych stanów jest bardzo szerokie, od oburzenia, poprzez ton zniechęcenia, niepewności, podekscytowania, sympatii/antypatii, itd.:

1). Wyrażenia wykrzyknikowe sygnalizujące bezpośrednie emocje

³ Tłumaczeniu podlegało opowiadanie pt. *Angelägenheten* (L), autorstwa współczesnego szwedzkiego pisarza, Fredrika Lindströma pochodzące z tomu *Vad gör alla superokända människor hela dagarna?* Stockholm, Bonniers, 2003. Każdemu z nadesłanych tekstów nadano numer (1)-(34), który widnieje przy przywoływanych w artykule przykładach językowych.

⁴ Ponieważ kwestia implikowania treści w TW jest zjawiskiem skalarnym i trudno uchwytym (w rzeczywistości nie można przewidzieć w pełni jakie skojarzenia dana struktura wyjściowa wywoła w umyśle konkretnego tłumacza) nie będziemy się nią zajmować bliżej. Należy jednak podkreślić, że przedmiotem analizy w artykule były jedynie jednoznaczne przypadki dodawanie treści w różnych punktach wypowiedzenia w TD. Chodzi więc o struktury, w których przypadku w TW nie istniał żaden bodziec językowy pozwalający na wypuklenie treści w TD.

[...] det borde vara tvärtom. (L: 21)

[...] **Ale** cóż, oni zachowują się zupełnie inaczej. [...] (2)

Wyrażenie *ale cóż* zostało w przekładzie wpisane w wypowiedź postaci w tekście. W rzeczywistości stanowi jednak wyraz stanu emocjonalnego tłumacza, wywołanego w jego umyśle pod wpływem sytuacji, o której mowa w TW. Tłumacz nie ogranicza się więc do stwierdzenia faktu, tak jak ma to miejsce w oryginale, ale również wprowadza w ramy konceptualizacji ton zwątpienia połączony z pogodzeniem się z rzeczywistością.

2). Wyrażenia o charakterze wykrzyknikowym

(2.1)

Hon har ett fantastiskt rikt liv; hon älskar sin självständighet, sin frihet, sina frukostar på balkongen, [...]. Allt. (L: 22)

Angela prowadzi niesamowicie bogate życie. Uwielbia swoją niezależność, swoją wolność, swoje śniadania na balkonie, [...] **Wszystko to naprawdę kocha.** (30)

(2.2)

Hon kan bli så trött på sig själv, på den här angelägenheten [...]. (L: 22)

Zasami tak jest zmęczona sobą samą, **całym** tym **swoim** angażowaniem się [...]. (9)

Wprowadzone do tłumaczenia dodatkowe informacje *to naprawdę kocha, całym ... swoim* spełniają funkcję ekspresywną i ujawniają euforię tłumacza – (2.1) oraz jego poirytowanie obiektem, o którym mowa – (2.2). Jako takie wpływają także na obraz kreowanej w TD postaci.

3). Wyrażenia o charakterze modalnym

Wyrażenia o charakterze modalnym stanowią najliczniejszą grupę jednostek wprowadzanych przez tłumaczy do tekstów przekładu. Sygnalizują one związek emocjonalny wypowiedzianego się z treścią wypowiedzi. Zdecydowana większość z nich to przysłówki, tak jak w przykładach w (3.1).

(3.1)

[...] **Po prostu** wszystko. (16)

[...] Najpierw **po prostu** spotka kogoś, kto będzie ją kochał taką, jaka jest. (30)

Po prostu czuje się wartościowa. (7)

Jej życie jest **naprawdę** bardzo bogate. (27)

Można się **naprawdę** zmęczyć sobą, tym zaangażowaniem. [...] (19)

[...], ale jego spojrzenie było **przecież** takie przyjemne. (12)(18)

[...] już zdążyła przemyśleć warunki życia w Brazylii, naukę nowego języka i **oczywiście** rezygnację z dotychczasowej egzystencji. (28)

[...] Tę dewizę wpajały jej od zawsze mama, siostry, koleżanki, **nawet** czasopisma. (18)

[...] tę formułkę Angela wbiła sobie do głowy czytając gazety, słuchając znajomych, **sióstr a nawet** mamy. (28)

Także te z pozoru nieznaczące modyfikacje wyjściowej konceptualizacji ujawniają odczucia, jakie wywołała ona w umysłach tłumaczy.

4). Wartościowanie poprzez intensyfikujące jednostki leksykalne

Stosunkowo liczną grupę stanowią konceptualizacje zawierające wyrażenia wartościujące, które ujawniają ocenę sytuacji (obiektu) dokonywaną przez tłumacza – (4.1):

(4.1)

[...], siedzi w kawiarni i czyta **wciągającą** książkę Simone de Beauvoir. # (4)

Siedzi w kawiarni i czyta **ciekawą** książkę Simony de Beauvoir. # (11)

[...], zaczęła się **gorączkowo** zastanawiać jak to będzie, [...]. (19)

Szkopuł w tym, że nigdy nawet nie rozmawiała z **uroczym** cudzoziemcem. (30)

[...] Angela czasami myśli o tym, co jest w niej napisane, **ale tylko przez moment**.

[...] (13)

[...] Wtedy zastanawia się, czy według tego, co jest tam napisane, **rzeczywiście** jest beznadziejnym przypadkiem. [...] (30)

[...] Czasem gdy zerknie na nią i pomyśli jak **prawdopodobnie** beznadziejnym jest według niej przypadkiem [...]. (2)

Czasami jest tak zmęczona sobą, tym swoim **zgubnym w skutkach** pośpiechem, że ma ochotę uciec od swojego życia. (18)

Odpowiedni dobór tego rodzaju środków leksykalnych służy np. wyrażaniu podziwu względem obiektu, łagodzeniu jego obrazu, itp. W wypowiedzeniach w (4.2) poniżej są to podeksycytowanie i niepewność.

(4.2)

[...], ale zadzwoni, **tak zadzwoni na pewno**, żeby ustalić **dokładną** datę wspólnego obiadu. (30)

[...] **Wziął numer telefonu**, **pewnie** zadzwoni na dniach, żeby umówić się na kino czy kolację. (31)

Jednym ze środków intensyfikacji są także powtórzenia jednostek, tak jak ma to miejsce w przykładzie (4.3) poniżej.

(4.3)

[...], to ona przynajmniej o tym nie wie i **jeszcze może mieć nadzieję i jeszcze**, choć przez jakiś czas może próbować. (34)

5). Wyrażenia sygnalizujące dystans konceptualny

W szeregu konceptualizacji docelowych występują również jednostki wyprofilowujące większe/mniejsze dystansowanie się tłumacza względem odwzorowywanych zdarzeń. Wszystkie stanowią swoistego rodzaju „ozdobniki” stylistyczne mające na celu nadanie wypowiedzi bardziej oficjalnego tonu. Wyraźnie pokazują osobowość tłumacza, który jako człowiek wydaje się osobą zdystansowaną i oficjalną w kontaktach. Efekt kreowany przez rozbudowane formalnie wyrażenia typu *biorąc pod uwagę to, że...; zważywszy na to, że...* itd. uwidocznia się wyraźnie gdy zastąpi się je mniej złożonymi jednostkami, np. *gdy*.

(5.1)

Nie powinno być to aż takie trudne, **biorąc pod uwagę to, że** jest się dwudziestoosmiolatką o miłej aparycji. (16)

[...] To nie może być zupełnie niemożliwe, **zważywszy na to, że** ma się 28 lat [...].

(22)

[...] Rzecz to zupełnie prawdopodobna, **jeśli wziąć pod uwagę wiek** dwudziestu ośmiu lat [...]. (5)

W niektórych przykładach można dostrzec obecność struktur, do których tłumacz wydaje się przyzwyczajony w komunikacji monolingwalnej. Przywołuje je zatem w formie, do której przywykł i którą traktuje jako naturalną. Zgodnie z zasadą, że mówiący komunikują się za pomocą zrutynizowanych połączeń, ten rodzaj konceptualizacji można traktować jako przejaw torowania (*priming*), które jak ujmuje to Hoey (2005, p. 9) „leads to a speaker unintentionally reproducing some aspect of language” – (5.1).

(5.1)

Wprawdzie nigdy nawet ze sobą nie rozmawiali, jednak jego spojrzenie było tak niesamowite. (32)

Co prawda nigdy nie było okazji, **by** mogli ze sobą **choć** porozmawiać, ale jego spojrzenie było przyjemne. (8)

Szkopuł w tym, że nigdy nawet nie rozmawiała z [...]. (30)

6). Zmiana perspektywy

Sygnalizowane przez tłumacza stany emocjonalne można także zidentyfikować w przykładach bazujących na zmianie perspektywy. W (6.1) poniżej

konceptualizacje zostają rozszerzone o punkt widzenia innej osoby '[on] odłoży słuchawkę...' '[on] powiedział, że...', 'ma świadomość, że ...', itd., które w rzeczywistości stanowią subiektywną wizję sytuacji tłumacza. Dzięki zmianie perspektywy tłumacz nie tylko kształtuje postawę bohatera, ale także obdarza go większą sympatią, co widać wyraźnie w przypadku zestawienia przykładów w (6.1) z ich pozbawionym uzupełnień treści odpowiednikiem w (6.2).

(6.1)

[...] i który może zadzwoni do niej pewnego dnia i **odłoży słuchawkę dopiero wtedy**, gdy ona zgodzi się zjeść z nim obiad. (8)

[...] **Powiedział, że zadzwoni** któregoś dnia [...]. (29)

(6.2)

[...] i ma zadzwonić któregoś dnia żeby ustalić, kiedy mogą zjeść kolację. (15)

7). Werbalizacja uczuć bohatera

Emocje ulegają także werbalizacji poprzez przypisanie ich bohaterowi. To jednak przekładowca dokonuje ich interpretacji w ramach zaistniałego kontekstu a następnie nazywa przy pomocy konkretnych wyrażeń językowych, tak jak w (7.1).

(7.1)

Ma świadomość, że sama może się tym zaangażowaniem zmęczyć, tak, że [...]. (2)

Angela **obawia się, że pewnego dnia może być tak zmęczona sobą**, [...]. (30)

Uwypuklenie stanu świadomości i obawy bohatera uwidocznia się w porównaniu wymienionego wypowiedzenia z jego wariantem tłumaczeniowym pozbawionym tego rodzaju „odautorskich” komentarzy w (7.2) poniżej:

(7.2)

Czasami jest już tak zmęczona sobą, całym tym zaangażowaniem, że [...]. (27)

Kombinacje zastosowanych uzupełnień treści, których klasyfikacja nie zawsze jest łatwa i wymaga dalszych szczegółowych badań, tworzą w niektórych tekstach bardzo wyraźny obraz tożsamości tłumacza. Tożsamość ta, poprzez subtelne ślady wyrażanych emocji, odciska swój ślad na odwzorowywanych w TD zdarzeniach i sylwetkach postaci, tak jak ma to miejsce w przykładach w (8) poniżej.

(8)

Po drugie, on **na pewno** nie będzie chciał być z nią, jeśli zauważy, jak bardzo jej zależy. Tak to już jest z facetami. To dziwne, powinno **przecież** być na odwrót. To,

że czują, jak bardzo są kochani, jak bardzo nam na nich zależy **powinno być dla nich jedynie dodatkową zachętą**. Ale tak nie jest, z facetami jest dokładnie na odwrót. Tę dewizę wpajały jej od zawsze mama, siostry, koleżanki, nawet czasopisma. [...] (18)

[...] **Od razu** zaczęła wyobrażać sobie, jak to by było zacząć zupełnie nowe życie w Brazylii, [...]. **Szkopuł w tym**, że nigdy nawet nie rozmawiała z **uroczym** cudzoziemcem. Ale to jego spojrzenie – było takie ujmujące ... (30)

Zaprezentowana tu analiza bez wątpienia nie wyczerpuje tematu a jedynie zwraca na niego uwagę. Przywołane powyżej przykłady pozwalają jednak stwierdzić, że w przypadku poszczególnych odwzorowań nie chodziło o niezrozumienie wyjściowej konceptualizacji przez tłumacza. Po oddzieleniu poddawanych analizie uzupełnień treści okazuje się, że zdecydowana większość odwzorowań stanowi bardzo wierną wersję wyjściowych konceptualizacji⁵. W przeanalizowanych konceptualizacjach tłumacz nie kształtował więc „nowej”, tj. indywidualnej wersji zdarzeń (bo np. nie zrozumiał wyjściowej treści lub natrafił na trudności konceptualizacyjne wynikające z różnic między językami na płaszczyźnie obrazowania konwencjonalnego), ale jedynie dodawał własne subiektywne „komentarze” nadając wypowiedzeniu bardziej indywidualny, emocjonalny wydźwięk. W zastosowanych rozwiązaniach dał więc wyraz swojemu pierwotnemu egocentryzmowi. Podobnie jak każda egocentryczna osoba projektował własne doświadczenia, obawy, uczucia, itd. na otoczenie i innych. Czyniąc to opierał się na mechanizmie metafory i tym samym postępował w naturalny poznawczo sposób.

Wnioski

Odnosząc się do językowej ekspresji treści pojęciowej przez człowieka, w jednej ze swoich prac Steiner postawił znak równości między komunikacją i translacją. Badacz wyraził to w następujący sposób: “In short: inside or between languages, human communication equals translation” (Steiner, 1998, p. 49). Zaprezentowane w tym artykule obserwacje nie potwierdzają jednak tej tezy. Z perspektywy

⁵ Należy także podkreślić, że na przeanalizowany materiał językowy składały się wyłącznie konceptualizacje, w których nie istniała potrzeba bardziej zaawansowanego przeformułowywania treści pojęciowej związana z wyraźnymi różnicami konceptualnymi zachodzącymi między językiem szwedzkim i polskim. Zaobserwowane uzupełnienie treści dotyczyły więc konceptualizacji, w których przypadku zastosowanie tzw. dosłownego odwzorowania spełniającego warunki akceptowalności na gruncie docelowym było w pełni możliwe.

kognitywnej prototypowa komunikacja językowa i przekład, zgodnie z najbardziej powszechnym (tradycyjnym) sposobem jego rozumienia, wydają się być dwoma przeciwstawnymi zjawiskami.

Przeprowadzona analiza wykazała, że tłumacz, zgodnie z przypisywaną mu rolą kulturową (zawodową/profesjonalną), musi w wielu przypadkach postępować wbrew swojemu systemowi poznawczemu i wynikającym z niego naturalnym potrzebom językowej ekspresji treści. Zdecydowana większość przywołanych w artykule zjawisk przekładowych, bazujących na metaforze (mapowaniu cel-źródło) jest tradycyjnie traktowana jako niepożądana. Zgodnie z tradycyjnym podejściem do tłumaczenia, w którym eksponuje się zachowanie wierności TW, za niepożądane uznaje się bowiem wszelkie przejawy przemycania do TD ideologii, oraz „odautorskiego” wartościowania, łączącego się np. z dodawaniem informacji wskazującej na stan emocjonalny tłumacza i eksponującej jego ocenę zdarzeń. Taki model tłumaczenia jest także wspierany przez dydaktykę przekładu. Przedstawione w analizie ślady ujawnionych przez tłumaczy emocji, są zazwyczaj negatywnie oceniana przez dydaktyków przekładu. Charakteryzuje się je jako samowolę czy błędy metatranslacyjne, które nie powinny mieć miejsca (por. np. Hejwowski, 2004, p. 149).

Takie podejście do translacji pozostaje jednak w sprzeczności z codziennym językowym funkcjonowaniem tłumacza. Jako użytkownik języka w komunikacji monolingwalnej tłumacz powszechnie stosuje bowiem konceptualne mapowanie cel – źródło, co służy jego kreatywności językowej przejawiającej się w kategoryzowaniu, dowolnym kreowaniu konceptualizacji, wyrażaniu ideologii, opinii, emocji, itd.

Cały system ustaleń, które składają się na dominującą wśród translatologów postawę dotyczącą tego jak tłumaczyć, wydaje się więc „przeciwdziałać” temu, co jest przyrodzone człowiekowi, wyposażonemu w dany (taki a nie inny) aparat poznawczy i, najogólniej rzecz ujmując, przyzwyczajonemu do stosowania metafory jako narzędzia poznawania rzeczywistości. W wielu aspektach swojej profesjonalnej działalności tłumacz musi (ponieważ takie jest powszechne oczekiwanie), postępować wbrew sobie jako użytkownikowi języka, którym stawał się przez lata nabywania języka ojczystego. Nie można zatem wykluczyć, że to właśnie takie anty-kognitywne wyobrażenie translacji leży u podstaw powszechnego przekonania, że jest to najtrudniejsza forma działalności językowej człowieka, łącząca się z ciągłym przewyciężaniem problemów i zarezerwowana jedynie dla nielicznych.

Z drugiej strony prowadzone badania translatologiczne dostarczają dowodów, że oddziaływanie mechanizmu mapowania cel-źródło trudno powstrzymać w procesie tłumaczenia, co przejawia się w głosie tłumacza

przemawiającym w jego własnym imieniu wszędzie tam gdzie „dyscyplina profesjonalna” ustępuje miejsca poznawczej naturalności.

Jak zatem w tak zarysowanym kontekście może być postrzegana rola dydaktyki przekładu i czy przywołanie konceptu metafory jako podstawy komunikacji poprzez translację może być tu w ogóle przydatne?

Wydaje się, że podbudowywanie tożsamości zawodowej tłumacza-outsidera w obecnym kształcie jest wątpliwe, ponieważ łączy się z eliminowaniem tego, co w działalności językowej człowieka jest naturalne poznawczo. Budowanie wzorca działania tłumaczy poprzez wtłaczanie ich w rolę zdystansowanego „outsidera” wiernie odwzorowującego treść na linii TW – TD równa się ćwiczeniu ich w „zwalczaniu” utrwalonego w umysłach ludzkich mechanizmu metafory, co wydaje się już od początku skazane na niepowodzenie. Przypomnijmy głos psychologów w kwestii nakładania masek zapewniających człowiekowi akceptację grupy, a to właśnie taką maskę zmuszony jest wkładać tłumacz (adept przekładu) szukając miejsca w ramach profesji. Każda maska zaczyna być uciążliwa w sytuacji, gdy okazuje się niezgodna z poczuciem tożsamości osobistej jednostki (Gałdowa, 2000, p. 12). Bycie tym, kim się jest w przypadku przekładowcy oznacza natomiast odwoływanie się do swojej tożsamości jako użytkownika języka, którego umysły na przestrzeni tysięcy lat wykształciły takie, a nie inne mechanizmy poznawcze – w tym metaforę. To do tego aspektu tożsamości tłumaczy odnoszą się więc rysy pojawiające się na ich masce profesjonalnej, ujawniane w postaci ich głosu zaznaczającego się w kreowanych przekładach. Biorąc pod uwagę ten aspekt językowej działalności człowieka należy zatem stwierdzić, że perspektywna droga kształcenia, którą można zaproponować na gruncie dydaktyki przekładu powinna raczej wspierać oddziaływanie mechanizmu metafory, tj. konceptualnego mapowania cel – źródło.

Przywrócenie konceptu metafory na grunt rozważań translatologicznych umożliwi zatem zwrócenie uwagi na paradoks, który istnieje na gruncie nauki o przekładzie w kwestii preferowanego sposobu postępowania w zakresie odwzorowywania treści. Zauważenie problemu stanowi natomiast pierwszy krok w kierunku jego rozwiązania i zapewnienia przekładowi, jako formie działalności językowej człowieka, większej naturalności. Przedstawione w niniejszym artykule omówienie tego zapomnianego konceptu pozwala na wyłonienie kilku obszarów działania dydaktyki przekładu, dzięki którym tłumacz będzie mógł bardziej precyzyjnie określić swoją rolę, zarówno zdystansowanego i wiernego oryginałowi outsidera (działającego na linii źródło – cel), jak i kreatora treści (wykorzystującego mapowanie cel – źródło).

Wsparcie mapowania cel – źródło w nauczaniu tłumaczenia może dotyczyć już płaszczyzny konwencjonalnego sposobu organizowania treści w języku

docelowym. Uświadamianie adeptom przekładu konceptualizacyjnego potencjału konkretnego języka i roli obrazowania językowego w formowaniu treści pojęciowej, może okazać się pomocne w likwidowaniu sztywności (zbytniej konwencjonalności) języka tłumaczeń, o którym mówią badacze przekładu.

Kolejnym obszarem działania dla dydaktyki jest ujawnianie podobieństw między językami spotykającymi się w przekładzie, które wzmacnia mechanizm metafory konceptualnej. Dlatego w studiach porównawczych oryginału i przekładu, będących stałym elementem dydaktyki przekładu, warto może obok różnic zachodzących między językami (kulturami) postawić także na wyłanianie zachodzących między nimi podobieństw, których zakresu ciągle jesteśmy świadomi w zbyt małym stopniu (por. Tymoczko, 2005, p. 1092).

W kontekście omawianych w tym artykule zagadnień nie można także pominąć uwrażliwiania adeptów przekładu na struktury wyjściowe w celu minimalizowania nieuniknionego w tłumaczeniu na linii L2 – L1 ubóstwa bodźca. Jest to jedyna droga zwiększania czytelności wyjściowej konceptualizacji w umyśle tłumacza. Tu przydatne może się okazać ćwiczenie czujności tłumacza na płaszczyźnie gramatycznych wykładników kategorii w języku wyjściowym. Podkreślanie wagi znajomości gramatyki języka obcego (wyjściowego) w pracy tłumacza wspiera więc poznawcze podstawy przekładu. Dodajmy jednak, że nie chodzi tu o gramatykę nauczaną poprzez listy reguł, ale poprzez aktywną obserwację, identyfikację i opis znaczących elementów języka przez studenta-adepta przekładu.

Wartym rozważenia posunięciem jest również uwrażliwienie adeptów przekładu na przysługujące im prawo „powrotu” do treści TW na warunkach systemu języka docelowego, zwłaszcza w sytuacji, gdy natrafiają oni na trudności w odwzorowywaniu treści w tłumaczeniu a konceptualizacje nie wpisują się w konwencje języka docelowego. Jednym ze sposobów wspierających ten obszar działania jest przywrócenie do repertuaru ćwiczeń dydaktycznych korekty tłumaczenia sporządzonego przez innego tłumacza z uwzględnieniem TW.

Na tym etapie niniejszych rozważań istotne jest ponadto zwrócenie uwagi na fakt, że metafora nie jest jedynym procesem poznawczym zachodzącym w przekładzie, ale wpisuje się w szerszy system takich mechanizmów, o których uruchomieniu decyduje konkretny umysł tłumacza, wyposażony w dany aparat poznawczy ale i „obciążony” indywidualnymi doświadczeniami, kompetencją translatorską, znajomością języka, wrażliwością poznawczą, itd. Zatem aby dydaktyka przekładu mogła opierać się na naturalności poznawczej, a nie na jej zwalczaniu, konieczne jest również bliższe poznanie tych procesów, co stanowi ciągle aktualne wyzwanie dla współczesnych translatologów.

Bibliografia

- Badran, D. (2001). "Modality and Ideology in Translated Political Texts." *Nottingham Linguistic Circular* 16, pp. 47-61.
- Baker, M. (2000). "Towards a methodology for investigating the style of literary translator." *Target* 12(2), pp. 241-265.
- Boase-Beier, J. (2006). *Stylistic Approaches to Translation*. Manchester: St Jerome.
- Chesterman, A. (1997). *Memes of Translation. The Spread of Ideas in Translation Theory*. John Benjamins: Amsterdam/Philadelphia.
- Data, K. (2000). „W jaki sposób językoznawcy opisują emocje?” *Acta Universitatis Wratislaviensis. Język a Kultura* 14, pp. 245-252.
- Data-Bukowska, E. (2011). „O konceptualizacjach kreatywności w translatoologii.” [In:] P. Fast, A. Car, W. M. Osadnik (red.). *Historyczne oblicza przekładu*. Katowice: Śląsk, pp. 77-113.
- Data-Bukowska, E. (2016). *Eksplicitacja w nieprofesjonalnym przekładzie szwedzko-polskim. Perspektywa kognitywna*. Kraków: WUJ.
- Englund Dimitrova, B. (1997). "Translation of Dialect in Fictional Prose. Vilhelm Moberg in Russian and English as a Case in Point." [In:] J. Falk (ed.). *Norm, variation and change in language*. Acta Universitatis Stockholmiensis. Stockholm Studies in Modern Philology. New Series 11, pp. 49-65.
- Falkowski, A., Ścigała, E., Maruszewski, T. (1997). „Procesy spostrzegania.” [In:] M. Materska, T. Tyszka (red.). *Psychologia i poznanie*. Warszawa: PWN, pp. 200-223.
- Furmanek, O. (2006). "The role of emotions in establishing meaning: implications for interpreting." *Journal of Specialised Translation* 5: 57-71
- Gałdowa, A. (red.). (2000). *Tożsamość człowieka*. Kraków: WUJ.
- Gruszczyńska, E. (2003). „Gniew po polsku i po szwedzku. Próba porównania.” [In:] N. Pawlak, A. Duszak (red.). *Anatomia gniewu – emocje negatywne w językach i kulturach świata*. Warszawa: WUW, pp. 125-137.
- Gruszczyńska, E. (2001). *Linguistic Images of Emotions in Translation from Polish into Swedish (Henryk Sienkiewicz as a Case in Point)*. Uppsala: Uppsala Universitet.
- Gruszczyńska, E. (2005). „Szczęście po szwedzku – leksem *lycka* w języku szwedzkim.” [In:] A. Duszak, N. Pawlak (red.). *Anatomia szczęścia: emocje pozytywne w językach i kulturach świata*. Warszawa: WUW, pp. 93-102.
- Gruszczyńska, E. (2011). „Manipulacja za pomocą przekładu w gazetach ulotnych.” [In:] M. Kizeweter, J. M. Esquibel (red.). *Manipulation in Translation. Theory and Application*. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo Academica SWPS, pp.169-182.
- Gruszczyńska, E. (2012). *Dawne polskie przekłady prasowe. Informacja – Perswazja – Manipulacja*. Warszawa: Oficyna Wydawnicza ASPRA-JR.
- Hejwowski, K. (2004). *Kognitywno-komunikacyjna teoria przekładu*. Warszawa: PWN.
- Hermans, T. (1996). „The Translator's Voice in Translated Narrative.” *Target* 8(1), pp. 23-48.

- Hsieh, E. (2002). "Necessary changes in translation ideology." *Studies of Translation and Interpretation* 7, pp. 399-435.
- Huang, L., Chiyu, C. (2014). "Translator's style or translational style? A corpus-based study of style in translated Chinese novels." *Asia Pacific Translation and Intercultural Studies* 1(2). 122-141. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/23306343.2014.883742>. (Dostęp. 12.01.2015)
- Hurtado de Mendoza, A. (2008). "The Problem of Translation in Cross-Cultural Research on emotion Concepts (Commentary on Choi & Han)." *International Journal for Dialogical Science* 3(1), pp. 241-248.
- Kussmaul, P. (2000). "A Cognitive Framework for Looking at Creative Mental Processes." [w:] M. Olohan (ed.). *Intercultural Faultlines. Research Models in Translation Studies I: Textual and Cognitive Aspects*. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing, pp. 57-72.
- Lakoff, G., Johnson, M. (1988). *Metafory w naszym życiu*. Warszawa: PIW.
- Langacker, R. W. (2009). *Gramatyka kognitywna*. (Tłum. E. Tabakowska, M. Buchta, H. Kardela et al.). Kraków: Universitas.
- Leonardi, V. (ed.). (2007). *Gender and Ideology in Translation: Do Women and Men Translate Differently? A Contrastive Analysis from Italian into English*. Bern: Peter Lang.
- Malmkjær, K. (2008). "Norms and Nature in Translation Studies." [In:] G. Anderman, M. Rogers, (eds.). *Incorporating Corpora: The Linguist and the Translator*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters, pp. 49-59.
- Marmaridou, A. S. (1996). "Directionality in Translation. Processes and Practices." *Target* 8(1), pp. 49-73.
- Mason, I. (1994). *Discourse, Ideology and Translation*. [In:] R. de Beaugrande, A. Shunnaq, M. H. Heliel (eds.). *Language, Discourse and Translation in the West and Middle-East*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, pp. 23-34.
- Meylaerts, R. (2008). "Translators and (their) norms: Towards a sociological construction of the individual." [In:] A. Pym, M. Shlesinger, D. Simeoni (eds.). *Beyond Descriptive Translation Studies. Investigations in homage to Gideon Toury*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, pp. 91-102.
- Mikhailov, M, Villikka, M. (2001). "Is there such a thing as a translator's style?" *Proceedings of the Corpus Linguistics 2001 Conference*. Lancaster: Lancaster University Press, pp. 382-383.
- Munday, J. (2008). "The Relations of Style and Ideology in Translation: A case study of Harriet de Onís." *Actas del III Congreso Internacional de la Asociación Ibérica de Estudios de Traducción e Interpretación. La traducción del futuro: mediación lingüística y cultural en el siglo XXI*. Barcelona: Promociones y Publicaciones Universitarias, pp. 57-68.
- Modrea, A. (2005). "Ideology, subversion & the translator's voice: a comparative analysis of the French and English translations of Guillermo Cabrera Infante's *Tres Tristes Tigres*." [In:] M. L. en Romana García (ed.). *II AIETI. Actas del II Congreso*

- Internacional de la Asociación Ibérica de Estudios de Traducción e Interpretación. Madrid, 9-11 de febrero de 2005.* Madrid: AIETI. 1-12. http://www.aieti.eu/pubs/actas/II/AIETI_2_AM_Ideology.pdf.
- Najder, K. (1997). „Schematy poznawcze.” [In:] M. Materska, T. Tyszka (red.). *Psychologia i poznanie*. Warszawa: PWN, pp. 38-60.
- Neubert, A. (1997). “Postulates for the Theory of *Translatio*.” [In:] J. H. Danks, G. M. Shreve, S. B. Fountain, M. K. McBeath (eds.). *Cognitive Processes in Translation and Interpreting*. Thousand Oaks, London, New Delhi: SAGE Publications, pp. 1-24.
- Newmark, P. (1997). “Translation and Ideology.” [In:] K. Klaudy, J. Kohn (eds.). *Transferre necessere Est. Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Current Trends in Studies of Translation and Interpreting 5-7 September, 1996, Budapest, Hungary*. Budapest: Scholastica, pp. 56-61.
- Nowak, A. (1997). „Przestrzenne mechanizmy przetwarzania informacji.” [In:] M. Materska, T. Tyszka (red.). *Psychologia i poznanie*. Warszawa: PWN, pp. 103-128.
- Nowakowska-Kempna, I. (1986). *Konstrukcje zdaniowe z leksykalnymi wykładnikami predykatywowo uczuć*. Katowice: Uniwersytet Śląski.
- Necka, E. (1997). „Struktura operacji intelektualnych a twórczość.” [In:] M. Materska, T. Tyszka (red.). *Psychologia i poznanie*. Warszawa: PWN, pp. 182-199.
- O’Sullivan, E. (2003). “Narratology meets Translation Studies, or, The Voice of the Translator in Children’s Literature.” *Meta* 48(1-2), pp. 197-207.
- Simon, S. (1996) *Gender in Translation. Cultural Identity and the Politics of Transmission*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Steiner, G. (1998). *After Babel: Aspects of Language and Translation* (Third edition). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Tymoczko, M. (2005). “Trajectories of Research in Translation Studies.” *Meta* 50(4): pp. 1082-1097.
- Taylor, J. R. (2007). *Gramatyka Kognitywna*. (Tłum. M. Buchta, Ł. Wiraszka, red. naukowa E. Tabakowska). Kraków: Universitas.
- Wang, Q, Li, D. (2011). “Looking for translator’s fingerprints: a corpus-based study on Chinese translations of Ulysses.” *Literary and Linguistic Computing Advance Access* 2, pp. 1-13.
- Wierzbicka, A. (1999). *Emotions Across Languages and Cultures: Diversity and Universals*. New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Wilss, W. (1996). *Knowledge and Skills in Translator Behaviour*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Valerio, A. (2013). “Translation and ideology: a critical Reading.” *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences* 70, pp. 986 – 996.
- van Dijk, Teun A. (2000). *Discourse and Ideology – A Multidisciplinary Introduction*. <http://www.discourses.org/UnpublishedArticles/Ideology%20and%20discourse.pdf>. (dostęp 9.04.2015)
- Venuti, L. (1995). *The Translators Invisibility. A history of translation*. London: Routledge.

Il personaggio di Fiammetta nelle creazioni boccacciane

Summary

The chapter is an analysis of three works of Boccaccio: *Filocolo*, *Teseida delle nozze d'Emilia* and *Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta*. It presents the transformation of Fiammetta, the heroine of these works, which is the image of the author's maturation as a person and as an artist. The transformation of Fiammetta, as well as Boccaccio, is a lyrical story, where they mature in the emotional terms. The transformation of Boccaccio can also be treated as the image of his maturation to the protest against the position of a woman in the fourteenth-century society. In a world dominated by men, women could not publicly express their views, and even decide their own choices about their lives. In the works of Boccaccio Fiammetta has taken an attempt to existence as an independent entity, which in those days was a moral novelty.

Keywords: Boccaccio, Fiammetta, Filocolo, Teseida, fourteenth-century Italian literature

Introduzione

Giovanni Boccaccio è uno scrittore, narratore entusiasta, poeta, umanista e celeberrimo padre della novellistica europea conosciuto innanzitutto grazie al suo capolavoro *Decameron* (1348-1353). Giovanni Boccaccio insieme a Dante Alighieri e Francesco Petrarca è uno dei più affermati rappresentanti della letteratura italiana del XIV secolo e costituisce parte delle cosiddette “Tre corone”:

Dante, Petrarca e Boccaccio, le cosiddette Tre Corone, contennero e regolarizzarono un lessico letterario che tendeva alla moltiplicazione e all'importazione incontrollata e legittimarono parole nuove, (...) restando fedeli alla grammatica nativa. Grazie a loro, alla loro rapida fortuna e alla potenza economica e politica di Firenze, il fiorentino divenne un modello di riferimento per il resto dell'Italia che scrisse (lo riconobbe già ai primi del Trecento il padovano Antonio da Tempo). Insomma, cominciò a produrre una sua norma e a diventare norma (Coletti, 2011).

¹ Il capitolo è basato sulla tesi di laurea dello stesso titolo scritto presso la Facoltà di Filologia di Ateneum-Scuola Superiore di Danzica, sotto la direzione della Dott.ressa Ric. Dorota Karwacka-Pastor.

Le sue opere sono accomunate dalla traccia più importante nella vita boccacciana ovvero la figura della donna amata, ispiratrice e destinataria di tante tra le sue opere, mito letterario, infondata storicamente figura di Maria d'Aquino, figlia naturale di Roberto d'Angiò, nelle opere letterarie chiamata Fiammetta.

Nel presente lavoro si andranno ad esaminare le prescelte opere minori di Boccaccio dal *Filocolo* e *Teseida* fino all'*Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta* dove si sente una forte presenza dell'immortale *personaggio* di Fiammetta. Fiammetta, troviamo anche nelle altre opere boccacciane come: *Filocolo-Fatica d'amore*, *Teseida*, *Comedia delle ninfe fiorentine* o *Ninfale d'Ameto* dove rappresenta una delle nimfe: impersonificazione della speranza, *Amorosa visione* scritta probabilmente dopo presunta morte di Maria d'Aquino, *Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta* e *Decameron*. Il proponimento della presente analisi sarà quello di mettere in evidenza il cambiamento del personaggio di Fiammetta a seconda delle opere. Dal *Filocolo* dove è eletta regina delle questioni d'amore, nel *Teseida* lodata per il suo intelletto e per la sua conoscenza della letteratura fino all'*Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta* diventata protagonista e relatrice delle vicende dell'opera.

L'intenzione di questo studio è anche la presentazione della critica e della ricezione dell'amore boccacciano nonché dei suoi percorsi biografici nella realtà storica dell'epoca.

Biografia di Giovanni Boccaccio

Lo scrittore trecentesco, Giovanni Boccaccio, è uno dei più grandi intellettuali dell'epoca, una persona colta ed erudita. Probabilmente nasce nell'estate 1313 in Toscana a Certaldo o a Firenze come figlio illegittimo di un ricco mercante, Boccaccino di Chelino "... è da ritenersi la seconda (Firenze) vera "patria" natale, secondo l'autorevole opinione di Vittore Branca" (Surdichi, 2001, p. 4).

Dalla critica la vita letteraria di Giovanni Boccaccio è divisa in due fasi: quella giovanile dell'epoca napoletana e quella più matura, umanistica legata ai soggiorni a Firenze e alle corti dell'Italia settentrionale. Il momento decisivo della sua formazione è il suo trasferimento a Napoli dove ha l'opportunità di frequentare gli ambienti signorili della città e la corte del re di Napoli Roberto d'Angiò. Alcuni argomenti riguardanti la storia della stirpe d'Angiò espone Manikowska (1996, p. 5-8; 1997, p. 48-77).

Visto che il Regno di Napoli ai tempi di re Roberto vive una gran prosperità intellettuale, Giovanni Boccaccio ha l'occasione unica di conoscere alcuni dei più celebri esponenti e studiosi dell'epoca i quali hanno un grande influsso sul pensiero del giovane letterato. In codesto luogo incontra Cino da Pistoia. Quell'incontro è definito da Menetti come: *proprio incontro del destino, quasi il*

simbolo dell'ineluttabilità di una vocazione letteraria (Menetti 2013). Cino da Pistoia, poeta stilnovista e giurista, che provocando in Boccaccio maggiore interesse per *la letteratura degli stilnovisti e soprattutto di Dante e assecondando la vocazione letteraria del giovane* (Surdichi 2001, p. 4) semina la passione letteraria. Durante gli anni 1332-1341 trascorsi a Napoli Giovanni Boccaccio compone: *Elegia di Costanza, Caccia di Diana, Filocolo, Filostrato, Teseida* e le epistole latine *Crepor celsitudinis, Mavortis miles, Nereus amphitribus* e *Sacre famis*.

Siccome le date della biografia di Boccaccio sono da sempre discusse dagli studiosi abbiamo discordanze negli avvenimenti nella vita dello scrittore. Nel 1905 Arnaldo della Torre data l'arrivo di Boccaccio a Napoli nel 1323 e l'incontro fra Maria e Giovanni nel 1331 (Della Torre, 1905, p.171). Allo stesso tempo Francesco Torraca scrive che *Boccaccio giunse a Napoli nel dicembre del 1325* e invece l'anno dell'inizio del suo amore sarebbe il 1333 (Torraca, 1912, p. 34). Gli ultimi studi datano il trasferimento di Giovanni Boccaccio nella capitale del Regno nell'autunno del 1327 a seguito di suo padre che lavora nell'agenzia bancaria dei Bardi, i finanziatori del re Roberto d'Angiò (Surdichi, 2001, p. 5). Nel 1341 costretto dalle gravità famigliari Boccaccio ritorna a Firenze, dove lo aspetta il complicato mondo dell'*incertezza politica ed economica, aggravata da difficoltà familiari e finanziarie* (Battaglia, 2008, p. 27). Malgrado diverse traversie fino al 1346 scrive: *Comedia delle ninfe fiorentine o Ninfale d'Ameto, Amorosa visione, Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta, Ninfale fiesolano*. Nel 1348 a Firenze Boccaccio diventa impotente spettatore dell'atroce peste, la causa della morte dei suoi amici e familiari indi descritta dal poeta nelle pagine d'apertura del *Decameron* (1348-53).

Boccaccio ammirando tanto Dante Alighieri e sentendosi responsabile delle salvaguardia e promozione delle opere dantesche, raccoglie diverse testimonianze sul Vate, riordina le sue opere, revisiona e copia alcuni suoi testi. A Boccaccio si deve la prima ricostruzione della biografia di Dante. Legge e commenta pubblicamente la *Commedia* di Dante e per primo la chiama *divina*.

Fiammetta, la donna amata da Boccaccio

Giovanni Boccaccio trovandosi nella capitale angioina, si concede alla sofisticata vita mondana ed alle feste signorili dove conosce belle gentildonne. "Tratta queste donne dell'alta società angioina con una famigliarità ossequiosa; proprio come amava fare il Boccaccio (prologo del Filocolo, le questioni d'amore...) considerato da loro un po' come il canntore madrigalesco della loro bellezza e della loro vita raffinata" (Branca, 1958, p. 128). Ma vi è soltanto una donna che è padrona del suo

cuore per sempre, il suo amore eterno, colei che è *trasfigurata e sublimata nel mito letterario di Fiammetta* (Surdichi, 2001, p. 6) probabilmente Maria dei Conti d'Aquino. Ma non si è mai avuta la certezza della sua esistenza, "il nome di Maria d'Aquino è del tutto ignoto ai genealogisti di quella pur illustre casata" (Sapegno, 1952).

Tantissimi studiosi si occupano dell'argomento amoroso boccacciano e della provenienza dell'amata. Lo storico e ricercatore Scipione Ammirato (1531-1600) colleziona un'ampia raccolta di informazioni sugli illustri cittadini partenopei fra cui i Conti d'Aquino (Ammirato, 1580, p. 145-146). Secondo l'autore il padre della celebre fanciulla sarebbe *Tommaso d'Accerra, figlio di Adenolfo IV d'Aquino* e di una nobildonna francese (Piccolo, 1997).

Invece lo storiografo Matteo Camera (1807-1891) sostiene che il padre naturale di Maria sarebbe il re Roberto "cotesta esser figlia di una dama maritata in un conte d'Aquino, a quale era francese e che Roberto ebbe commercio con la medesima" oppure Tommaso IV d'Aquino conte di Accerra sposato con Sibilla de Sabran, presunta madre della giovane donzella (Camera, 1860, p. 474). Ma nel 1908 lo storico Giuseppe de Blasiis (1832-1914), professore e studioso, dimostra che la citata Sibilla de Sabran non poteva essere la madre di Fiammetta perché all'epoca era di età avanzata, nello stesso tempo constata che suo padre sarebbe Adenolfo III d'Aquino di Castiglione Cosentino (De Blasiis, 1908).

Lo stesso Boccaccio accenna al re Roberto d'Angiò detto il Saggio, il quale ha ottenuto i favori da una bellissima donna francese sposata con un conte d'Aquino e proprio da quel rapporto sarebbe nata Maria d'Aquino:

Quegli che dopo lui rimase successore nel reale trono, lasciò appresso di sé molti figliuoli: tra quali uno, nominato Ruberto, nella reale dignità costituito... E avanti che alla reale eccellenza pervenisse, costui, preso del piacere d'una gentilissima giovane dimorante nelle reali case, generò di lei una bellissima figliuola; ben che volendo di sé ed ella giovane donna servare l'onore, con tacito stile, sotto nome apposito d'altro padre teneramente la nutricò, e lei nomò del nome di colei che in sé contenne la redenzione del misero perdimento che avvenne per l'ardito gusto della prima madre (Boccaccio 1967, p. 3).

Secondo Arnaldo della Torre l'incontro sarebbe avvenuto nel 1313, invece Kazimierz Chłędowski parla di una data che si aggira intorno al 1311 (Chłędowski, 1959, p. 97). Da quanto già è stato scritto non si ha la certezza né della discendenza di Maria d'Aquino né che ci sia proprio lei sotto il nome di Fiammetta nella letteratura boccacciana.

I d'Aquino fanno parte delle sette grandi casate del Regno Napoletano. La famiglia d'Aquino è una storica casata nobile che ha lontane origini

longobarde da Atenulfo Principe di Capua, detto Sommuca (Heraldrys Institute of Rome, 2011), discendente dai gastaldi (Albertario, 1932) padroni delle terre di Aquino, Portecorvo e la Val Comino (Długosz, 2011, p. 139-146, Zientara, 2000, p. 69-70). Benedetto Croce (1966, p. 304) parla della provenienza d'Aquino: "... se bene vivessero in iure Francorum erano di sangue Longobardo, provenienti da un Rodoaldo, gastaldo di Aquino, sotto i duchi di Benevento". Gli eminenti membri famigliari sono Rinaldo d'Aquino (Salinari 1961) e san Tommaso d'Aquino.

Victoria Kirkham (2001, p. 49) nel *Fabulous Vernacular: Boccaccio's Filocolo and the Art of Medieval Fiction* grazie alle ricerche svolte prova a indicare la data del primo incontro fra Boccaccio e Fiammetta. L'autrice nel suo libro fa dei riferimenti al *Filocolo* di Boccaccio, il quale ci dà indicazioni astrologiche sul giorno preciso. Inoltre Victoria Kirkham nomina alcuni ricercatori che hanno svolto analisi approfondite quali: F. Torracca, A. della Torre, E. de Ferri, H. Huvette, F. De Sanctis, F. Corazzini. Ma non sono unanimi nell'indicare le date che variano fra i mesi di marzo e aprile, e si potrebbe trattare di anni diversi: 1331, 1334, 1336, 1338 o anche 1341. Carmelo Cappuccio nel 1926 scrive che la prima volta Boccaccio *la vide il 30 marzo 1336* (Cappuccio, 1926, p. 8). Secondo lo scrittore, pochi giorni dopo il loro primo incontro, i due si ritrovano nel monastero a Baiano e allora Fiammetta prega Giovanni di narrare la triste storia di Florio e Biancofiore. Sono i due protagonisti di una leggenda medievale d'avventura e d'amore, conosciuta in tutta l'Europa, in Italia si trovava un poema popolare in ottava rima (Ciociola, 2011) intitolato *Cantare di Florio e Biancofiore* (Treccani 1932). Così nasce il *Filocolo*, il primo romanzo d'avventura nella letteratura italiana in prosa ed in volgare: *fabulosi parlari del vulgo* (Cappuccio, 1926, p. 40).

Boccaccio dal momento del primo incontro rimane colpito dalla bellezza della donna e comincia un lungo corteggiamento della fanciulla ricorrendo ad ogni occasione per poter manifestare la sua passione che viene appagato nell'ottobre (Branca, 2010, p. 237) o settembre dell'anno 1336 (Cappuccio, 1926, p. 8). Il periodo di felicità del poeta termina con il tradimento da parte di Maria-Fiammetta e allora Boccaccio nel 1339 comincia a scrivere il poema *Teseida*, che concluderà nel 1340.

Fiammetta, personaggio letterario nelle opere boccacciane

Fiammetta, è un mito letterario creato in base alle indicazioni autorevoli della tradizione del *dolce stil novo*. La donna degli stilnovisti è un angelo venuto dal cielo, perfetto e unico, che appare improvvisamente come un fulmine. Si distingue per la sua bellezza, è l'incarnazione della virtù. Con le doti di grazia, bontà, umiltà la donna angelicata nobilita lo spirito dell'uomo poeta che grazie a lei può salvare

l'anima, come se l'amore desse catarsi (Tateo, 1970).

Anche nelle opere di Dante, celeberrimo rappresentante del *dolce stil novo*, vediamo la medesima visualizzazione ideale della donna amata: Beatrice *colei che rende beati*, che col tempo grazie alla crescita umana e poetica di Dante, diventa il simbolo della fede cristiana e svolge il ruolo di connessione fra gli uomini e Dio. Il personaggio di Beatrice cambia da amorosa terrestre di Dante a guida nel percorso al Paradiso. Pure Boccaccio, essendo influenzato dalla letteratura di Dante e poi da quella di Petrarca, crea la sua donna ideale. Ci sono somiglianze fra i caratteri intrinseci degli amori di Dante Petrarca e Boccaccio. Gli avvenimenti sono simili; tutti e tre i poeti si innamorano nelle chiese: si suppone che Dante nella chiesa di Santa Margherita dei Cerchi di Firenze, Petrarca durante il Venerdì Santo nella chiesa di Santa Chiara ad Avignone, Boccaccio nel Sabato Santo nella chiesa francescana di San Lorenzo a Napoli (Vairo, 2013). Nella tradizione poetica oltre a Beatrice e Laura ci sarà anche Fiammetta.

Tuttavia secondo Victoria Kirkham e anche in base alle ricerche e alle analisi di Vittore Branca, Boccaccio negli anni in cui scriveva il *Filocolo* aveva poca conoscenza delle liriche di Petrarca. Ambedue gli amori di Petrarca e di Boccaccio sono connessi alla liturgia pasquale e tutti e due i bardi si trovano impreparati al fulmine amoroso e nelle loro opere ci danno anche indicazioni sul giorno preciso dell'incontro: "Ma, mentre per Petrarca la donna è occasione di esame interiore e rimorso, per Boccaccio l'avvenimento è una meravigliosa epifania" (Kirkham, 2002, p. 382).

Il nome Fiammetta proveniente dal soprannome medievale Fiamma, in latino *flamma che deriva da flagrare ossia "ardere"* (Virgilio, 1996). Quindi è una metafora del fuoco che descrive *amoroso ardore* (Boccaccio, 1988, p. 38). Veniva usata da sempre dagli scrittori amati da Boccaccio quali: Ovidio, Virgilio, Dante (Kirkham, 2002, p. 379).

Troviamo alcune descrizioni di Fiammetta nei frammenti di *Amorosa Visione*: "In fronte a lei, più ch'a altra valorosa, Due belli occhi lucean, sì che fiammetta Parea ciascuno d'amor luminosa. E la sua bocca bella e piccioletta Vermiglia rosa e fresca simigliava. E parea si movesse senza fretta" (Boccaccio, 1974), e del *Decameron*: "... cui capelli eran crespi, lunghi e d'oro e sopra li candidi e dilicati omeri ricadenti, e il viso ritondetto con un colore vero di bianchi gigli e di vermiglie rose mescolati tutto splendido, con due occhi in testa che parevano d'un falcon pellegrino e con una boccuccia piccolina, li cui labbri parevan due rubinetti (Boccaccio, 1956, p. 399).

La concezione della donna angelica di Boccaccio, Fiammetta, il simbolo della crescita del poeta, cambia nelle opere fino a diventare la protagonista

femminile e nello stesso tempo narratrice dell'opera *Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta* dove racconta della propria sofferenza.

Filocolo – fatica d'amore

Il *Filocolo* è un poema in prosa sorto tra gli anni 1336 e 1338 scritto in cinque libri. Dagli studiosi è chiamato la prima *opera di rilievo* (Surdichi, 2001, p. 18). Boccaccio, indotto da Fiammetta, comincia a scriverlo durante il suo soggiorno napoletano nel pieno della giovinezza.

L'antica leggenda popolare di Florio e Biancifiore (Blanco, 2006) riprende vita nell'opera scritta con *matura tecnica artistica con erramenti della sua fantasia* (Treccani, 1932) ma vi si sentono i suoi *riflessi personali* (Surdichi, 2001, p. 18) e la passione dell'autore.

Ben noto è l'interesse di Boccaccio per la letteratura e gli scrittori antichi. Avendo la possibilità di accedere alla biblioteca reale a Napoli il giovane poeta si immerge in diversi testi: bizantini, greci e latini, testi storici e morali, ma anche romanzi francesi fino ai cantari popolari. Boccaccio fruisce dei "... rari e preziosi manoscritti degli autori classici più cari alla cultura medievale, come Ovidio, Apuleio, Virgilio, Stazio, Livio, Valerio Massimo, Lucano e Macrobio, oltre agli autori canonici mediolatini" (Menetti, 2007). Studiando il greco da autodidatta, Boccaccio fa un'errata traduzione della parola *Filocolo* come *fatica d'amore*. Secondo il poeta le parole greche *philos* e *colos* che compongono il termine Filocolo, esprimono *fatica d'amore*, ma il vero significato di codeste parole secondo C. Cappuccio (1926, p. 42). è *philos-amico, colos-odio, ira*. Il senso del titolo diventa più chiaro nel terzo libro dell'opera dove Florio in cerca della donna amata con una brigata di amici fidati, sceglie lo pseudonimo Filocolo *corretto poi da editori e critici in "Filopono" o "Filocopo"* (Muscetta, 1974, p. 38).

Boccaccio, racconta nel libro la storia avventurosa di Florio e Biancifiore (versione del nome nel *Filocolo*), nati lo stesso giorno, cresciuti insieme, innamoratisi l'uno dell'altra. L'amore fra i due nasce mentre leggono le immortali strofe del *santo libro di Ovidio-Ars amandi* conosciuto anche come *Ars amatoria* (Muscetta, 1974, p. 27, nota 15): "... fece loro leggere il santo libro d'Ovidio, nel quale il sommo poeta mostra come i santi fuochi di Venere si deano ne' freddi cuori con sollecitudine accendere" (Boccaccio, 1967, p. 67).

La sorte sottopone i due spasimanti a diverse prove malegevoli, Biancifiore viene separata da Florio, poi venduta schiava ai mercanti orientali. Durante il viaggio percorrendo il Bel Paese alla ricerca dell'amata, Filocolo ed i suoi amici raggiungono Napoli, dove sono invitati alla corte del Re dalla *reina* Fiammetta a partecipare al gioco delle *questioni d'amore*. Gioco di intrattenimento, diffuso in

Italia nella società cortese, chiamato *jeu parti*, *joc partit* o *paartimen* (partir tun joc “proporre una questione”): “il poeta proponeva una questione che veniva raccolta e discussa da più d'uno, in modo che si potessero avere parecchie risposte; e spesso i contendenti si rimettevano a un giudice autorevole (un poeta celebre o un principe), che il più delle volte presentava una soluzione personale, in contrasto con quelle date” (Battaglia, 1937). Il tema dell'ilar combriccola di giovani del *Filocolo* viene poi sviluppato da Boccaccio per costruire la cornice narrativa del *Decameron*.

Fiammetta del *Filocolo* non è soltanto la committente e destinataria dell'opera, ma pure un importante personaggio conosciuto come la *regina della festa* incoronata da Ascalion: “è d'ogni grazia piena e di bellezza, e di costumi ornatissima e di leggiadra eloquenza dotata, io in nostra reina la eleggo” (Boccaccio, 1967, p. 341). Lodata per le sue virtù con le parole di Ascalion, Boccaccio encomia le sue qualità, chiamandola donna complessa dalle doti morali e intellettuali. Ascalion esalta i suoi valori, ringrazia della sua indimenticabile accoglienza e della sua generosità.

Davanti a Fiammetta vengono a turno i partecipanti del giuoco, presentando le tredici questioni dell'*argomento amoroso*, parlano di varie situazioni, astratte o concrete, *dal frivolo-mondano al serio-ideologico* (Surdichi, 2001, p. 23). Lei giudica e risponde ai quesiti sottoposti nel dibattito ed a lei appartiene l'ultima parola.

Un giovane nel gruppo di nome Caleon “di costumi ornatissimo e facundo di leggiadra eloquenza si presenta con la sua settima questione al culmine del giuoco. Nell'ambito letterario “... sa suscitare una scena che rivela veramente un gusto pittorico con presentimenti umanistici” (Battaglia, 2002). Si vede la parte centrale del suo ruolo: sta di fronte a Fiammetta, assorto non parla, è tutto catturato dalla dolce visione della regina. Invitato a proporre la questione, Caleon prima elogia le doti di Fiammetta e alla fine espone il dilemma filosofico sul tema amoroso: “egli formula il quesito basilare in tematica amorosa, e cioè se l'uomo debba innamorarsi o no per realizzare la propria perfezione” (Surdichi, 2001, p. 24).

Secondo alcuni cultori della vita e delle opere letterarie boccacciane come per esempio: Lucia Battaglia Ricci e Luigi Surdich, Caleon sarebbe l'autopresentazione di Boccaccio (Battaglia 2008, p. 86.) Invece secondo Vittore Branca oltre a Caleon, Boccaccio viene raffigurato nel personaggio di Idalogos. Fiammetta rispondendo distingue diverse categorie in cui l'amore può presentarsi: “l'amore onesto, quello divino, per diletto, amore passionale al quale tutti sono sotto il proprio dominio o per utilità, calcolato, di cui il mondo è pieno” (Boccaccio, 1967, p. 385).

Avverte contro l'amore *per diletto* che va evitato da chi vuole essere *savio* e vivere una vita *virtuosa*. Ma l'amore è un sentimento ineluttabile, se ne rende conto anche lei essendo una donna innamorata, infatti dice: " ...è il nostro iddio: costui adoriamo, costui preghiamo, in costui speriamo che sia il nostro contentamento, e che egli interamente possa i nostri disii fornire" (Boccaccio, 1967, p. 385).

Nell'opera boccacciana sorge un'immagine di Fiammetta *reina*, donna non solo bella, ma pure saggia in giudizio. Pronunciandosi risponde in modo accurato, preciso, segue la logica. Alla fine di ogni questione enuncia la sentenza finale. Boccaccio ha creato un personaggio complesso, notevole, dandogli un ruolo importante.

Teseida delle nozze d'Emilia

L'opera *Teseida* è un poema epico di dodici libri in ottave in lingua volgare. Ciascun libro è anticipato da un sonetto che funge da introduzione e nello stesso momento da sommario. Il primo sonetto riassume l'argomento dell'intera opera. La composizione poetica è scritta da Boccaccio negli ultimi anni napoletani ovvero tra il 1339 e il 1340 ed è dedicata al suo amore eterno, Fiammetta. Alcuni studiosi ritengono che il componimento non sia stato creato esclusivamente a Napoli, ma anche a Firenze (Battaglia, 2008, pp. 94-95). Vittore Branca nel *Schemi letterari e schemi autobiografici* sostiene che una serie di indizi denoti Firenze come luogo dell'esecuzione di *Teseida* (Branca 2010, p. 240).

Il *Teseida* è ideata sull'ispirazione dell'*Eneide* di Virgilio e del *Tebaide* di Stazio (Müller 2006), "come un riadattamento dell'epopea latina a una nuova lingua a un nuovo metro [...] e soprattutto a una nuova cultura" (Battaglia, 2008, p. 96). Carlo Muscetta sostiene l'influenza della narrativa francese, soprattutto del *Roman du Chastelain de Couci* (Muscetta, 1974, p. 70-71, nota 23).

Il poema è preceduto dalla dedica a Fiammetta in forma di lettera proemiale, scritta da Boccaccio in seguito al presunto tradimento da parte di lei. Volendo riconquistare la donna amata le dedica l'opera e dichiara di raccontare un'antica storia d'amore. Nel proemio evoca la sua ormai svanita felicità, sostituita dalla disperazione per causa della donna amata, la quale ormai è lontana e non ricambia l'amore. La chiama crudele, ma la sua bella visione lo perseguita nella mente affaticata. Fiammetta appare bella, giovane, affascinante, avvenente, ma distante. Il suo aspetto "più tosto celestiale che umana figura è quasi divino".

Nonostante le traversie, la fine della relazione e lo sfavorevole comportamento della donna, che è cambiata da amorosa a sdegnosa, la fiamma dell'amore una volta accesa non si spegne più: "... spegnere nell'anima quella

fiamma la quale mediante la vostra bellezza esso v'accese; anzi essa, più fervente che ma" (Boccaccio, 1964). Il poeta mantiene sempre l'*isperanza verdissima* che alimenta l'anima della persona soggetta all'amore.

Invocando la sua opera a testimone delle proprie parole, Boccaccio si rivolge direttamente alla destinataria e richiama i suoi momenti piacevoli quando appassionata, *ardava nel fuoco*, mentre ascoltava storie d'amore. Anticipando i desideri dell'amata, sperando che le piaccia, il bardo riporta: una sconosciuta storia antica con dei personaggi nobili dal sangue reale, coinvolti in vicende amorose. La stessa passione, che un giorno accompagnava l'amata nel leggere storie amorose, adesso conduce la mano di Boccaccio mentre scrive il poema.

L'autore presentando argomenti-prove, accenna a due obiettivi dell'opera: il primo, astruso, va scoperto solo da Fiammetta durante la lettura. Momenti personali ed intimi devono rimanere noti solo a lei. I lettori non devono neanche identificare i protagonisti del racconto. Secondo le norme dell'amore cortese non sarebbe una cosa giusta e onesta rivelare cose accadute fra i due. E se l'amata non negherà la loro passata passione, seguendo il filo della storia, potrebbe ricordarsi di lui: "ricordandovi bene, e io a voi di me e voi a me di voi, se non mentiste" (Boccaccio, 1964). Sembra un gioco di parole - sostiene A. B. Givens nel suo libro affermando che Boccaccio con il "tono leggero, perfino un po' scanzonato, rivela l'angoscia infinita della sua anima dopo l'abbandono della donna amata" (Givens, 1968, p. 79).

Il secondo argomento-obiettivo dell'opera al quale Boccaccio fa cenno nel proemio e nello stesso momento, la prova della sua devozione a Fiammetta consiste nel lodare la sua capacità di intendere e conoscere gli argomenti di cultura e di letteratura. Considerando che: "le donne sì come poco intelligenti ne sogliano essere schife" (Boccaccio, 1964) alle donne comuni non si addicono certi argomenti come ricchezza della materia o la dissimulazione allegorica e autobiografica e solo una donna, Fiammetta, ha l'abilità di capirli. La donna nobilissima è ricca di intelligenza e di cultura, sapiente e saggia. Dichiarando il suo amore il poeta le chiede di abbandonare il proprio orgoglio e di guardarlo in modo diverso, affida alla sua comprensione tutto quanto è stato detto prima nel proemio. Solo lei ha il dono e la capacità di poter cambiare la *miseria in desiderata felicità* del poeta. Se invece alla donna gli argomenti sembreranno pesanti spera soltanto che lei accetti il modesto dono di quel piccolo libro: "il presente picciolo libretto, poco presento alla vostra grandezza ma grande alla mia picciolezza, teganat" (Boccaccio, 1964). Alla fine del proemio Boccaccio si rivolge ad *Amore* perché possa restituirgli il suo sentimento di prima: "Lo sorregge la recondita speranza di un rattivarsi della travolgente passione d'un tempo tra il poeta e la donna amata" (Givens, 1968, p. 80).

Alcuni argomenti seri sono affrontati dal poeta addirittura in modo disinvolto perché lui: “ne fa fede quel suo quasi infantile attaccarsi ad un tenue filo di speranza che ella ritorni a lui” (Givens, 1968, p. 79). Benché il linguaggio usato da Boccaccio nel prologo sembri leggero, si sentono comunque l’angoscia, l’abbandono e il dolore del poeta. Nella lettera proemiale del poema *Teseida*, Fiammetta è presentata in modo diverso rispetto all’opera *Filocolo* dove è eletta *reina* delle questioni d’amore. Vediamo una donna sempre bella, ma chiamata dall’autore crudele, più discosta e lontana, quasi eterica, leggera e spirituale. Il poeta la ritiene una persona dotata di considerevoli abilità intellettuali e si riferisce alla sua sapienza letteraria.

Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta

È un’opera scritta in prosa negli anni 1343-1344, composta dal prologo e da nove capitoli dove l’ultimo funge da commiato. Il testo è modellato sulla forma classica dell’elegia confermata da “la predominanza della confessione dolorosa rispetto all’intreccio e alla progressione concatenata degli eventi” (Tateo, 1998, p. 70). Il poeta la chiama *elegia* in conformità ai canoni dell’epoca: “... appassionato lettore di Dante, elegia vale, giusta De vulgari eloquentia, II, IV 6, stilum miserorum: lo stile degli infelici” (Battaglia, 2008, p. 113). Gli studiosi notano che Boccaccio si è ispirato ai preziosi modelli classici come le opere ovidiane: le *Eroidi* e l’*Ars amatoria* (Raczyńska, 2011) oppure la *Phaedra* e l’*Hercules furens* di Seneca. Il poeta prende in considerazione anche modelli medievali: non solo la stilisticamente sostenuta *Elegia* di Arrigo da Settimello (Raczyńska, 2011) ma soprattutto la dantiana “La vita nova da cui derivano soprattutto sia la scelta – per ragioni di empatia – del pubblico femminile, sia il tono di diario intimo” (Battaglia, 2008, p. 114).

L’*Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta* è stata definita dalla critica il primo romanzo psicologico della letteratura europea. Vi troviamo un’analisi basata sull’osservazione delle emozioni e riflessioni della protagonista sul suo animo, anche se secondo Azzurra B. Givens il tono dell’opera sembra “... più consona alla poesia rinascimentale che alla meditazione retrospettiva del romanzo psicologico moderno” (Givens, 1968, p. 104). Sperimentando, Boccaccio attribuisce alla sua opera la forma di una lunga lettera monologo-confessione di una nobildonna chiamata Fiammetta. La novità boccacciana in questo romanzo consiste anche nell’evoluzione del ruolo della donna-musa in eroina-autrice del libro. Grazie a questa scelta, la donna, non “più rappresentata dalla voce maschile di un autore come oggetto di desiderio, si fa soggetto che scrive e con la scrittura parla, racconta, e si rappresenta nel lento scavo della propria anima travolta dalla

passione amorosa” (Battaglia, 2008, p. 113).

Le opere del periodo napoletano di Boccaccio sono caratterizzate dalla forma romanzesca dove l'autore racchiude spunti biografici nel *continuo narrare di sé*. Ma anche “l'Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta è chiamata un romanzo pseudo-autobiografico” (Battaglia, 2008, p. 113). Dando a Fiammetta il ruolo dell'autrice dell'opera e concedendole di esprimersi in prima persona, il poeta può manifestare liberamente i suoi sentimenti. “Voi, leggendo, non troverete favole greche ornate di molte bugie, né troiane battaglie sozze per molto sangue, ma amoroze, stimulate da molti disiri, nelle quali davanti agli occhi vostri appariranno le misere lagrime” (Boccaccio, 1976, p. 3).

La gentildonna napoletana racconta le sue angosce della sventurata passione. Essendo una donna sposata non può vivere la sua storia in tutta libertà ma deve occultare i suoi tremiti d'amore. Nella lettera *mandata alle donne innamorate* (Boccaccio, 1976, p. 3) Fiammetta descrive l'uragano di emozioni contrastanti, patimenti e miserie che straziano la sua anima: prima l'incontro e la felicità, poi la malinconia per l'amante lontano, la sofferenza, la gelosia, in seguito il tentato suicidio e quindi di nuovo la speranza che non può realizzarsi.

L'abilità poetica di Boccaccio, grazie all'esperienza condotta, fa raggiungere il risultato dell'illusione di una storia vera, come se Fiammetta vivesse realmente una storia infelice e fosse davvero l'autrice del racconto, libera di avere dei sentimenti e di rivellarli agli altri. Rivolgendosi nel prologo alle *nobili donne* Fiammetta presenta l'obiettivo della sua opera, quello di suscitare commiserazione e comprensione per le sue sofferenze amoroze “... li quali, con istimolo continuo molestandomi, insieme il cibo, il sonno, i lieti tempi e l'amata bellezza hanno da me tolta via” (Boccaccio, 1976, p. 3). Ma vuole anche avvertirle nei confronti degli uomini crudeli ed ammonirle contro la fatale ascendenza della poderosa passione. “Né m'è cura perché il mio parlare agli uomini non pervenga, anzi, in quanto io posso, del tutto il niego loro, però che sì miseramente in me l'acerbità d'alcuno si discuopre, che gli altri simili imaginando, piuttosto schernevole riso che pietose lagrime ne vedre” (Boccaccio, 1976, p. 3). Secondo Dorota Karwacka-Pastor (2016) la fanciulla racconta la sua storia d'amore non corrisposto, sperando non solo di suscitare nobile compassione e comprensione nelle altre donne, ma anche intende metterle in guardia contro la fatale influenza delle passioni potenti.

Nella società maschile, *società improntata all'uomo* le donne non sono ancora libere di esprimere in pubblico le loro opinioni né di fare scelte riguardanti la loro vita (Opitz 2009, p. 330). Malgrado le donne comincino a prendere parte agli eventi spirituali ed intellettuali a partire dal XIII secolo “... in numero sempre maggiore e sempre più diffusamente dentro la società rispetto ai secoli precedenti, direttamente alla rappresentazione e all'evoluzione della vita medievale” (Opitz,

2009, p. 331) “... restano comunque dominate dall’egemonia maschile non solo in campo culturale ma in tutti i campi della società” (Opitz, 2009, p. 332).

Nonostante ciò uno dei poeti più affermati della letteratura italiana del XIV secolo, scrive un’opera, dove una donna diventa autore–personaggio. Inoltre è un’*epistola “consolatoria”* (Battaglia, 2008, p. 116) ed è destinata al pubblico femminile. Gli elementi soprannominati segnano il carattere sperimentale, originale e rivoluzionario dell’opera.

Nel primo capitolo conosciamo Fiammetta, che si sta per innamorare perdutoamente colpita dallo sguardo dello sconosciuto. Lo sguardo che dà inizio all’amore cortese è il tema letterario appartenente al *dolce stil novo* e ripreso da Boccaccio nell’*Elegia*. L’amore cominciato da uno sguardo arriva come un fulmine, diventa una forza che si impadronisce dell’animo, ma che dà anche un profondo senso d’angoscia e di turbamento mentale. Attraverso i dolci sguardi all’inizio nascosti poi chiari, evidenti e reciproci, si rivela l’amore.

Nonostante il sentimento possa portare delle sofferenze, la donna si domanda: “ma chi può resistere da Amore, quando egli con tutte le forze operando, s’opponne?” Non trova via di scampo amando perdutoamente il giovane e sentendosi la sua serva obbediente. Non vuole e non riesce a liberarsi del sentimento, perfino non servono a niente gli avvertimenti della sua vecchia balia di stare attenta. Analizzando le sensazioni di Fiammetta Boccaccio illustra la debole e delicata anima della donna. Dal primo al nono capitolo del libro Boccaccio ci fa vedere il prezioso quadro della psiche del personaggio tragico. Assistiamo ad una tempesta dei sentimenti travolgenti di una donna innamorata, pronta e decisa a commettere gesti folli.

Entriamo insieme coll’autore e con la protagonista in sentimenti opposti, dalla gioia estrema per assurde speranze alla depressione totale e perfino alla prova suicida. La donna oscilla dagli estremi dell’accesa aggressione alla fredda indifferenza. Alla fine Fiammetta, rivolgendosi alle *pietosissime donne*, infelice ed ammalata d’amore le rende consapevoli del pericolo di forti sensazioni e sentimenti amorosi. Tante volte il suo modo di reagire è esagerato, folle, estremo, insorge l’immagine di una donna turbata mentalmente, squilibrata. La Fiammetta dell’opera boccacciana appare drammatica e dolorosa, ferita nel profondo dell’animo, ma anche guida e salvatrice per altre donne perse in amore.

Conclusione

Il presente articolo espone la trasformazione dell'immagine dell'amore nelle opere boccacciane nel corso degli anni. Nelle analizzate opere, dal *Filocolo* e *Teseida* fino all'*Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta* sono accentuate in modo chiaro le tappe di questa trasformazione. Lo scrittore ha presentato lo sviluppo dell'Amore sull'esempio del personaggio di Fiammetta, che secondo alcuni studiosi di letteratura è esistita realmente. Fiammetta, descritta da Boccaccio come una donna semi-mitica si trasforma a seconda delle opere: dal *Filocolo* dove è eletta regina delle questioni d'amore, e il *Teseida* dove viene lodata per il suo intelletto e per la sua conoscenza della letteratura fino all'*Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta* nella quale diventata protagonista e la relatrice delle vicende.

Nel *Filocolo* Boccaccio idealizza la figura di Fiammetta, *reina* delle questioni d'amore, donna di bell'aspetto, intelligente, la quale si esprime in modo fine e con acribia. In quest' opera giovanile Boccaccio presenta l'amore come un sentimento puro e genuino. Il *Teseida delle nozze d'Emilia* è una descrizione di una fase più matura d'amore, il sentimento che diventa anche un gioco di società. Ciò era in conformità con le regole dell'amor cortese. Secondo esse non è corretto non solo svelare i segreti dell'amore tra due persone, ma neanche rivelare il solo fatto dell'esistenza del sentimento. Essendo abbandonato da Fiammetta Boccaccio si sente angosciato e addolorato. Nella lettera proemiale del poema *Teseida*, Fiammetta è presentata come una donna sempre bella, ma crudele, più discosta, spirituale. Il poeta la ritiene una persona dotata di considerevoli abilità intellettuali e si riferisce alla sua sapienza letteraria. Nel presente lavoro come ultima è analizzata *Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta*. Oltre ad una storia d'amore esprime la protesta dell'autore contro la posizione delle donne nella società trecentesca. In un mondo dominato dagli uomini, le donne non potevano esprimere pubblicamente le proprie opinioni, e neanche decidere per la propria vita. Fiammetta compare tragica, abbandonata e ferita, ma nello stesso tempo condivide la sua amara esperienza con le altre donne.

Bibliografia primaria

- Boccaccio, G. (1956). *Decameron*. Torino: Einaudi tascabili. Classici
- Boccaccio, G. (1964). *Comedia delle ninfe fiorentine*. Milano: Mondadori
- Boccaccio, G. (1964). *Teseida delle nozze d'Emilia* da *Tutte le opere di Giovanni Boccaccio* - Volume II, a cura di Vittore Branca, Milano: Arnoldo Mondadori editore.
http://boccaccio.letteraturaoperaomnia.org/boccaccio_teseida_delle_nozze_d_emilia.html (02.03.16).
- Boccaccio, G. (1967). *Filocolo*. Milano: Mondadori

- Boccaccio, G. (1974). *Amorosa visione* da *Tutte le opere* a cura di Vittore Branca. Milano: Mondadori. http://www.classicitaliani.it/boccaccio/poesia/amorosa_visione.htm (21.03.16)
- Boccaccio, G. (1976). *Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta*. Incipit. Torino: Einaudi
- Boccaccio, G. (1988). *Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta*. Milano: Garzanti.

Bibliografia secondaria (testi critici, monografie)

- Albertario, E. (1932). *Gastaldo*, Enciclopedia Italiana http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/gastaldo_%28Enciclopedia-Italiana%29/ (21.03.16)
- Ammirato, S. (1580). *Delle Famiglie Nobili napoletane*. Firenze: Apresso Giorgio Marescotti.
<https://books.google.pl/books?id=pY1iJhb29BgC&pg=PP11&dq=delle+famiglie+nobili+napoletane&hl=pl&sa=X&ved=0CCMQ6AEwAWoVChMila3mubfEyAIVxqACh0S1gf3#v=onepage&q=delle%20famiglie%20nobili%20napoletane&f=false> (14.10.15)
- Battaglia, S. (2002). *Schemi lirici nell'arte del Boccaccio* in *La prosa del Boccaccio. Crestomazia della critica* a cura di Tedesco N. Caltanissetta: Salvaore Sciascia Editore.
- Battaglia, S. (1937). *Tenzone*. Enciclopedia Italiana http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/tenzone_%28Enciclopedia-Italiana%29/ (21.03.16)
- Battaglia, Ricci L.(2008). *Boccaccio*. Roma:Salerno Editrice S.r.l.
- Blanco. Valdes C. F. (2006). *La città partenopea nel Filocolo di Giovanni Boccaccio*. Universidad de Córdoba. <http://helvia.uco.es/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10396/5978/citt%C3%A0%20partenopea.%20Boccaccio.pdf?sequence=1>(21.03.16).
- Branca, V. (1958). *Tradizione delle opere di Giovanni Boccaccio. Vol. I, Un primo elenco dei codici e tre studi*. Roma: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura.
- Branca, V. (2010). *Boccaccio medievale* Milano: BUR Alta Fedeltà.
- Camera, M. (1860) *Annali delle Due Sicilie. Dell'origine e fondazione della Monarchia*. Tom II, Napoli: Dalla Stamperia. Camera M. (1860) *Annali delle Due Sicilie. Dell'origine e fondazione della Monarchia*. Tom II, Napoli:Dalla Stamperia. <https://archive.org/details/annalidelledues01camegoog> (21.03.16).
- Cappuccio, C. (1926). *La Vita e le Opere di Giovanni Boccaccio*. Livorno: Raffaello Giusti.
- Giociola C. (2011). Ottava rima, Enciclopedia dell'Italiano. http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/ottava-rima_%28Enciclopedia_dell'Italiano%29/ (21.03.16).
- Cipollone, A., Carlo C. (1999). *Petrarca e Boccaccio: modelli letterari fra Medioevo e Umanesimo : atti della giornata di studi, St Andrews, St Mary's College, 29 ottobre 1999*.
- Coletti, V. (2011). *Storia della lingua*. Enciclopedia dell'Italiano, capitolo 10. http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/storia-dellalingua_%28Enciclopedia_dell'Italiano%29/ (07.04.16).
- Chłędowski, K. (1959). *Historie neapolitańskie*. Warszawa: PIW.
- Croce, B. (1966). *Storia del regno di Napoli*. Bari: Laterza.
- de Blasiis, G. (1908). *Racconti di storia napoletana*, Napoli: Francesco Perella, Editore.

- <https://archive.org/details/raccontidistori00blasgoog> (07.04.16).
- de Mattei, R. (1961) Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani – Volume 3. http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/scipione-ammirato_%28Dizionario_Biografico%29/ (14.10.15).
- Della Torre, A. (1905). *La giovinezza di Boccaccio. Proposta di una nuova cronologia. Città di Castello: S.Lampi* <http://archive.org/stream/lagiovinezzaadigb00torruoft#page/n7/mode/2up> (07.04.16).
- Długosz, D. (2011). *Barbarzyńcy w północnej Italii, Longobardowie i ich królestwo przed Alpami*. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo TRIO.
- Givens, A. B. (1968). *La dottrina d'amore nel Boccaccio*. Firenze: Casa Editrice G.D'Anna.
- Heraldrys Institute of Rome (2011). Araldica Italiana S.C.V. Roma. <http://www.heraldrys.institute.com/cognomi/Aquino/Italia/idc/139/lang/en/> (21.03.16).
- Karwacka-Pastor, D. (2016). *Lament kobiety opuszczonej w Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta Giovanniego Boccaccia*. In: Walęciuk-Dejneka B. (2016). *Samotność – wybór czy los. Literatura i kultura*. Kraków: Aureus.
- Kirkham, V. (2001). *Fabulous Vernacular: Boccaccio's Filocolo and the Art of Medieval Fiction*. Michigan: University of Michigan. https://books.google.pl/books?id=OlbDZY3S_mIC&printsec=frontcover&hl=pl&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false (21.03.16).
- Kirkham, V. (2002). *Il canonista e la sua dama: Iconografia della Fiammetta dall' Autori e Lettori di Boccaccio* Atti del convegno internazionale di Certaldo (20-22 settembre 2001). a cura di Michelangelo Picone. Firenze: Franco Cesati.
- Manikowska, H. (1996). *Andegaweni. Dynastia Feudałów. Mówią Wieki*, nr 2.
- Manikowska, H. (1997). *Andegaweni*. In: A. Mączka (red.) *Dynastie Europy*. Wrocław: Zakład Narodowy im. Ossolińskich.
- Menetti, E. (2007) *Giovanni Boccaccio – Biografia e approfondimento critico su tutte le opere* inserito nella Letteratura italiana. Einaudi, volume 2, edizione La Biblioteca di Repubblica – L'Espresso. http://blogs.dotnethell.it/artblog/16.-Giovanni-Boccaccio-Biografia-e-approfondimento-critico-su-tutte-le-opere__11344.aspx (21.03.16).
- Menetti, E., Curti, E. (2013). *Giovanni Boccaccio*. https://www.academia.edu/10989330/Boccaccio_e_la_seduzione_della_poesia_Introduzione_con_Elisa_Curti_L_e_Monnier_2013_ (07.04.16).
- Muscetta, C. (1974). *Giovanni Boccaccio*. Bari: Laterza.
- Müller, M. C. (2006) *Boccaccio e letterature romanze tra Medioevo e Rinascimento. Atti del convegno internazionale "Boccaccio e la Francia" a cura Mazzoni Peruzzi S.* Firenze: Alinea Editrice. https://books.google.pl/books?id=jbKs1_gs7RUC&pg=PA160&lpg=PA160&dq=Boccaccio#v=onepage&q=Boccaccio&f=false (21.03.16)
- Opitz, C. (2009). *La vita quotidiana delle donne nel tardoMedioevo (1250-1500)* In: G.Duby. M.Perrot (2009). *Storia delle donne. Il Medioevo*. Bari: Gius, Laterza & Figli.
- Piccolo, R. (1997). Una Contessina di Belcastro. <http://www.belcastroweb.com/>

- belcastro/piccolo/fiammetta.htm#_ftnref11 (14.10.15)
- Picone, M. (2002). *Autori e lettori di Boccaccio : atti del Convegno internazionale di Certaldo (20-22 settembre 2001)*/ a cura di Michelangelo Picone. Firenze: Franco Cesati Editore.
- Raczyńska, A. (2011). Gli influssi ovidiani nella descrizione delle sofferenze amorose nell'Elegia di Madonna Fiammetta di Giovanni Boccaccio *Romanica.doc*, nr. 2 <http://romdoc.amu.edu.pl/Raczynska.pdf> (29.04.16).
- Salinari, C. (1961). *Rinaldo d'Aquino*, 1961 Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani - Volume 3. http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/rinaldo-d-aquino_%28Dizionario_Biografico%29/ (21.03.16).
- Sapegno, N. (1952). *Giovanni Boccaccio: Decameron, Filocolo, Ameto, Fiammetta – Introduzione*. http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/giovanni-boccaccio-decameron-filocolo-ameto-fiammetta-introduzione_%28I_Classici_Ricciardi:_Introduzioni%29/ (14.10.15).
- Surdichi, L. (2001). *Boccaccio*. Bari: Editori Laterza.
- Tateo, F. (1970). *Umiltà*. Enciclopedia Dantesca, http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/umilta_%28Enciclopedia-Dantesca%29/ (25.03.16)
- Tateo, F. (1998). *Boccaccio*. Roma: Editori Laterza.
- Tedesco, N. (2002). *La prosa del Boccaccio : cretomazia della critica / a cura di Natale Tedesco*. Caltanissetta, Roma : Salvatore Sciascia Editore.
- Torraca, F. (1912). *Per la biografia di Giovanni Boccaccio. Appunti*. Roma: Riccardo Garroni. p. 34. <https://archive.org/details/perlabiografiadi00torruoft> (07.04.16).
- Treccani (1932). La Cultura Italiana, Enciclopedia italiana, *Florio e Biancofiore*. http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/florio-e-biancofiore_%28Enciclopedia-Italiana%29/ (21.03.16).
- Vairo, E. (2013). *Basilica di San Lorenzo Maggiore - "Grazioso e bel tempio" di Boccaccio*. http://www.immagazine.it/wp-content/uploads/2013/09/arte_sett.pdf (21.03.16).
- Virgilio (1996). Vocabolario, <http://sapere.virgilio.it/parole/vocabolario/fiamma> (21.03.16).
- Zientara, B. (2000). *Historia powszechna średniowiecza*. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo TRIO.

Maša GUŠTIN
Uniwersytet Gdański
masa.gustin@univ.gda.pl
Liliana KALITA
Uniwersytet Gdański
liliana.kalita@ug.edu.pl

Pod pręgierzem cenzury – „półkownicy” kina radzieckiego

Summary

The article presents the phenomenon of the so-called shelf sentenced Soviet movies, in other words, cinematographic achievements which were withdrawn from public distribution due to their political disloyalty. Their screening was possible only after the political upheaval of the 1980s. The focal point of the paper is the censorship and its role in the Soviet Union with the examples of movies subjected to administrative intervention. The authors underscore the role of the 5th Cinematographic Congress taking place in Moscow in 1989. Analytical attention is brought in particular to movies of Gleb Panfilov, Tengiz Abuladze, Alexander Askoldov, Alexei German and Alexander Sokurov.

Keywords: censorship, forbidden movies, Soviet Union, Soviet cinematography, Russian cinematography, Panfilov, Abuladze, Askoldov, German and Sokurov.

Wprowadzenie

Swoboda wypowiedzi artystycznej, naukowej, publicystycznej czy religijnej należy do najistotniejszych zdobyczy ludzkości. Nie jest to jednak wartość dana raz na zawsze, bowiem, jak uczy historia, na różnych etapach rozwoju dziejów poszczególne instytucje, rządy, a nawet jednostki nakładały na twórców i myślicieli ograniczenia, usiłując w ten sposób nie dopuścić do prezentowania źle widzianych treści, czy kreowania wizji świata niezgodnej z obowiązującą oficjalnie ideologią. Innymi słowy, w sferze publicznej pojawiła się cenzura, czyli „urzędowa kontrola publikacji, widowisk teatralnych, audycji radiowych itp., oceniająca je pod względem politycznym lub obyczajowym” (*Słownik języka polskiego*, online).

Cenzura w Rosji do czasów Piotra I dotyczyła przede wszystkim struktur kościelnych i miała charakter raczej prewencyjny. Wraz z ograniczeniem roli kościoła przez reformy podjęte na życzenie Piotra I prawie cała działalność typograficzna znalazła się w rękach prywatnych, przełamując tym samym wieloletni monopol cerkwi w kwestii kontroli publikacji. Role cenzora spełniał

sam car lub jego współpracownicy. Należy zauważyć, iż w XVIII wieku cenzura była zjawiskiem nieuporządkowanym. W praktyce wnoszeniem wszelkich poprawek, akceptacją tekstów zajmowała się Akademia Nauk. Pierwsze regulacje prawne odnośnie do kontroli publikacji pojawiły się za czasów Katarzyny II. 22 października 1796 roku dekretem carycy powołano instytucje cenzury w każdym mieście. Cenzurą miał zajmować się zespół złożony z trzech osób: przedstawiciela stanu duchownego, świeckiego i osoby związanej z nauką. Kolejni władcy Rosji nie tylko rozszerzyli zakres uprawnień cenzorskich, ale również wzmocnili zapisy prawne, co wynikało m. in. z doświadczeń historycznych, jak np. rewolucja francuska, wojna z Napoleonem i rozwój idei liberalno-demokratycznych na Zachodzie (Zhirkov, online).

W wieku XX w krajach, w których władza miała charakter totalitarny, a do takich należał Związek Radziecki, cenzura stała się jednym z elementów aparatu represji, całkowicie podlegającym i kontrolowanym przez władze komunistyczne, które powołały Zarząd Główny do Spraw Literatury i Wydawnictw (tzw. Gławlit), czyniąc go w pełni odpowiedzialnym za publikowane treści. Książki, które nie wpisywały się swoją problematyką czy stylistyką w socrealistyczny kanon (np. poezja Anny Achmatowej czy proza Michaiła Bułhakowa) przechowywane były w tzw. speczchronach, do których dostęp był ściśle reglamentowany. Sytuacja taka trwała niemalże do upadku Związku Radzieckiego, chociaż już w końcowej fazie jego istnienia zauważalne było złagodzenie cenzury, przestały bowiem obowiązywać dotychczasowe ideologiczne podstawy, na których opierało się państwo sowieckie. Oficjalnie cenzura została zniesiona dekretem z 27 grudnia 1991 roku *O środkach masowego przekazu*.

Podobnie jak literatura piękna czy publikacje prasowe ograniczeniom cenzuralnym podlegał również film. Ingerencja kontroli mogła nastąpić już na etapie czytania scenariusza przez przedstawicieli odpowiednich instytucji, w trakcie zamkniętych pokazów, zanim jeszcze film trafiał do dystrybucji, a nawet już w czasie jego prezentacji szerokiej publiczności, kiedy to pod wymyślonym pretekstem konfiskowano kopie obrazu, zamykając je w archiwach lub – w najlepszym razie – wymuszając na reżyserze przemontowanie filmu i usunięcie z niego niepożądanych elementów, np. uznawanych za antysowiecką propagandę. Za ocenę filmów pod kątem ich zawartości ideologicznej odpowiedzialny był Państwowy Komitet ds. Kinematografii (Goskino) ZSRR, który od 1953 roku działał w strukturach Ministerstwa Kultury. Cenzurą zajmowały się również takie organy, jak KGB (od lat siedemdziesiątych XX wieku), wojsko, ministerstwa, a nieoficjalnie, w formie „samokontroli” lub „kontroli wewnętrznej”, sami twórcy filmowi, zarówno scenarzyści, reżyserzy, jak i technicy oraz inne osoby. Roli cenzora podejmowali się także osobiście, wzorem chociażby cara Mikołaja I,

przewodniczący KP ZSRR – Józef Stalin i Nikita Chruszczow. Oczywiście twórcy przeciwni ideologii systemu prowadzili swoją grę z cenzurą, na przykład poprzez metafory wizualne, których cenzorzy nie potrafili odczytać. Zwykle jednak ich filmy nie przechodziły etapu kolaudacji i trafiały na półki, a widownia przez długie lata nie wiedziała o ich istnieniu.

Rosyjskie filmy podlegające cenzurze i ich losy

Obrazy filmowe, które były źle widziane przez cenzurę w rosyjskim obszarze językowym znane są jako „filmy w skarbcu”, w Polsce natomiast określano je mianem „półkowników”. Jak podaje definicja słownikowa, „półkownik” to „[...] utwór filmowy, którego dystrybucję uniemożliwiła cenzura, przechowywany na półce w magazynie (stąd nazwa). Pierwszym słynnym półkownikiem był film *Purity* (1916) Rea Bergera, wycofany z kin za „skandaliczne ukazywanie nagości” (Wiącek, 2006, p. 143). Katalog rosyjskich „półkowników” zawiera filmy odmienne stylistycznie i gatunkowo, a ingerencja cenzury dotycząca niektórych scen rozpatrywana z dzisiejszej perspektywy przypomina często „dmuchanie na zimne”, kontrolerzy bowiem, prawdopodobnie chcąc uniknąć zarzutu braku ideowej czujności, nakazywali usunięcie określonych fragmentów jakby na wyrost, usiłując zapobiec naśladowaniu przez odbiorców negatywnych wzorców zachowań. Taka sytuacja miała miejsce z filmem Eldara Riazanowa *Na rabunek* (*Старики-разбойники*, 1971). Cenzura dopatrzyła się w jednej ze scen, przedstawiającej szybką jazdę samochodem, który m. in. po schodach wjeżdża do przejścia podziemnego, propagowania niebezpiecznych i niepożądanych zachowań i obawiając się ich naśladownictwa kazała wyciąć ten fragment filmu. Dużą popularnością, również w Polsce, cieszył się serial *Gdzie jest Czarny Kot?* (*Место встречи изменить нельзя*, 1979) w reżyserii Stanisława Goworuchina z Włodzimierzem Wysockim w roli kapitana Gleba Żegłowa. Serial liczy pięć odcinków, chociaż pierwotny projekt zakładał siedem, a trwające blisko dwie godziny ujęcia, które padły ofiarą ingerencji cenzury, zostały stracone bezpowrotnie. Usunięto m. in. scenę z wojennej przeszłości Szarapowa, w której bohater dostarcza za linię frontu niemieckiego żołnierza, czy też scenę miłosną, obecną w powieści braci Wajnerów *Era miłosierdzia*, która posłużyła jako podstawa scenariusza, a także szczerą rozmowę Żegłowa i Szarapowa, w której miało dojść do wyjaśnienia powodów nieporozumień pomiędzy szefem a jego podwładnym (Bocharov, online). Niekiedy jednak film zamiast na półkę trafiał do sal kinowych. Taka historia zdarzyła się z pierwszą radziecką komedią muzyczną pt. *Świat się śmieje* (*Веселые ребята*, 1934) w reżyserii Georgija Aleksandrowa oraz filmem Andreja Tarkowskiego *Andriej Rublow* (*Андрей Рублев*, 1966).

Obrazowi Aleksandrowi, w większości chwalonemu przez krytykę za styl i dowcip, zarzucono „brak «szkieletu społecznego» oraz amerykańizm” (Cybulski, 2013, p. 19) i gdyby nie aprobata Stalina, kto wie czy taśma zamiast do kin nie trafiłaby na półki ściśle strzeżonych archiwów. Jeżeli zaś mowa o dramacie Tarnowskiego, to został on wyświetlony na zamkniętym seansie Nikicie Chruszczowowi, który po kilku minutach projekcji zasnął, a obudziwszy się tuż przed finałem filmu, stwierdził: „Film jest nudny, ale nie niebezpieczny. Wyświetlajcie”. W ten sposób obraz trafił do III kategorii cenzorskiej.

Wiele filmów rosyjskich twórców, szczególnie tych, którzy cenili sobie artystyczną niezależność i własną perspektywę oglądu zdarzeń, trafiało do archiwów jeszcze na etapie pokazów zamkniętych. Taki los podzieliły filmy m. in. Kiry Muratowej, Aleksieja Germana, Aleksandra Askoldowa, czy Gleba Panfiłowa. Na swoją premierę musiały nierzadko czekać wiele lat i być może nie nastąpiłoby to w ogóle gdyby nie reformy Michaiła Gorbaczowa. Gorbaczow, wprowadzając Związek Radziecki w okres pierestrojki, spowodował stopniowe otwieranie się horyzontów myślowych władzy, a to łączyło się z większą wolnością słowa dla elit intelektualnych. Pod hasłem „głasności” pojawiła się możliwość wyrażania myśli i publicznej dyskusji w dziedzinach będących przez długi czas tematem tabu. Radziecka badaczka, Olga Bułgakowa, łączy zjawisko filmowych ingerencji cenzorskich z przygotowaniem gruntu pod reformy lat 80., jej zdaniem bowiem, filmy odsyłane na półki były swoistym katalizatorem zmian i pomogły w duchowym przygotowaniu Związku Radzieckiego do pierestrojki (Bułgakowa, 1999, p.184).

Przełomowym momentem w kinematografii rosyjskiej był V Zjazd Związku Filmowców, który odbył się w maju 1986 roku i został uznany za najważniejsze wydarzenie na rzecz przemian współczesnej kinematografii rosyjskiej. Jego znaczenie jest na tyle istotne, że sam zjazd stał się symbolem procesów demokratyzacji państwa. Po raz pierwszy w tajnym głosowaniu wybrano nowego przewodniczącego Związku Filmowców Radzieckich, Elema Klimowa, ponadto utworzono nową radę recenzentów, a także zdecydowano się uwolnić filmy dotychczas zakazane i umożliwiono ich projekcje w kinach i na festiwalach. Związek zaczął także wspierać młodych autorów, którzy w poprzednim systemie nie mieli szans na rozwój artystyczny i samodzielną realizację filmów. Doniosłość zjazdu łączy się też z uświadomieniem sobie przez artystów prawa do wolności słowa, co poskutkowało przegłosowaniem władzy radzieckiej, do czego jeszcze kilkanaście lat wcześniej z pewnością by nie doszło. Rosyjski reżyser Andriej Smirnow skomentował V Zjazd Związku Filmowców jako „pierwszy haust wolności w historii państwa”, niektórzy twierdzili wręcz, że kongres rozpędził motor pierestrojki, a jeszcze inni, jak pisarz Borys Wasiljew, mówili, że to koniec

służalności (*5-yj S'jezd Sovetskich Kinematografistov*, online). Bez wątpienia podwalin zmiany w sferze artystycznej należy upatrywać w epoce odwilży, jednak dopiero czas pierestrojki i zauważalny w każdej niemal sferze życia publicznego kryzys ośmielił twórców do manifestacji swoich poglądów.

Elem Klimow, jako nowy szef rosyjskich filmowców, poważnie podszedł do swojej roli i wprowadził „prawo dwóch podpisów”, według którego do zrealizowania filmu wystarczała akceptacja dwóch instytucji (Związku Kinematografistów i Goskomitetu), co w porównaniu z przeszłością, było znaczącym novum. Działalność Klimowa przyczyniła się do „uwolnienia” wielu zabronionych wcześniej filmów oraz przywrócenia do pracy szeregu twórców, którym z przyczyn politycznych zabroniono wykonywania zawodu. Jednak sam reżyser, sfrustrowany brakiem całkowitej swobody działania, postanowił w 1988 roku ustąpić ze stanowiska i do końca życia (zmarł w 2003) nie nakręcił już żadnego filmu. Losy artystyczne Elema Klimowa są doskonałą ilustracją napięć, jakie istniały pomiędzy dążącym do wyrażania siebie twórcą a narzucającymi własną wizję epoki instytucjami rządowymi. W 1965 roku na ekrany kin wszedł film *Przygody dentysty* (*Полождения зубного врача*), do którego scenariusz napisał Aleksander Wołodin. Na pozór niewinna historia lekarza, potrafiącego bezboleśnie leczyć zęby „uznana została za antysowiecką i zdjęta z ekranów” (Wojnicka, 2015, p. 833), a przywrócona została dopiero w 1987 roku. Cenzorom nie spodobało się groteskowe – ich zdaniem – ukazywanie sowieckich realiów. Od 1966 roku Klimow pracował nad pomysłem filmu o Grigoriju Rasputinie, którego scenariusz przez długi czas nie zyskiwał akceptacji decydentów. Jak pisze Sebastian Chosiński „dopiero kiedy w 1973 roku zmieniły się władze sowieckiej kinematografii, zapalone zostało zielone światło. Kilkanaście miesięcy później film – opowiadający o upadku caratu i eksponujący postać «szalonego mnicha» Grigorija Rasputina – był już gotowy, ale zamiast na ekrany, ponownie powędrował na półkę. Specjaliści od propagandy uznali bowiem, że nie tyle przedstawia on rozkład moralny imperium Romanowów, co degrengoladę Związku Radzieckiego epoki Leonida Breżniewa, natomiast działacze partyjni dopatrzyli się w nim, jak w krzywym zwierciadle, własnego wizerunku” (Chosiński, online).

Zjazd Związku Filmowców miał niebagatelne znaczenie dla samych „pułkowników”, o czym w następujących słowach pisze Wolfgang Beilenhoff: „najważniejszymi decyzjami podjętymi na Kongresie było [...] powołanie Komisji Do Spraw Konfliktów pod wodzą Andrzeja Płachowa, która miała za zadanie obejrzeć i zrewidować wszystkie «półkownicy». Za sprawą ich działań ujawniono niemal 200 zakazanych filmów z różnych dziedzin kinematografii, od kronik filmowych do animacji. Najbardziej zaskakujący, zdaniem Smirnowa, był fakt, że

zakazane były filmy nie tylko z lat 60. czy 70., ale nawet z lat 30., które po dziś dzień na półkach nie utraciły nic na swym znaczeniu” (Beilenhoff, 1990, p. 131).

Problemy z cenzurą mieli m. in. znani twórców komedii lat 60.: Gieorgij Danielija i Eldar Riazanow. Danielija zrealizował komedię pt. *Trzydzieści trzy* (*Тридцать три*, 1965), której bohater – Iwan Trawkin – ze względu na posiadanie trzydziestego trzeciego zęba jest medycznym ewenementem. Wieści o nim szybko się rozchodzą, Trawkin trafia do Moskwy, gdzie staje się medialną sensacją i obiektem licznych badań naukowych. Pojawia się nawet pomysł wysłania go w kosmos (lata 60. to czas ekspansji kosmicznej Rosjan i prób wyprzedzenia na tym polu Ameryki), co ostatecznie przesądziło o ingerencji cenzury. W filmie dopatrzoneo się kpiny z radzieckich kosmonautów i obraz zdjęto z ekranów zaledwie po dwóch tygodniach jego wyświetlania.

Wspomniany już wcześniej Eldar Riazanow również miał kłopoty z cenzurą, co przejawiało się chociażby w problemach z uzyskaniem zgody na rozpoczęcie produkcji filmu *Złodziej samochodów* (*Берегись автомобиля*, 1966). Scenariusz filmu, autorstwa reżysera i Emila Bragińskiego, który początkowo nosił tytuł *Ukradli samochód*, miał być zatwierdzony do produkcji w 1964 roku. Czujni uznali pomysł za ewentualną próbę namawiania obywateli ZSRR do kradzieży samochodów i praca nad filmem utknęła na wiele miesięcy.

Film Gleba Panfilowa *Temat* (*Тема*, 1979), był pierwszym „półkownikiem”, który został zauważony na świecie, a miało to miejsce podczas Międzynarodowego Festiwalu Filmowego w Berlinie w 1987 roku. Obraz opowiadający o braku wolności twórczej i trudnościach głównego protagonisty, dramaturga Kima Jesienina, w Związku Radzieckim został nagrodzony Złotym Niedźwiedziem. Film ma jednak za sobą niełatwą historię. Latem 1979 po Moskwie rozeszły się słuchy, że Gleb Panfilow skończył swój nowy film i być może zostanie on zgłoszony do konkursu w Moskiewskim Festiwalu Filmowym. Reżyser prezentował swoje dzieło na zamkniętych pokazach, starannie dobierając widzów. Jednak choć film widzieli nieliczni, do Komitetu Centralnego partii zaczęły przychodzić listy określające go jako kontrewolucyjny. To przekreśliło szanse obrazu Panfilowa na udział w festiwalowym konkursie i odesłaniu go na półkę. Film podejmuje problematykę kryzysu artysty i jego wewnętrznej przemiany. Jak zauważa Valerij Golovskoj, „stajemy się świadkami całkowitego życiowego upadku bohatera” (Golovskoj, online), który uświadomił sobie, że zmarnował swoje życie, bowiem sprzeniewierzył się zasadom prawdziwej sztuki, stając się twórcą-konformistą, piszącym na zamówienie władzy. Jesienin, już jako człowiek dojrzały, dochodzi do wniosku, że przez lata oszukiwał siebie i innych, zatracając stopniowo ludzkie cechy, stając się natomiast śrubką w maszynie państwowej, utrwalającej istniejący system. Z dawnych ideałów nie pozostało już nic, a jedyne uczucia, jakie bohater

w sobie odnajduje to obojętność wobec bliskich i poczucie braku sensu jakichkolwiek działań. Gleb Panfilow filmem *Temat* po raz kolejny udowodnił, „że potrafi on w codzienności dostrzegać cechy niezwykle, odnaleźć charakter zadziwiający, a zarazem typowy dla człowieka nowego społeczeństwa niezależnie od tego, czy będą to lata dwudzieste, sześćdziesiąte, czy też siedemdziesiąte” (Dołmatowska, Szyłowa, 1980, p. 247).

W tym samym roku na festiwalu w Cannes triumfuje *Pokuta* (*Покаяние*, 1984) w reżyserii Tengiza Abuładze, satyryczno-groteskowa rozprawa ze zbrodniami i absurdami stalinizmu. Produkcji tego obrazu patronował ówczesny gruziński pierwszy sekretarz partii Eduardy Szewardnadze, który wspierał film od momentu, gdy przeczytał scenariusz. Aby obejść procedury formalne i cenzurę, zgłoszono go jako dokument telewizyjny, zyskując w ten sposób możliwość finansowania przez gruzińską telewizję. W 1984 roku film został pokazany zarządowi studia Gruzfilm, który wyraził swoją akceptację pod warunkiem dokonania kilku drobnych poprawek. Do obiegu jednak trafiła kopia oryginału, a w rezultacie film został zakazany.

W 1986 roku krytyk filmowy Andriej Płachow w trakcie podróży służbowej do Tbilisi poprosił reżysera i dyrektora studia filmowego Gruzfilm, Rezo Czcheidze, żeby zorganizował dla niego tajny seans i pokazał mu *Pokutę*. Sytuacja ta nabrała nieoczekiwanego zwrotu, o czym tak pisze krytyk: „W sali byliśmy we trzech: ja, Abuładze i Czcheidze, ale w pomieszczeniu operatora filmowego zebrało się około dwudziestu osób, które usłyszały o tajnym seansie. Oglądanie filmu było zabronione «pod groźbą śmierci»” (Medvedev, 2002, p. 74).

Po powrocie z Tbilisi Płachow poinformował o tym wydarzeniu Elema Klimowa i potajemnie przywiózł kopię filmu do Moskwy. Irina Rubanowa, krytyk filmowy, wspomina, jak film trafił na V Zjazd Filmowców Radzieckich: „Pamiętam, że potykaliśmy się o skrzynie z tym filmem. I dosłownie na drugi dzień po zjeździe nowe władze urządziły pierwszą projekcję. Zamknięto nas na klucz, przy drzwiach stanęła sekretarka poprzedniego szefa związku – Kulidżanowa zdjęto, ale wyszkolona sekretarka została. Tak w atmosferze ścisłej tajemnicy – spadek po poprzedniej epoce – obejrzelśmy *Pokutę*. Zapadła decyzja o skierowaniu jej na ekrany. Ale nawet taki liberał jak Aleksander Jakowlew długo był temu przeciwny” (Żebrowska, 2001, online).

Rosyjscy filmoznawcy potraktowali *Pokutę* jako film kończący epokę stagnacji. Reżyser otrzymał wiele nagród, między innymi na festiwalach w Cannes, w Chicago i w Moskwie, a *Pokuta* doczekała się fenomenalnej dystrybucji. Sukces obrazu Abuładzego najlepiej chyba odzwierciedla liczba widzów w Związku Radzieckim – w roku 1987 film obejrzało około 13,6 miliona osób.

Rok później następnym „półkownik” – *Komisarz* (*Комиссар*, 1967) Aleksandra Askoldowa zostaje gorąco przyjęty w Berlinie, otrzymując Srebrnego Niedźwiedzia *ex aequo* z *Matką królów* Janusza Zaorskiego. Film ten przez dwadzieścia lat leżał na półkach z powodu „błędu ideologicznego”, który według cenzury polegał na niewłaściwym sposobie odzwierciedlenia epoki rewolucji, odbiegającym od wymowy utworu Wasilija Grossmana *W mieście Berdyczowie* (*В городе Бердичеве*, 1934), będącego podstawą scenariusza. Cenzorzy uznali też, że skandalicznie są w tym filmie ukazane losy narodu żydowskiego, a zwłaszcza niejednoznaczna postać głównej bohaterki, Kławdii Wawiłowej (w tej roli niezrównana Nonna Mordiukowa), u której pod wpływem ciąży rodzą się nieznanne jej wcześniej odruchy i uczucia, dochodzi też do swoistej rywalizacji w jej osobowości pomiędzy pierwiastkiem męskim (zaangażowanie w wojnę) i żeńskim (macierzyństwo). Film Askoldowa, nawiązując tematycznie do burzliwych lat rewolucji, korzystał ze stylistyki ornamentalnej i metaforycznej. Jak zauważa Joanna Wojnicka „Askoldow pogłębia symboliczne skojarzenia. Inkrustuje stonowaną i oszczędną narrację Grossmana. Najwyraźniej widać to w ostatnich ujęciach filmu, które istnieją jakby poza kontekstem fabuły” (Wojnicka, 2012, p. 212). Askoldow swoim obrazem ewidentnie nie trafił w odpowiedni czas. Nastąpiła zmiana na stanowisku I sekretarza partii – Chruszczowa zastąpił Leonid Breżniew, premiera filmu zbiegła się ponadto w czasie z siedmiodniową wojną pomiędzy Izraelem a Egiptem, a zatem temat żydowski był źle widziany. Sam reżyser za tak zrealizowany film zapłacił bardzo wysoką cenę. Wykluczono go z partii, z powodu pasożytnictwa społecznego musiał opuścić Moskwę, został uznany za nieprzydatnego do zawodu, co wiązało się z nałożeniem na niego zakazu wykonywania pracy. Taśma z filmem miała zostać zniszczona, jednak prośby do władz kierowane m. in. przez odtwórców głównych ról: Nonnę Mordiukową i Rolana Bykowa, spowodowały zmianę tej decyzji.

Jednym z najbardziej znaczących filmów, które podzieliły los „półkowników” jest obraz pt. *Próba wierności* (*Проверка на дорогах*, 1971) Aleksieja Germana. Film został zakazany, ponieważ desakralizuje radzieckich żołnierzy walczących w II wojnie światowej. „Tragicznym bohaterem uwikłanym w labirynt historii” (Mucha, 2002, p. 300) jest były sierżant Armii Czerwonej, Łazarow złapany w niemieckim mundurze przez sowieckich partyzantów. Żołnierzy uznanych za zdrajców zazwyczaj rozstrzeliwano lub wysyłano do łagru, ale w tym filmie dowódca Łokotkow i komisarz Pietuszkow traktują dezertera inaczej, postanawiając najpierw sprawdzić jego lojalność. Siłą tego filmu, zdaniem Silvii Holtz, wypływa z faktu, iż „dostanie się do niewoli i (przymusowa) współpraca z Niemcami nie było traktowane jako deklaracja zdrady, wręcz odwrotnie – «zdrajca» został pokazany jako ofiara wojny, a następnie nawet jako

bohater, co stanowiło naruszenie tabu” (Holtz, 2012, p. 288). Film ten przez cenzurę został określony jako antysowiecki, podobnie jak kolejny zakazany obraz tego reżysera, *Mój przyjaciel Iwan Łapszyn* (*Мой друг Иван Лапшин*, 1984), który zapoczątkował w kinie radzieckim tematykę terroru stalinowskiego lat 30. i 40. XX minionego wieku. Wspomniany wyżej obraz Germana opowiada o wydarzeniach w prowincjonalnym miasteczku w roku 1935 z perspektywy dziewięcioletniego chłopca, który mieszka z ojcem w komunalnym mieszkaniu, dzieląc je z komisarzem milicji kryminalnej Iwanem Łapszynem i kilkoma innymi postaciami. Również w tym filmie German w niezgodny z tradycją, a według polityków komunistycznych nieodpowiedzialny, sposób podejmuje problematykę zbrodni dokonywanych przez władze na własnym narodzie, demitologizuje oficjalnie głoszone poglądy w tej sprawie i przełamuje istniejące tabu, zgodnie z którymi pewne problemy w ogóle nie istniały w świadomości społecznej. „W odróżnieniu od filmów okresu odwilży – pisze Bettina Lange – w których bohater jest nośnikiem metaforycznego znaczenia jako typ historyczny, w filmie Germana nie ma bohatera, który mówiłby w imieniu kolektywu i historii. [...] Zamiast tego film akcentuje przypadkowe, prywatne i drugorzędne elementy historii” (Lange, 2012, p. 375).

Reżyserem, którego filmy zarówno fabularne, jak i dokumentalne przez wiele lat nie trafiały do kin, jest także Aleksander Sokurow. W 1978 w Moskiewskiej Wyższej Szkole Filmowej Sokurow nakręcił swoją pierwszą fabułę, *Samotny głos człowieka* (*Одинокий голос человека*, 1978–1987), na podstawie opowiadania Andrieja Płatonowa *Rzeka Potudań* (*Река Потудань*, 1934) – do 1988 roku ten oraz inne fabularne i dokumentalne filmy Sokurowa, powstałe przed 1987, leżały na półkach. W *Samotnym głosie człowieka*, który przez dziesięć lat był, jak pisze Oleg Kowalov, „filmem widmem” czy „filmem legendą” (Kowalov, 1994, p. 41), Sokurow, kreśląc wieloaspektowy portret młodego Nikity Firsowa i jego bliskich, reżyser buduje obraz wewnętrznie skomplikowanej i dotkniętej ciężkim doświadczeniem wojennym jednostki na tle historycznego przełomu, po zakończeniu wojny domowej, na początku lat dwudziestych XX wieku. Świat, w którym żyją bohaterowie, jest ponury, zniszczony przez wojnę domową, wypełniony destrukcją i rozkładem. *Samotny głos człowieka*, uznany za antyradziecki, na polecenie władz szkoły filmowej miał zostać całkowicie zniszczony. Sokurow i jego scenarzysta Jurij Arabow uratowali go jednak, wykradając oryginalną taśmę. Zamiast niej włożyli do puszkę negatywy filmu Siergieja Eisensteina *Pancernik „Potiomkin”* (*Броненосец „Потемкин”*, 1925). Perypetie związane z filmem *Samotny głos człowieka*, brak zgody administracji Wszechzwiązkowego Państwowego Instytutu Kinematografii na przyjęcie obrazu jako projektu dyplomowego skończyło się porzuceniem przez

Sokurowa studiów w 1978 roku. Sokurow obronił dyplom w 1979 roku filmem dokumentalnym pt. *Maria* (*Мария*, 1974).

Kolejnymi „półkownikami” w reżyserii Sokurowa były takie filmy fabularne i dokumentalne, jak *Zdegradowany* (*Разжалованный*, 1980), *Smutna obojętność* (*Скорбное бесчувствие*, 1983), *Sonata dla Hitlera* (*Соната для Гитлера*, 1979–1987) czy *Elegia* (*Элегия*, 1986). Film *Zdegradowany*, opowiadający o degradacji inspektora pojazdów do stanowiska taksówkarza, został niemal kompletnie zniszczony – pozostała jedynie trwająca około trzydziestu minut kopia reżysera. Obraz *Smutna obojętność*, do którego scenariusz napisany został na podstawie sztuki Bernarda Shaw *Dom serc złamanych* (*Heartbreak House*, 1917) należy do nielicznych radzieckich filmów utrzymanych w stylistyce postmodernistycznej. W *Sonacie dla Hitlera* Sokurow zestawiał obok siebie fragmenty radzieckiej i niemieckiej kroniki filmowej z czasów dobiegającej końca II wojny światowej. Artystę interesowały szczególnie konsekwencje, jakie ideologia nazistowskiej spowodowała u swoich wyznawców. Na tym tle znaczącą wybrzmiewają sugestie reżysera o zastąpieniu jednego tyrana innym, Sokurow dokonuje bowiem wyraźnej paraleli pomiędzy rządami Hitlera i Stalina. Dokumentalny obraz *Elegia* dotyczył przeniesienia prochów Fiodora Szalapina z paryskiego miejsca pochówku na Cmentarz Nowodziewiczy w Moskwie i związanej z tym wydarzeniem wizyty w Rosji rodziny śpiewaka. Jak zauważył Jakub Majmurek „w swoich dokumentach Sokurow nie udaje, że jako dokumentalista po prostu pokazuje jakiś wycinek «rzeczywistości» – za każdym razem problematyzuje pozycję, z której patrzy na świat. Nie interesuje go to, co w gazetowym obiegu wiedzy potocznej zwykło się nazywać «wydarzeniami», ale raczej to, co obok nich” (Majmurek, online).

Filmy Sokurowa, zarówno będące dokumentami, jak *I nic więcej* (*И ничего больше*, 1982–1987) lub *Elegia*, jak również produkcje fabularne, były zakazane pod pretekstem formalizmu i antysowieckości, mimo że zdaniem samego twórcy nie zawierały krytyki społecznej czy politycznej. Aleksander Sokurow pytany w wywiadach, jak traktował cenzorskie ingerencje, mówi: „Dawniej komuniści straszili, że odeślą moje filmy na półki. Spodziewali się histerycznych protestów albo gotowości na kompromisy. A ja mówiłem po prostu: «Nie ma pośpiechu, poczekam». Wzbudzało to konsternację i prędzej czy później, najczęściej po kilku latach, filmy trafiały w końcu na ekrany” (Sokurow, *Mogę...*, online).

Zakończenie

Artystyczna strategia, przyjęta w relacjach z cenzorami przez Sokurowa, okazała się świetną metodą na przetrwanie nie tylko dla jego filmów, ale również dla wielu innych rosyjskich obrazów. Jeśli bowiem, jak sugerował Bułhakow

„rękopisy nie płoną”, historia radzieckich „półkowników” dowodzi, że również taśma filmowa jest materiałem trwalszym niż zawodowy żywot niejednego cenzora czy polityka. Dziesiątki filmów, skazanych początkowo na zapomnienie lub niebyt, trafiły do odbiorców po roku 1986 i zostały tym samym włączone w nieprzerwany potok dziejów rosyjskiej kinematografii, stając się ich chlubą i znakiem jakości.

Bibliografia:

- 5-yj S'jezd Sovetskich Kinematografistov (1986), reż. G. Buraszowa. Available at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Ej_Ogq7GPiI>. Accessed 3.10.2016.
- Beilenhoff, W. (1990). „Dokumentar-und Spielfilm im Aufbruch: Andrzej Smirnow und Marina Goldowskaja”. In: Sabina Brändli, Walter Ruggle (eds.). *Sowjetischer film heute*. Baden: Lars Müller.
- Bocharov, O. *12 faktov o seriale „Mesto vstrechi izmenit' nel'zja”*. Available at <http://www.maximonline.ru/guide/cinema/_article/mesto-vstrechi-izmenit/>. Accessed 7.10.2016.
- Bulgakova, O. (1999). „Der neue Konservatismus“. In: Christine Engel (ed.). *Geschichte des sowjetischen und russischen Films*. Stuttgart-Weimar: Metzler.
- Chosiński, S. *Wizja Piekła, które ziściło się na Ziemi*. „Esensja Magazyn Kultury Popularnej” 2009, 23 września. Available at <<http://esensja.pl/film/dvd/tekst.html?id=8208>>. Accessed 3.10.2016.
- Cybulski, M. (2013). *ZSRR się śmieje. Filmy Leonia Gajdaja i radziecka kinematografia komediowa*. Toruń: Grado.
- Dołmatowska, G., Szyłowa, I. (1980). *Sylwetki radzieckiego ekranu*. Moskwa: Progress.
- Golovskoj, V. *Opasnaja tema Gleb*. Available at <<http://www.peoples.ru/art/cinema/producer/panfilov/history.html>>. Accessed 7.10.2016.
- Holtz, S. (2012). „Proverka na dorogach (1971)”. In: *Noev kovcheg russkogo kino: ot „Sten'ki Razina” do „Stiliag”*, Moskwa: Globus-Press.. Available at <<http://kinopressa.ru/wp-content/uploads/library/ve-nk-01.pdf>>. Accessed 10.10.2016.
- Kovalov, O. (1994). „My w odinokom golose cheloveka”. In: Ljubov Arkus (ed.), *Sokurov*. Sanki Peterburg: Seans-Press.
- Lange, B. (2012). „Mój drug Ivan Lapschin (1984)”. In: *Noev kovcheg russkogo kino: ot „Sten'ki Razina” do „Stiliag”*, Moskwa: Globus-Press. Available at <<http://kinopressa.ru/wp-content/uploads/library/ve-nk-01.pdf>>. Accessed 10.10.2016.
- Majmurek, J. *Oko jest leniwe*. Available at <<http://www.krytykapolityczna.pl/Serwiskulturalny/MajmurekOkojestleniwe/menuid-431.html>>. Accessed 3.10.2016.
- Medvedev, M. (2002). „V Tbilisi na kinostudii Gruzfil'ma sostojalsja pervyj tajnyj prosmotr «Pokojanija»”. In: *Novejshaja istorija otechestvennogo kino: Kino i kontekst: t. IV. 1986-2000*. Sankt Peterburg: Seans.
- Mucha, B. (2002). *Sztuka filmowa w Rosji 1896-1996*. Piotrków Trybunalski: Naukowe Wydawnictwo Piotrkowskie.

- Sokurow: Mogę żyć bez kina*. Wywiad Piotra Czerkawskiego z Aleksandrem Sokurowem. „Dziennik Opinii” 2015, nr 238. Available at <<http://www.krytykapolityczna.pl/artykuly/film/20150826/sokurow-moge-zyc-bez-kina>>. Accessed 7.10.2016.
- Słownik języka polskiego*, hasło: „Cenzura”. Available at <<http://sjp.pwn.pl/slowniki/cenzura.html>>. Accessed 3.10.2016.
- Wiącek, E. (2006). „Pułkownik”. In: Rafał Syska (ed.), *Słownik filmu*. Kraków: Zielona Sowa.
- Wojnicka, J. (2012). *Dzieci XX Zjazdu. Film w kulturze sowieckiej lat 1956-1968*. Kraków: Universitas.
- Wojnicka, J. (2015). „Kino sowieckie lat sześćdziesiątych i siedemdziesiątych”. In: Tadeusz Lubelski, Iwona Sowińska, Rafał Syska (eds.). *Historia kina, t. 3: Kino epoki nowofalowej*. Kraków: Universitas.
- Zhirkov, G.. Istorija cenzury w Rossii XIX-XX vv. Available at <<http://www.pseudology.org/tsenzura/ZhirkovTsenzuraHistory>>. Accessed 10.10.2016.
- Żebrowska, A. *Jak się nie udał eksperyment zrozumiały dla milionów. O kinie radzieckim i rosyjskim, Tarkowskim, Michałkowie i wyboistej drodze polskich reżyserów na moskiewskie ekrany z Iriną Rubinową, wybitnym krytykiem filmowym rozmawia Anna Żebrowska*, „Gazeta Wyborcza: 2001, 11.07. Available at <<http://wyborcza.pl/1,75410,345331.html>>. Accessed 7.10.2016.

