

ISSN 2353-2912

1(2)2014

Ateneum-Szkoła Wyższa w Gdańsku

Forum Filologiczne

ATENEUM

Ateneum Philological Forum

IDENTITY AND OTHER CONSTRUCTIONS

TOŻSAMOŚĆ I INNE KONSTRUKCJE



Gdańsk 2014

Komitet Wydawniczy:

prof. zw. dr hab. Edmund Kotarski (przewodniczący), prof. nadzw. dr Hanna Dubrzyńska,
dr Małgorzata Godlewska, prof. nadzw. dr hab. Marcin Krawczyński,
prof. nadzw. dr hab. Henryk Olszewski, prof. zw. dr hab. Waldemar Tłokiński,
prof. nadzw. dr hab. Zdzisław Aleksander.

Komitet Naukowy Czasopisma *Forum Filologiczne Ateneum*:

Filologia angielska

Prof. Desmond Graham, The University of Newcastle, Newcastle upon Tyne (Wielka Brytania)
Prof. zw. dr hab. Roman Kalisz, Wyższa Szkoła Języków Obcych w Świeciu (Polska)
Prof. Henryk Kardela, Uniwersytet M. Curie-Skłodowskiej w Lublinie (Polska)
Prof. Tom Napieralski University of Colorado, Colorado Springs (Stany Zjednoczone)
Prof. Piotr Stalmaszczyk, Uniwersytet Łódzki (Polska)

Filologia włoska

Prof. Mercedes Arriaga Florez, Universidad de Seville (Hiszpania)
Prof. Dario Tomasello, Università degli Studi di Messina (Włochy)
Prof. Maria Rosaria Vitti-Alexander, College Nazareth-Rochester (Stany Zjednoczone)

Filologia hiszpańska

Prof. Antonio Pàmies Bertrán (Universidad de Granada) (Hiszpania)
Prof. Luis Luque Toro (Università Ca' Foscari, Venezia) (Włochy)
Dr Lucía Luque Nadal (Universidad de Córdoba) (Hiszpania)

Recenzja tomu:

Prof. María Jesús Lorenzo Modia, English Department Universidade da Coruña (Hiszpania)
Prof. Ingeborga Beszterda, UMK Poznań (Polska)
Prof. Ignacio Perez Pascual, Universidade da Coruña (Hiszpania)

Redaktor Naukowy: dr Małgorzata Godlewska

Redaktor języka angielskiego: Ross Aldridge
Redaktor języka hiszpańskiego: Fernando Torrens
Redaktor języka włoskiego: Linda Balistrelì

ISSN 2353-2912

© Copyright by „Ateneum-Szkoła Wyższa” w Gdańsku 2014
Pierwotna wersja czasopisma drukowana.

Adres Redakcji:

„Ateneum – Szkoła Wyższa” w Gdańsku, ul. 3 Maja 25A, 80-802 Gdańsk
e-mail: wydawnictwo@ateneum.edu.pl

Wydawnictwo

Ateneum – Szkoła Wyższa w Gdańsku
Przygotowanie do druku: Violetta Pastwa
Projekt okładki: Katarzyna Krawczyńska
Druk i oprawa: SOWA Sp. z o.o., 01-209 Warszawa, Hrubieszowska 6a
Nakład 100 egz.

Spis treści

Słowo wstępne..... 5

IDENTITY CONSTRUCTIONS

Elizabeth WOODWARD-SMITH	The Construction of a Female Leader.....	9
Begoña LASA ÁLVAREZ	The Discourse in Compilations of Women's Biographies in the Eighteenth Century: Constructing a Portrait of the Female Writer as a Model of Behaviour.....	25
Mónica Amenedo COSTA	Construction of Spanish Identities in the Eighteenth-Century English Press.....	41
Ross ALDRIDGE	Britain and the Cultural History of the First World War: The Uses of Historiography.....	51
Alan FLOYD	The Construction of the Nation in the Language of the Eighteenth-Century English Press.....	63

TEXTUAL CONSTRUCTIONS

Arek JANCZYŁO	Reframing in Translation in Political Context.....	77
Estefanía Mosquera CASTRO	Texting, Pidgin and Creole Languages: A Comparative Note on the Appearance of Peripheral Communicative Constructions.....	89
Carlos Pitel GARCIA	La picaresca, su nacimiento, evolución y entorno histórico.....	101
Aneta PAWLAK	El concepto de <i>aspecto</i> según la <i>Nueva Gramática de la Lengua Española</i>	115
Fernando TORRENS	Las TIC en la enseñanza del Léxico a estudiantes extranjeros.....	129

Słowo wstępne

Ateneum-University has always been concerned with humanistic studies and recently also with research within the field of philology. On this occasion, we celebrate the launching of the second volume of Ateneum Philological Forum, "Identity and Other Constructions".

This number addresses several interesting subjects from different methodological perspectives with the issue of "a construction" being their integral part. The first group of articles in Part I relates to the construction of human identities, both individual and global, as presented in European literature as well as history and culture. The second one relates to linguistic constructions and literary patterns rather more directly.

Literary biography has not always enjoyed the same acceptance it has today, and Begoña Lasa's contribution analyzes how the fact of being women might shape their consideration and recognition as writers, as well as to what extent this could affect their feminine readers.

On the other hand, Elizabeth Woodward, in "The Construction of a Female Leader", approaches the construction of the political personality of the British Prime Minister Margaret Thatcher through her speeches, interviews as well as aspects of non-verbal communication such as her way of speaking and the attitude she adopted in public appearances.

"Construction of Spanish Identities in the Eighteenth-Century Press" deals with the role of English Periodical Publications in cultural construction, focusing in particular on the travels through Spain of Major William Dalrymple.

Arek Janczylo in "Reframing in Translation in Political Context" addresses the question of how translation as an act of communication is politically, ideologically and culturally motivated and how it is a subject which can easily be manipulated.

"The concept of *aspect* according to the New Grammar of the Spanish Language" discusses *aspect* in the recent Grammar published in 2009 and this article also covers the history of studies on aspectuality.

The author of "Las TIC en la enseñanza del léxico a estudiantes extranjeros" discusses the teaching of Spanish as a foreign language using ICTs (Information and Communication Technologies), in particular in the teaching of vocabulary.

Historiographical issues, on the other hand, are analyzed by Ross Aldridge in "Britain and Cultural History of the First World War: The Uses of Historiography". The paintings of the British artist Charles Sims, some war poetry by Wilfrid Owen and Siegfried Sassoon.

Alan Floyd contributes a chapter entitled "The Construction of the Nation in the Language of the Eighteenth-Century English Press", where the author analyses attitudes displayed in texts published in *The Annual Register* of 1758 and *The Times* in the early 1790's.

"La picaresca, su nacimiento, evolución y entorno histórico" by Carlos García deals with the construction and evolution of this specific subgenre of the Spanish novel, discussing its importance in the development of the novel.

The volume tries to articulate what it might mean to talk about "constructions" in literature and language studies. It is suggested that the concept, which draws on literary, linguistic and cultural traditions of interpretation, might embrace a wide and complex phenomenon which easily moves beyond the borders of its conventional signification. One implication of the entire volume is that it is necessary to embrace the internal and external perspectives on a written text so as to participate in the discourse about constructions of human identities and the literary and linguistic patterns which these identities create. The articles collected in this volume constitute a philological project of opening out the concept of "a construction" for further inspection from a variety of new perspectives. All in all, these articles comprise an important analysis of modern academic interests from different methodological approaches and bring new light to philological studies today.

Prof. Antonio Raul de Toro Santos, University of Coruña
Dr Małgorzata Godlewska, Ateneum-University in Gdansk

Część 1
Part 1

**KONSTRUKCJE TOŻSAMOŚCI
IDENTITY CONSTRUCTIONS**

The Construction of a Female Leader

Konstrukcja Kobiety – Przywódca

Summary

The UK has had a long history of strong female figures, many of whom have been considered quintessentially British for their particular qualities. However, in spite of this tradition of memorable and successful women, the UK had never had a female prime minister, until Margaret Thatcher. Throughout her political career, and also after she had retired, she had both devoted admirers and staunch enemies. She was the object of cartoons, caricatures, and a satirical puppet show, her nickname became the title of a 'biopic' about the grocer's daughter from Grantham, and there was even a musical about her and the anxieties of power.

This article examines the construction of the political personality of Thatcher, and the sociocultural circumstances surrounding it, by examining some of her key statements, with reference to defining moments of her personal and political life, in order to reveal how discourse frames the identity of this important contemporary figure. For the purpose of this paper, discourse is taken as including not only her speeches, interviews or deliberately inserted comments, but also aspects of non-verbal communication such as the appearance, manner of speaking and attitude she cultivated. Sources used include the Margaret Thatcher Foundation which offers access to thousands of historical documents, and the press, television archives and selected printed works. The approach owes methodology to discourse analysis and cultural studies.

A young lower-middle class woman managed to enter a snobbish, male-dominated Conservative party and take up her place in parliament as a 'Lady Member', progressing in the space of twenty years to the ultimate post: prime minister of the UK. Although this looks like a great achievement for feminism, it will be shown how Thatcher took advantage of both feminine and masculine qualities in order to build a strong figure, projecting an increasingly adversarial personality, for which she will be remembered for many years to come, but without completely identifying with the problems experienced by her gender.

Her image as a strong female leader in a man's environment, incorporating powerful masculine qualities into her public projection must be one of the reasons why she is considered, even by her detractors, as the most iconic of all post-war Prime Ministers.

Keywords: Margaret Thatcher – identity – discourse – values – cultural studies

Introduction

The UK has had a long history of strong female figures, many of whom have been considered quintessentially British for their particular qualities. From the times of Boudicca, queen of the first-century A.D. Iceni tribe, to the twentieth-century Queen Mother (Elizabeth Bowes-Lyon), there has been a tendency to associate cultural values with certain public figures (Storry and Childs 18-19). Thus, in the common consciousness, defiant women, as leaders of a resilient nation, have become powerful symbols of shared cultural identity. Symbolic females include such varied figures as the pioneering professional nurse Florence Nightingale (strong, supportive womanhood), Joyce Grenfell and Margot Fonteyn (well-mannered, charming performers), or the fictional Miss Marple (quietly solving complicated mysteries). However, in spite of this tradition of memorable women, and successful female sovereigns such as Elizabeth I and Elizabeth II, the UK had never had a female political party leader, and much less a female prime minister, until Margaret Thatcher came to the fore. Thatcher not only became the UK's first—and to date only—female prime minister, but also remained in office for three consecutive terms, which is a feat beyond the reach of many modern (male) politicians. Throughout her political career, and also after she had retired, she had both devoted admirers and staunch enemies. She was the object of cartoons, caricatures, a satirical puppet show¹ and biting criticism, and more recently her nickname gave filmmakers the excuse for a 'biopic'² about the grocer's daughter from Grantham. This paper will examine the construction of the political personality of Thatcher, and the sociocultural circumstances underlying it, by examining some of her key statements, with reference to defining moments of her personal and political life, in order to reveal how discourse frames the identity of this important contemporary figure. For the purpose of this paper, discourse is taken as including not only her speeches, interviews or carefully inserted comments, but also aspects of non-verbal communication such as the appearance, manner of speaking and attitude she cultivated. An important source of information used in this paper is the Margaret Thatcher Foundation which offers access to thousands of historical documents concerning Thatcher and both British and world politics. Other sources include the press, television archives and selected printed works. The approach owes methodology to discourse analysis and cultural studies.

¹ *Spitting Image*: a satirical puppet series broadcast between 1984 and 1996 by ITV (UK). See <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=R1jY5fYjV-U>

² *The Iron Lady*. 2011. Dir.: Phyllida Lloyd. Pathé International.

A young lower-middle class woman managed to enter a snobbish, male-dominated Conservative party and take up her place in parliament as a 'Lady Member', progressing in the space of twenty years to the ultimate post: prime minister of the UK. Although this looks like a great achievement for feminism, it will be shown how Thatcher took advantage of both feminine and masculine qualities in order to build a strong figure, projecting an increasingly adversarial personality, for which she will be remembered for many years to come, but without completely identifying with the problems experienced by her gender.

Early years

Margaret Hilda Roberts was born in 1925 in Grantham, the daughter of a grocer who exercised a dominant influence in her early life. He was a very serious man, a Methodist lay-preacher who served as mayor of the town, and whose strict political and social principles conditioned Thatcher's own outlook. Little has been written, however, about her mother who is conspicuously absent from Thatcher's memoirs. After secondary school, Thatcher won a place at Oxford University to study chemistry, and afterwards worked as a research chemist in a factory, before returning to university to study law and prepare examinations to become a barrister. Her marriage in 1951 to Denis Thatcher, a wealthy businessman, enabled her to pursue her career and political ambitions unhampered by family responsibilities and financial concerns, especially when she gave birth to twins in 1953. Her comfortable economic status, together with the unfailing moral support of her husband, was to be a key factor in enabling her to participate in a time-consuming and expensive political career (Blake and John 19; Fernández 42). In 1959 Thatcher finally became a Conservative member of parliament (MP), for Finchley in North London, after a decade of failed attempts in different circumscriptions. In her first attempt to win the Labour-voting Dartford seat, she had been unsuccessful, and Blake and John (18) point to possible reasons for her defeat: perhaps it was because she was a woman, or the youngest woman, at only 24, ever to contest the seat, or perhaps it was merely that she was a Conservative trying to win in a predominantly Labour environment. The authors opt for the main reason probably being the political one, "but certainly in those times, the other two factors may well have played a consolidating part in her downfall" (18).

Thatcher's first parliamentary post was as a junior minister for pensions in Harold Macmillan's government. From 1964 to 1970 she occupied a number of different posts in Edward Heath's shadow cabinet, while the Labour party was in power. When the Conservatives won the general elections and Heath became

prime minister in 1970, Thatcher was appointed secretary for education. She lost little time in acquiring public notoriety, when in 1971 she was fiercely criticized for abolishing the right to free milk for primary-school children. The press quickly dubbed her 'Margaret Thatcher milk-snatcher' and she quickly became the most unpopular woman in Britain. The experience of being so unpopular may have been unpleasant at the time, but "it served to toughen her up considerably, and stood her in good stead for the even more turbulent times to come" (Blake and John 25). In fact, Thatcher seemed to thrive on failure, criticism, ridicule and scorn: the more difficult the situation, the more it made her fight for survival. When speaking of this period as a member of the Heath government, she later reflected in an interview that "it was then that the iron entered my soul" in reference to her nickname, the Iron Lady (Blake and John 25). In 1976, three years before she became PM, she gave a carefully constructed speech to a gathering of Conservatives, cleverly turning ridicule and name-calling around to work in her favour:

I stand before you tonight in my Red Star³ chiffon evening gown, my face softly made up and my fair hair gently waved, the *Iron Lady* of the Western world. *A cold war warrior, an Amazon philistine, even a Peking plotter.* Well, am I any of these things? [...] Yes I am an iron lady [...] They are welcome to call me what they like, if that's how they wish to interpret my defence of values and freedoms fundamental to our way of life (MTF-1).

From then on she took great delight in the nickname and it soon became associated with her every political action. Instead of hampering her rise in politics, it actually reinforced the strong image she was intent on projecting.

Women, leadership and politics

After the defeat of the Conservative party in the elections of 1974, Thatcher challenged the former PM for the leadership of the party. She was considered an outsider, or as Jenkins puts it "Thatcher was an unknown quantity" (325), and she seemed unlikely to receive the number of votes required to force a second ballot (BBC archive 1). She was thought to be the sort of candidate who would be able to stand for election, and lose, without any harm being done, having only a walk-on part in the drama, which was the usual role for women in politics at the

³ The Russian military newspaper, the *Red Star* (*Krasnaya Zvezda*), had nicknamed Thatcher 'the Iron Lady' for her anti-communist ideas. Given her preference for blue outfits, it is significant that on this occasion she chose a bright red gown, combining the communist colour, the iron nickname and a contrasting soft, feminine fabric such as chiffon.

time. According to Jenkins she was disliked by her party colleagues for being over-groomed, over-assertive and 'suburban' (325). She seemed to have little chance of success. However, to almost everybody's surprise she won the second round and became the party's first female leader, and in fact the first woman to lead any major political party in the UK. It had taken over fifty years for this to happen in a country in which the first woman⁴ had taken her seat in parliament as early as 1919 (UK Parliament archives). Only one year before being elected party leader, Thatcher had famously asserted:

I don't think that there will be a woman Prime Minister in my lifetime. And I don't think it depends on so much whether it's a man Prime Minister or a woman Prime Minister as to whether that person is the right person for the job at that time. And it's very difficult to foresee what may happen many, many years ahead (MTF-2).

Her prediction was obviously quite off the mark, because by becoming leader only one year later (and not "many, many years ahead") she made a considerable impact in the hardest of all glass ceilings. In the same interview she had been asked if few women occupied high-ranking posts because females were not aggressive enough, to which she had replied quite honestly, "I wouldn't say that I was guilty of lack of aggression" (MTF-2). As party leader she was now on the penultimate rung of the political ladder, dependent entirely on the outcome of the next general elections. However, during the course of the aforementioned interview she did observe that one or two other countries had women PMs⁵ at that time and that they seemed to have done "quite well", adding "so I don't think we've failed as a sex".

Her discourse throughout the years shows that positive or affirmative discrimination in favour of women was not on Thatcher's list of priorities, because in her view, gender was irrelevant; only excellence and hard work ought to bring reward. Thatcher's categorical statement "I owe nothing to Women's Lib" (Blake and John 49) reveals that she was convinced that she deserved what she had achieved through her own hard work and determination, although even she admitted there had been an element of luck at being in the right place at the right time. During the Thatcher period, society did change for the better in many aspects, with meritocracy taking over from the 'old boys' network'. Even though there were unpleasant side effects of Thatcher's era, her rise from the shopkeeper-class allowed many others to aspire to do the same, to become home owners for the first time by buying their council houses (and therefore they became potential

⁴ Nancy Astor.

⁵ India, Israel and Ceylon.

Conservative voters), to enjoy lower taxation and to be rewarded for being enterprising and ambitious (Ivens), although critics would call it being selfish and forming part of the yuppie culture. She believed she had a lot in common with a large section of the British population: the hardworking, law-abiding, self-denying lower middle class from which she came (Independent). When she became PM in 1979, just three per cent of MPs were women, but after the general elections following her departure from power, the proportion had grown to nine per cent (Statistics). Although she did not actively encourage women to follow in her footsteps, and though women's representation in parliament was still disproportionately low in relation to their presence in society, both men and women from the lower-middle class "were no longer frightened of banging on the door of the boardroom, or hammering at the glass ceiling" (Ivens), so Thatcher's peculiar version of a role model must have had some positive effect on the perception of class mobility and gender roles in society. However, an article in *The Guardian* calls her an "accidental feminist" and asks "Is it possible to further the interests of women without doing anything more than pursue your own interests, while happening to be a woman?" (Williams).

Idiosyncratic discourse

When explaining her particular vision of free market capitalism, Thatcher often deliberately made use of domestic feminine metaphors: "Any woman who understands the problems of running a home will be nearer to understanding the problems of running a country" (Blake and John 15). She made the most of her gender using "housewifely wisdoms to crank up her appeal", but the domestic metaphors she incorporated into her speeches, such as references to "the many practical skills of a wife and mother", were probably simply stylistic flourishes (Williams). She was probably also trying to appeal to women voters, and consequently her discourse frequently contrasted masculine and feminine attitudes and qualities: "I've got a woman's ability to stick to a job and get on with it when everyone else walks off and leaves it" (BBC News 1). By implying that, given the chance, women do things better than men, she took advantage of her feminine condition, although she found it effective to make fun of it on occasions: "I'm extraordinarily patient provided I get my own way in the end" (Blake and John 54). However, her intention was to leave no doubt in the listener's mind that she was as strong morally and politically as any male colleague or opponent.

One noticeable characteristic of her discourse is pronoun use; she defended her opinions, policies, and actions by using the first person plural 'we', often

referred to as the 'pluralis majestatis' and associated with bishops, popes and monarchs:

We have worked for our vision of a Europe which is free...

We have never hesitated to stand up for Britain's interests.

We shall win the censure motion, so we shall not be censured for what is thoroughly right.

In the past decade, we have given power back to the people on an unprecedented scale (MTF-2).

It is possible to interpret her pronoun use in the above examples as simply a collective plural referring to herself and her cabinet, government and/or party. However, critics detected a growing 'majestic' tendency in her speeches and interviews; either consciously or subconsciously she was showing she had risen above her humble beginnings, and for many people this was excessive. On the day the Conservatives won the elections in 1979, and she was to be the new PM, she gave a short speech to reporters outside Number 10 Downing Street based on a prayer proposing harmony in place of discord, which was to be rather paradoxical since she would later become the century's least 'harmonious' PM, fighting the unions, strikers and rioters:

I would just like to remember some words of St. Francis of Assisi which I think are really just particularly apt at the moment. 'Where there is discord, may we bring harmony. Where there is error, may we bring truth. Where there is doubt, may we bring faith. And where there is despair, may we bring hope'... and to all the British people—howsoever they voted—may I say this. Now that the Election is over, may we get together and strive to serve and strengthen the country of which we're so proud to be a part. And finally, one last thing: in the words of Airey Neave whom we had hoped to bring here with us, 'There is now work to be done'. **We shall be going inside and we shall be getting on with that as fast as we can...** (Emphasis added. MTF-4).

According to Ronnie Millar, her adviser and speech writer who suggested she should use the quoted prayer, jotted down on a piece of paper in the palm of her hand, "St Francis said 'I' but 'we' seemed more modest for Margaret" (MTF-5). This may have been the intention, but towards the end of this fragment (emphasized in bold) Thatcher is undoubtedly expressing a personal and not a collective thought in the 'majestic plural', since Airey Neave had been a very close personal friend and collaborator before he was killed by a car bomb in March 1979. This is the problem with her use of 'we': people never knew if it was inclusive or 'majestic', and some of Thatcher's detractors even suspected she was trying to imitate the Queen, who was obviously entitled to use the royal 'we'.

The use of the ‘majestic plural’ by a mere prime minister from the lower-middle class, together with Thatcher’s imperious manner, were frequently the cause of ridicule, disdain and aversion, but, as McSmith points out, even the satirists who tirelessly targeted her throughout her years in power were in fact unwittingly enhancing the powerful figure they were mocking. There can be no doubt that on one occasion at least Thatcher resorted to the royal ‘we’ as a deliberate way of poking fun at herself and her critics. The occasion in question was the birth of her first grandchild in 1989, when Thatcher purposefully approached reporters waiting outside Downing Street and communicated the news with emphasis and an appropriation of the ‘royal’ pronoun: “We have become a grandmother of a grandson called Michael!”, she said, instead of the more logical and natural “I have become a grandmother” or, an expression including her husband, “We have become grandparents” (MTF-6). The subconscious forces at work in other statements by Thatcher reveal further details about her sense of identity. Jenkins maintains that her identification with the nation she represented was reflected in her referring on several occasions to Britoil⁶ as ‘my oil’ and quarrelling with the European Union over ‘my money’ (329), although she then explained that “we want our money back”. Such expressions seem to indicate a kind of fusion of personalities: the country is Thatcher, and its resources are therefore hers, at least in her projected image. Such examples bring to mind Louis XIV’s apocryphal observation, “L’état c’est moi” (I am the state); though Thatcher obviously did not enjoy the French Sun King’s absolute powers. Demagogues’ discourse is full of pronoun appropriation and false logic: “Adolf Hitler is Germany and Germany is Adolf Hitler,” said Rudolf Hess in 1934 (Propaganda); an extreme case, obviously, but it left no options for dissenters. Thatcher’s domineering image and personalization of political questions led critics to feel uneasy about her apparent (in)ability to distinguish between the country, her role as prime minister and the speaker as an individual.

Margaret Thatcher’s tone and intonation were idiosyncratic and the subject of commentary, criticism and mockery. When she was preparing to fight for the leadership of her party, she was advised to modify her shrill voice because it might alienate listeners and potential voters, and so after voice coaching she was able to lower the pitch and develop a calm and authoritative tone. Whether or not this new way of speaking actually attracted more support is arguable, but it made her have one of the most instantly recognizable voices in modern history, and also one of the easiest to parody: “Soon the hectoring tones of the housewife gave way to softer notes and a smoothness that seldom cracked except under extreme

⁶ Britoil: A privatised British oil company operating in the North Sea.

provocation on the floor of the House of Commons” (Dunbar). She was also advised to modify her physical appearance, having her teeth straightened, doing away with her frumpy clothes, adopting power dressing techniques and avoiding hats for all except special occasions. Her public image became associated with the tailored suit in blue, the colour of her party; her heavily backcombed and lacquered blonde hair was the essence of resilience, a kind of helmet to protect her from would-be aggressors or criticism. This can be deduced from a cartoon in the satirical magazine *Punch* showing Thatcher asking her hairdresser to modify her hairdo and harsh image: “Could you make it just a bit more compassionate and caring?” in reference to the fact that Conservatives were being criticised for introducing welfare cuts and paying little attention to questions of general well-being for ordinary people (*Punch*).

A new verb: ‘to handbag’

An interesting accessory of Thatcher’s appearance and character forms a curious visual and verbal metaphor: the ever-present handbag. It seemed to be firstly a symbol and a reminder of her feminine condition, and status as the first woman PM, but then it came to be viewed as a virtual offensive weapon. One political journalist refers to the accessory as her “steel-tipped, armour-plated handbag” (Marr). She is said to have kept documents and scribbled notes in it and, at critical moments, to place the handbag on the table in full view of all present, as if announcing a challenge or a warning that something inconvenient for her opponents was about to emerge from the bag. The verb (‘to handbag’) and noun (‘handbagging’) are traceable to the 1980s, when this usage was coined by Julian Critchley (Oxford), a Conservative MP, with reference to Thatcher’s assertive, domineering style at cabinet meetings or international summits. She was reputed to attack her opponents, colleagues or civil servants verbally and in a very forceful manner, as though she had hit them metaphorically with her handbag (BBC News 2). Anybody in her team who was on the receiving end of a ‘handbagging’ could expect to be ignored, demoted, or even find himself out of a job. However, according to Norman Tebbit, a close friend and member of the Iron Lady’s cabinet between 1981 and 1987, Thatcher was certainly tough and determined in her dealings with colleagues, but never intransigent or over-emotional: “She was always open to persuasion, but only by argument and facts properly marshalled and presented, and she could be hard – perhaps at times unfairly so – on colleagues who failed her standards” (Guardian-1).

The famous handbag came to symbolize her style of leadership, and it finally received recognition as such when in 2000 a black leather item belonging to

the former PM was auctioned at Christies' in aid of charity. When *The Iron Lady* was premiered in London in 2012, a Telegraph pocket cartoon by 'Matt' resorted to the image of the handbag to remind readers of the protagonist's strength. It showed cinema spectators watching the film performance, with one of them wearing special glasses and claiming that "If you watch in 3D the handbag seems to come straight at you" (Matt). Not surprisingly, this 'biopic' on Thatcher aroused a great amount of controversy, and it received mixed reviews. Her children and close friends criticized it for portraying her dementia; politicians on the left were concerned that its human narrative might overlook the negative aspects of Thatcher's premiership in favour of the image of the woman triumphing against adversity; others praised the fact that it showed the combination of roles of wife, mother and leader in context. Boris Johnson, flamboyant and outspoken Conservative mayor of London, maintains that it is the most important political film for many years and that "nothing and no-one has done more, in the 22 years since she was kicked out of office, to rehabilitate Margaret Thatcher" (Telegraph). In addition to this film version of Thatcher's biography, there had already been a lesser-known performance entitled "Thatcher: The Musical" which toured the UK in 2006. The theatre critic of the *Guardian* described the Thatcher portrayed in this satirical musical tribute as having "soul beneath her steel, a woman as well as a politician, in a touching exploration of the anxieties of power" (Guardian-2). Not surprisingly, the performance began with a huge handbag being pushed onto the stage and opening up to reveal the actress playing Thatcher, as the narrator, sitting inside it (BTG). Thatcher was always able to poke fun at herself, turning around the caricatures and parodies about her if they could help her to make a point. For example, in 1993, when she was no longer PM, she commented on her successor, John Major, who was a cricket fan, and the difficult negotiations for the EU Maastricht Treaty in which he was immersed: "In my day, that would have required the occasional use of the handbag. Now it will doubtless be the cricket bat. But that is a good thing because it will be harder" (MTF-7).

Conclusions

There are few people today who would not recognize Margaret Thatcher as either one of the greatest leaders ever to enter 10 Downing Street or the woman whose policies wrecked British society in the 1980s. Some people therefore look on her with affection, and others with loathing, but there can be no doubt that she was one of the most influential characters of the twentieth century, responsible for some of the most radical social changes the UK has ever experienced. She is one of the few British leaders to have a school of political and economic thought

named after her. In a 2014 survey conducted by students and academics at Royal Holloway, University of London, she emerged as the most highly valued PM in post-war Britain, beating Winston Churchill into fourth place. The quality most valued in a PM, according to the survey carried out among MPs of all parties, was decisiveness (77 per cent), while being compassionate was only valued by 10 per cent, and being, tolerant, friendly, or cautious represented only single figures in the statistics (Survey). Given her strong character, it is easy to see how Thatcher could win in such a survey, but it is interesting to see how she has progressed from being the hated milk-snatcher of the seventies, and in 1981 the most unpopular PM since records began (McSmith), to the country's most valued premier after her death in 2013.

Her speeches and interviews were made memorable largely due to their provocative tone, often patronizing, fiercely patriotic, representing the personification of the state. If her relationship with male cabinet colleagues was often problematical, her relationship with female colleagues was practically non-existent, since only one woman was ever chosen for a senior cabinet post during her eleven years in office. This paradox, making history as the first female PM while keeping other women from rising to positions of power, may have been a conscious choice in the projection of her image. Nobody should be chosen simply because of their gender, rather, because of their capacity. She could be compared to a kind of twentieth-century Boudicca or the mythical Britannia surrounded by men in a male-dominated sphere of activity, enjoying the advantages of being female but fighting on men's terms. She was able to use her feminine condition to her advantage when it suited her. McSmith concludes that she was, in some respects, very feminine, especially in the care she took choosing her clothes, make-up and hairstyling, "but she was no feminist. She preferred to work with men, preferably men who behaved flirtatiously". On the day of the 1983 General Election, the *Daily Express* ran the headline "Now is the hour—Maggie is the man" (Thomas 90), while her election campaign song contained the lyrics "... Two, three, four, Thatcher, Thatcher, Thatcher, not a man around to match her". Other women might have been dismayed at being called the best man for the job, but Thatcher took it as a great compliment and exploited the strength associated with masculinity to the full, while keeping her high-heels and feminine grooming. She was not averse to making sexist puns, as on one occasion in the House of Commons when she was praising the work of her faithful and highly efficient deputy, William (Willie) Whitelaw. To MPs' delight, she declared: "Every prime minister needs a Willie" (BBC News 3).

However, her "egocentric and hectoring style made her difficult to work with" and her "dictatorial style" eventually brought about her downfall

(Jenkins 332). Thatcher's discourse was not only verbal; her public image reinforced her identity, projecting a picture of a determined ruler, gaining the status of a world figure. In 1982, when Argentina invaded the Falkland Islands, she was advised by Ministry of Defence experts that it would be unwise to try to retake the islands. However, when one of her party colleagues warned her that now was her chance to prove that she really was the *Iron Lady*, she decided to risk sending a task force to the South Atlantic. Not only was a distant piece of British territory in danger; her image was also at stake. The Opposition had imagined that the mission would be a disaster and that it would be the end of Thatcher, but they were wrong. The recapture of the Falkland Islands from Argentina greatly improved Thatcher's standing in the UK, proving that a woman could lead her country to war and emerge victorious. Her personal victory also helped to produce a landslide victory for the Conservatives in the 1983 elections.

The role that she created for herself as a strong premier for over more than a decade was inherited, and exploited, by successive PMs: Conservative John Major was able to appear stronger and less 'grey' thanks to her legacy and backing, and Tony Blair, of the opposing Labour party, confessed to being an admirer of Thatcher, whose prestige he decided to exploit, and he duly invited her to tea at Downing Street, as did his successor, Gordon Brown. The first Conservative party leader elected without first securing her backing was David Cameron, although he was careful to praise her as his "inspiration" (McSmith).

When she was forced out of office, not by the electorate but by her own party colleagues, she was unable to assimilate defeat, and when she retired from political life completely "a gulf seemed to open up between Lady Thatcher's colossal reputation, and the lady herself. In private, she could not come to terms with her dismissal" (McSmith). She felt let down by her cabinet colleagues; it was betrayal with a smile. Feminine tears filled her eyes on the day she left Downing Street—but she still resorted to the majestic pronoun:

We're leaving Downing Street for the last time after eleven-and-a-half wonderful years, and we're very happy that we leave the United Kingdom in a very, very much better state than when we came here eleven and a half years ago (UK Politics).

Here it is clearer than ever that she is making use of the majestic 'we', since she is the only one who is leaving office, not the government, nor the party. Neither is she including her husband in the farewell, as he had nothing to do with policy. The country is in a very much better state, she says, than when "we" came to Downing Street. So the achievements are all hers, and are associated with her eleven-and-a-half-year stay (mentioned twice in three lines). Thatcher held the office of PM for longer than anybody in the twentieth century (while she saw

three incumbents pass through the White House) and judged by any standards this was an extraordinary achievement, and yet the Thatcher years were a time of conflict and controversy in Britain's contemporary history. Her image as a strong female leader in a man's environment, incorporating powerful masculine qualities into her public projection must be one of the reasons why she is considered, even by her detractors, as the most iconic of all post-war Prime Ministers.

References

- BBC archive 1. "Margaret Thatcher: From MP to PM. Mrs Thatcher's journey from Finchley to Downing Street." <http://www.bbc.co.uk/archive/thatcher/6315.shtml> Accessed 8th May 2012.
- BBC News 1. "A lifetime of public speaking". 22nd October 2002. http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk_news/politics/1888444.stm Accessed 2nd May 2012.
- BBC News 2. "I was handbagged by Mrs Thatcher." 9th April 2013. <http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-politics-11518330> Accessed 1st March 2014.
- BBC News 3. "UK Politics. Whitelaw: The archetypal Tory." 1st July 1999. http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk_news/politics/382770.stm Accessed 1st March 2014.
- Blake, Stephen and Andrew John. *Iron Lady: The Thatcher Years*. London: Michael O'Mara Books. 2012.
- BTG. Steve Orme. "Thatcher: The Musical." British Theatre Guide. 9th February 2006. <http://www.britishtheatreguide.info/reviews/thatchermusical-rev> Accessed 8th May 2012.
- Dunbar, Polly. "How Laurence Olivier gave Margaret Thatcher the voice that went down in history." 30th October 2011. <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2055214/How-Laurence-Olivier-gave-Margaret-Thatcher-voice-went-history.html> Accessed 15th May 2012.
- Fernández Sánchez, José Francisco (1999). *El thatcherismo. Historia y análisis de una época*. Almería: Universidad de Almería.
- Guardian-1. Ben Child. "Meryl Streep's Iron Lady dismantled by Norman Tebbit." 16th November 2011. <http://www.theguardian.com/film/2011/nov/16/meryl-streep-iron-lady-tebbit> Accessed 8th January 2012.
- Guardian-2. Julian Glover. "Thatcher: The Musical". 9th February 2006. <http://www.guardian.co.uk/stage/2006/feb/09/theatre.conservatives> Accessed 8th May 2012.
- Ivens, Sarah. "The Mother of all Essex Girls". *The Guardian/The Observer*. 3rd October 2004. <http://www.guardian.co.uk/theobserver/2004/oct/03/featuresreview.review?INTCMP=S RCH> Accessed 8th May 2012.
- Jenkins, Simon (2011). *A Short History of England*. London: Profile Books.
- Marr, Andrew (2009). *History of Modern Britain*. DVD. 2-Entertain.
- Matt. Pocket Cartoon by Matthew Pritchett, published in *The Telegraph*, 5th January 2012. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/matt/?cartoon=8993505&cc=8988527> Accessed 9th February 2012.

- McSmith, Andy. "Margaret Thatcher obituary. The most divisive political leader of modern times." 8th April 2013. <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/obituaries/margaret-thatcher-obituary-the-most-divisive-political-leader-of-modern-times-8564559.html> Accessed 26th March 2014.
- MTF-1. Speech to Finchley Conservatives on 31st January 1976. Margaret Thatcher Foundation. <http://www.margaretthatcher.org/document/102947> Accessed 2nd May 2012.
- MTF-2. TV interview for BBC1 on 5th March 1973. Margaret Thatcher Foundation. <http://www.margaretthatcher.org/document/101992> Accessed 2nd May 2012.
- MTF-3. House of Commons speech. 22nd November 1990. Margaret Thatcher Foundation. <http://www.margaretthatcher.org/document/108256> Accessed 24th January 2012.
- MTF-4. Remarks on becoming Prime Minister. 4th May 1979. Margaret Thatcher Foundation. <http://www.margaretthatcher.org/document/104078> Accessed 24th January 2012.
- MTF-5. Some words of St. Francis of Assisi. 4th May 1979. Margaret Thatcher Foundation. <http://www.margaretthatcher.org/archive/StFrancis.asp> Accessed 24th January 2012.
- MTF-6. Remarks on becoming a grandmother. 3rd March 1989. Margaret Thatcher Foundation. <http://www.margaretthatcher.org/speeches/displaydocument.asp?docid=107590> Accessed 24th January 2012.
- MTF-7. European Community. Statement to the House of Commons. 20th November 1991. <http://www.margaretthatcher.org/document/108291> Accessed 24th January 2012.
- Oxford. Verb: to handbag; noun: handbagging: definition and origin. <http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/handbag> Accessed 12th January 2012.
- Propaganda. German propaganda archive. "The Oath to Adolf Hitler". Rudolph Hess, 25th February 1934. <http://www.calvin.edu/academic/cas/gpa/hess1.htm> Accessed 24th January 2012.
- Punch. Cartoon referring to Thatcher's hairstyle. <http://punch.photoshelter.com/gallery-image/Margaret-Thatcher-Cartoons/G0000iZrJGN2t3dg/I0000vSQcheeOmNY> Accessed 9th February 2012.
- Spitting Image*. Margaret Thatcher's puppet: "I did it my way." <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=R1jY5fYjV-U> Accessed 20th March 2014.
- Storry, Mike and Peter Childs (eds). *British Cultural Identities*. London: Routledge. 1997.
- Statistics. "Women PMs and parliamentary candidates since 1945." <http://www.ukpolitical.info/FemaleMPs.htm> Accessed 24th March 2014.
- Survey. "MPs vote Margaret Thatcher as best prime minister in student study." 2nd January 2014. <http://www.rhul.ac.uk/aboutus/newsandevents/news/newsarticles/mpsvotemargaretthatcherasbestprimeministerinstudentstudy.aspx> Accessed 26th March 2014.

- Telegraph. "Maggie's magic came from her contempt for complacent men." Boris Johnson. 9th January 2012. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/comment/columnists/borisjohnson/9001544/Maggies-magic-came-from-her-contempt-for-complacent-men.html> Accessed 24th January 2012.
- Thomas, James (2007). *Popular Newspapers, the Labour Party and British Politics*. London: Routledge.
- UK Parliament archives. "The First Women MPs". <http://www.parliament.uk/business/publications/parliamentary-archives/archives-highlights/archives-the-suffragettes/archives-the-first-women-in-parliament-1919-1945/> Accessed 8th May 2012.
- UK Politics. "Margaret Thatcher. Comments made when leaving Downing Street." 29th November 1990. <http://www.ukpolitics.org.uk/node/365> Accessed 2nd May 2012.
- Williams, Zoe. "The accidental feminist." *The Guardian*, 21st October 2004. <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2004/oct/21/gender.uk> Accessed 8th May 2012.

The Discourse in Compilations of Women's Biographies in the Eighteenth Century: Constructing a Portrait of the Female Writer as a Model of Behaviour

Dyskurs w zbiorowych biografiach kobiet 18-go wieku: konstruowanie wizerunku pisarki jako modelu zachowania

Summary

Although the lives of writers have always been attractive for readers, literary biography has not enjoyed a positive reception within literary studies from the end of the nineteenth century onwards, when first with positivism and then with formalism the text became the centre of literary research, and indeed most recently with all the controversy around the death of the author (Dosse, 2007: 83; Backscheider, 2001: 177-178). However, the study of literary biography can offer interesting results within the realm of women's studies, since it permits the examination of the discourse provided in women writers' biographies and whether it affected or not the way women's literary works were read (McDowell, 1993; Backscheider, 2001; Batchelor, 2012). Bearing this in mind, by means of a selection of some women writers' biographies published in the compilations of Mary Hays (2013) and Mary Matilda Betham (1804), this paper aims at analysing how the fact of being women might shape their consideration and esteem as writers and to what extent women writers' lives offered an exemplary and proper model of behaviour for the female readers, the target audience of these works.

Keywords: Literary Biography, Women's Studies, Eighteenth Century.

References:

- Backscheider, P.R. 2001. *Reflections on Biography*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Batchelor, J. 2012. "Jane Austen and Charlotte Smith: Biography, Autobiography and the Writing of Women's Literary History". In D. Cook and A. Culley, eds. *Women's Life Writing, 1700-1850. Gender, Genre and Authorship*. Basingstoke: Palgrave. 181-196.
- Betham, M.M. 1804. *Biographical Dictionary of the Celebrated Women of Every Age and Country*. London: B. Crosby & Co.
- Dosse, F. 2007. *La apuesta biográfica. Escribir una vida*. Trans. J. Aguado and C. Miñana. Valencia: Publicacions de la Univ. de Valencia.

Hays, M. (1803) 2013. *Female Biography; or, Memoirs of Illustrious and Celebrated Women, of All Ages and Countries. Alphabetically Arranged*. 6 vols. G. Luria, ed. London: Pickering & Chatto.

McDowell, P. 1993. "Consuming Women: The Life of the 'Literary Lady' as Popular Culture in Eighteenth-Century England". *Genre* 26: 219-252.

Within the space of only one year two very similar editorial projects were published in London. In 1803 the six volumes of the *Female Biography; or, Memoirs of Illustrious and Celebrated Women, of All ages and Countries. Alphabetically Arranged* by Mary Hays (1759-1843) saw the light, and a year later, in 1804, *Biographical Dictionary of the Celebrated Women of Every Age and Country* by Mary Matilda Betham (1776-1852) was published. It is rather interesting that they were published consecutively in such a short space of time, both being catalogues of women's biographies with a similar goal and target readership, and quite costly. In the preface to her text, Betham herself notes that just when she was sending proposals to publish her collection, the text by Hays was advertised (1804: v). However, given the popularity of this type of compilations in this period, to the point that "by the nineteenth century female biographies written by women were so common to constitute a minor literary phenomenon" (Spongberg 2005: 172), publishers' engagement in this kind of publishing project is understandable. Moreover, as historical writings, these texts also fitted into the "unprecedented fascination with the past" (Kucich 2000: 15) in the later eighteenth century and the beginning of the nineteenth century. Simultaneously, they participated in the long tradition of female worthies, of *querelle des femmes*, and of defences of women, as well as in the boom in the publishing of conduct books and didactic texts in the Romantic period (St Clair 2004: 275), since by this time female biographies had already come to function as such (Sponger 2005: 173).

As texts dealing with women and written by women, their target audience was mainly female (Pearson 1999: 51-2), particularly in this period, when "biography was central to the unofficial curriculum for middle-class women's education outlined by innumerable cultural commentators" (Wood, 1998: 124). Accordingly Mary Hays refers to her intended women readers in the preface of her *Female Biography* stating that she publishes the lives of illustrious women in order to provide her own sex with good examples to emulate (2013: I, 3). Given that

among all the women present in these texts, numerous writers can be found¹, this article aims at analysing their biographies in order to seek how the fact of being women might affect their consideration and esteem as writers and to what extent women writers' lives offered an exemplary and proper model of behaviour for the intended female readers.

Although the lives of writers have always been attractive for readers, literary biography has not enjoyed a positive reception within literary studies from the end of the nineteenth century onwards, when first with positivism and then with formalism the text became the centre of literary research, and indeed more recently with all the controversy around the death of the author (Dosse, 2007: 83; Backscheider, 2001: 177-178). However, the study of literary biography can offer interesting results within the realm of women's studies, since it permits an examination of the discourse provided in women writers' biographies and shows to what extent it affected the way women's literary works were read (McDowell, 1993; Backscheider, 2001; Batchelor, 2012). In this regard, McDowell maintains that "for British *women* writers, venturing into print has *always* meant granting one's public the right to make one's private life a public commodity" (1993: 227). Mary Hays herself indicated in the preface to her biography of Charlotte Smith, that she lamented the double-edged nature of women writers' biography, on the grounds that these women writers' lives were under a much more severe scrutiny than those of their male counterparts, and also because women's lives became part of public opinion, even more than their works, which resulted in women's writings being read in the light of their authors' biographies (Batchelor, 2012: 181-182). In volume VI of the *Female Biography*, Hays also ruminates on this idea when quoting some words by Mme Roland about women writers' negative reputation:

Never, says she, did I feel the slightest temptation to become an author. I perceived, at a very early period, that a woman who acquires this title, loses more than she gains. The men do not like, and her own sex criticise her. If her works are bad, she is ridiculed; if good, she is bereaved of the reputation annexed to them. If the public are forced to acknowledge that she has talents, they sift her character, her morals, her conduct, and balance the reputation of her genius by the publicity which they give to her errors (2014: VI, 180).

Moreover, Hays adds a footnote with quite a mordant commentary: "And if they cannot find any real blemishes in her conduct, they are ingenious to substitute

¹ Generally speaking, after a group of women famous by her governmental influence, such as queens, princesses, warriors or courtesans, and wives or lovers of relevant men, women writers are the next largest group in this kind of dictionaries (Bailey, 2004: 401).

fiction for facts; the more absurd, the more credible and the more eagerly received” (2014: VI, 180). As this study will demonstrate, some of the women’s lives analysed here, such as those of Aphra Behn and Catharine Macaulay, are significant instances of these notions.

Owing to the impossibility of dealing with all the women writers compiled by Hays and Betham, we have selected those from the Restoration and the eighteenth century who are present in both texts. The selection has been based on Susan Staves’s *A Literary History of Women’s Writers in Britain, 1660-1789*, a monograph constructed around women writers’ texts, and particularly those considered of merit at the time when they were published (2006: 4). Hence, the presence in the inventory of some canonical authors who cultivated diverse genres and also of writers hardly known and studied today. Accordingly, the list of considered writers includes the following ones:

- 1) Margaret Cavendish, duchess of Newcastle (1623-1673), poet, philosopher, writer of prose romances, essayist, and playwright.
- 2) Katherine Phillips (1631-1664), poet and playwright.
- 3) Aphra Behn (1640-1689), playwright, novelist, poet, and translator.
- 4) Lady Mary Chudleigh (1656-1710), poet and essayist.
- 5) Lady Damaris Masham (1658-1708), philosopher and theological writer.
- 6) Anne Finch, countess of Winchelsea (1661-1720), poet, dramatist and translator.
- 7) Mary Astell (1666-1731), polemicist, rhetorician, and feminist writer.
- 8) Susanna Centlivre (1667-9?- 1723), playwright.
- 9) Elizabeth Singer Rowe (1674-1737), poet and religious writer.
- 10) Elizabeth Thomas (1675-1731), poet.
- 11) Catharine Trotter (1679-1749), dramatist, novelist, poet, and philosopher.
- 12) Elizabeth Elstob (1683-1756), Anglo-Saxon scholar.
- 13) Mary Chandler (1687-1756), poet.
- 14) Eliza Haywood (1693?-1756), novelist, playwright, translator, and writer of periodicals.
- 15) Sarah Fielding (1710-1768), novelist and translator.
- 16) Laetitia Pilkington (1712-1750), poet and auto-biographer.
- 17) Mary Leapor (1722-1746), poet.
- 18) Frances Sheridan (1724-1766), novelist and playwright.
- 19) Hester Chapone (1727-1801), essayist and poet.
- 20) Catherine Macaulay (1731-1791), historian and pamphleteer.

Considering both dictionaries, the first disparity is obvious, given that their book format is considerably different. Hays’s work comprehends six books, while

Betham's text is only one. However, in Betham's compilation the text occupies almost the whole page and the space between lines is narrower, and it contains a greater number of entries, 691, than Hays's text, 288. But Betham herself explains in her preface one of the main differences between the texts under examination here: "upon the publication of [Hays's] work, I found it to be rather a selection of historical extracts, than a digested compilation of Female Biography, which it had been, and is now, my object to produce" (1804: v-vi). Indeed, Hays's text provides the reader with excerpts of some writings of the authors, as well as longer quotations from the sources used by her. Hays's biography of Aphra Behn is a telling instance, in that the writer's life is embellished by an excerpt of Behn's well-known novel, *Oroonoko; or, The Royal Slave* (1688), describing the luxuriant landscape of Surinam (2013: I, 370-1), and also, by a five-page comic episode extracted from one of her letters, which narrates the writer's love affairs using many supplanting characters and humorous misunderstandings (2013: I, 373-378); it is very similar to Behn's own narratives and to "the short, jokey tales of intrigue then in vogue" (Spencer, 2000: 36).

Both collective biographies start identifying the woman in question by stating who her father was. This fact lets us know in some way the social class to which these women belonged. Most of them were middle-class women from a respectable family. Moreover, their social extraction is instrumental in their education, an aspect which obviously determined and made possible these women's consecration to writing. The way they had acquired their education is consistently mentioned in almost all the cases, and there are several different models. Cavendish (Hays, 2014: V, 517-518; Betham, 1804: 575) and Leapor (Hays, 2014: 493-494) were instructed at home by their mother, Lady Damaris Masham's father, as an eminent divine and a professor at the University of Cambridge, taught his daughter divinity and philosophy, and she also enjoyed Locke's knowledge while he lived with her family (Hays, 2014: V, 494-495; Betham, 1804: 509); Katherine Phillips was sent to a boarding school, but was also aided by a friend (Hays, 2014: VI, 61; Betham, 1804: 620-621); Macaulay had a governess who took care of the children of the family, but she benefitted from her father's library, where she found and read enthusiastically newspapers and history books (Hays, 2014: V, 290-291). In the case of Elstob (Hays, 2014: IV, 300; Betham, 1804: 313-314) and Fielding (Hays, 2014: IV, 333; Betham, 1804: 325), their brothers who were already members of the world of letters, encouraged them. In any case, their family circumstances favoured their self-education, since most of them had a deep interest in their instruction and continued their studies on their own during their whole life. Mary Astell, for instance, was educated by an uncle, a clergyman, but she then led a life of constant study on her own (Hays, 2013: I, 213, 245; Betham,

1804: 76-77). There are also examples of writers who were self-educated and are considered as such, namely, Lady Mary Chudleigh (Hays, 2013: III, 316-317; Betham, 1804: 242) and Susanna Centlivre (Hays, 2013: III, 275; Betham, 1804: 225). In the case of Chudleigh, Hays notes that “She received from education no particular advantages; but a passion for books, great activity of mind, and habits of application, enabled her to make a considerable progress in literature, and to acquire distinction and celebrity” (2013: III, 316-317).

Apart from these quite common situations at that time, some of these women’s lives offer the reader entertaining and even amusing anecdotes connected to their educational progress. At this point we should remember a well-known passage from Jane Austen’s *Northanger Abbey* (1818), in which Catherine Morland echoes a common complaint, particularly of women, about reading history: “I read it a little as a duty, but it tells me nothing that does not either vex or weary me”, all full of “war and pestilence” and “hardly any women at all –it is very tiresome” (2006: 110). By means of these biographical anthologies, Hays and Betham provide a solution for both these complaints. Hence, when narrating Susanna Centlivre’s early stages in life, for instance, Hays states that “Some obscurity at this period involves her life, to which an air of romance is given” (2013: III, 275). Indeed, Centlivre had to run away very young from home where she was ill-treated by her step-mother and when she was alone on the road, a student of Cambridge persuaded her to reside at the university with him disguised as a boy (Hays, 2013: III, 275; Betham, 1804: 226), taking thus the opportunity of proceeding with her studies there. As for the life of Elizabeth Thomas, Hays begins her biographical account by saying: “The life of Mrs. Thomas, known to the public by the poetical name of Corinna, affords an interesting picture, and displays a tissue of calamities that can scarcely fail to excite the sympathy and commiseration of the reader” (2014: VI, 427). Among these calamities, both Hays and Betham explain how Thomas’s widow mother was deceived by a pretender to alchemy who apparently was about to discover the philosopher’s stone and defrauded her of 3,000 pounds, but curiously enough, “during the process, the doctor acted the part of a tutor for Corinna, in arithmetic, Latin and mathematics, to which she discovered a very strong propensity” (Betham, 1804: 746). Interestingly, in both collective works this poet’s biography is a detailed report of every calamity in her life, and just at the end there is a short paragraph about her literary career, which is qualified as second rate (Betham, 1804: 749). This fact proves the relevance accorded to women’s personal circumstances, in detriment of their public achievements – in this case their literary career-, when narrating their lives.

The importance of women’s education is also reflected in the space given to comments and quotations of some of these writers’ educational texts. In *Occasional*

Thoughts in Reference to a Virtuous and Christian Life (1705), Lady Damaris Masham, focusing mainly on religious and pious instruction, defends “the necessity of a reform”, given “the neglected education of daughters” (Hays, 2014: V, 496); moreover, she regrets that “a woman capable of instructing her children, and of implanting in their minds just principles, could scarcely escape becoming an object of ridicule, under the title of a learned lady, for the most laudable use of her time and talents” (Ibid, 497). Lady Masham herself put in practice this enlightened assumption about the civilising and moral capacities of women (Capern 2005), in that she was in charge of the education of her only son (Hays, 2014: V, 495; Betham, 1804: 509), who became years later an important politician. A contemporary to her, Mary Astell, similarly “observed and lamented the defects in the education of her sex; which, she said, were the principal causes of their running into so many follies and improprieties. To remedy so great an evil, she wrote and published, in 1696, an ingenious treatise, entitled, A serious Proposal to the Ladies, for the Advancement of their true and greatest Interest, &c.” (Betham, 1804: 77). In this text, Astell proposed the foundation of “a seminary, or college, for the education of young women, and also to serve as an asylum for those whom misfortune, studious habits, or other circumstances, should render desirous of retiring from the world” (Hays, 2013: I, 240-241). In this same period, Lady Mary Chudleigh published an essay in verse, *The Ladies’ Defence* (1701), “in which she deprecates with some severity the usurpation of man, and contends for intellectual rights and privileges of her sex” (Hays. 2013: III, 319). After quoting several lines of her text, Hays judges Chudleigh’s claims too modest, but they are remarkable in her opinion, since “light on some occasions serves but to make darkness visible. Happy is the slave who remains unconscious of his bonds!” (Ibid, 319), comparing thus women’s circumstances to those of a slave, as had done Mary Wollstonecraft, her mentor. Finally, Mary Hays gives her readers notice of Hester Chapone’s *Letters on the Improvement of the Mind, Addressed to a Young Lady* (1773), one of the most popular conduct books of the second half of the eighteenth century. To praise Chapone’s writing, Hays quotes a review of another popular woman writer, Mrs. Barbauld, who, among other things, declares that “it is perhaps the most unexceptionable treatise that can be put into the hands of a female youth” (2013: III, 287), and considers that Chapone’s *Letters* are “much more consonant to true taste” (Ibid, 287), than another well-known conduct book of that time, Fordyce’s *Sermons to Young Women* (1766).

In order to be writers and to take part in the world of letters women needed to have a reasonably accomplished education, and, as almost all the women in these dictionaries, to exhibit a precocious or early inclination to the *belles lettres*. But, was it easy for them to develop and maintain a literary career? The majority of

women got married at some time and this circumstance affected them deeply. The Duchess of Newcastle had to go into exile with her husband in the Low Countries during the Republic and aided him with his financial difficulties, but then, childless and with a good fortune, “the remainder of her life was devoted to domestic tranquillity and to the cultivation of letters” (Hays, 2014: V, 519). Her assistance to her husband is precisely what makes the Duchess a virtuous woman, as happens with Katherine Phillips and particularly with Elizabeth Singer Rowe, since Hays states about her that “As daughter, as a wife, as a friend, her conduct was exemplary, her taste for letters led her not to neglect the duties and occupations of her sex” (2014: VI, 324). Singer Rowe is in both biographical compilations the highest standard of female exemplarity and virtuosity, to the point that Betham qualifies her life as “almost saint-like” (1804: 676). She was the perfect wife, and once a widow, she expressed her sorrow during her whole life and spent most of it studying in retirement (Betham, 1804: 677). Her qualities and attitude give evidence of what at that time was applauded in women’s behaviour, namely moderation (Burstein, 2004: 27). Singer Rowe was calm, sweet, generous, humble, and modest, and declined all the honours on account of her literary works (Betham, 1804: 682-4). She was also a properly educated woman, according to the values of the period, given that she did not act and try to govern by power, but by her influence (Burstein, 2004: 55-6). Thus, just her commendable manners “produced a perpetual sunshine of the mind, that diffused itself on all around her” (Hays, 2014: VI, 326).

According to the data in these biographies, widowhood was a propitious status for these women in order to intensify their writing production, as happened to Singer Rowe, since women had more spare time, but also because they sometimes were left in very narrow financial circumstances, and they had to write out of necessity, as Behn, Centlivre and Chapone did. The case of Laetitia Pilkington is rather different, since her marriage was not happy and after her separation, she had to “recourse to her pen for her support” (Hays, 2014: VI, 68). Spinsterhood was also favourable to keep a literary career, as the biographies of Astell, Thomas, Elstob, Chandler and Fielding demonstrate. However, Elstob could pursue her Saxon studies while her brother was alive; afterwards, she was obliged for support to keep a small school and to work as a governess, while some friends raised an annuity for her and procured a small pension from Queen Caroline (Betham, 1804: 314).

In any case, married life and raising children was not the proper situation for women in order to maintain a literary career, since it was expected from them first to perform adequately their domestic duties and then to write, if they had spare time. This is clearly attested by Catharine Trotter, who declared in a letter to Pope

that “Being married in 1708, I bade adieu to the muses, and so wholly gave myself up to the cares of a family, and the education of my children, that I scarcely knew whether there were such things as books, plays, or poems, stirring in Great Britain” (Hays, 2013: III, 421). Thus she spent nearly 20 years in the cares of her family, before resuming her career again in her later years. These difficulties and “the uneasy situation of her fortune, during the whole course of her life” (Betham, 1804: 257), did not prevent Trotter being considered as “the new Scotch Sappho” (Hays, 2013: III, 415). This appellative and comparison to the Greek lyric poet of Lesbos was also awarded to Katherine Phillips, who is equalled to the Lesbian Sappho in genius (Hays, 2014: VI, 66). Nevertheless, it is interesting to note that when these writers were praised by the critics, the masculine features of their writings are eulogised, since what the eighteenth-century critics valorised in women writers was the masculinity achieved by them and accordingly the vocabulary used for praising women was masculine (Ezell, 1993: 72). Consequently, for scholars and critics, Phillips had “solid and masculine thoughts, in no feminine style” (Hays, 2014: VI, 66), while Astell exercised the pen “with masculine force and judgement” (Betham, 1804:79).

Aphra Behn was also called the English Sappho, but even though her literary merits were thus recognized in her biography, her works are the only ones not to be recommended; on the contrary, they are “reprehensible for their licentiousness” and “do not serve the cause of virtue” (Hays, 2013: I, 384-385). In this regard, Betham’s last remark in Behn’s biography is devastating and a telling instance of how a woman who escaped the realm of domesticity was judged and to what extent this circumstance affected the way her writings were assessed: “Had not Mrs. Behn been so strongly tinctured with the prevalent dissipation and loose morality of the age, her talents would have ranked her higher in the list of female writers” (1804: 111). Hays similarly mentions “the manners of the times [...] and the contagion of the court” (2013: I, 385) as the causes for censoring Behn’s works, giving voice to the eighteenth-century construction of the Restoration writing period as decadent and salacious (Spencer, 2000: 2). Most of the facts and events narrated in Behn’s early biographies are taken from a prefatory piece which was published in 1696 as a heading for a posthumous volume of Behn’s *Histories and Novels. Being Oroonoko and The Fair Jilt; or, The History of Prince Tarquin and Miranda* (1688), two texts here reprinted for the first time, this extensive biography of the writer concentrates in two settings, Surinam and Antwerp, where these two narratives are respectively set. Concerning her alleged stay in Surinam Behn’s *Oroonoko* is taken as a real source and her presence there and her acquaintance with the famous African prince are considered authentic and true; however, Hays and Betham mention a possible intercourse or sexual affair between

Behn and this prince (Hays, 2013: I, 275; Betham, 1804: 110), both of them referring to previous sources based on the aforementioned biographical text which had appeared in 1696. As Jane Spencer accurately explicates, what can be actually found in this biography is a refutation of “some unjust Aspersions” about Behn’s stay in the Caribbean colony, but “This elaborate denial serves, of course, to draw attention to the titillating idea of a sexual relationship” (2000: 35).

The increasing publication of this type of long biographical accounts was the consequence of the public’s interest and thus it became fashionable to include writers’ biographies at the beginning of their works, particularly in collections (Todd, 1998: 26). In any case, thanks to this biography, Behn’s life also gained respectability, since, taking *Oroonoko* as an autobiographical narrative, she was considered to be the daughter of a gentleman of good family, afterwards appointed a lieutenant-general of Surinam (Hays, 2013: I, 369; Betham, 1804: 109), when actually she appeared to be the daughter of a barber from a little market town in Kent (Todd, 1998: 27). According to other events also narrated in this biographical text, Behn’s life resulted in an odd mixture of biographical information and fictional details, which were then used by subsequent authors, such as Hays and Betham. Hays, for instance, mentions “Some letters, addressed to a gentleman, whom she poetically calls Lycidas; are printed in her Memoirs: this attachment appears to have been not less tender and ardent than unfortunate” (2013: I, 383). Spencer remarks that these letters were interpreted biographically, when it is not entirely certain that they are even hers, yet they introduce the reader to Behn as a passionate and desperate woman in love (2000: 38).

As for the literary works created by Behn, Hays provides a detailed list of her dramatic texts with additional information about their sources, their dedicatees, the year they were premiered and published (2013: I, 378-382). Her success as commercial playwright was unprecedented, challenging thus male hegemony (Staves, 2006: 61), which was probably the cause of several accusations against her of plagiarism. Hays refers clearly to this charge when she states that “she seems to have been a plagiarist, rather from haste than sterility of imagination, being at times compelled to write by pressing and urgent necessities” (2013: I, 383-384), offering at the same time some kind of justification. Behn was also in some way forced to give similar explanations during her lifetime. In the preface to *The Luckey Chance, or An Alderman’s Bargain* (1686), she mentions literary tradition to vindicate her works when she states that she desires to “tread in those successful Paths my Predecessors have so long thriv’d in, to take those Measures that both the Ancient and Modern writers have set me” (1996b: 217). Interestingly, in the preface to *Sir Patient Fancy: A Comedy* (1678) she considers plagiarism a sex-based accusation: “The play had no other Misfortune but that of coming out

for a Womans [sic]: had it been owned by a Man, though the most Dull Unthinking Rascally Scribler [sic] in Town, it had been a most admirable Play” (Behn, 1996a: 5), vindicating also women’s right to fame. Generally speaking and as a consequence of this initial biographical portrait, Behn’s critical reception in the eighteenth century was negative, usually appearing in contrast to other women writers studied here, such as Katherine Phillips or Elizabeth Singer Rowe, who epitomised chastity and piety (Todd, 1998: 31; Salzman, 2006: 176), and who are accordingly portrayed in this way in both these collective works, as has been mentioned above. This negative portrayal of Behn is also reflected in Hays and Betham’s biographies of the writer, which closely follow previous sources and repeat conservative comments about women’s role in the public sphere (Wood, 1998: 133-134; Bailey, 2005: 390).

In the case of Mary Hays’s dictionary and as a consequence of her usage of these sources, it has been considered that she left her first radical and liberal views and adopted a more conservative perspective and tone in it, more in accordance with a post-revolutionary atmosphere in Britain (Kelly 1993: 234; Spongberg, 2002: 117). It is important to note that Hays was one of those women who Reverend Powhele had called with contempt “unsex’d females” in his widely known and circulated poem published in 1798, particularly in the aftermath of the French Revolution. She was also the target of other satirical texts, such as Elizabeth Hamilton’s novel, *Memoirs of Modern Philosophers* (1800). Additionally, her association with Mary Wollstonecraft, who was catalogued after her death and the publication of her *Memoirs* by her husband, William Godwin, as a dangerous and promiscuous woman, was quite problematic for a woman writer who wanted to achieve a wide audience. However, as Andrew McInnes points out, in some entries and particularly in the footnotes, Hays is able to articulate a more personal discourse providing her feminist philosophy and criticising current gender roles and social prejudices (2011: 279). Concerning the case of Behn’s biography, the mere inclusion of her entry in the compilation is significant and remarkable, since she was conspicuously absent in most of the biographical collections of the period, more concerned with presenting virtuous and pious women to their intended readers (Wood, 1998: 132-133). Similarly, when analysing the scope and content of Betham’s dictionary, this text has been considered, on the one hand, a repetition of her predecessors’ words and judgements, and on the other, a “striking example of early feminism” (Bailey, 2005: 389-390), precisely for

the same reason, for incorporating women who were regarded as inappropriate for either sexual or political causes.²

The women writers under study here, except for the case of Aphra Behn, are positively portrayed in their biographies. Even though their lives are always determined by their family circumstances, which primarily do not depend on them, but on an omnipresent masculine figure, they appear as strong and courageous women who had to strive in order to acquire an education and to exploit their talent and natural disposition in pursuing a literary career. Similarly to earlier female biographies, such as hagiographies, catalogues and defences of women, where women usually had to endure and overcome painful circumstances and in which they are praised and admired precisely for their fortitude, the women writers in both these dictionaries are thus delineated. On one level, this record of female miseries and pains provokes empathy for the situation of the sufferer, and thus facilitates the creation, using the term coined by Benedict Anderson (2006), of imagined communities of women –encompassing biographers, writers and readers– who share similar circumstances (Kucich 2000). But on another level, women could take a more activist role, as Mary Hays did in her *Female Biography*, in resisting men’s authority, by means of some of her comments in certain entries and footnotes, such as those comparing women with slaves, or by her unwavering defence of some ill-treated women writers, given the prejudiced viewpoint with which they were regarded and judged.³

Catharine Macaulay is a case in point and Hays explains the motives in her biography: “A female historian, by its singularity, could not fail to excite attention: she seemed to have stepped out of the province of her sex; curiosity was sharpened, and malevolence provoked. The author was attacked by petty and personal scurrilities, to which it was believed her sex would render her vulnerable” (2014: V, 294). The particular circumstances regarding history and women during the second half of the eighteenth century are thus described by Susan Staves:

Unlike most contemporary women writers who confined themselves to genres supposed to be suited to ladies (letters, translations, poems, novels, and, perhaps, comedies), Macaulay dared to write in a prestigious genre, history, which most

² The most remarkable case in Betham’s collection is probably the presence of Mary Wollstonecraft – or Mary Godwin, as it appears in her dictionary (1804: 337-340)-, when Mary Hays did not even risk doing so.

³ This fact was particularly noticeable in the reviews of women writers’ texts which were increasingly present in the periodical press of the period. On the one hand, women might suffer harsher critics due to their lack of modesty for entering in the literary world, still considered eminently male, and on the other, reviewers might behave patronisingly and provide them with positive but gender-biased reviews (Lasa Álvarez, 2010: 192).

people still considered exclusively the proper province of male authors. Despite advice literature's frequent admonitions to ladies that they ought to read fewer novels and more history, and despite the introduction of history into approved curricula for ladies, few people had contemplated the possibility that a woman who could read history might also write it (2006: 321).

Indeed, Macaulay's most influential work was her *History of England from the Accession of James I to that of the Brunswick Line*, which was published in eight volumes between 1763 and 1783. This text met a considerable success during the 1760s and 1770s (Hill, 1992: 49), but as Betham states at the end of this writer's biography, "the democratic spirit of her writings has made them fall into disrepute" (1804: 450). Apart from her radical political ideas some personal circumstances affected her consideration and esteem among the public, especially among the reviewers and critics, who eagerly gave details about her second marriage to William Graham, who was about 25 years her junior (Hill, 1992: 117). Hays and Betham do not allude to this incident, but the former tries to exonerate Macaulay from all the charges attributed to her using the testimony of a close friend of Macaulay's, Mrs. Arnold (2014: V, 294), who in fact was the sister of her second husband and later became her sister-in-law (Hill, 1992: 108). By means of Mrs. Arnold's own account, Hays warmly constructs a new image for Macaulay without resorting in this case to preceding sources.⁴ She first portrays her as the incarnation of the proper effects of education in women, and then, as a physically nice-looking lady and as a domestic and virtuous woman.

Concerning Macaulay's education, Hays stresses that

Every hour in the day, which no longer hung heavy upon her hands, was now occupied and improved. She first made choice of the periodical writers [...]. As she advanced in age, her studies took a wider range; she grew attached to history, and dwelt with delight and ardour on the annals of the Greek and Roman republic. [...] From the world of frivolity, flattery, and dissipation, she shrunk back to a more improving world of her own (2014: V, 291-293).

Macaulay herself had published her own text on education, *Letters on Education*, in 1790, in which she attacked the chief and most widespread educational systems of that time, namely those proposed by Rousseau and Hume. According to these pedagogical programmes, girls' education was based on the association of women's nature with lesser virtues, such as delicacy, smoothness,

⁴ In fact, in the annotations to Macaulay's entry in the *Female Biography* it is highlighted the innovation of this way of presenting the information from oral sources "to gain first-hand knowledge of her subject" (Hays, 2014: V, 550).

beauty and dependence (Frazer, 2011: 608), which made them incapable of receiving the same education as boys. Macaulay, however, was in favour of an egalitarian education, for knowledge in her opinion was not determined by gender and thus claiming that assumed distinctions between men and women “do not in any manner proceed from sexual causes, but are entirely the effects of situation and education” (1790: 202). Consequently, Macaulay’s educational pursuits, as described in Hays’s *Female Biography*, reflect undeniably the writer’s own ideological manifesto on education, which additionally is to a great extent in line with Hays’s own notions on this particular issue, as expressed for instance in one her major essays, *Appeal to the Men of Great Britain in Behalf of Women* (1798).

As far as Macaulay’s appearance is concerned, Hays replies to those who cannot question her undeniable talents as a writer and consequently have to attack her by describing her as an ugly and deformed woman (Hays, 2014: V, 294). Hays quotes Mrs. Arnold’s own words to offer quite a different image of the writer, since she emerges as an elegant, delicate, fascinating, interesting and amiable lady (Ibid, 295). However, the highest commendations received by Macaulay in Hays’s biographical account refer to her domestic worthiness. At the end of her biography, the writer is celebrated as follows; “as a wife, a mother, a friend, a neighbour, and the mistress of a family, [Macaulay] was irreproachable and exemplary” (Ibid, 305). Consequently, Hays’s discourse, even in the case of Macaulay’s more original and ideologically risky and progressive biography, ends up acclimatising to prevailing notions of female value and exemplarity which were primarily grounded on domestic virtues.

References

- Anderson, Benedict (2006). *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Rev. Ed. New York: Verso.
- Austen, Jane (2006). *Northanger Abbey*. Ed. B. M. Benedict and D. Le Faye. *The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Jane Austen*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Backscheider, Paula R. (2001). *Reflections on Biography*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bailey, Elaine (2004). “Lexicography of the Feminine: Matilda Betham’s *Dictionary of Celebrated Women*”. *Philological Quarterly* 83, 4. 389-413.
- Batchelor, Janine (2012). “Jane Austen and Charlotte Smith: Biography, Autobiography and the Writing of Women’s Literary History”. In D. Cook and A. Culley, eds. *Women’s Life Writing, 1700-1850. Gender, Genre and Authorship*. Basingstoke: Palgrave. 181-196.
- Behn, Aphra (1996a). *Sir Patient Fancy: A Comedy*. In *The Works of Aphra Behn. Vol. 6. The Plays 1678-1682*. Janet Todd, ed. London: William Pickering. 1-82.
- (1996b). *The Lucky Chance, or An Alderman’s Bargain*. In *The Works of Aphra Behn. Vol. 7. The Plays 1682-1696*. London: William Pickering. 209-284.

- Betham, Mary Matilda (1804). *Biographical Dictionary of the Celebrated Women of Every Age and Country*. London: B. Crosby & Co.
- Burstein, Miriam Elizabeth (2004). *Narrating Women's History in Britain 1770-1902*. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Capern, Amanda L. (2005). "Enlightenment". In M. Spongberg, B. Caine and A. Curthoys, eds. *Companion to Women's Historical Writing*. Basingstoke: Palgrave. 152-160.
- Dosse, F. (2007). *La apuesta biográfica. Escribir una vida*. Trans. J. Aguado and C. Miñana. Valencia: Publicacions de la Univ. de Valencia.
- Ezell, Margaret J.M. (1996). *Writing Women's Literary History*. Baltimore & London: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Frazer, Elizabeth (2011). "Mary Wollstonecraft and Catharine Macaulay on Education". *Oxford Review on Education* 37, 5: 603-617.
- Hays, Mary (2013). *Female Biography; or, Memoirs of Illustrious and Celebrated Women, of All Ages and Countries. Alphabetically Arranged*. Vols. I, II and III. G. Luria Walker, ed. London: Pickering & Chatto.
- (2014). *Female Biography; or, Memoirs of Illustrious and Celebrated Women, of All Ages and Countries. Alphabetically Arranged*. Vols. IV, V, VI. G. Luria Walker, ed. London: Pickering & Chatto.
- Hill, Bridget (1992). *The Republican Virago. The Life and Times of Catharine Macaulay, Historian*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Kelly, Gary (1997). *Women, Writing and the Revolution 1790-1827*. Oxford & New York: OUP.
- Kucich, Greg (2000). "Romanticism and the Re-engendering of Historical Memory". In M. Campbell, J.M. Labbe and S. Shuttleworth, eds. *Memory and Memorials 1789-1914. Literary and Cultural Perspectives*. London & New York: Routledge. 15-29.
- Lasa Álvarez, Begoña (2010). "Reviewing Women in the Long Eighteenth Century: A Question of Inequality". In A. Antón-Pacheco, et al. eds. *Diferences, (In)Equality and Justice. Estudios de Mujeres. Vol. VII*. Madrid: Fundamentos. 191-199.
- Macaulay, Catharine (1790). *Letters on Education. With Observations on Religion and Metaphysical Subjects*. London: C. Dilly.
- McDowell, Paula (1993). "Consuming Women: The Life of the 'Literary Lady' as Popular Culture in Eighteenth-Century England". *Genre* 26: 219-252.
- McInnes, Andrew (2011). "Feminism in the Footnotes: Wollstonecraft's Ghost in Mary Hays' *Female Biography*". *Life Writing* 8.3. 273-285.
- Pearson, Jacqueline (1999). *Women's Reading in Britain 1750-1835. A Dangerous Recreation*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Salzman, Paul (2006). *Reading Early Modern Women's Writing*. Oxford: OUP.
- Spencer, Jane (2000). *Aphra Behn's Afterlife*. Oxford: OUP.
- Spongberg, Mary (2002). *Writing Women's History since the Renaissance*. Hampshire: Palgrave.
- (2005). "Female Biography". In M. Spongberg, B. Caine and A. Curthoys, eds. *Companion to Women's Historical Writing*. Basingstoke: Palgrave. 172-182.

- Staves, Susan (2006). *A Literary History of Women's Writing in Britain 1660-1789*. Cambridge: CUP.
- St Clair, William (2004). *The Reading Nation in the Romantic Period*. Cambridge: CUP.
- Todd, Janet (1998). *The Critical Fortunes of Aphra Behn*. Columbia, SC: Camden House.
- Wood, Jeanne (1998). "Alphabetically Arranged': Mary Hays's *Female Biography* and the Biographical Dictionary". *Genre* 31: 117-142.

Construction of Spanish Identities in the Eighteenth-Century English Press

Konstrukcja hiszpańskich tożsamości w angielskiej prasie 18-go wieku

Summary

English periodical publications offered the public products of other cultures. The perception of reality through published travel accounts gave readers the opportunity to raise awareness of other countries, traditions, and lifestyles, and helped them to gain knowledge of different social practices. In order to extend understanding of how identity was represented in eighteenth-century press, this work examines the construction of cultural identity through the writings published in *The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* in 1777. The focus will be specifically on the circulation of the narratives of Major William Dalrymple's journey to Spain. These printed items illustrate the way in which the Spanish identity was constructed as well as the role played by periodical publications in the presentation of culture and traditions of different people across the world.

Keywords: Construction, Cultural Identity, English Press, Eighteenth-Century

Travelling was a pleasant experience for the high class. Some travellers, such as the wealthy and powerful, found in their journeys abroad “a means of education and of enjoyment.” (Black, 1981-1982: 665). Other purposes of voyages and journeys were making scientific observations and discovering customs of foreign countries (Carlson, 1938: 155-158). The English press devoted coverage to cultural and social activities abroad and published records of travels to distant corners of the world. These press stories took the audience on entertaining journeys through a variety of traditions. In Cranfield's words, they “must have made fascinating reading for those who had never ventured outside their immediate neighbourhood; and they also had a very definite educational value, quite apart from their helping to draw people out of their old insularity and parochialism into an interest in the outside world.” (Cranfield, 1962: 68-69).

The news items of travellers' journeys in the press granted Spain a place in the British society¹. Eighteenth-century perception of Spanish identity can be seen

¹ Many eighteenth-century British travellers to Spain created literary works on their journeys. Among them, it is worth mentioning *Letters Concerning the Spanish Nation* (1763), *Travels through*

in the article “A Gentleman’s Travels through Portugal, Spain and Galicia”, which was published by *Bristol Journal* in 1749 (Cranfield, 1962: 68). *Gentleman’s Magazine* was another periodical in Britain which printed items of travels in Spain such as the “Account of the Island of Minorca” in 1751 (Carlson, 1938: 158). Another travel account of Spain appeared in *The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* in 1777. It was entitled “Travels through Spain and Portugal, in 1774; with a short Account of the Spanish Expedition against Algiers, in 1775: by Major William Dalrymple”². These geographical materials helped increase public knowledge of different communities across Spain and gave readers the opportunity to discover the Spanish culture through the travellers’ descriptions of the different places they visited.

In 1774, Major William Dalrymple undertook his journey into Spain in order “to dip into the state of government, to observe in particular on military establishments, to notice the customs and manners of the people, and to remark upon other transient particulars” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 432). The views of his five month journey were recorded in sixteen letters written during his travels and printed by *The Critical Review or Annals of Literature*, a London monthly publication which focused on English literature, history and criticism. His itinerary was the following: “[h]e passed from Gibraltar over Cordoba to Madrid, and from thence by Avila, Salamanca, Benavente, Astorga and Lugos, to Corunna and Ferrol, the ports on the Bay of Biscay. From Corunna he proceeded to St. Iago de Compostella, and then he entered Portugal, visiting Braga, Oporto, Coimbra and Leiria in his way to Lisbon. Returning from thence to Gibraltar, he passed Evora, Elvas, Badajoz, Seville, Xeres and Cadiz” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 432).

The letters are a chronicle of his journey. They not only offer the traveller’s descriptions of places but also a cultural construction of the Spanish identity at that time. In his first letter, the traveller provides the conditions of the roads and inns. He complains of the bad accommodation and indicates that roads were also

Portugal and Spain, in 1772 and 1773 (1775), *A Year’s Journey through France and Part of Spain* (1777), *Travels through Spain, in the years 1775 and 1776* (1779), *Travels through Spain, with a View to Illustrate the Natural History and Physical Geography of that Kingdom, in a Series of Letters* (1782), *A Journey through Spain in the Years 1786 and 1787* (1792), *Letters during a Short Residence in Spain and Portugal* (1797).

² Details of this journey were documented in the book *Travels through Spain and Portugal in 1774; with a Short Account of the Spanish Expedition against Algiers in 1775* (1777).

bad as “takes much pains to count all the wooden crosses on the road” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 432). Accommodation and roads were considered to be two of the major concerns regarding travelling in Spain (Guerrero, 1990: 95-106). The issue of immigration is introduced in his first and third letters, dated from Cordoba and La Carolina, respectively. They provide accounts of a colony of Germans at La Carlota and another in the mountains of Sierra Morena, where they had arrived eight years ago³. They were “chiefly from Alface, French Flanders, and Lorrain; [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 432). In Dalrymple’s opinion, these colonies were “not in a very flourishing state.” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 432). Neither the character nor the way of life of the Germans who inhabited those parts of Andalusia are presented in the periodical publication. In the second letter, the traveller makes some remarks on the manners of the inhabitants of Cordoba⁴. A famous figure in Spanish literature, Miguel de Cervantes Saavedra, and his masterpiece, *Don Quixote*, are mentioned when the traveller arrives at Venta Quesada and Puerto Lapice having passed through El Viso and Valdepeñas. In Tembleque he encounters an adventure like that of Don Quixote and Maritornes. Yet, the newspaper establishes that the traveller’s account of this adventure missed the humorous touch that pervades the entertaining adventures in Cervantes’s book (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 433).

Dalrymple pursued his journey to Madrid, which is described in letter five, and “travelled to the famous convent and royal library of the Escorial”, of which he provides a detailed account⁵, and to Avila, a town where general O’Reilly had established a military academy (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 434). He also visited Salamanca, which boasts “the principal Spanish university” and “is a sketch of Spanish academic education, [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 434). Yet ironically, his narrative of this town elaborates a critique of the Spanish education as “literature appears to be in a deplorable state there” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 432). According to Guerrero, British travellers expressed shock at the widespread acceptance that certain systems of thought and authors, such as

³ The presence of German immigrants in those parts of Spain had to do with a land reform project initiated by Pablo de Olavide in order to colonise uncultivated land in Andalusia (Muñoz, 2010: 162).

⁴ Details of these manners were not revealed by *The Critical Review or Annals of Literature*. This illustrates that in selecting what part of the accounts was to be reported the periodical publication was choosing the cultural elements that wanted to emphasize or omit.

⁵ These descriptions were not provided in this London periodical publication.

Aristoteles, Scoto and Tomas de Aquino, had acquired in the Spanish faculties of the time (1990: 389). In his description of Salamanca, the traveller refers to a nineteen year old student, described as being very poor, who shares his learning with the visitor by repeating one of the odes of Horace (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 434).

The major's journey through Zamora to Astorga is documented in letters eight and nine, and is followed by an account of the port of Corunna and of Ferrol's naval instalations in letter ten. His stay in this town reveals one of the purposes of his tour through Spain: to examine the military establishments based there. The importance of Ferrol is manifested in its dockyard, what is described as "the great Spanifh marine arfenal" (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 437). The reader is given the periodical publication's opinion on the traveller's account of this matter in the phrase "[t]he particulars which major Dalrymple mentions in this account, are very interesting, as they give us a juft idea of a maritime power with which we are often at variance". (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 437). The author completes his last letters with a narrative of his journey from Santiago de Compostela to Portugal, Seville, Cadiz and Gibraltar⁶.

Analysis of the published accounts of the travels indicates that *The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* shaped a general representation of the physical description of the places visited by the traveller. Yet, the construction of Spanish identities is more vivid as a great deal of attention is given to specific group identities and to references to customs of the inhabitants. The publication presents different social groups such as the royalty, the grandees, and the Magaratos. With respect to the monarchy, major Dalrymple indicates that the accession to the throne of the Bourbon dynasty had negative consequences for the privileges of the upper classes who "have infenfibly fallen under the tyranny of an abfolute monarch" (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 433). The negative construct of the sovereign's identity shows that the major clearly disliked despotic regimes and helps readers to construct the political situation in which the Spanish population lived at that time.

Negative professional and personal qualities are also associated with aristocracy, who enjoyed residing with the court and never visited their estates (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 433). The grandees not

⁶ Details of these places are not published in *the Critical Review*.

only lost sight of their duties but also had a constant love and pursuit of pleasure. They displayed a total lack of interest in working and kept buffoons for their amusements. One of the members of this group attended the duke of Alba. In the morning, as soon as the grandee awaked, the buffon was “obliged to relate some facetious story, to put his grace in good-humour: [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 433). Sexual practices were lax at that time and the conjugal bed was “not held very sacred by the men of fashion” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 434). In addition, courtship was increasingly widespread across aristocratic women. In the traveller’s opinion, this custom was associated with the monarchy as “since the Bourbon family has been seated on this throne, jealousy has lost its sting. The ladies are not behind-hand with their husbands: every dame has one *cortejo* at least, and often more; [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 434). The persistent pursuit of sexual activity damaged the health of those people around them as they were exposed to a number of different diseases (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 434). Black points out that Catholic countries were noted for their immorality and that “sexual customs were held to be looser on the Continent, [...]” (Black, 1981-1982: 660).

More specific representations of the Spanish identity can be seen in the construction of other social groupings such as the Maragatos. The fact that *The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* chose to report the traveller’s account of his journey through Zamora to Astorga illustrates the opportunity that these periodical publications provided for groups outside the wealthy and influential upper classes to gain access to newspaper content and audiences. The construction of this group was not simplistic as the newspaper devotes nearly two pages to provide a description of their physical appearance and details about their way of living. Those women’s costume was very unusual and unique. They wore large ear-rings, a brown woolen cloth bodice and petticoat, and a kind of white hat (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 435). The traveller draws the reader’s attention to their hair, which is parted in the front and never combed after marriage (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 436), and to a number of little pictures of saints which are “tied round their neck and spreading all over their breasts; [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 435). These religious attitudes show that they were worshippers of images. The costume men wore consisted of “very large breeches, which tie at the knee, and the loose part hangs over the tie as far as the calf of the leg; the rest of their dress is a kind of coat, with a belt round their middle.” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 435).

The notion of heterogeneity becomes stronger in the Maragato's shared sense of cultural features, which help to identify and personify this social group. The traveller provides valuable insights into perceptions of its members circulating in the general culture of the day. He points out that they "intermarry amongst each other; and if any of them should change their drefs, or violate their established customs, they are driven from the society" (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 435). This quotation states an absolute separation of the Maragatos from the customs of other social groupings and a total commitment to tradition and established conventions. In his account, the traveller also explores issues of gender. Within the group's norms, women adopt some cultural practices such as "the work in the fields at all the labours of agriculture, whilst men are employed as carriers from this country across the mountains into Galicia, keeping many hundreds of horses for that purpose; [...]" (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 436). A direct reference to Miguel de Cervantes and some of his characters is provided again in this description. The traveller argues that the Maragatos "are supposed to be the Yanguedian Carriers mentioned in Don Quixote." (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 436). In addition, the major cites passages taken from *España Sagrada*, written by Enrique Flores, to refer to the Maragatos as "given to commerce, in which they are noted for their integrity; [...]" (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 436).

Other comparisons are drawn between the Muslims and the Maragatos when historical implications are considered for the construction of their identity. Dalrymple suggests that this social group developed in connection with specific historical circumstances linked with Africa. He provides constructed arguments into the relationship that exists between the Muslims and the King Don Alonso el Católico, in the middle of the eighth century. This monarch had an illegitimate son, called Mauregato, who received help from the Moors in his claim to the throne. This assistance was provided in exchange for a hundred maidens, "fifty virgins of noble birth, and fifty of low extraction; [...]" (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 436). Don Alonso "not being sufficiently powerful to resist the force that was brought against him, retired into Cantabria or Biscay" (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 436). As a consequence, Mauregato acceded to the throne of Leon. During his reign, which lasted five years and six months, he "granted lands to encourage the Moors to settle in his kingdom" (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 436). Although it is not obvious that the Maragatos are the descendants of these Moors, the traveller makes reference to this African involvement in order

to “offer it as a conjecture, till a more satisfactory account be given of them, [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 436). It is interesting to note that this direct connection between the Moors and the Maragatos was still made ten centuries after their settlement in those parts of Spain.

On the traveller’s construction of the Spanish identity, descriptions of social groups demonstrate that there were distinct types of inhabitants. All of them produce a form of cultural identity. Dalrymple identifies different parts of Spain and notes cultural differences between its peoples. He establishes that “[t]he Castilian, Andalusian, and Gallician are strongly marked, each as a separate people; [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 437). Once he arrived at La Mancha, he observed that “the dress and turn of mind” were quite different from those in Andalusia (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 438). Association of Andalusian people with the Moors is founded in accordance with their direct descent from those settlers and suggests that the cultural products of this part of the country reflect historical circumstances which represent a specific identity. Andalusian are described as crafty and designing (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 432). 438). A positive construction of the people from the North is presented when he states that a nobler spirit runs through their veins (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 438).

Despite these differences, the traveller indicates that as a unique government, religion and education prevails, Spanish people share a number of qualities which also make up their character. Some of these characteristics are gravity and a reserved behaviour (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 437). He states that the inquisition created tremendous anxiety over identity as “urged them to have a curb upon their tongue, for fear they should utter what might be interpreted to their ruin; [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 437). The fact that ordinary people did not share their opinions shows that they were oppressed and that eighteenth-century Spanish population constructed their identity based on their fears. Other features of the Spanish character were their acute and lively imagination, warmth in their affections, optimism, and high notions of the dignity of their birth (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 437-438). Identity is also constructed in terms of class and hierarchy. Most commonly, marriages were made according to backgrounds and status. People from similar social levels tended to mix. A parallel is also drawn in relation to upper class attitudes as “the old nobility seldom contract themselves with the new; [...]” (*The Critical*

Review or Annals of Literature 43, June 1777: 438). The use of the adjective “old” versus “new” suggests that these people were victims of tradition and old values.

Spanish people are also portrayed as having a conscious dignity and being “temperate, or rather abstemious in their living [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 438). This perception is reinforced when linked to an analysis of language use. In his description, the traveller explains that the word *borracho* [drunk] “is the highest term of reproach; [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 438). Spanish citizens are also recognized to “treat one another with the greatest civility and respect”, to be “free from diffidence”, to “have a manly character, and speak to their prince with the same sangfroid and confidence that would do to their fellow; [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 438). At that time, women received a limited education and were “confined with bars at home, [...]” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 438). This quotation illustrates that they were subject to patriarchy and to some discriminatory practices that adversely affected their lives. Dalrymple’s representation of the Spanish character ends with a political note by saying “[t]here was a time, when the ardent flame of liberty fired each Spaniard’s breast; but it has been extinguished by the malignant blasts of despotism, never to be kindled more” (*The Critical Review or Annals of Literature* 43, June 1777: 438).

Publication of these journeys has the potential to confer significant benefits on society as a whole in terms of cultural enrichment and understanding as it offers readers the chance to gain exposure to new places and people as well as to shape and construct new identities. The analysis of how Dalrymple constructed the Spanish identity shows social inequality. Individuals were identified as belonging to particular social groups which defined their differences. Despite the fact that these printed expressions of foreign cultural news provide a broad perspective and do not illuminate the eighteenth century situation, they serve as a referent for the construction of Spanishness and provide an insight of specific groups. This, in turn, contributes to recognise that a number of different identities operated and coexisted with each other in the Spanish culture of the period.

However, and despite the diversification of identity, the traveller’s account indicates that all the inhabitants shared a common government, religion, and education which make the highlighting of general features of character valid. Their differences and similarities provided a better understanding of Spanish culture and identity throughout Britain. These newspaper representations of

eighteenth-century Spain helped British citizens to gain a concept of a foreign country and a construction of some of its physical features and social groups.

Primary Sources

Periodical Publications

Bristol Journal

Gentleman's Magazine

The Critical Review or Annals of Literature

References

- Black, Jeremy (1981-1982). "British Travellers in Europe in the Early Eighteenth Century". *Dalhousie Review* 61: 655-667.
- Carlson, Lennart C. (1938). *The First Magazine. A History of the Gentleman's Magazine*. Rhode Island: Brown University.
- Clarke, Edward (1763). *Letters Concerning the Spanish Nation*. London: T. Becket and T. A. de Hondt.
- Cranfield, G. A. (1962). *The Development of the Provincial Newspaper 1700-1760*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Dalrymple, William (1777). *Travels through Spain and Portugal in 1774; with a Short Account of the Spanish Expedition against Algiers in 1775*. London: J. Almon.
- Dillon, John Talbot (1792). *Travels through Spain, with a View to Illustrate the Natural History and Physical Geography of that Kingdom, in a Series of Letters*. London: Pearson and Rollason.
- Guerrero, Ana Clara (1990). *Viajeros británicos en la España del siglo XVIII*. Madrid: Aguilar.
- Muñoz Bort, Domingo (2010). "La colonización agraria del siglo XVIII en Andalucía: el proyecto ilustrado para el espacio de Doñana." *Huelva en su historia – 2ª época* 13: 161-200.
- Southey, Robert (1797). *Letters Written during a Short Residence in Spain and Portugal*. Bristol: n.p.
- Swinburne, Henry (1779). *Travels through Spain, in the Years 1775 and 1776*. Dublin: S. Price.
- Thicknesse, Philip (1777). *A Year's Journey through France and Part of Spain*. Dublin: n.p.
- Townsend, Joseph (1792). *A Journey through Spain in the Years 1786 and 1787*. London: C. Dilly.
- Twiss, Richard (1775). *Travels through Portugal and Spain, in 1772 and 1773*. London: G. Robinson.

Britain and the Cultural History of the First World War: The Uses of Historiography

Wielka Brytania i historia kultury I Wojny Światowej: zastosowania historiografii

Summary

This article discusses and reviews the main trends in the historiography of the cultural history of the First World War as it relates to Britain. Since the publication of Paul Fussell's *The Great War and Modern Memory* in 1975 a debate has opened up about the exact nature of British responses to the war in the cultural sphere. Fussell's arguments about the role played by irony in creating a new mode of meaning in literary works about the war are briefly discussed and contrasted with Jay Winter's claim (in *Site of Memory, Sites of Mourning*) that it was more traditional cultural forms that helped artists and writers to mediate the experiences of the war in their work. What follows is an analysis of a wartime painting by the British artist Charles Sims, together with a discussion of some examples of British war poetry, namely that of Siegfried Sassoon and Wilfred Owen. In the light of the historiography about the war's cultural impact it can be seen that traditional forms of artistic expression were present alongside 'modernist' modes such as irony, since both had a function for writers and artists attempting to represent the British experience of the Great War. The author concludes by suggesting that a successful investigation into the war's cultural consequences should avoid making any unnecessary distinctions between so-called 'modernist' and 'traditionalist' interpretations.

Keywords: Britain, cultural history, First World War, historiography, irony, war poetry

A hundred years since it began, the First World War (or as contemporaries knew it, the Great War) continues to play a central role in the collective memory and culture of the British nation. As Britain, along with other nations, prepares to mark the centenary of the war, the ways in which the conflict is remembered and understood still evoke significant debate and discussion both within the academic community as well as beyond in the wider public sphere. Unfortunately, some of these debates have sought to crudely mirror long-standing historiographical differences in the way that cultural historians have interpreted the war's impact, but as will be seen, these metaphorical battle lines are not helpful in advancing

a subtle and nuanced understanding of what the war meant to those who experienced it.

The process of writing the military, diplomatic and political history of the Great War was begun either during or soon after the conflict, but the exploration of the First World War's cultural impact has belonged, for the most part, to a far more recent period. Over the last few decades a body of secondary literature dealing with the connections between the war and culture has developed and provided us with a varied corpus of writing. The central issue to have emerged from this literature is the extent of continuity and change that existed in the cultural sphere as a result of the conflict. In its simplest outline the debate can be characterised as being about whether the war was an event that stimulated a backward-looking reliance on cultural traditions and forms, or whether it led to an enhancing and strengthening of cultural modernism, an integral element of which was the rejection of pre-war art and literature (see Winter 1995, 2-5). The differences between historians working in this field are in fact often superficial, and where differences do exist they do not necessarily result in exclusivity or incompatibility. There is no clear dichotomy between 'tradition' and 'modernism', and no obvious separation of historians into those who identify the war as a moment of cultural *caesura* and those who see a continuation or recasting of older cultural trends. Variations in the interpretation of the war's cultural impact do arise, but where this is the case they are usually subtle and due either to a concentration on different sources or are a consequence of a historian's particular focus and purpose.

The entire field of the cultural history of the Great War was stimulated almost forty years ago by the publication of Paul Fussell's book, *The Great War and Modern Memory* (1975). Perhaps because he wrote as both an American and a literary critic, Fussell's work was idiosyncratic in its grasp of the general context of the British war experience and its understanding of many historical details. This has resulted in some critics, often those with a background in military history, questioning the value both of Fussell's work and, more generally, the reliability of cultural history as a means of understanding the experience of war (see Prior and Wilson, Stephen 230-237). Some of these writers have made the misguided claim that Fussell's writing mistakes itself for history rather than literary criticism. However, this interpretation of Fussell is at odds with his own clearly-stated claims about the *literary* forms that writing about war experience took. For example, the failure to understand the distinction between the analysis of war literature (the task of the cultural historian) and the more general question of the experience of war, is present in Brian Bond's attempt to discredit the value of cultural histories of the Great War (see Bond 1996 and 2000).

Despite these criticisms, Fussell's central arguments have been both profound and fruitful. Many of his critics failed to comprehend that the primary concern of his work was not so much the experience of the war, but the process by which experience was turned into memory. More precisely, Fussell's purpose was to analyse the literary manifestation of memory and to this end he concentrated on what he took to be some of the classic war memoirs written by British soldiers, notably those of Edmund Blunden, Siegfried Sassoon and Robert Graves. It was in these and similar literary efforts that Fussell claimed to identify a significant turning-point in twentieth-century culture. In attempting to interpret and understand their war experience these writers made a new and radical departure by employing irony as the dominant mode of meaning. Fussell explained that:

'In reading memoirs of the war, one notices the same phenomenon over and over. By applying to the past a paradigm of ironic action, a rememberer is enabled to locate, draw forth, and finally shape into significance an event or a moment which otherwise would emerge without meaning into the general undifferentiated stream.' (Fussell 30)

In his slightly cumbersome prose, Fussell referred to this as the 'mechanism of irony-assisted recall' and it was in this respect that the Great War played a crucial role in giving birth to a form of memory and understanding that came to be dominant in the twentieth century. Fussell summarised his claims by stating that: 'I am saying that there seems to be one dominating form of modern understanding; that it is essentially ironic; and that it originates largely in the application of mind and memory to the events of the Great War.' (Fussell 35)

More recently, this prevailing historiographical pattern has been challenged (or at least modified) by Jay Winter. His book *Sites of Memory, Sites of Mourning* (1995) differs in that whilst literary sources are discussed these are not the sole or primary focus. Winter goes beyond them to explore some of the wider social forms of the conflict's cultural impact: film, painting, poetry and novels take their place alongside war memorials, spiritualism and commemoration, not only in Britain but also in France and Germany. More importantly though, Winter concentrates on one main theme – the process of mourning – and in so doing arrives at a conclusion which although not entirely incompatible with that of Fussell, certainly possesses a different emphasis. Winter dissents from the view that the Great War represents a crucial moment in the ascent of modernism and maintains that if any such cultural rupture did take place it was ambiguous (adding the corollary that the nature of modernism has been misunderstood). In looking at the ways in which the war dead were mourned, Winter finds not a break with

the past but a reliance on traditional cultural modes. Religion and Christian motifs, classicism, romanticism and figurative art all flourished, precisely because these were recognisable universal themes that had the ability to heal. This is what was required for both the public and private process of mourning, commemorating and remembering the dead. 'It is the central contention of this book', Winter explains:

'that the backward gaze of so many writers, artists, politicians, soldiers, and everyday families in this period reflected the universality of grief and mourning in Europe from 1914. A complex traditional vocabulary of mourning, derived from classical, romantic, or religious forms, flourished, largely because it helped mediate bereavement. The 'sites of memory' ... faced the past, not the future.' (Winter 1995, 223)

By drawing attention to the persistent themes and elements of continuity in the cultural response of Europeans to the war, Winter did not intend to replace one historiographical orthodoxy with another, confessing that 'I recognize [it] as equally true that the 1914-18 war was, if not the end of one phase of European cultural history, at least the beginning of the end.' (Winter 1995, 8) This sense of ambiguity was captured more clearly in the thoughts Winter expressed in an earlier article, where he wrote that:

'It should be evident on even the most cursory consideration that the repercussions of the Great War cannot be fitted neatly into any one cultural theory or interpretation. There were lines of continuity and a widespread and stubborn refusal to accept new categories of thought and artistic expression, and cultural historians ignore them at their peril. But there was also a parting of the ways in European cultural history, a schism visible perhaps only twenty or thirty years after the war rather than during or immediately after it.' (Winter 1992, 531)

Where differences in the interpretation of the Great War's cultural impact exist they can largely be attributed to some of the basic decisions made by the historians concerned. As has been pointed out by Aviel Roshwald and Richard Stites, the emphasis on a particular country, the type of sources used and the concentration on particular themes can yield different conclusions, but these need not be antagonistic (Roshwald and Stites 2). As will be seen in the following analysis, what Winter calls the 'backward gaze', as well as the use of classical forms and motifs, are present in a notable painting by an English artist, Charles

Sims, who was attempting to understand the experience of loss and bereavement in light of the war. His painting 'Clio and the Children' can be interpreted as an attempt to use and recast traditional cultural forms as part of the process of mourning. At the same time, among some British soldier-writers a new ironic mode of meaning did take root, as can be observed in the poetry of Wilfred Owen, Siegfried Sassoon and others. In the analysis that follows, elements of both continuity *and* change can be observed in cultural responses to the war.

Art and the Historical Imagination: Charles Sims

Within the collections of the Royal Academy in London is a painting entitled 'Clio and the Children' by the English artist Charles Sims (1873-1928). In many respects it is an unimpressive work of art: it is not innovative in its approach and it fails to display any great technical proficiency. The artist was for the most part undistinguished and he has never been widely discussed, either in his lifetime or subsequently. But, for all this, 'Clio and the Children' is still an interesting painting. This was the work which in 1916 gained Sims his diploma from, and entry into, the Royal Academy, but it is the subject matter and 'narrative' of the painting which is of interest here.

Charles Sims was born in Islington in 1873 and in his early years passed through separate apprenticeships in London and Paris, initially as a draper, then as an engraver and finally as a painter (see Stevens 145 and Cork 128-129). The subject matter of his work usually comprised human figures placed outside in rural and pastoral settings, often set incongruously alongside pagan creatures or mythic individuals. This was the case with 'Clio and the Children', a painting that was originally completed in 1913. The setting of this work is a green and succulent landscape, clearly identifiable as the English countryside and most probably based on the Sussex Downs, where Sims lived for part of his life. It is in many respects a depiction of a rural idyll: a deep and warm blue sky is punctuated by a few unthreatening white clouds and a collection of innocent young children, barefooted and wearing colourful summer clothes, are aligned in the foreground in relaxed but attentive poses. The gazes of the nine children, some of whom may have been modelled on Sims's own sons and daughters, are directed towards the other figure in the painting, situated in the right foreground. This is Clio, the muse of history, represented as a seated woman clothed in classical robes. Resting upon Clio's lap is a scroll – the scroll of history – from which she is reading and holding the attention of the children. This is almost certainly the scene as Sims first painted it in 1913 and it appears to speak to us of a benign and peaceful world at ease with itself. Clio is bestowing the inheritance of the ages and knowledge of

the past to the young children, who represent the next generation. This process, the process of seamlessly transferring the past into the future, is depicted as continuous, positive and beneficial (the general atmosphere of benign inheritance being suggested in part by the tranquil and idyllic setting).

This, however, is not how the painting is known to us today. In the early stages of the Great War, Sims's own son was killed and this appears to have been the event which prompted the changes he made to the work. Red paint was added to the scroll in order to represent blood and it is possible that Clio's posture was also altered (Stevens 146). In the final version she is hunched, almost dejected, with her head bowed over the scroll, and such is the anatomical inaccuracy and distortion in the representation of Clio's shoulder and upper back that this may have been awkwardly adapted to give her a subdued countenance. The painting that was re-completed in 1915 and submitted to the Royal Academy in 1916 is therefore a work which, despite originally depicting a positive notion of history, in its finished form expressed the defilement of history, a view arrived at through the artist's experience of the Great War. History, Sims appeared to be suggesting, had been stained by the blood of the war dead. How could he believe that the past was a wonderful inheritance for the next generation when his own son had been the victim of Europe's recent troubled history? The figure of Clio appears in the 1915 work as a dejected, sorrowful and pitiful figure, reading from a tainted script.

Sims's own life also ended on a note of tragedy. Apparently unable to come to terms with the loss of his son in the war, suffering from ill health and artistically exhausted, he committed suicide in 1928 (Stevens 145). However, his response to the war in the form of 'Clio and the Children' raises an interesting set of questions. What seems to have happened in Sims's mind as a direct consequence of the conflict is some kind of significant shift in the way he perceived history. Prior to 1914 he depicted the past as something which could be passed on to future generations as a gift, as if the story of mankind's efforts was one about achievement, success and perhaps even greatness. With the war of 1914 Sims appeared to believe that this no longer held. Human history was somehow discredited by the brutal nature of war and the spilt blood of Europe's youth. In its crudest form, Sims's perception of history had shifted, as a direct consequence of the conflict, from something positive to negative. What the picture represents is a significant departure from a largely optimistic pre-war notion of history as a progressive process, but this is expressed through a minor re-working of a painting that employs traditional figurative forms and classical motifs.

War Poetry: The Uses of Irony

Amongst the recent anglophone literature that has explored the cultural history of the Great War there is a noticeable revisionist trend that seeks to diminish or at least minimise the role of war literature, most obviously poetry, in shaping the collective national memory of the conflict. This trend followed and in some ways mirrored and slightly earlier pattern of revisionism in the sphere of military history, but it is clearly observable in the approach of writers such as Brian Bond and Martin Stephen. Most recently, David Reynolds has clearly reiterated this position in his assertion that British war poetry from 1914-1918 should not be seen as representative of the common soldier's experience:

'...[T]he iconic war poets... are remarkable both as men and as writers – fascinating in their complicated, often contorted, responses to the experience of modern war and how it should be represented in poetry. Yet these men were typical neither of the British Tommy in general nor of the writers (a quarter of them women) who published poems in 1914-18. Their verse should not be used as historical description of the soldier's experience, as suggested by the still influential anthologies from the 1960s.' (Reynolds 431)

Whilst it is clearly true that the work of soldier poets such as Wilfred Owen and Siegfried Sassoon cannot be taken as fully representative of the experiences of ordinary soldiers, it is nevertheless the case that their poetry often displays the ironic mode of understanding that Paul Fussell identified in the memoirs of Blunden, Graves and, of course, Sassoon himself. Indeed, Sassoon's commonly anthologised and most famous short poem, 'The General', uses two imagined, ordinary 'Tommyes', named Harry and Jack, to express a bitter and sardonic irony about the circumstances of their deaths:

'Good-morning; good-morning!' the General said
When we met him last week on our way to the line.
Now the soldiers he smiled at are most of 'em dead,
And we're cursing his staff for incompetent swine.
'He's a cheery old card,' grunted Harry to Jack
As they slogged up to Arras with rifle and pack.

But he did for them both by his plan of attack. (Sassoon 1918)

It is the final line that carries the main ironic burden of the poem. The General (together with his staff officers) is unambiguously identified as the cause of

the two soldiers' deaths, but the colloquial and abrupt expression of their fate (they are 'done for') conveys a lack of sentimentality about the loss of life. This is perhaps intended to reflect the callousness of the General and his staff, but Sassoon is employing language which lacks any trace of the romantic, tragic or heroic sentiments that can be found in earlier British literature from the war. Most notable in this latter category is of course the self-conscious patriotism of Rupert Brooke's 'The Soldier' (published in 1915, but written in 1914), in which the poet reassures the reader that 'If I should die, think only this of me:/That there's some corner of a foreign field/That is for ever England.' (Silkin 81-82) The immortality of Brooke's soldier, together with the suggestion of a noble cause that redeems the death, contrasts starkly with the sudden, meaningless and unnecessary deaths of the Tommies in 'The General'.

A shift in poetic language and sentiment can also be observed in the work of the writer who is today remembered as Britain's greatest war poet, Wilfred Owen. Owen was killed in action on the Western Front on 4 November 1918, just a few days before the armistice, but his development as a poet and the move away from the slightly florid pre-war Georgian poetry of his youth was precipitated by meeting Sassoon at Craiglockhart hospital in Scotland in 1917, where they were both receiving treatment (in theory for shell-shock, but actually under somewhat different circumstances in Sassoon's case). Although Owen's poems from the last two years of the war still retained some of the form and sentimentality of his pre-war poetry, under the influence and guidance of Sassoon the younger poet introduced a harsher and more sardonic style in which irony clearly had a role to play in undermining older, patriotic notions of warfare which could not be sustained in the light of the experience of modern, industrial warfare. The poem 'Dulce et Decorum est' (completed through the winter of 1917-18) is one of the clearest examples of this. Here, Owen gives an unflinching and graphic description of the consequences of a gas attack, after which the victim is 'flung' (a verb deliberately expressing the unceremonious treatment and commonplace nature of the soldier's suffering) into a wagon, almost like an animal carcass:

Bent double, like old beggars under sacks,
Knock-kneed, coughing like hags, we cursed through sludge,
Till on the haunting flares we turned our backs
And towards our distant rest began to trudge.
Men marched asleep. Many had lost their boots
But limped on, blood-shod. All went lame; all blind;
Drunk with fatigue; deaf even to the hoots
Of gas shells dropping softly behind.

Gas! GAS! Quick, boys! – An ecstasy of fumbling,
Fitting the clumsy helmets just in time;
But someone still was yelling out and stumbling,
And flound'ring like a man in fire or lime...
Dim, through the misty panes and thick green light,
As under a green sea, I saw him drowning.

In all my dreams, before my helpless sight,
He plunges at me, guttering, choking, drowning.

If in some smothering dreams you too could pace
Behind the wagon that we flung him in,
And watch the white eyes writhing in his face,
His hanging face, like a devil's sick of sin;
If you could hear, at every jolt, the blood
Come gargling from the froth-corrupted lungs,
Obscene as cancer, bitter as the cud
Of vile, incurable sores on innocent tongues, –
My friend, you would not tell with such high zest
To children ardent for some desperate glory,
The old Lie: Dulce et decorum est
Pro patria mori. (Silkin 192-193)

To strip his readers of any illusions about the nature of modern warfare, Owen dwells on the 'obscene' nature of the physical suffering, but once again the ironic burden of the poem rests in the final line with the Latin evocation (from the Roman poet Horace) that it is sweet and fitting (or honourable) to die for one's country. The contrast with the previous lines is enough to undermine the platitudinous and naive patriotic sentiments that are the real target of the poem. In poems such as this and Sassoon's 'The General' there is undeniably an ironic mode of expression at work that serves the function of attacking notions of warfare as heroic (or even tragic), in which death is redeemed by the idea of noble sacrifice.

Since the publication of Paul Fussell's *The Great War and Modern Memory* in 1975, clear historiographical trends have developed in the way that cultural historians and other writers have interpreted the artistic and literary expression of Britain's war experience. Although this pioneering study has been much criticised since the 1990s (the most recent example being that by David Reynolds (377-380), Fussell's insights about the Great War's role in changing literary modes of

expression remain valuable, and even essential, when it comes to interpreting the poetry of writers such as Sassoon and Owen. At the same time, it would be too simplistic to suggest that the 1914-18 conflict marked a clean and decisive break in the cultural, intellectual and artistic life of Britain. Charles Sims' painting 'Clio and the Children' is a curious example of how the war changed an artist's understanding of the meaning of history, but this was expressed through adapting traditional artistic forms of expression (in this case, by literally altering a painting). Although various forms of literary and artistic modernism had taken root before the war, as Jay Winter points out, these were not necessarily conducive to expressing or mediating loss, bereavement and consolation at a time of widespread death inflicted by a new type of mass industrial warfare. Yet, at the same time, some of the most important literary texts produced by British writers during the conflict clearly employed a previously absent ironic mode to express what they hoped was a stark realism, coupled with anger and protest, in deliberate opposition to the notion that war was in any way heroic or virtuous. A hundred years after the conflict, the historiography of the war's cultural impact is at a point where it needs to move beyond a crude dichotomy.

References

- Bond B. (1996). British "Anti-War" Writers and Their Critics. [In:] Cecil H., Liddle P., eds., *Facing Armageddon: The First World War Experienced*. London: Pen and Sword, 817-830.
- Bond B. (2002). *The Unquiet Western Front: Britain's Role in Literature and History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Cork R. (1994). *A Bitter Truth: Avant-Garde Art and the Great War*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Fussell P. (1975). *The Great War and Modern Memory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Prior R., Wilson T. (1994). Paul Fussell at War. [In:] *War in History*, vol.1, no.1, 63-80
- Reynolds D. (2013). *The Long Shadow. The Great War and the Twentieth Century*. London: Simon and Schuster.
- Roshwald A., Stites R., eds., (1999). *European Culture in the Great War: The Arts, Entertainment, and Propaganda, 1914-1918*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sassoon S. (1918). *Counter-Attack and Other Poems*. New York: E.P. Dutton.
- Silkin J., ed., (1996). *The Penguin Book of First World War Poetry*. Second edition. London: Penguin.
- Stephen M. (1996). *The Price of Pity: Poetry, History and Myth in the Great War*. London: Leo Cooper.

- Stevens M., ed., (1990). *The Edwardians and After: The Royal Academy 1900-1950*. London: Royal Academy.
- Winter J. (1992). Catastrophe and Culture: Recent Trends in the Historiography of the First World War. [In:] *The Journal of Modern History*, vol. 64, no. 3, 525-532.
- Winter J. (1995). *Sites of Memory, Sites of Mourning: The Great War in European Cultural History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

The Construction of the Nation in the Language of the Eighteenth-Century English Press

Konstrukcja narodu w języku osiemnastowiecznej prasy angielskiej

Summary

The projection of national identity by means of media discourse, in order to influence media audiences, has traditionally been part of the purpose of media. An attempt is made to persuade the public that they belong to a national group, and that therefore they are important as members of that group. This is true whenever the production of media texts is linked to government financing, in whatever century and location we like to study. In times of war, this purpose becomes the main one, as outlets rally round to defend, encourage and construct the concept of nation. We show how eighteenth-century English periodicals conform to this general rule, but also how there appear some dissenting voices. Our examples place special emphasis on *The Annual Register* of 1758 and *The Times* in the early 1790's, both periods when the country was involved in international conflicts, especially with France, during the Seven Years War and the period immediately after the French Revolution.

We will focus our attention on some lexico-syntactic points in detail, as they are used as linguistic devices to enhance national identity and awareness: the use of "we" to denote the nation, metaphors, the passive voice, especially without the agent, nominalization and raising structures.

Keywords: media discourse; eighteenth century; periodicals; lexico-syntactic devices.

1. Introduction

The term "construction" is a highly appropriate one when we are studying eighteenth-century England, whether we are concerned with its politics, economy, industry or in terms of its national identity. It was a country "under construction", and there were vast changes. During the course of the century, English imperial achievements meant they cornered the world markets in raw materials, dominated the seas, and expanded their frontiers. The Act of Union of 1707 meant that the English and Scottish crowns were united, while the industrial and agricultural revolutions radically altered the landscape, with towns growing

into cities, and Enclosure meant that the countryside was divided up in a different way.

Just as nations appear and disappear, grow, merge and are separated, so our awareness of and attitude towards our national identity also change. Also, a sense of national identity is not something we are born with but is formed throughout our lives, and may change radically in the course of time. One important influence on our attitude to national identity is the media to which we are exposed. Eighteenth-century English media included books, pamphlets, satirical cartoons, periodicals and newspapers. There was real debate about issues of the day, both inside and outside parliament and the press, with pamphlets being written against pamphlets, pamphlets against newspapers, journalists writing against other journalists, and so on. However, although pamphlets continued to be written, newspapers and magazines became more and more important as the century progressed.

The media can be exaggerated as an attitude- and opinion-former. People are more sceptical about what they hear and read than they are generally given credit for, and reach their own conclusions by talking to their inner circle of friends and family. In Jeremy Black's words, in the eighteenth century, "[t]he extent to which Britain remained a face-to-face society is often underrated... This face-to-face society was frequently referred to in terms of coffee house discussion ..." (46) Besides which, low literacy levels and the lack of a reliable network of distribution outside the cities hindered access to media texts for the bulk of the population: "In the towns, most readers did not purchase their own newspapers but came to coffee-houses, taverns and barbers, and read them as part of the purchase price and service." (Black, *ibid*) The same author goes on to explain that such contemporary oral debates are difficult to chart, given, for example, the lack of reliable parliamentary reporting, and therefore researchers must rely on the print records remaining, which is what we have done here.

2. The Press and the Nation in Eighteenth-Century England

Reporting in the eighteenth century was a far more uncertain affair than nowadays, and all periodicals admit to the fact. *The Times* of March 26th 1792 tells us: "A report was so *prevalent* on Saturday as to be *very generally believed* ... that news has been *received overland* ... On enquiry, however, we find that *every part of this report is unfounded* ...". Later in the same year, sources are equally vague: "*According to some reports...* The last letters from Spain mention ... *It appears* by the report of M de Montmorin ..." (Nov 9, 1791); "*We have every reason to believe* that the intelligence contained in that letter ... was in every respect true..."

(Nov 10, 1791) The words and expressions I have placed in italics here are hedging devices used to reflect the uncertainty felt by news reporters. News travelled only as fast as the transport system, slow and unsophisticated, would allow it to, before the days of the telegraph in the nineteenth century, and bona fide news was at a premium. The result of this time lag was that rumour and hearsay were rife.

During both the Seven Years' War and in the 1790's, with a situation perceived by most of the governing class as threatening, media discourse became belligerently anti-French. However, there are many examples of non-nationalistic opinion in the periodicals during the century. The Tory press, in particular, saw little or nothing to be gained by imperialistic adventures, especially as they were generally aimed against Catholic France, with whom the Tories had sympathy. And even outside Tory and Jacobite circles, marginalized elements of society saw little point in lining the pockets of the merchants and grandees who benefited most from the wars.

For example, Jonathan Swift, in *Gulliver's Travels*, takes British colonialism to task: "And to set forth the valour of my own dear countrymen, I assured him, that I had seen them blow up a hundred enemies at once in a siege, and as many in a ship, and beheld the dead bodies drop down in pieces from the clouds, to the great diversion of all the spectators." (294) Swift recounts the brutal realities of colonialism, in a literary style very reminiscent of the Catholic periodical *Fog's Weekly*, though he claims, in a rather tongue-in-cheek manner, that he is not referring to British colonialism:

Ships are sent with the first opportunity, the natives driven out or destroyed, their princes tortured to discover their gold; a free licence given to all acts of inhumanity and lust, the earth reeking with the blood of its inhabitants; and this execrable crew of butchers employed in so pious an expedition is a *modern colony* [his italics] sent to convert and civilize an idolatrous and barbarous people. (343)

Even during the 1790's, in the aftermath of the French Revolution, when England was virtually at war with France, there is, curiously, balanced reporting, and a consciousness that events straddle national frontiers. Quotes are lengthy, whoever they are from, and there is little apparent bias or censorship, so there is news from the French National Revolutionary Assembly, published on March 26th 1792, with speeches quoted verbatim in *The Times*. Many outlets were pro-French Revolution. For example, the *New Annual Register*, founded by William Godwin, opposed Edmund Burke's conservative views on the French Revolution, showing how France was only defending itself, surrounded as it was by marauding enemies on all sides: the Prussians, British, Dutch, Austrians, and so on. It argued that France was being pushed into an extreme position, and that if France was

dismembered, other powers would grow more powerful in turn and also become a threat. The *Monthly Review* says likewise that Burke's extreme views actually encouraged revolutionary ideas, and holds high hopes of the Revolution: "... we are justified in forming high expectations... the independence of the Anglo-Americans is the event most suited to hastening the revolution which must restore happiness on earth." The *Analytical Review* drew parallels between it and both the 1688 Glorious Revolution in England and the American Revolution, with the aim being "... that freedom may everywhere flourish, and liberty and happiness be diffused over the whole creation of God." Even *The Annual Register* (*AR*) claims that the French Revolution was largely welcomed in England. Pamphlets argued that though the French Revolution had killed two thousand people, it had "broken the fetters of 25,000,000". (Andrews, 8f, 9, 15f, 17) The same author goes on to state that he has "... identified 65 books or pamphlets directly addressed to Burke's attacks on the French Revolution, of which 55 are hostile. Whatever accolades may have been bestowed on Burke by posterity, he did not sweep the field when challenged by his contemporaries," and that "[i]t was events, rather than pamphlets, that would "ensure the success of Burke's crusade against the ideas of 1789." (*ibid* 57, 29)

It was clear to at least some that the main reason for conservative opposition to the French Revolution was the fear that it might arouse the Catholics and the working classes, against the Protestants and wealthy. Therefore, outlets in favour of the privileged classes used patriotism as a propaganda weapon against anti-war elements. The government also introduced "Gagging Laws" and bought up "libellous" pamphlets with a view to prosecuting them, proving again that in wartime the first victim is freedom for the press. The pro-government press defended this, arguing that subsidies and censorship were essential: "In the present state of Europe, it is as much the duty of those who are entrusted with the government of states to attend to the press as to the army or to the revenue." (*The Anti-Jacobin Review and Magazine*, Vol. 2, Jan/Apr 1799, quoted in Andrews, 102) However, such control could only partially censor the opposition. In this sense, people were more fortunate than today, as most historians would agree that: "...eighteenth century governments ... had little of the apparatus of persuasion, control and coercion which the modern state can wield... (Cannon, 150)

The general tendency of the eighteenth-century English press, though, is towards "patriotism", this word being used throughout the century rather than "nationalism", a word not employed until the mid-nineteenth century, for example: "Such is the effect when power and patriotism unite..." . (*AR* 1758, 7). The stress is on the importance that British unity has in the face of foreign threats,

such as those posed by the French during the Seven Years War and after the French Revolution. A common thread in British media is that of fear of foreign invasion, which has sometimes been real, but often a fabrication.

Building on a longstanding concern with threats from the continent... the British tended to present all their policies in terms of how best to prepare against danger, with the threats expressed in such language as the challenge from an over-mighty monarch or universal monarchy, terms also used in relation to the Spaniards in the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries and to the Dutch in the late seventeenth century. (Black, 26f.)

And, we could add, during the Cold War and the Gulf Wars. (Floyd, 2001) The natural enemy for the English is the French, who are stereotyped as treacherous monsters. For instance *The Universal Museum* (1765, p2 of imprint from London) is typical, just as the Seven Years War was ending:

Proof of French politics and French faith was given us by the famous Count d'Estaing ... whose cruelties to the English at Bencoolen, in the East Indies, marked him for a monster of human kind, and who shewed himself to be a true Frenchman, by afterwards breaking his parole of honour in England ... It is now said the Court of France have finally refused to reimburse any sums of money expended so generously by Great Britain in the cloathing [sic] and maintenance of their prisoners in the late war.

This same periodical claims it is an English virtue to be honest and warlike, as against the French and Spanish characteristics of treachery and cowardice: "An honest and warlike people like the English must inevitably disdain the purchase of peace by the surrender of such acquisitions as are indelible proofs of their superior courage." (*Ibid* 98) "Give them [France and Spain] an inch and they'll take an ell." (*Ibid* 151)

Later in the century, during the 1790's, the French planned to attack Britain, and did actually attempt an invasion, so justifying the anti-French press campaign orchestrated by the government in London. In 1792, Pitt went to war, responding to a French declaration of war on Holland and on "the king of England". So patriotic sentiments were brought to fever pitch. The Revolution was seen by the British monarchy and a large swathe of the upper classes as a threat to their position. The domestic threat to the status quo was a real one. As a result of the French Revolution, there were 36 official petitions for Parliamentary reform, 24 from Scotland, and it is no coincidence that Wolfe Tone's Irish rebellion took place in these years. Thus, the very union of Great Britain was threatened. Steps were taken in the field of opinion forming, with the "Gagging Laws" already mentioned. Also, interestingly, the cap of liberty traditionally worn by Britannia on coins and in other symbols and images, could be mistaken for its French

revolutionary counterpart, so Britannia was dropped from images by the mid-1790's. (Macleod, 701) By 1793, most satirical artists and publishers were only producing patriotic, pro-British prints.

The Times, a newspaper founded in 1788, displays a typical British attitude to the Revolution in France, showing it as a terrible warning as to what could happen if base human instincts are allowed to act unbridled in England as well. This newspaper unashamedly mixes news and opinion in the same breath:

A tumult has lately taken place at Versailles; but tumults, assassinations and conflagrations are now so frequent, the report of them scarcely makes an impression on the callous hearts of Frenchmen, become ferocious like tygers [sic] in the forest. Miserable France! Thou art indeed plunged and plunging still deeper into an abyss of misery, from which nothing but providence can extricate thee! An awful lesson to surrounding nations. (Nov 7, 1791)

Religion, largely absent from public debate, was called on to rally support for the status quo and a weapon to hit Revolutionary sympathisers with. The pro-government media attacked atheism as they had never done before. Such is the extent to which it has made Britain more conservative. Of course, the *Anti-Jacobin Review and Magazine* was at the forefront of these attacks: "... this truly diabolical effort to corrupt the minds of the rising generation, to make them imbibe, with their very milk, as it were, the poison of atheism and disaffection, and so to contaminate the very source of social order and social happiness." (Vol 2, Jan/Apr 1799, quoted in Andrews, 108)

3. Linguistic Devices and National Identity

Eighteenth-century periodicals and newspapers reflects the attitudes of an elite, a literate and moneyed upper classes. Journalists primarily served this class, as did architects, soldiers and politicians, and news is almost all about elites (aldermen, mayors, dukes, ambassadors, etc.). Their language reflects this relationship of power existing in society at the time. But language also shapes reality. Sorensen claims that language helps to establish power relationships: "Grammar claims to mirror but in fact establishes power relationships between speakers of various regional, classed and gendered languages." (2005: 13) She claims that: "... the standard language figured centrally in the national subject's ability to imagine him or herself as a member of a national community." (*ibid*) and that: "A common dominant language ... divides populations into linguistic "haves and have nots." (19) We will show in some detail the devices used to mark off differences between national groups.

The eighteenth-century press simply assumes the partisan nature of its audience, but does not usually feed patriotism, presumably because the class of people who read its accounts would have needed no prodding in that direction. The linguistic devices used in the late twentieth and twenty-first century press are much more subtle, as people perhaps need to be convinced by sophisticated language of the need for military conflict, which has become rarer than it was two centuries before.

Labels and adjectives, ascribing people to certain categories with in-born characteristics, are present then as now. In the eighteenth-century English press, nations are characterized variously as innately treacherous (American Indians, the French and sometimes the Scots, depending on the outlet), or valiant and freedom-loving (the Germans and English), and so on. One very widely-used linguistic device, used to great effect in the media, is "we", "us" and "our". "We" can be used *exclusively*, to refer to the outlet as an institution, as in this example: "We are well persuaded that ... A fact has come within our knowledge..." (*The Times* Dec 5 1792, 2), where "we" can only be the writer(s) and by extension the newspaper they write in. But there is also a manipulative use of "we", when it is used *inclusively* (to include the reader and the nation), one purpose of which is to persuade the audience that they are part of a national in-group that it is in their interests to maintain. As an example: "Our government will shew [sic] Europe the example, ... If our countrymen are to lose their birthright, it will only be after defending it with the last drop of their blood. The French will find us a very different set of people from those they have lately been accustomed to deal with." (*ibid*) Again, *AR*: "... there is no doubt that we employed a greater number of men against Quebec." (35)

Periodicals are full of metaphors, which both distance readers from the cruel realities of conflict and make nations appear as indivisible units. We give here only a small sample: *AR* uses metaphors of play for war, as in (4): "...the Austrians did not play, with sufficient spirit, the great game which was in their hands"; then of impersonal torrents of men, as if they were water: "Nothing seemed able to withstand the rapid torrent with which the French overran the whole country." (16) Nations are described metaphorically, even metonymically, as persons, generally feminine: "Holland preserved her neutrality ... divided in her councils..."; (5) "the success which France had in Germany was not at all proportioned to the prodigious efforts which she made"; (7) while England "when she turned all her power to her land forces... never did she cover the seas with such formidable fleets... when a nation sits under the shade of abilities which she has tried...". The language of *AR* has a lot in common with diplomatic language, in that the common people are impersonalized or completely absent: from the first

page, the author speaks in terms of “the powers”, “all parties”, “the player of the skillful [sic] game”, “Europe”, “all sides”.

Whole armies are personified in their generals, using the device of synecdoche, the soldiers themselves being unnamed pawns in the game: “D’Armentières advanced against Munster; he attempted to take the place...” (*AR*, 16). On the other hand, whole nations are lumped together in their armies: “The Austrians ... the French ... the Prussians ... the Swedes ... Saxony could no longer yield such supplies as formerly” (*AR*, 16), even though it was not all of them, just their armies or leaders. The names of countries are used metonymically to represent the whole entity: “France perceived that the strength of the English ...” (*AR*, 5)

Moving on to syntax, many structures are used that hide the identity of the actor or agent. We will consider some of them here. The use of the passive voice, especially when the agent is absent, is so widespread as to be the unmarked form in many media texts. Instead of: “We attacked the port and took no prisoners”, it is more frequent to find: “The town was attacked and no prisoners were taken.” The ideological implication is often that of removing blame for some action in the course of conflicts. But, perhaps because armed actions needed little justification in the eighteenth century in the eyes of the typical newspaper or magazine reader, there is proportionally less use of the passive voice than in the late twentieth or early twenty-first century. So active utterances of this type: “... there is no doubt that we employed a greater number of men against Quebec” (*AR*, 35) are very common. In a report about a British invasion of a Caribbean island (*AR*, 15) the periodical says in very plain language that it was: “...defended by men who fought for everything that was dear to them...It must not be omitted that many of the inhabitants exerted themselves very gallantly in the defence of their country.”

The passive voice is of course widely used, as in *AR* (2): “In the treaty of Aix la Chapelle it had been agreed that ... should be restored ...” However, the account is far more upfront and fairer than many in the twentieth century: attack is called attack and defence is called defence. One very common passive form in our texts, on the other hand, is the use of “It is thought”, “It is believed”, and so on, as in the following report from France: “It is suspected that many persons of the first consequence are concerned in the forgery ...above 30 people are already taken up on suspicion... It is asserted that some persons high in office were the Prime Movers in this execrable plan.” (*The Times*, March 21, 1792) And “It is hoped” in the following extract about the slave trade: “It is hoped that after being dignified by the freedom of that respectable town, they will have no problem in proceeding to Sierra Leone ...” (*The Times*, March 31, 1792)

Nominalization is the substitution of a verb group by a noun group. It has the effect of deadening the action, making it a lifeless thing. Two typical examples are "war" and "death". Their use makes them appear simple events without agents: "a victim of war", "the death of Kennedy", and so on. So: "...the calamities of that war..." "His death appeared inevitable ... the King of Spain's death hath since happened..." (*AR*, 2) An eighteenth-century journalist could have written: "When we [the British] took Niagara, we effectively stopped the French communicating between Canada and Louisiana which we dreaded." But *AR* prefers to use nominalization (34): "The *taking* of Niagara broke off effectually the *communication*, so much dreaded, between Canada and Louisiana." [my italics] This device is so frequent it is hard to turn a page without it rearing its head; the use of the noun in place of the corresponding verb form has a double effect, in that it both drains vitality from the action, removes blame from violent actions, and shields the sensitivity of the reader.

Some examples from our corpus include the following, with the nominalized form in my italics: "*Revenge* embittered by the *blows* which all had felt in their turns ... the *blows* which each had felt ... *expenses* that fell upon all ... a *peace* at that time ... the *hopes* arising ... the last *campaign* ... the *accession* of Don Carlos to the crown of Spain..." (*AR*, 2) "... in the midst of the devouring *waste* of such an expensive war..." (*Ibid* 3) "the reduction of Niagara ... the great and central operation ... as this was to be the decisive stroke." (*Ibid* 35) It seems events just happen without agents: revenge is taken without avengers, blows are felt without there being aggressors, expenses fall without being imposed, peace breaks out on its own, hopes are felt without hopes, campaigns are waged without armies, accessions just occur and waste occurs without wasters! The following extract combines use of the nominalizations "riots", "bloodshed" with the raising verb "appear", this time in its nominalized form: "[We have] read several letters from the ex-Minister M. Cahier de Gerville, containing information of riots and bloodshed ... there is the most alarming appearance of a general insurrection." (*The Times* March 31, 1792, 3) We will now go on to refer to this latter form.

The use of so-called "raising structures", which beg the question about who or whom constitute(s) the grammatical indirect object of the verb, was and is a manipulative device, whether consciously or unconsciously employed. The most frequent device is "seem" or "appear", where the person to whom something "seems" or "appears" is unnamed, but is usually meant to be understood as forming part of the in-group or "we", whether national or institutional. This can also of course be a hedging device, without any obvious ideological content, as sure and certain knowledge of events was seldom available. Reports also included more "seems" and "appears" and "it is reported" at that time, because journalists relied,

not on correspondents, but on couriers, rumours, and other newspapers from England and the Continent, which were plagiarized unashamedly. Examples from the period are not lacking: "It *appears* from the last report of the Committee for the sale of eastern Lands in America, that there have been sold ..." (*The Times* March 31st 1792, 3), while news from the French National Assembly is given as follows: "Three different departments *seem* to have been designed by the enemies of the Constitution ..." (*Ibid*, 4)

The word "need" has in common with raising structures that it also hides an essential element of the action. In "It was necessary to possess it [an island] in order to act against the town" (*AR*, 35), we could ask the question "Necessary for whom?" but only a critical reader will do so.

4. Conclusion

We have shown how press discourse regarding the nation in eighteenth century England was not composed of a single voice, but many, with real debate occurring. Although the majority of the upper classes supported the mainstream discourse that attempted to convince readers that they were part of an all-embracing national whole, there existed some freedom to express dissenting opinions.

We have seen that press discourse in Britain was often couched in defensive terms, though Britain was far from on the defensive, but was in fact intervening on a world-wide scale. But then, it is hard to write a narrative describing armed conflict without using value judgments, and the eighteenth century is no exception.

It was thought by the upper classes that there was a need to unify the nation, especially in wartime, though less than nowadays, because wars were more frequent and were seen to occur naturally. One magazine even uses the expression "last war", as naturally as we could say "last Thursday"! The French were perceived as Britain's natural enemy worldwide, for example in the Seven Years' War (1756-63). Later in the century, the British press recognised the importance of the French Revolution (1789), but it was often viewed negatively, partly because of the impact it might, and indeed did, have on national unity. It is no coincidence that the Irish uprising took place in 1798, led by Wolfe Tone.

In order to construct this unity of Great Britain, journalists used several lexico-syntactic devices, especially the use of the national "we", the passive voice, especially the agentless passive, several kinds of metaphorical language, nominalization and raising structures. Lexical items and syntax have an effect on

the meaning and impact of media messages, and as we have seen, how we say something is just as important as the factual content.

Primary sources

The Times (London, England) 1791 – 1799. British Library. Accessed through Southampton University Gale Collection (CENGAGE Learning). 17th and 18th Century Burney Collection Newspapers.

The Annual Register Vol. 1 Dec 1758:Accessed July 22nd 2008 <http://www.bodley.ox.ac.uk/cgi-bin/ilej/image1.pl?item=page&seq=3&size=1&id=ar.1758.x.x.1.x.x.u3>

The Universal Museum or the Entertaining Repository for Gentlemen and Ladies (1765 collection)

References

Andrews, Stuart (2000). *The British Periodical Press and the French Revolution, 1789-99* Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave.

Black, Jeremy (2011). *Debating Foreign Policy in Eighteenth Century Britain* Farnham, Surrey, UK: Ashgate Publishing Ltd.

Cannon, John (1987). *Aristocratic Century: The Peerage of Eighteenth-Century England*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Floyd, Alan (2001). *La Prensa Británica y la Crisis del Golfo Pérsico* A Coruña, Spain, Servizo de Publicacións, Universidade da Coruña (based on unpublished doctoral thesis in English, deposited in University of A Coruña).

Haig, Robert L. (1960). *The Gazetteer 1735-1797: A Study in the Eighteenth-Century English Newspaper*. Carbondale: Continental Editions, Southern Illinois University Press

Macleod, Emma Vincent (2007). “British Attitudes to the French Revolution” *The Historical Journal*, 50, 3, pp. 689–709.

Sorensen, Janet (2005). *The Grammar of Empire in Eighteenth-Century British Writing* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Swift, Jonathan *Gulliver's Travels* (1726). 1981 edition Penguin English Library Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England.

Część 2
Part 2

**KONSTRUKCJE TEKSTU
TEXTUAL CONSTRUCTIONS**

Reframing in Translation in Political Context

Przeformułowanie w tłumaczeniu w kontekście politycznym

Summary

Ideological shifts in translation stem from the fact that both the author of the original and the party involved in the translation process represent two distinct worlds and histories of experience of the world around. Different narratives we are exposed to lead us to perceive the world in specific ways, and these ways influence translation choices even if subconsciously. Promoting narratives facilitates the selection of vocabulary in translation as well as textual and paratextual features. These choices impact on the way the message is framed in the target text, which more often than not will sound differently. Therefore, the way a translator epitomises the original message will influence the reader's perception and memory of it, and this in turn may influence their perception and memory of the object described. Thus, translation as a communication act is politically, ideologically and culturally motivated, thanks to which translation presents itself as a subject which is easy to be manipulated. The sensitivity towards these issues should make an important part of translator training as well as their professional self-development.

Keywords: culture, framing, ideology, inter-cultural communication, manipulation, memory, political discourse, narrative, paratext, translation

Introduction

This paper presents an analysis of Akbar Ganji's open letter to UN Secretary General Ban Ki-moon dated 23 June 2009 (source text) and its translation into Polish (target text) produced by Robert Stefanicki. The original English text appeared on *The Guardian* website on 12 August 2009¹ (The Guardian website). In his letter, Ganji expresses his dissatisfaction with the presidential election in Iran and seeks the UN's assistance in tackling the issue. The letter was signed by over two hundred academics, dissidents and activists from around the world. One of the dissidents who signed the letter was Adam Michnik, Editor-in-Chief of *The Gazeta Wyborcza* [The Electoral Gazette], the only Polish newspaper which

¹ guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2009/aug/12/iran-ban-ki-moon-protest

published the Polish version of the letter on its website on 9 July 2009² (Gazeta Wyborcza website). Although the Polish version preceded the English original, the date of the publication in this case is not the date on which the letter was produced. The two language versions of the letter, Polish and English, date back to 23 June 2009, which is the official date the letter was drafted. Thus, on these grounds it is possible to assume that the English text pre-existed the Polish translation and is in fact the source text.

Passing on information has always played an important part in society ever since the first instances of human communication took place. Whether directly between a communicator and an addressee, or through a messenger, this process has always been politically and ideologically meaningful and an easy target to be manipulated to one's own ends. The same message looks different when presented by different people using it to promote their own agendas, as is typically the case as every human applies their own views of the world to the messages they hear. These views in turn have been shaped through different experiences, exposure to different circumstances in life and being influenced by different people in a social context where communication is a prerequisite.

The linguistic skills along with cultural sensitivity provide for a syntactically, semantically and culturally successful inter-cultural communication and exchange of ideas, thus enabling the target society to progress further. The cultural expertise is deemed to play an equal role in inter-social communication as often the language and cultural systems that translation embraces are distinct and mere substitution of words in one language with words in another is less than satisfactory. Therefore, a certain level of extra-linguistic awareness of the source culture is required in order to understand and transfer an author's concepts into the target reality. Consequently, this area is most prone to suffer ideological manipulation in translation as cultural sensitivity levels will vary from translator to translator.

Such manipulation may at its simplest show through a target text having a tendency to frame the source text differently through adopting different narratives and framing devices. Translation, being a communication act, is essentially a communication event which happens between at least two distinct parties with the help of a third – agent (translator). Whenever two people are involved, two different worlds meet which are set in different realities, with

² wyborcza.pl/1,76842,6805321,List_Akbara_Gandziego__iranskiego_dziennikarza_i_dysydenta_.html

different experience, backgrounds, views and culture. It comes as no surprise then that one of the most easily manipulated channels of communication is the media. In politics, media are regarded as one of the most potent sources of power through which messages help reinforce or demise whole systems. Therefore translating such messages also comes with a fair dose of responsibility because dealing with such texts as a translator is as ethical as it is a linguistic exercise.

Theoretical framework:

Every human being experiences their life in their own unique way, goes through unique developmental stages, is exposed to unique physical and emotional sensations, is led to believe different ideas and follow numerous concepts. Hence, a human being shapes their own identity based on how they read and interpret everything that happens around them and to them. Through this their own stories of life (narratives) are created. The stories are affected by the story-tellers we listen to. They, on the other hand, follow their own agenda when they choose which stories to tell and which tools to apply to present them so that we could believe them (framing). Whether the stories are told orally or in the form of a written text will also influence the selection of extra elements which accompany and illustrate a given story (paratext) making it more or less credible, attractive and plausible.

Narrative theory has been extensively elaborated in translation studies by such scholars as Baker (2006). She applies it after, among others, Fisher (1987), Somers (1992, 1994) and White (1987) who adopted it from sociology and communication studies. Briefly, narratives are stories which we tell and which orient our lives providing us with motivation for our actions and ideology to justify them. Thinking and reasoning processes and capacity of the human brain equip us to shape our own identity and personality against the background of social and professional settings we come to exist and act in. Thus it is the stories which we are exposed to that create us as sociological being.

The sources of stories in our life are manifold: individual/personal, family, professional, institutional, social, etc. The list is endless and depends upon the many roles that we adopt at a particular time in our lives. The stories which come to play a role in our life in one way or another may extend far beyond the most immediate surrounding and reach the most remote corners of society or even the world. The way various events shape our lives will depend upon which settings we define as significant to our reality. The facts we choose to accept or

disapprove of directly or indirectly contribute to the selection of what we come to believe, assume and adopt. The narratives are divided into four categories: personal, public, conceptual and metanarratives. For the analysis here the conceptual narrative seems irrelevant and will not make the focus of the paper.

Broadly, narratives can be said to be stories we decide to believe in, hence we use them to promote ourselves, and which we come to contest in disapproval. Nevertheless, they are also subject to construction, because someone somewhere came up with the idea to turn an event, or a series of events for that matter, into a story and passed it onto others. In so doing they had to make a selection which event(s) to retell, which to omit, whether to include all details or only some, and which ones, in order to achieve a specific effect of the story. Goffman (1986) calls this technique *framing*. In short, the author of a story decides which elements a given narrative will contain within its picture frame. Some elements may be foregrounded whereas others put in the shade, yet others will be omitted altogether. Such strategies are used to promote a particular agenda of the storyteller. The way a message in a text is framed may be very subtle and superficially undetectable, which may lead to a translator overlooking some delicate cultural issues the author of the original decided to deal with at a deeper level. Therefore, cultural awareness and sensitivity towards how languages manipulate their syntax, semantics and pragmatics proves indispensable in translator training as well as self-development.

The final aspect under consideration in this paper is paratext (Genette, 1997) understood as those elements outside the immediate body of text which illustrate, accompany, reinforce, add or otherwise comment extratextually on what that text itself states. Some most obvious examples of paratext are headlines, subheadlines, introductions, blurbs, footnotes, pictures relating to the content of the text, photos of the author or other people, etc. Such paratextual elements add to the overall feel, style and effect of a text. The general result of paratext may be modified through adopting specific font styles and sizes, selecting photos of places and people taking certain poses to express particular feelings, ideas, choosing meaningful words for titles, headlines, etc. to indicate and lead a reader into a specific way of understanding a text. It should be noted, however, that a translator very often has little or no influence on paratext, yet its role in framing the message of a text for a specific kind of a reader cannot be undervalued.

Photos and Headlines

The two paratextual elements which deserve highlighting here are the headlines and photos used in the original and target texts. The headlines the two versions address the reader in two different ways. The dissimilarity seems to stem from the different ways people are addressed in the two language realities. The English version seems to rely more on the understatement whereby the message 'Dear Mr Ban, heed the Iranian people', being a direct quote from the letter, suggests that the British reader will be able to understand the message behind the text. The hidden appeal presented in the form of a letter opening offers an indirect picture of problems in Iran. The directness of the address adds to its dynamic character and proves to attract attention more effectively. On the other hand, the Polish headline (Letter of Akbar Ganji, Iranian journalist and dissident, to the UN secretary general Ban Ki-moon) takes a more formal preaching-teaching tone. The difference in the style of headlining seems culturally grounded. The Polish paper adopted an approach closer to the Polish reader being usually told straightforwardly what the message is. Unlike the Polish reader, the British reader is asked to arrive at an interpretation in a more camouflaged way which requires a certain degree of meaning decoding (see Table 1 below). It is only in the subheadline that the English version attempts to explain the problem of the letter in slightly more detail; yet, still not giving away as much information as the Polish version.

In a similar vein, the photos seem to support the same conceptual framework as the headlines. The picture in the English text is less imposing and more neutral emotionally in contrast to the Polish one, significantly larger and displaying a photo of Ganji in an emotionally loaded pose which sends a message that what he is saying in the letter is important. It seems that the newspaper took a stance that the Polish reader requires to be shocked and astounded in order to make a decision whether to read an article in a newspaper, therefore a strong visual paratextual cue.

TABLE 1. Headlines and photos of Akbar Ganji accompanying the two language versions of the letter

The Guardian

Dear Mr Ban, heed the Iranian people

More than 200 intellectuals, activists and defenders of rights appeal to the secretary general of the UN to take action on Iran



Akbar Ganji

guardian.co.uk, Wednesday 12 August 2009 11.45 BST

[Article history](#)

The Gazeta Wyborcza

List Akbara Gandżiego, irańskiego dziennikarza i dysydenta, do sekretarza generalnego ONZ Ban Ki-moona

[Letter of Akbar Ganji, Iranian journalist and dissident, to the UN secretary general Ban Ki-moon]

tlum. Robert Stefanicki

2009-07-09, ostatnia aktualizacja 2009-07-09 15:48



Akbar Gandżi w 2000 roku

Fot. Hasan Sarbakhshian / AP

Text – Framing through Relabeling

As for the framing, or rather reframing, in the translation of Ganji's letter I would like to propose two approaches. The first concerns framing through relabeling, i.e. the way Ganji labelled the institutions in Iran in his letter and how they were relabelled in the Polish translation. The institutions Ganji mentions are both formal and constitutional and define Iran as a state. The second approach is reframing through repositioning of participants. Ganji draws a very specific picture of the conflict in Iran in which he posits three potential participants in a particular way: the government, the Supreme Leader and the people of Iran. The Polish renditions lead to stimulating conclusions on the translation choices made, i.e. the Polish version seems to reframe those institutions in a manner that affords them slightly different positions in the constitutional system of Iran.

Firstly, a few facts may shed some light onto several motives behind linguistic choices in the Polish translation. For instance, the word *Islam* and all its derivative forms appear thirteen times in the English version, whereas the Polish texts contains only five such uses. One can remember only too well when several years ago any word resembling or pertaining to Islam in any way was strictly camouflaged or avoided altogether in western countries. Nowadays, however, newspapers and media in general are no longer afraid to use it. Due to an influential international campaign (in English and other major languages) of the Islamic world trying to disassociate Islam from terrorism, it is possible to think that, unlike the Polish reader, English speakers are now more accustomed to discussing Islamic matters openly. The Islamic seems to evoke constantly negative connotations in most Polish speaking circles, media included, and thus avoiding direct references to it is commonly regarded as a justified means to reduce the possibility of an overtly emotional response from readers.

The issue above is also meaningful for another reason; namely, a more limited use of the word Islam in all its forms creates a tangible effect in the Polish text. That effect seems to flatten the overall ideological structure of Ganji's message. Table 2 displays several examples of linguistic choices which replace the Islamic in the Polish text. Each numbered row in the table contains original text from Ganji's letter at the top, followed by a target text translation and then accompanied with a gloss in italics to illustrate the actual meaning of the Polish rendition.

TABLE 2. First line in each box is original text from Ganji's letter, followed by a target text translation and then accompanied with a gloss in italics to illustrate the actual meaning of the Polish rendition

1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Article 110 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Iran (...) • Artykuł 110 irańskiej konstytucji (...) • <i>Article 100 of the Iranian Constitution (...)</i>
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • According to Article 98 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Iran (...) • Według art. 98 ustawy zasadniczej (...) • <i>According to article 98 of the Fundamental Act (...)</i>
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The people of Iran only have a say in voting for the presidency, the Islamic Consultative Assembly (Majles), and local councils. • Naród Iranu może wybierać tylko prezydenta, parlament (Madżlis) i rady lokalne. • <i>The nation of Iran can only elect the president, Parliament (Majles), and local councils.</i>
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (...) the power of the Supreme Leader is not limited by the letter of Constitution, rendering the powers of the rahbar of the Islamic Republic virtually limitless. • (...) konstytucja nie ogranicza władzy Rahbara i przyznaje mu praktycznie nieograniczoną władzę. • <i>the Constitution does not limit the Supreme Leader's power and renders him practically limitless powers.</i>
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (...) the Supreme Leader of the Islamic Republic publically divulged that the one candidate who came closest to his own personal views was Mahmoud Ahmadinejad. • (...) Najwyższy Przywódca publicznie ujawnił, że kandydatem najbliższym jego poglądom jest Mahmud Ahmadineżad. • <i>the Supreme Leader publically divulged that the candidate closest to his views was Mahmoud Ahmadinejad.</i>
6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (...) had previously been top official positions in the Islamic Republic (...) • (...) zajmował wysokie stanowisko we władzach (...) • <i>had been in a top official position within the Authorities (...)</i>
7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (...) the government of the Islamic Republic has faced off these peaceful and civil protests harshly, (...) • (...) te pokojowe i obywatelskie protesty rząd Iranu potraktował brutalnie. • <i>the government of Iran treated those peaceful citizens' protests brutally.</i>
8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pressuring the government of the Islamic Republic to free the media that have been banned (...) • Wywarcie nacisku na rząd Iranu, aby uwolnił media (...) • <i>Putting pressure on the government of Iran to release media (...)</i>
9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pressuring the government of the Islamic Republic to stop its harsh and barbaric treatment of the people of Iran (...) • Wywarcie nacisku na rząd Iranu, by zaprzestał brutalnego i barbarzyńskiego traktowania swoich obywateli. • <i>Putting pressure on the government of Iran to cease brutal and barbarian treatment of its citizens.</i>

Ganji chose to label Iran’s public institutions in a way that positions them within ‘the Islamic Republic (of Iran)’ and not in Iran, unlike the Polish version. This is significant as it builds a frame whereby the state of Iran consists in its public bodies, or else the public bodies operate within state structures, as opposed to the society. In the letter, every reference to a public entity is accompanied by the expression ‘of the Islamic Republic of Iran’ or ‘of the Islamic Republic’; a rhetorical device which has been omitted entirely in the target text. Those expressions in the English version add to the narrative which Ganji attempted to disseminate; namely, the public bodies have been created by and for the state and therefore belong to it. The Polish text, through failure to apply the same framing device, is unsuccessful in recreating the same effect. It mislabels the participants as placed in ‘Iran’ rather than in ‘the Islamic Republic (of Iran)’, which will also be meaningful in the following section.

Text – Framing through Repositioning of Participants

The second framing device concerns repositioning of the participants in the event as mentioned in the letter: the government, the Supreme Leader and the people of Iran. The issues here relate to the use of specific English prepositions to indicate the relationship between the theme and rheme of each bolded expression (see Table 3 for specific examples). The prepositions concerned here are ‘in’ and ‘of’, and their systematic application positions the participants within different structures of Iran.

TABLE 3. Repositioning of Participants

1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pressuring the government in Iran to annul fraudulent election results • Wywarcie nacisku na rząd Iranu, aby anulował fałszywe wyniki wyborów • <i>Putting pressure on the government of Iran to nullify the false election results</i>
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pressuring the government of the Islamic Republic to stop its harsh and barbaric treatment of the people of Iran • Wywarcie nacisku na rząd Iranu, by zaprzestał brutalnego i barbarzyńskiego traktowania swoich obywateli. • <i>Putting pressure on the government of Iran to cease brutal and barbarian treatment of its citizens.</i>
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (...) rendering the powers of the rahbar of the Islamic Republic virtually limitless. • (...) przyznaje mu praktycznie nieograniczoną władzę. • (...) <i>renders him practically limitless powers.</i>

4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (...) the Supreme Leader of the Islamic Republic publically divulged that (...) • (...) Najwyższy Przywódca publicznie ujawnił, że (...) • (...) <i>the Supreme Leader publically divulged that (...)</i>
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (...) the government of the Islamic Republic has faced off these peaceful and civil protests harshly (...) • (...) te pokojowe i obywatelskie protesty rząd Iranu potraktował brutalnie (...) • (...) <i>the government of Iran treated those peaceful citizens' protests brutally (...)</i>
6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The people of Iran only have a say in voting for the presidency, the Islamic Consultative Assembly (Majles), and local councils. • Naród Iranu może wybierać tylko prezydenta, parlament (Madżlis) i rady lokalne. • <i>The nation of Iran can only elect the president, Parliament (Majles), and local councils.</i>
7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We (...) beseech you to heed the widespread protests of the Iranian people (...) • My (...) wzywamy Pana do dostrzeżenia masowych protestów narodu irańskiego (...) • <i>We (...) beseech you to take notice of mass protests of the Iranian nation (...)</i>

Firstly, as is common practice in English, to indicate one inanimate object possessing another inanimate object the preposition 'of' is preferred rather than the Saxon genitive ('s). Ganji overrode this trend in the English language by substituting this preposition with 'in' in several instances; all to a specific final rhetoric effect of his letter (Table 3). The idea seems successful as the image he managed to create shows where his loyalties lie. He consistently used 'of' when he intended to show that a participant belonged to a particular rheme and 'in' to indicate a mere location of a participant within Iran's structure.

When referring to public bodies, Ganji chose to use 'of' only when he meant to express that they belonged to 'the Islamic Republic (of Iran)', but not to 'Iran'. On the other hand, when the word 'Iran' was used in the company of some public body, the preposition 'in' appeared, suggesting that body was merely placed in Iran, but did not constitute a real Iran. Similarly, when he referred to the society and 'Iran', he wrote 'the people of Iran' and not of 'the people of the Islamic Republic (of Iran)'. This strategy proves beyond doubt that for Ganji Iran is a dual country consisting of two opposing forces: the state and the people, with the latter being acknowledged over the former. The target language version, on the contrary, yet again fails to signify this distinction.

Conclusions

Textual and linguistic manipulation is easy to overlook in discourse analysis; particularly when the message is as subtle as that in Ganji's letter. Insensitivity to such rhetoric strategies as Ganji's may and does lead to loss of meaning in translation; it flattens the original effect or even skips it entirely. One way to overcome this may be through an ability to understand underlying narratives and framing devices which motivate the author of a source text. This can be acquired through meticulous analysis not only of the text itself, but its social, political, historical, spatial, temporal and economic context. Ganji promoted a specific ideological and political agenda in his letter and the rhetorical devices he employed support his point. To discover this we would need to follow his personal context as well as that of Iran.

The decision to publish the Polish translation of Ganji's letter seems justified politically and ideologically. It seems to counterbalance the metanarrative of war on terror by way of refusing to avoid discussing such inconvenient issues as political problems in the Arab world for the sake of not spreading more panic among ordinary people in the non-Arabic parts of the world. Yet full consciousness is called upon when dealing with sensitive texts of this kind and bravery to make the full message transpire rather than only certain elements of it. The relabeling and repositioning of participants are the aspects which have influenced the ideological shift in the translation making the target text less rich linguistically and ideologically. Furthermore, the problems mentioned above may have exerted some impression on how the Polish reader perceived Iran, its people and problems in a way which requires further research into intercultural memory studies.

References

- Baker, Mona (2006). *Translation and Conflict: a Narrative Account*, London and New York: Routledge.
- Fisher, Walter R (1987). *Human Communication as Narration: Toward a Philosophy of Reason, Value, and Action*, Columbia: University of South Carolina Press.
- Genette, Gérard (1997). *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Goffman, Erving (1986). *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organisation of Experience*, Boston: Northeastern University Press.
- Somers, Margaret (1992). 'Narrativity, Narrative Identity, and Social Action: Rethinking English Working-Class Formation', *Social Science History* 16(4): 592-630.

Somers, Margaret R and Gloria D. Gibson (1994). 'Reclaiming the Epistemological "Other": Narrative and the Social Constitution of Identity', in Craig Calhoun (ed.) (1994) *Social Theory and the Politics of Identity*, Oxford: Blackwell.

White, Hayden (1987). *The Content of the Form: Narrative Discourse and Historical Representation*, Baltimore MD and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Gazeta Wyborcza website: wyborcza.pl/1,76842,6805321,List_Akbara_Gandziego_iranskiego_dziennikarza_i_dysyde4nta_.html [last accessed 15 March 2010].

The Guardian website: guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2009/aug/12/iran-ban-ki-moon-protest [last accessed 15 March 2014].

Texting, Pidgin and Creole Languages: A Comparative Note on the Appearance of Peripheral Communicative Constructions

Wiadomości tekstowe, język pidżynowy i kreolski: nota porównawcza na temat pojawienia się peryferalnych konstrukcji komunikacyjnych

Summary

This article carries out a comparative analysis of texting language and Pidgin and Creole varieties. They are certainly two distant linguist realities, but they show certain points of connection which allow us to establish various analogies and to propose new perspectives from which to address their study. As a case in point, both texting language and Pidgin and Creole varieties have emerged in response to the communicative restrictions of the context in which they have been practiced. As a result of such restrictions, both texting language and Pidgin and Creole varieties have adopted similar linguistic solutions. All of them represent alternative modes of interaction and, due to the somehow “peripheral” position they occupy, they have not received the academic attention they deserve. What is more, existing studies on these varieties have tended to offer analyses in which these realities are compared to the languages or varieties they come from. Hardly ever have studies focused on their specificities, specificities that deserve recognition in their own right. Contrarily, this study intends to focus on the particularities of the aforementioned varieties and the points of continuity that exist amongst them, vindicating this praxis as a means to achieve a better understanding of language.

Keywords: Languages, Texting, Pidgin, Creole, Communication

1. Linguistic diversity and the construction of communicative modes

Linguistic diversity is a phenomenon that has received the attention of many researchers, not only linguists. It has been, and continues, to be analysed from multiple perspectives: technological, sociological, historical and commercial, amongst others. From a strictly philological approach, it is worth mentioning David Crystal’s work, especially *Language Death* (2000); Tove Skutnabb-Kangas’

more recent books *Linguistic Genocide in Education - or Worldwide Diversity and Human Rights?* (2008), *Multilingual Education Works: from the Periphery to the Centre* (2010); and Robert Phillipson's *Linguistic Imperialism continued* (2010). Within the Iberian context, we should also pay attention to Carme Junyent and Cristina Muncunill's works, in particular *El libro de las lenguas* (2010), as well as to Teresa Moure's *Ecolingüística. Entre a ciencia e a ética* (2011). In their respective works, these scholars have explored various contexts where multilingualism exists, contexts where certain languages have more power than others, and contexts where certain imperialist policies have been stifling those languages with fewer possibilities. Almost ubiquitous to all these works is the idea that all languages are important and that all of them enrich us. Consequently, the death of a language implies a loss not only to the community that speaks it, but also to the whole humanity.

Unfortunately, the death of languages and processes of linguistic assimilation continue to occur in our contemporaneity. However, in the course of history, speakers have also developed new linguistic forms through which to interact at a given moment or in a given context. In fact, we have observed that, despite the potential communicative restrictions they might face, people from all over the world have been developing various solutions and/or linguistic alternatives. Despite being relatively different, these solutions and alternatives seem to walk in a similar direction. In this respect, we can easily establish analogies between texting language and Pidgin or Creole varieties. For, in spite of being different linguistic realities, all of them bear witness to the different strategies developed by certain users in order to adapt themselves to new communicative circumstances. Furthermore, in all these cases we are dealing with peripheral or alternative linguistic practices, meaning that they are outside what is traditionally considered to be regulatory, institutionalized and legitimized use (Cassany *et al.* 2008). These concomitances allow us to build a bridge, and to establish certain points of connection, between the aforementioned varieties, thus favouring discussions that have not as yet been addressed.

2. Texting, Pidgin and Creole languages: a comparative approach

2.1. Nature, linguistic behaviour and social impact

When dealing with texting, Pidgin and Creole languages, we are facing linguistic constructions, i.e. modalities, that have mainly been developed for communicative purposes – where these modalities have an oral-basis (Pidgins and Creoles) or a written-basis (texting language). Pidgins and Creoles are linguistic

varieties that have emerged within specific contexts where two or more languages have been in contact due to social needs. In other words, speakers whose native languages are different develop a “third” language to be able to communicate amongst them. Texting language is a system of graphical representation that users of instant messaging systems have created to communicate within a new writing environment which emulates orality and which presents certain time, space and expressive limitations that hinder the use of the standard written code. SMS language is conditioned by the technological factor, while Pidgins -and later on Creoles- have tended to develop in commercial environments or context of slavery where multi-lingual meetings often occur. Yet, in all these cases speakers have come up with different linguistic strategies that overcome the communication constraints imposed by the particular context in which the exchange takes place, a context originally adverse.

According to Wardhaugh (1992), these linguistic phenomena occupy a marginal position, even though the existence of Pidgins and Creoles is documented since long time ago. Linguistic research on these areas is relatively recent. This does not come as a surprise considering that, for a long time, these communicative systems have been stigmatized: “it was oftenly thought they had little value or intrinsic interest” (Wardhaugh 1992:73)¹. Studies on Pidgins and Creoles have tended to focus on examining the linguistic features that these varieties “allegedly” lack and their speakers have often been treated with disdain and contempt². Without the benefit of hindsight, the similarities to research on electronic speech, and especially on texting language, are certainly significant: research approaches on this linguistic reality are still scarce, particularly in relation to minoritized languages as Galician. Only within English studies, there seems to be something of a “tradition”. Additionally, very often, studies on the topic do not focus on describing the linguistic specificities of texting language, but rather on pointing out the potential deviations of this variety *vis-à-vis* the standard language. And this apocalyptic discourse has an impact on the users, who are considered “language vandals” and responsible for discursive practices that will eventually destroy the language as we know it (Thurlow 2003).

Wardhaugh’s words on Pidgins and Creoles may serve to describe the social perception on texting language:

¹ In a similar vein, Baxter (1996) affirms that, while the linguistic study of these languages goes back to the end of the previous century, its nature is still subject of intense debate, and many fundamental questions are still unanswered.

² In Vasconcellos (1987), for example, these linguistic varieties are referred to as Portuguese dialects and Vasconcellos’ description of these varieties is focused on comparing them to what is considered Standard Portuguese.

These languages are considered, not as creative adaptations, but as degradation; not as systems in itself, but as deviations from other systems. Its origin was explained alluding not to historical and social forces [technological in texting], but as ignorance, indolence and inferiority [of its speakers] (1992:73)

Another feature that connects texting language and Pidgin and Creole varieties is the quickness with which they all emerge. Economic issues and the limitations of the medium on the one hand, and the pressing need of speakers of different languages to communicate amongst them on the other hand have led individuals to set into motion their linguistic creativity in a short period of time and to develop language varieties that are extremely functional. For this reason content becomes, in both cases, much more important than form³. As noted in Pereira (2006), in a situation where mother tongues are not useful and the more functional language –the dominant– is inaccessible and can not be fully acquired, Pidgin speakers usually deploy a reduced vocabulary consisting of some of the most common words used to designate objects, individuals or situations, and they dispense with grammatical words such as articles or prepositions. Thus, the process of pidginization process normally involves some sort of linguistic simplification, such as the reduction of morphology and syntax, as well as the tolerance for-considerable phonological variation or a considerably poor lexical flow. Crystal (2008:37-56) has identified similar scheme for texting: the use of logograms, initialisms, omitted letters and words or nonstandard spellings being some of the most important features. These features might contribute to shortening the message or to making it functional. In other words, texting language, like Pidgins, minimizes grammatical complexity and the result is a structure devoid of ambiguities and redundancies (Baxter 1996).

However, after the initial phase in which these codes prioritize simplification in order to achieve their main objective (that is,-basic interaction), other requirements begin to emerge. Once it becomes the usual language of communication within a multilingual community, Pidgins expands their areas of use and, as a consequence, they have to increase their expressive possibilities. When Pidgin becomes the first language of a new generation of speakers, it is referred to as Creole. Creolization involves, therefore, a series of processes whereby morphology and syntax become more complex, and phonology is regularized. Additionally, the situations in which the language is used are increased, and the speakers develop a stable system that allows them to increase

³ This occurs at least in the early stages, which correspond to the construction of the Pidgin and the initial period of texting, where the need of communicate quickly and the limitation of characters encourage this type of practice (Crystal 2008).

their vocabulary according to their communicative needs⁴. In this way, an initial rudimentary, fragmented and variable code becomes a full linguistic system. In so doing, it allows its native speakers to communicate, not only from a functional point of view (as in its initial stages), but also from a relational and even social perspective, as the rest of world's languages. Similarly, besides developing mechanisms that enable its users to reduce the number of characters and to speed interactions, texting language has quickly begun to create strategies that make it possible to express feelings and other paratextual marks. As a result, this variety has become a rather complex system of written representation which, on many occasions, sacrifices brevity for the sake of expression and eloquence.

2.2. Pidginization and creolization as a metaphor to explain texting language

The Parallelisms that exist between these two linguistic varieties have led many researchers to consider texting language as a sort of Creole that simplifies the characteristics of the dominant language -in this case the standard writing code- to adapt it to a particular context of communication (Rafi 2009). On other occasions, this metaphor of creolization has been used to refer to the electronic discourse in digital interaction systems⁵. Texting, electronic e-mail or chat-rooms, like telegraphs, letters or telephones, do not constitute linguistic systems, but technologies that allow us to transmit messages. However, the medium through which they circulate can greatly affect their linguistic form, as explained by Crystal in the case of English (2008) or Mosquera-Castro in the case of Galician (2012). For this reason, many authors, among them Baron (2000) or Zitz & Stein (2004), understand these discursive modalities as linguistic transmission systems, as well as writing and orality. And it is in this sense that electronic interaction can be said to share many characteristics with those situations of language contact that lead up to the creation of Pidgins and Creoles. Baron (2000) states the following: i) varieties are created unnaturally, i.e. "artificially"; ii) they emerge quickly; iii) they are born as a result of new technological or social circumstances that put in

⁴ Thus, for example, the Tok pising -in its Pidgin stage- lacked almost full of bending in their names, pronouns, verbs and adverbs. However, in its transformation into Creole, the grammatical categories of time became mandatory and also a component for the training of words and certain mechanisms for the stylistic structure of speech were developed, among the most notable aspects (Wardhaugh 1992).

⁵ In Baron's opinion, "classifications, comparisons, analogies, and metaphors are often most useful not for showing identity between two phenomena but for helping us think about one of them in a new way" (2000:256).

contact users of two or more different language codes –in texting orality and writing–; iv) users dominate at least one of those systems; v) the morphological and syntactic components come from both sources, although lexicon comes predominantly from one – orality in texting and the dominant language in Pidgins and Creoles; vi) the tendency to simplify or not to correct the code depending on the linguistic system from which they come; and vii) the wide variety –still in expansion– of uses and users.

There are, however, some differences that we should also consider: texting language, as opposed to Creole, is not a native language, but a system of graphic representation. Similarly, in texting language the linguistic codes involved (writing and orality) are closely related, whereas Creoles are eminently oral and their speakers have different mother tongues. Nevertheless, authors such as Chardenet (2004), Yus (2010) or Crystal (2011), among others, affirm that, although people have mastered writing and speech, it is possible to consider that electronic interaction systems are beginning to create a group of native users who learn this code “as a primary and distinct avenue for creating many types of messages rather than transferring [...] prior assumptions from face-to-face speech or traditional writing” (Baron 2000:258). For this scholar, this transformation is analogous to the change that has occurred with regard to the treatment of texts in recent decades. Thus, at a given point, instead of writing a text by hand and type it later on, users began to type their messages directly on the keyboard of the electronic device. In any case, an approach to electronic language under the metaphor of pidginization can contribute to a better understanding of its hybrid nature (half oral and half written), its quick expansion – not only with regard to its users but also with regard to its uses. Additionally, it will allow us to understand the way in which it was once developed and later on transmitted. Indeed, it is significant that we can establish parallelisms between the universality of both codes: Pidgins and Creoles have their own specific rules, but many of them share a number of similarities that “raise important theoretical issues related the origin that has been attributed to them so far and the human aptitude to language acquisition” (Wardhaugh 1992:77)⁶. When dealing with texting language, we can also detect certain language universals: similar communicative strategies have

⁶ In the same direction, Pereira says that, in addition to the particular socio-historical conditions in which Creoles were developed, there are other common features between all of them: “the same way as the different Creoles developed their grammar, from basic varieties (structurally unstable and with lexical deficit) of a target language (the language speakers want to learn) determines the structural similarities between them, regardless of the languages which have been in its origin”(2006:29).

been observed amongst different languages, no matter the potential geographical and linguistic distance that separates them or the alphabet they might use.

Bearing in mind the aforementioned similarities between texting language on the one hand and Pidgins and Creoles on the other, it is possible to hypothesize about the potential directions that texting language might take in the future. The stigmatization to which many Pidgin languages have been subjected in the course of history – considered poor varieties, poorly spoken languages or even inferior versions of standard codes – has had important consequences for their speakers, as well as for the languages themselves⁷. As a result of these stigmatizations, in many contexts, a process known as descreolization has taken place, i.e. a process of linguistic assimilation whereby the structures of a particular Creole language are substituted for those of the language into which it assimilates (Pereira 2006). In Baron's opinion (2000), electronic speech might eventually undergo a similar process. According to this scholar, electronic speech might end up being replaced by an already existing variety of written or spoken language and disappearing as a linguistic differential code. However, if Creoles become functional for new generations of speakers, they may contrary remain as a communication tool, expand the usage scenarios and even create a standardized variety. Similarly, texting language may maintain its informal character and its lack of standardization, while continuing to be functional for users; or it may also develop a standard variety, retaining its aesthetic and pragmatic codes and regularizing the different solutions that exist for the same linguistic phenomenon. From our point of view, it seems that at least in the near future this new system of writing will keep much of its subversive character, since it was born as an alternative written system and it is a linguistic variety which favours interaction within contexts where neither conventional writing nor traditional speech seem, *a priori*, capable of replacing it.⁸

⁷ Here the analogy could also be transposed to situations of linguistic contact, as occurs in Galicia with regard to the Galician and Spanish languages. Both the minority variety and its speakers are subjected to similar prejudices and stigmas. See Pilar García Negro (2009), Xosé Henrique Costas González (2010) and Carlos Callón (2012), among the most recent.

⁸ For Baron, texting language and, by extension, electronic discourse “fosters a more level playing field and encourages higher self-discourse than either speech or writing. It also provides a venue for communication where initiating a traditional spoken or written message might be socially impossible” (2000:259).

2.3. Texting as a medium to encourage Pidgins and Creoles

The connections that we can draw between Creoles and electronic discourse are multiple. Different authors, including Hinrichs (2004; 2006), have pointed out, quite rightly, the positive influence of digital communication systems and its written codes on the use of Creole languages. Relying on his knowledge about the Jamaican Creole, Hinrichs (2006) considers that digital communication, in as much as it transcends the limitations of traditional writing and in as much as it encourages linguistic experimentation, provides a subversive space for the written manifestation. In so doing, it might also give visibility to some linguistic varieties that do not have written representation or that have a limited written representation.

It is worth noting that, as Mosquera Castro has pointed out (2013a), language samples on the Net and the digital messaging system respond to the users' conscious and intentional linguistic purposes. The usage of Creoles in this media contributes to increasing their prestige in the eyes of public opinion, since it responds to voluntary actions and reflects their expansion to the ICT new language use contexts. Indeed, the electronic medium, and especially the Internet, are set up in most cases as a conducive medium to linguistic normalisation (Crystal 2006 & Patricio-Martín & Martínez-Cortés 2010); and this could perfectly be applied to Creole languages, even to those which do not have a standardized written representation. The following extract, where Hinrichs speaks about the written representation of the Jamaican Creole, allows us to observe certain similarities between this variety and texting language:

No orthographic standard exists for JamC, so that all Creole orthography is basically experimental and mostly based on English [...]. Recent shifts in prestige notwithstanding JamC is still very much an oral language, the first language for most Jamaicans, and primarily the code of informal interaction in Jamaica. Thus, its use in writing is in itself an instance of the stylized use of orality features in writing" (Hinrichs 2006:185).

Having said that, the informality shared by the electronic medium and Creole varieties is not the only factor that explains the popularity of these discursive practices. To begin with, in many cases the usage of Creoles can respond to specific motivations of an expressive nature, as also occurs with regard to texting language: emphasis, loudness or complicity are some of the reasons that motivate the emergence of these codes (Tascón & Abad 2011). Secondly, and as Antaki *et al.* (1996) have pointed out, amongst young generations of speakers the use of Creole also emerges as a sign of identity. For them, it becomes a visible feature – not only from a linguistic point of view – which identifies them as belonging to a particular

community. In this sense, electronic writing has also been understood, at least in its origin, as a symbol of group belonging: "shared text behaviour shows you belong to the same 'gang'" (Crystal 2008:93). Thus, speakers of Pidgins and Creoles see in electronic discourse a medium through which to channel, and make visible, their linguistic identity. In other words, the pressure of digital media make speakers of Pidgin and Creole feel more confident in their use of these varieties and it also reinforces the idea of language as a means of identity transmission.

3. Conclusion

By way of conclusion, it is worth noting two further analogies between texting language and Pidgins and Creoles that might make us think and re-think about these realities. Firstly, both of them have been considered linguistic codes that are not worthy of being taught and even studied. No doubt all languages and linguistic varieties can be learned and taught. But, as Pereira (2006) has sagely pointed out, the question is whether languages – or written systems such as texting – which only have an oral tradition and/or are restricted to specific contexts should have a place within education curricula. As Mosquera Castro (2013b) suggests, texting language constitutes a very profitable tool to learn language, and even literature. Likewise, Creoles are also meaningful and, moreover, they are equally valid as a vehicle for learning different subjects. Secondly, the extent to which the study of these varieties might contribute to the realm of linguistics has often been questioned. Initially, the study of Pidgins and Creoles was often undertaken with curiosity and sometimes with revulsion. Later on, pragmatism began to prevail and dictionaries and vocabularies started to appear. In recent years, scholars have been publishing a "set of isolated notes, data, bibliographic news, theoretical reflections and grammatical analysis which constitute a precious boost to approaching them with new metalinguistic eyes" (Pereira 2006:106).

In certain areas of Linguistics conducting studies on texting language and electronic discourse, especially in previous decades, might mean to occupy a marginal space within the academe. Despite this, some scholars –amongst whom I humbly include myself – have decided to mine this rich vein, encouraged by scientific curiosity as well as by the belief that any linguistic phenomenon, even if it is "secondary" or "peripheral", contributes to a better understanding of language. What is more, the study of such "peripheral" phenomena might help to revise and revisit the dominant linguistic thought. In this respect, I agree with Wardhaugh's words (1992) when he states that, in any case, these realities constitute linguistic varieties of large utility in the lives of those who use them and, just because of

this, they deserve attention. Ultimately, like Pidgins and Creoles, such new codes as texting language bear testimony to the vitality of languages, languages that are able to adapt themselves to new contexts of usage as well as to the communicative needs of their speakers. In addition, by comparing the aforementioned two realities we can observe the persistence of various stereotypes which continue to circulate around certain linguistic phenomena and which hinder the development of linguistic theory.

References

- Antaki, Ch. *et al.* (1996). "Social identities in talk: Speakers' own orientations. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 35 (4). 473-492.
- Baron, N. S. (2000). *Alphabet to email*. Londres e Nova York: Routledge.
- Baxter, A. (1996). "Línguas pidgin e crioulas". Hub Faria, I *et al.* (orgs.): *Introdução à Linguística Geral e Portuguesa*. Lisboa: Caminho. 539-549.
- Callón, C. (2012). *Como falar e escribir en galego con corrección e fluidez*. Vigo: Xerais.
- Cassany, D. *et al.* (2008). "Escribir 'al margen de la ley': prácticas letradas vernáculas de adolescentes catalanes". *8º Congress of General Linguistic*. Madrid: Universidad Autónoma de Madrid (25-28 June). Available at <http://www.llf.uam.es/clg8/actas/pdf/paperCLG21.pdf>. Viewed on 24/03/2014.
- Chardenet, P. (2004). "Échanges plurilingües en ligne: à la recherche de l'objet du discours". *Les cadens du Cediscor*, 8. 57-73.
- Costas González, X. H. (2010). *55 mentiras sobre a lingua galega*. Ames: Laivento.
- Crystal, D. (2006). *Language and the Internet*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Crystal, D. (2008). *Txtng: The Gr8 Db8*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Crystal, D. (2011). *Internet Linguistics: a student guide*. Abingdon; Oxon; New York: Routledge.
- García Negro, M. P. (Ed.) (2009). *Sobre o racismo lingüístico*. Ames: Laivento.
- Hinrichs, L. (2004). "Emerging orthographic conventions in written Creole: computer-mediated communication in Jamaica". *Arbeiten aus Anglistik und Amerikanistik* 29 (I). 81-109.
- Hinrichs, L. (2006). *Creole on the Internet: New types of evidence in the study of written vernacular language use among young people*. Available at https://webpace.utexas.edu/lh9896/public/hinrichs/hinrichs_2006.pdf. Viewed on 17/3/2014.
- Mosquera Castro, E. (2012). "Novos retos da Lingüística: as textualidades electrónicas. Consideracións sobre a escrita dos chats e das SMS". *LLJournal*, 7 (1). New York. Available at <http://ojs.gc.cuny.edu/index.php/lljournal/article/view/1147/1250>. Viewed on 16/03/2014.
- Mosquera Castro, E. (2013a). "A escrita SMS desde a perspectiva dos seus utentes. Unha achega sobre a lingua galega". *Madrytal. Revista de Estudos Gallegos*, 16. 63-71.

- Mosquera Castro, E. (2013b). *Didáctica da lingua e novos soportes comunicativos: a linguaxe SMS*. A Coruña: AS-PG.
- Patricio-Martín, S. J. & Martínez-Cortés, J. P. (2010). “Nuevas vías de revitalización para lenguas minorizadas: la repercusión de internet en el caso del aragonés”. *Digithum*, 12. Available at <http://digithum.uoc.edu>. Viewed on 10/03/2014.
- Pereira, D. (2006). *Crioulos de Base Portuguesa*. Lisboa: Caminho.
- Rafi, M. S. (2009). “SMS Text Analysis: Language, Gender and Current Practices”. *Language Vitality in South Asia*. India: Aligarh Muslim University Press. 393-405
- Tascón, M. & Abad, M. (2011). *Twittergrafía. El arte de la nueva escritura*. Madrid: Catarata.
- Thurlow, C. (2006). “From Statistical Panic to Moral Panic: The Metadiscursive Construction and Popular Exaggeration of New media Language in the Print Media”. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 11(3). Available at <http://jcmc.indiana.edu/vol11/issue3/thurlow.html>. Viewed on 12/03/2014.
- Vasconcellos, J. Leite de (1987). *Esquise d'une Dialectologie Portugaise*. Lisboa: Instituto de Investigação Científica.
- Wardhaugh, R. (1992). *Introducción á sociolingüística*. Santiago de Compostela: Universidade de Santiago.
- Yus, F. (2010). *Ciberpragmática 2.0. Nuevos usos del lenguaje en Internet*. Barcelona: Ariel.
- Zitzen, M. & Stein, D. (2004): “Chat and conversation. A case of transmedial stability?”. *Linguistics*, 42 (5). 983-1021.
- Crystal, D. (2000). *Language Death*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Skutnabb-Kangas, T. (2008). *Linguistic Genocide in Education - or Worldwide Diversity and Human Rights?* Delhi: Orient Blackswan.
- Skutnabb-Kangas, T. (2010). *Multilingual Education Works: from the Periphery to the Centre*. New Delhi: Orient Blackswan.
- Phillipson's, R. (2010). *Linguistic Imperialism continued*. Abingdon; Oxon; New York: Routledge & Orient Blackswan.
- Junyent, C. & Muncunill, C. (2010). *El libro de las lenguas*. Barcelona: Octaedro.
- Moure, T. (2011). *Ecolingüística. Entre a ciencia e a ética*. A Coruña: Servizo de Publicacións da UDC.

La picaresca, su nacimiento, evolución y entorno histórico

The picaresque, its birth, evolution and historical environment

Summary

This article presents the construction of the picaresque as a literary genre by making reference to the critics of the genre such as Rico, Parker, Guillén, Houses of Faunce, Saavedra, Suarez, Campuzano and other. It describes the circumstances which helped to produce this type of writing in a particular socio-historical period as well as the main facts which allowed the genre's emergence and its subsequent evolution and dissemination in European and American literatures.

Keywords:

Picaresque, rogue, appearance, characteristics, evolution, environment and history.

Cuerpo:

Para poder comprender la picaresca hay que empezar por entender por qué y dónde nació este género.

Saavedra (1996: 74) el género picaresco se desarrolla en los siglos XVI y XVII en España. Para él, "*La vida del Lazarillo de Tormes*" constituye la primera novela picaresca aunque existen autores que ya utilizan elementos de este género en sus obras, por ejemplo Fernando de Rojas. Parker (1996: 74), por otra parte, considera "*El Lazarillo de Tormes*" como otro precursor de la primera verdadera novela picaresca "*El Guzmán de Alfarache*". Cuando indagamos en los orígenes de la novela picaresca, resulta que existe una obra de un poeta árabe del siglo XI cuyos rasgos muestran gran semejanza con los rasgos de la novela picaresca Suárez (1926: 25). Se trata del poeta Al-Hariri. Su obra conoce mucho éxito y es posible que su popularidad haya llegado a España. Los rasgos típicos de esta literatura árabe son el idealismo y también el realismo. Suárez lo describe así: «el espíritu árabe es el que sabe mejor idealizar la realidad» (1926: 26). El autor habla también

de otras obras anteriores que contienen rasgos típicos de la picaresca como por ejemplo Luciano que, según Suárez, ejerce «la más decisiva influencia» (1926: 29).

Ya aparecen en la obra de Luciano (ca. 125 – ca. 181) el humorismo y el pensamiento pesimista, elementos típicos de la picaresca. Se trata del texto "*Diálogos de los muertos*" que forma parte de una serie de diálogos satíricos y morales: "*Diálogos de los dioses*", "*Diálogos de los muertos*", "*Diálogos de las cortesanas*", "*Caronte el cínico*", "*Prometeo*", "*La asamblea de los dioses*", "*El parásito*", "*Anacarsis*". Suárez considera la obra de Juan Ruiz, Arcipreste de Hita (ca. 1283 – ca. 1350), como «una verdadera novela de picardías, la que presenta una influencia decisiva en la picaresca posterior» (1926 : 32). Se trata del "*Libro de Buen Amor*" (1330 y 1343). Entre los elementos evoca, el humorismo y «el elemento satírico expresado en forma festiva» Suarez (1926: 33).

Otra obra importante es la de Alfonso Martínez de Toledo, Arcipreste de Talavera (ca.1398–ca.1470): "*El Corbacho*" o "*Reprobación del amor mundano*" (1438). Se trata de un libro de crítica social, no de sátira, y el autor no utiliza alegorías. Suárez nos dice que esta obra influye en "*La Celestina*" (1499), obra de Fernando de Rojas (1470-1541), escrita al final del siglo XV. En cuanto a "*La Celestina*", Suárez plantea que «es una obra que puede estar incluida en la picaresca, pero tiene una conmoción más honda, más profundamente trágica» (1926: 43). Cervantes utiliza en sus obras algunos elementos de "*La Celestina*".

En cuanto al papel que desempeña Cervantes (1547-1616) en el desarrollo del género picaresco, constatamos que en su obra figuran muchos elementos típicamente picarescos, por ejemplo las descripciones de las clases bajas de la sociedad. Entre estas obras con rasgos picarescos, destacamos en primer lugar la comedia "*Pedro de Urdemalas*" de las "*Ocho comedias y ocho entremeses nuevos*" (1615). Se trata de una obra realista con mucha gracia e ingenio. «Sólo le falta a esta obra la unidad de la acción para ser una verdadera comedia de picardías» (Suárez 1926: 101). "*Rinconete y Cortadillo*", otra novela de Cervantes, rebosa de elementos picarescos. Esta obra forma parte de las "*Novelas ejemplares*" (entre 1590 y 1612) de Cervantes y muestra el manejo perfecto del lenguaje que posee Cervantes. Según Suárez, Cervantes «sacó a la picaresca de la niñez y tuvo el arte suficiente de ahorrarla de pesadas moralidades; es decir, depuró el género y nos lo dio perfecto y sin mácula.» Suarez(1926: 107). Menciono en último lugar la obra principal de Cervantes, "*Don Quijote de la Mancha*" (1605 y 1615), que contiene también algunos rasgos del género picaresco, es decir, nos da un reflejo de la sociedad de aquel tiempo y del comportamiento humano. A pesar de ello,

la mayoría de los críticos consideran esta novela como la última novela española de caballerías. (Parker 1971: 40)

Otro factor importante es la situación en que se encuentra España en aquella época. Estas condiciones especiales tienen su influencia en la pronta evolución del género de la picaresca en España. Campuzano plantea que es la época en que España descubre el Nuevo Mundo (1949: 191). A partir de este momento la religión de cada persona se hace imprescindible.

Existe una diferencia importante entre cristianos viejos y cristianos nuevos que son árabes o judíos conversos. Entre tanto, el rey de España quiere conquistar más tierra para buscar oro. Al final todo eso lleva a la ruina económica de España. La población de la península emigra de su tierra natal. Esta situación puede explicar la existencia de un género poco realista, es decir el género de las novelas de caballerías, porque la gente no vive en la realidad a causa de la exaltación y del heroísmo que lleva la conquista consigo. Con el fracaso que sigue a este período, de repente el género de la picaresca llega a ser popular mientras que la novela de caballería y la novela pastoril se encuentran en retroceso. Las novelas picarescas describen la situación real de los españoles que viven en aquella época. Por la presencia de este realismo que reemplaza el idealismo de las novelas pastoriles y de las novelas de caballerías, se puede considerar la novela picaresca como la primera manifestación de la novela moderna. (Parker 1971: 39)

No obstante, Parker nos revela en su obra "*Los pícaros en la literatura*" (1971) que la situación en España no es peor que en otros países europeos como Inglaterra, Francia o Alemania. Pues, «si la novela realista del siglo XVI necesitaba una sociedad en la que la vagancia y la delincuencia fuesen importantes, lo mismo podía haber nacido fuera de España que dentro de ella» (Parker 1971: 48) ¿Por qué entonces nace el género picaresco en España? Según Parker, existen dos razones no económicas sino culturales que pueden explicar el surgimiento de la novela picaresca en España.

La primera razón constituye el nacionalismo de los españoles en el tratamiento de su propia cultura. Se trata de una actitud típicamente española ante la vida: «una tendencia a eludir o huir de las responsabilidades» (Parker 1971: 48). Sin embargo, esto no explica por qué nace el género en aquel período específico en España. De ahí que Parker, basándose en Américo Castro, añada una segunda razón: «la novela picaresca surgió como expresión del resentimiento social de la gente mísera contra las clases privilegiadas» (Parker 1971: 48-49) Con «la gente

mísera» se refiere a los judíos conversos malcontentos. Esta hipótesis se basa entre otros en el hecho de que Mateo Alemán es un judío. Parker no apoya totalmente la tesis de Castro sino que presta más atención a las ideas de Marcel Bataillon concerniente a la importancia de la "limpieza de sangre" para los autores picarescos:

Las distintas relaciones sociales a que esta "limpieza de sangre" daba lugar, en concreto, en relación con el progreso social de las personas de origen burgués, las ve reflejadas irónica y satíricamente en los relatos de las novelas y en los antecedentes inventados para los pícaros. (Parker 1971: 50)

Otro elemento tratado en la obra de Suárez es cómo Erasmo influye en el carácter picaresco y satírico. Este personaje histórico importante tiene un «espíritu crítico, satirizador e irreverente» (Suárez 1926: 51). Campuzano (1949) plantea que Erasmo influye también en Cervantes y en general, en la totalidad de la vida española del siglo XVI y de los principios del siglo XVII. Erasmo, como en las novelas picarescas, critica el dogma religioso pero tiene que hacerlo a escondidas. Son tiempos agitados en Europa (Campuzano 1949: 193). En España la situación cambia con la muerte del rey Felipe II: la censura se vuelve menos rigurosa. De esta manera se publican más novelas picarescas.

Las tres obras más importantes escritas en el período clásico del género de la picaresca: "*El Lazarillo de Tormes*" (1554) de un autor anónimo, "*Guzmán de Alfarache*" (1599 y 1604) de Mateo Alemán y "*El Buscón*" (1626) de Francisco Gómez de Quevedo y Villegas. A partir de las traducciones de estas novelas, el género de la picaresca se difunde por Europa, sobre todo en Alemania, Francia e Inglaterra.

Pero ¿qué es la novela picaresca?

Alonso Zamora Vicente empieza su obra "*¿Qué es la novela picaresca?*" profundizando en la etimología de la palabra 'pícaro' (1962: 8-9). Encuentra diversas posibilidades. En primer lugar la palabra puede venir del latín 'pica' que significa 'miserable'. Puede venir también de otra palabra del latín, es decir de 'pic', palabra derivada de 'picus' y que quiere decir 'picar'. De esta manera el sentido evoluciona hasta 'mendigo' o 'ladrón'. Otra posibilidad es que la palabra viene de la Picardía, una región de donde venían muchos emigrantes que eran pobres. En último lugar, la palabra 'pícaro' también puede estar en relación con las palabras 'bigardo', 'begardo' que significan 'vago' o 'vicioso'.

Es notable, como indican tanto Francisco Rico en su obra "*La picaresca y el punto de vista*" (2000: 115) como Alexander A. Parker en su obra "*Los pícaros en la literatura*" (1971: 37), que la palabra «pícaro» no figura en "*El Lazarillo*

de Tormes", novela considerada como la primera novela picaresca. Se utiliza el término por primera vez en "*El Guzmán de Alfarache*", novela picaresca escrita en 1599 (la primera parte) y 1604 (la segunda parte). Parker añade también que, según él, una traducción adecuada en inglés para la palabra «pícaro» sería «delinquent». Con este término el autor designa «un tipo sin honra y antisocial pero menos violento» (1971: 37)

Según Weber la causa de la dificultad para definir claramente el género de la picaresca consiste en el comportamiento de los escritores de la picaresca: «elaboraron e improvisaron el género sin la presión de normas fijas, añadiendo, modificando, rechazando los rasgos según les dio la real gana» (Weber 1979: 13) La solución según Weber reside en una clasificación de la narrativa picaresca en cuatro clases. La clasificación se hace mediante un sistema de dos polaridades, una semántica (modo cómico/modo irónico), otra estructural (novela/cuento). De esta manera se crean cuatro clases de narrativa: el cuento irónico, el cuento cómico, la novela irónica y la novela cómica.

María Casas de Faunce dedica también algunas páginas de su obra "*La novela picaresca latinoamericana*" a la pregunta «¿Qué es la novela picaresca?» (1977: 9) Evoca también el problema de la definición del término. Según Casas de Faunce, hay un montón de definiciones pero la mayoría resulta inadecuada. Además, a veces la noción está aplicada en un doble sentido. La autora habla en su obra de una realidad picaresca de filiación literaria y de otra de índole social (Faunce 1977: 9). En las obras que pertenecen a la picaresca social, figuran personas de las clases bajas. En cambio, la picaresca literaria es una categoría estética. Casas de Faunce propone también una definición del género picaresco: «aquella representación de una filosofía vital que se manifiesta en términos de una aparente aceptación del orden establecido, en beneficio propio, y que se burla o critica, a la vez, el convencionalismo social que permite hacerlo» (1977: 10) Por otra parte Casas de Faunce, para encontrar una respuesta a la pregunta '¿qué es la novela picaresca?', consulta el estudio «Toward a Definition of the Picaresque» (1971) de Claudio Guillén, y define la novela picaresca como:

[...] una narración ficticia, de cierta extensión y en prosa, expuesta desde el punto de vista de un ente acomodaticio cuya filosofía existencial, subjetiva y unilateral, enfatiza el instinto primario del individuo que no ha desarrollado las funciones espirituales, ni la sensibilidad anticipada en el hombre. (Casas de Faunce 1977: 12)

La novela picaresca clásica, tiene, según María Casas de Faunce, basándose de nuevo en Claudio Guillén, ocho características importantes:

- 1) El pícaro.
- 2) La pseudoautobiografía.
- 3) Una visión parcial de la realidad.
- 4) Un tono reflexivo.
- 5) Un ambiente materialista.
- 6) Observaciones relacionadas con ciertas clases sociales.
- 7) Un movimiento ascendente en un plano social o moral.
- 8) Una aparente falta de composición (1977: 13).

Las características tres, cuatro y seis figuran en todas las obras picarescas, tal como otro elemento, es decir, la comicidad. En cambio, en la novela picaresca en sentido lato se observa una transformación de algunos rasgos de la picaresca mientras que algunas características indispensables quedan presentes, por ejemplo el vínculo entre el personaje y el ambiente, la filosofía existencial y la güasa.

Finalmente se llega a la conclusión de que no es fácil definir el género, ya que hay tantas definiciones como críticos.

Para acercar algunas características del género que lo delimite y permita su diferenciación de otras obras, Casas de Faunce clasifica las tres novelas picarescas más famosas escritas en España en los siglos XVI y XVII bajo la categoría de novelas picarescas clásicas. Las características típicas de la picaresca clásica que elabora Casas de Faunce en su obra "*La novela picaresca latinoamericana*", basándose en Claudio Guillén. (1977: 13) Se trata de los siguientes rasgos:

- 1) la pseudoautobiografía,
- 2) una visión parcial de la realidad,
- 3) un tono reflexivo,
- 4) observaciones relacionadas con ciertas clases sociales,
- 5) un movimiento ascendente en un plano social o moral y
- 6) la comicidad.

En cuanto a las características del protagonista de las novelas picarescas, es decir el **pícaro**, los rasgos más importantes son ante todo, el pícaro es un antihéroe en vez de un héroe. Este personaje se basa en los tipos que forman parte de la sociedad española. De ahí que Alonso Zamora Vicente señale que «el gran invento del *Lazarillo* no fue otro que el de hacer del hombre de carne y hueso, con sus flaquezas y su difícil persistir sobre la tierra, un personaje literario. Antes de Lázaro, el personaje era un ente de ficción» (1962: 20).

Otra característica del pícaro constituye su rebeldía ante la sociedad, aunque el pícaro es conformista: «no quiere cambiar el orden social, lo que quiere es cambiar su posición dentro de ese orden» Bencomo (2003: 21) Su permanente inquietud es causa de su aversión por la tranquilidad y la calma.

El pícaro tiene un espíritu aventurero y libre. Como nos revela Suárez (1926: 151), la libertad es muy importante para el pícaro pero para obtener este sentimiento de libertad es necesario que el protagonista sirva a muchos amos. Cambiando de vez en cuando de amo y de trabajo, el pícaro se siente libre.

Este carácter inestable del pícaro se nota también en la continua necesidad de cambiar de lugar, de costumbres, de ambiente, etcétera. Además, el deseo más importante de los pícaros es vivir. Como señala Guillén (1971: 78), la palabra «vida» aparece frecuentemente en los títulos de las novelas picarescas. Guillén plantea también que la novela picaresca ofrece el conflicto entre el individuo y su entorno (1971: 78). De la misma manera Carrillo señala la presencia de un «conflicto entre el hombre interior y su medio ambiente» (Carrillo 1979: 75) en las novelas picarescas.

Bencomo añade que es la sociedad la que obliga al pícaro a meterse a engañar, a estafar, etcétera para « sacar partido de las condiciones caóticas de esa misma sociedad » (Bencomo 2003 : 21). Otro rasgo típico de los pícaros constituye su humorismo. Sin embargo, estas burlas y un sentimiento de decepción a menudo van parejas. Para el pícaro, la vida es «una senda llena de obstáculos que han de cruzarse vadeándolos, rodeándolos para evitarlos, y hay que bastarse con la propia ayuda» (Suárez 1926: 153) En último lugar, el pícaro es siempre un huérfano. De ahí que el pícaro tiene que buscarse la vida.

Se encuentra en una sociedad de adultos y trabaja para varios amos. Un segundo rasgo importante de la picaresca clásica es el parecido con el género de la **seudoautobiografía**. Los autores de las novelas picarescas clásicas recurren en la mayoría de los casos a la primera persona. De esta manera las obras parecen autobiografías. De ahí que Guillén (1971) utiliza el término ‘seudoautobiografías’.

El recurso a esta técnica se explica por el deseo de insertar el relato en una doble perspectiva de ocultación y de revelación de sí mismo. (Guillén 1971: 82) Rico (2000) analiza también el uso de la autobiografía en las novelas picarescas. Señala que a mediados del siglo XVI la autenticidad se hace más importante de manera que los humanistas intentan alcanzar el mayor grado de verosimilitud posible en sus obras (2000: 39). Según Rico, los autores de las novelas picarescas

tienen también este deseo de representar la realidad (2000:39). De ahí su recurso a la (seudo) autobiografía puesto que esta forma de narración les sirve bien para conseguir un mayor grado de verosimilitud en sus obras. Rico concluye que:

[...] en cualquier caso, uno [el realismo] y otra [la autobiografía] se implicaban, y la coherencia se imponía nuevamente: la novela debía ser fiel por entero a la ilusión autobiográfica, el mundo sólo tenía cabida en sus páginas a través de los sentidos de Lázaro y Lazarillo. (2000:39-40)

Maravall observa muy bien que con recurrir a la forma autobiográfica, el autor crea la impresión de que el pobre pícaro está hablando (1987:156). Antes de la aparición de la picaresca, la imagen de los pobres aparece en la mayoría de las novelas desde la perspectiva de los que no son pobres. La picaresca, al utilizar la forma autobiográfica, quiere «invertir la perspectiva a fin de darla lo más directamente posible. En virtud de tal recurso retórico, era el pobre el que parecía hablar de sí» (Maravall 1987:156).

El tercer rasgo típico de la picaresca clásica constituye **la visión parcial de la realidad** que nos ofrece la novela picaresca. Esta visión del autor sobre la realidad es siempre predispuesta. A través del pícaro el autor transmite su ideología. De esta manera nunca se trata de una visión total y objetiva de la realidad, sino que es siempre el autor el que elige que parte de la realidad va a mostrar. Zamora Vicente fija la atención en el hecho de que «la *novela picaresca* es ante todo *novela*, es decir: recreación artística, voluntaria selección y parcelación de una realidad» (1962:12) Francisco Rico, en su obra "*La novela picaresca y el punto de vista*", evoca que, según las ideas principales del Renacimiento, la obra de arte se entiende como «un segmento del universo según lo observa – o, por lo menos, según podría observarlo – una persona determinada, desde un determinado punto de vista, en un momento determinado» (Panofsky citado por Francisco Rico 2000: 37).

El cuarto rasgo típico es el **tono reflexivo** de las novelas picarescas clásicas. El pícaro aparece en estas novelas como un filósofo y un crítico. Reflexiona sobre lo que pasa alrededor de él y sobre su propia vida. Este personaje pone todo en duda y nunca acaba de aprender (Guillén 1971:82).

Rico hace referencia a la novela picaresca de Mateo Alemán, "*Guzmán de Alfarache*", diciendo que el protagonista quiere « volver los ojos a su pasado y a sí mismo, en un examen de conciencia » (2000: 77).

Rey, por su parte, señala que la visión del mundo que éste desea transmitir

depende en grandísima medida del narrador a cuyo cargo está la presentación, y en su caso el enjuiciamiento, del mundo narrado. La cuestión de quién narra, en nombre de qué ideas y en función de qué atributos, es particularmente crucial en un tipo de literatura que no se contenta con erigir edificios de ilusión, sino que pretende pronunciarse sobre el comportamiento del hombre. Si el autor no logra dar con un narrador adecuado a ese propósito, puede decirse que su novela habrá fracasado. (Rey 1979:71)

A través de estas reflexiones, el autor puede también exponer su crítica. El pícaro tiene asco a la sociedad que le rodea. En largas digresiones el autor expresa las reflexiones de su protagonista sobre todo lo que va mal en su sociedad. Revela por ejemplo las maldades de las clases altas, los abusos del clero, etcétera.

Mediante estas reflexiones, el lector se da cuenta de que el pícaro – y también el autor – no está de acuerdo con la situación social en que se encuentra.

En quinto lugar, menciono el rasgo del **ambiente materialista** de las novelas picarescas clásicas. En estas novelas se pone énfasis en el nivel materialista de la existencia. Se tratan de dos elementos: el hambre y el dinero. «Para el pícaro no existe la vida afectiva: ni amor, ni compasión ni cosa parecida» (Zamora Vicente 1962: 11)

Howard Mancing (1979) señala, refiriéndose al "*Lazarillo de Tormes*", que ya no existe un estrecho vínculo entre los personajes de la novela y Dios o los otros hombres. Además, estos personajes se sienten también aislados de sí mismos (Mancing 1979: 462).

En cuanto al elemento del hambre en las novelas picarescas, se pueden señalar muchos ejemplos. En "*El Lazarillo de Tormes*", el elemento del hambre aparece de manera muy explícita: la alimentación constituye una verdadera obsesión para el pícaro. Especialmente en los tres primeros tratados, la búsqueda de pan y vino resulta problemática.

El sexto rasgo típico de la picaresca clásica constituye la presencia en este tipo de novelas de **observaciones relacionadas con ciertas clases sociales**. El pícaro observa algunas condiciones sociales como las clases sociales, los oficios, las ciudades, etcétera. Para criticar estas condiciones sociales, el autor utiliza la sátira y otros recursos cómicos. Sin embargo, según señala Guillén (1971: 83), el lugar que ocupa la sátira en las novelas picarescas no es muy claro y depende de la obra.

Observa que además de representar condiciones colectivas y vicios, la novela picaresca contiene también humor y la valoración de la complejidad individual.

Alonso Zamora Vicente describe de manera muy clara lo que las novelas picarescas quieren evocar:

El pícaro, sirviendo a diversos amos, yendo de uno a otro como rebotándose, va aprendiendo la realidad hostil de la vida, oculta por los vestidos lujosos, las apariencias, los proceder encubiertos: el juez que se vende al juzgar, el médico ignorante, el pedantuelo sabihondo, el clérigo vicioso, la nobleza envilecida. (1962: 11)

El séptimo rasgo típico de la picaresca clásica tiene que ver con el **movimiento ascendente del pícaro en un plano social o moral.**

Francisco Carrillo habla de la búsqueda por parte del pícaro de una auténtica moral: «El pícaro tiene que descubrir por su propia cuenta la moral y los valores. Así crece, aprende y se forma» (1979: 76)

Según Guillén, se puede considerar la novela picaresca como un bildungsroman, puesto que el héroe crece, aprende y cambia durante la historia (1971: 80-82).

Pues, no sólo novelas alemanas pueden estar designadas como bildungsromane, sino también las novelas picarescas clásicas. Carrillo, por su parte, plantea que «es necesario una estructura episódica, bildungsroman, donde el pícaro, de forma vital, aprenda y se haga cada vez más independiente» (1979: 77)

El pícaro puede ascender en la escala social cuando se acomoda. Optar por la lucha no sirve a nada. Carrillo señala también que la sociedad española de los siglos XVI y XVII está muy preocupada por «la lucha por conquistar un alto nivel de consideración social» (1979: 74) El mismo autor explica las consecuencias de esta preocupación:

Por esto es posible que sólo en España se produzca una literatura como dimensión social del conflicto entre el individuo y la sociedad, motivado por dos fuerzas: mientras el cristiano viejo se enorgullece de su fe y hombría, el cristiano nuevo se enorgullece de su saber e inteligencia. (Carrillo 1979: 74)

Maravall, por su parte, hace referencia al papel que desempeña la educación en el ascenso social (1987: 396). El pícaro tiene el deseo de ascender pero para ello

necesita en primer lugar una buena educación. «En los siglos XVI y XVII, los hijos de labradores y mercaderes ricos buscaban con frecuencia en los estudios su promoción social y tanto en la ficción literaria como en la realidad [...] conseguían en ciertos casos [...] su propósito de mejorar de posición» (Maravall 1987: 397)

Como octavo rasgo típico de la picaresca clásica mencionamos **la aparente falta de composición** en las novelas picarescas clásicas. Estas novelas son episódicas, sin otra conexión entre los episodios que la presencia del antihéroe. Rico resume muy bien esta idea en su obra "*La novela picaresca y el punto de vista*" (2000): «Nuestro pícaro [...] surgió asociado a un esquema narrativo, en síntesis capaz de estructurar unitariamente infinidad de materiales que antes sólo habían tenido existencia inconexa, episódica» (2000: 141).

El noveno rasgo, es la **comicidad**. Bencomo, en su tesis, señala que la picaresca «se burla del honor, el linaje, el amor, la virtud, y otros mitos de la sociedad aristócrata medieval» (2003: 17) Parker, por su parte, evoca que el recurso a la comicidad constituye la única posibilidad para los autores de novelas picarescas: «Los tipos cómicos y la ingeniosidad taimada se convierten en convenciones del género, porque el estilo realista no podía concebirse de otra manera» (1971: 63)

En el siglo XVI, cuando un autor quiere escribir sobre cosas de la vida cotidiana, tiene que utilizar el estilo vulgar. Esto implica que tiene que introducir lo cómico en sus novelas. Se trata en la mayoría de los casos de una ironía humorística con una intención seria pero, según Parker (1971), no es posible combinar lo cómico con lo serio. Los autores de novelas picarescas lo intentan pero lleva a muchas confusiones al leer las novelas.

Parker concluye así:

El nuevo género ha oscilado, por tanto, entre dos extremos. En general, para utilizar la lengua literaria de la época ha oscilado entre el provecho sin deleite y el deleite sin provecho, y en el terreno particular de la literatura realista, entre demasiada seriedad con poca materia cómica, por un lado, y, por el otro, una falta total de seriedad. [...] El punto de equilibrio entre lo serio y lo cómico no plantea hoy en día problemas a los escritores, pero en la España de principios del siglo XVII esto constituía un verdadero problema. (1971: 97-98)

Maravall, a su vez, analiza también el humor en las novelas picarescas y llega a la conclusión que el pícaro «ríe, vengativamente, de la crueldad, del engaño, del mal, y, consiguientemente, del dolor que a otros ha producido, en contestación

al hostigamiento lacerante con que le han cercado en la vida» (1987: 240)

En conclusión, para establecer la conexión entre los nueve rasgos y la presencia y función del contexto socio histórico en la novela picaresca, se deben usar seis de las nueve características: 1) la (seudo) autobiografía, 2) la visión parcial de la realidad, 3) el tono reflexivo, 4) las observaciones relacionadas con ciertas clases sociales, 5) el movimiento ascendente en un plano social o moral, y 6) la comicidad. La (seudo) autobiografía ofrece la posibilidad al autor de transmitir sus ideas sobre el contexto histórico-social a través de su protagonista, el pícaro, que habla en primera persona. Por consiguiente, esta imagen del contexto histórico-social que aparece en la novela constituye siempre una visión parcial de la realidad, ya que el autor elige que elementos contextuales va a introducir en su novela.

Por añadidura, el pícaro reflexiona sobre el contexto histórico-social que le rodea en digresiones largas que llenan la novela picaresca. Estas digresiones sirven en la mayoría de los casos para criticar la sociedad, a veces complementado con la función de educar y moralizar a los lectores. Relacionado con esto, otro rasgo típico de la picaresca, es decir las observaciones relacionadas con ciertas clases sociales. Mediante la denuncia de este aspecto del contexto histórico-social, el autor puede exponer también su crítica. En cuanto a la relación entre la presencia de un movimiento ascendente en un plano social o moral en la novela picaresca y el contexto histórico-social, observamos que se establece esta relación justamente porque el deseo de ascender en la escala social y/o moral constituye un elemento del contexto histórico-social del pícaro. En último lugar, los autores utilizan a menudo la comicidad (por ejemplo la ironía o la sátira) para aliviar la crítica que dirigen hacia los aspectos contextuales.

En último lugar el contexto histórico-social puede tener aún una función relacionada con la transmisión de un mensaje didáctico y moralizador que consiste en transmitir ideas reformistas. No pretendo decir que los autores de las novelas picarescas sean reformistas, pero sí que estas ideas reformistas se traslucen en sus novelas. Esto marca una evolución de las opiniones y de la mentalidad en España. Ysla Campbell, en su artículo "La literatura picaresca del siglo XVII ¿una narrativa reformista?" (2004), aclara muy bien lo que constituye este carácter reformista en las novelas picarescas:

El carácter reformista de la picaresca, que se muestra desde los prólogos, es evidente al hacerse portavoz de un pensamiento renovador acorde con las circunstancias que atravesaba la Península. proclama la igualdad fundada en la universalidad del pecado original, lo que implicaba la ponderación de la virtud,

el mérito y el trabajo, con una reivindicación fundamental del buen uso del comercio, frente al linaje y el ocio de la aristocracia. (2004: 171)

Bibliografía

- Bencomo G. (2003). *Relectura del discurso narrativo de las tres primeras décadas de la República Cubana en el contexto de los rasgos de picaresca*. ETD Collection for Florida. International University, 6-37.
- Campbell Y. (2006). *La literatura picaresca del siglo XVII ¿una narrativa reformista?* Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica Vol. 52 No. 1, 153-171.
- Campuzano E. (1949). *Ciertos aspectos de la novela picaresca*. Hispania Vol. 32 N.2 190-197.
- Carrillo F. (1979). *Raíz sociológica e imaginación creadora en la picaresca española en La picaresca: orígenes, textos y estructuras. Actas del I Congreso Internacional sobre la Picaresca*. Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española.
- Casas de Faunce M. (1977). *La novela picaresca latinoamericana*. Madrid.
- Guillén C. (1971). *Toward a Definition of the Picaresque. En: Literature as System. Essays toward the theory of literature history*. New Jersey: Princenton University Press. 71-106.
- Mancing H. (1979). *El pesimismo radical del Lazarillo de Tormes en La picaresca: orígenes, textos y estructuras. Actas del I Congreso Internacional sobre la Picaresca*. Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española.
- Maravall J.A. (1987). *La literatura picaresca desde la historia social (siglos XVI-XVII)*. Madrid.
- Parker A. (1971). *Los pícaros en la literatura*. Madrid.
- Rey A. (1979). *La novela picaresca y el narrador fidedigno*. Hispanic Review Vol. 47, No. 1, 55-75.
- Rico F. (2000). *La novela picaresca y el punto de vista*. Barcelona.
- Saavedra M. (1996). *La vida inútil de Pito Pérez*. Vol. 43, 74-75. México.
- Suárez M. (1926). *La novela picaresca y el pícaro en la literatura española*. Madrid.
- Weber A. (1979). *Cuatro clases de narrativa picaresca, en La Picaresca: orígenes, textos y estructuras. Actas del I Congreso Internacional sobre la Picaresca*. Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española.
- Zamora Vicente A. (1962). *¿Qué es la novela picaresca?* Buenos Aires.

El concepto de *aspecto* según la *Nueva Gramática de la Lengua Española* The concept of *aspect* according to the *New Grammar of the Spanish Language*

Summary

The aim of this paper is to present the concept of *aspect* according to the *New Grammar of the Spanish Language*, which is the recent academic Grammar published in 2009. The authors define the *aspect* as the category that indicates the internal structure of situations and establish its division into lexical aspect, syntactic aspect and morphological aspect. On the other hand, the paper aims to outline the history of studies on aspectuality and prove that the application of the term *aspect* in the verbal system of Spanish, a language that typologically is ‘tense + article’, differs greatly from the grammatical value of aspect in the languages that typologically are ‘aspect + case’.

Keywords: The New Grammar of the Spanish Language (2009), the aspect, the aspectuality, the language typology

El presente trabajo aborda el tema de *aspecto* que despierta muchas discrepancias entre los lingüistas a la hora de describir la aspectualidad en las lenguas románicas. De ahí que estemos ante una categoría que constituye un campo de investigación muy polémico, por lo que se han elaborado múltiples estudios, teorías y términos que la describen.

El propósito de este trabajo es, por tanto, poner de manifiesto diferentes puntos de vista acerca del tema de *aspecto* en español, presentando las recientes aportaciones normativo-descriptivas de la *Nueva Gramática de la Lengua Española* (en adelante, *NGLE*) y confrontándolas con otras consideraciones al respecto.

En primer lugar, cabe mencionar que la *NGLE* sale a la luz en el año 2009, como resultado de 11 años de colaboración entre la Real Academia Española y la Asociación de Academias de la Lengua Española (en adelante, la RAE

y la ASALE) que, en su totalidad, abarcan 22 academias de la Lengua Española¹. De hecho, más de un centenar de asesores y expertos americanos y europeos, guiados por el académico Ignacio Bosque, el ponente de la *NGLE*, han participado en la creación de esta obra magistral.

Como es bien sabido, la labor académica tiene por objetivo unificar las variantes del español, fijando la norma lingüística común para ellas. Por tanto, según confiesa la RAE², la *NGLE* pretende reflejar en sus páginas *un mapa del español en todo el mundo*, siendo una obra colectiva, panhispánica, descriptiva, normativa, sintética y práctica. Su objetivo es constituir un punto de referencia útil para todos los niveles de aprendizaje y enseñanza del español.

La *NGLE* consta de dos volúmenes dedicados a la morfología y a la sintaxis que en su conjunto contienen casi 4.000 páginas, divididas en 48 capítulos principales. Uno de ellos, el 23, titulado *El verbo (I). Tiempo y aspecto. El aspecto léxico. Los tiempos del modo indicativo*, constituye precisamente el objeto de nuestro análisis, ya que nos parece de sumo interés presentar qué concepto de *aspecto* proclaman y divulgan los académicos en su reciente Gramática.

Como resume Rodríguez Espiñeira (1990: 181), hay tres posturas principales que cabe destacar en referencia al aspecto en los estudios españoles: junto con las posturas intermedias, hay dos extremas que consideran el aspecto bien como una pieza clave en la organización verbal, o bien niegan su presencia en el sistema gramatical español. De hecho, la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.2c) abiertamente admiten que la noción de *aspecto* en español sigue siendo una cuestión sin acuerdo entre los gramáticos:

“Constituye una polémica tradicional no resuelta la presencia que debe otorgarse en español a la noción de ‘aspecto’.”

Así las cosas, empecemos por comentar que el término de *aspecto*, por primera vez, aparece mencionado ya en la Introducción a la *NGLE* (2009: §1.5g), aplicado al tema de la morfología flexiva. De entrada, se constata, pues, que el aspecto forma parte de las características de la segmentación de los verbos flexionados. Tomando como ejemplo el verbo *cantábamos*, se explica que este contiene cuatro componentes, a saber: raíz (que es *cant*), vocal temática (que es *-á*),

¹ Asimismo, es conveniente recalcar otros datos interesantes al respecto, por ejemplo, que han transcurrido 78 años desde que se publicó la anterior Gramática de la Real Academia Española (1931); y 268 años, desde que surgió la primera edición en el año 1741.

² Véanse el siguiente enlace de la página oficial de la RAE:

<http://www.rae.es/obras-academicas/gramatica/nueva-gramatica/nueva-gramatica-morfologia-y-sintaxis> – fecha de consulta (24.06.2014).

tiempo aspecto y modo (que es *-ba*) y persona y número (que es *-mos*). Así pues, queda patente que así descrita la flexión verbal española también abarca la categoría de aspecto, además de número, persona, modo y tiempo.

Por lo tanto, la definición del *aspecto* que la RAE y la ASALE (2009: § 1.8n) presentan es la siguiente:

“Se llama ASPECTO la categoría que indica la estructura interna de las situaciones. El aspecto informa de la manera en que se manifiestan o se desarrollan los acontecimientos, y también del modo en que surgen, culminan, cesan o se repiten.”

De ahí que el aspecto verbal se denomine asimismo en español *tiempo interno*, dado que pone de manifiesto la manera en que aparecen los sucesos y no su relación directa o no con el momento de la enunciación. Además, con esta definición, lo que se entiende bajo el término de *aspecto*, a ciencia cierta, atañe a las propiedades semánticas del predicado, que pueden ponerse de manifiesto en diferentes formas y construcciones gramaticales.

Por otra parte, aunque los académicos (2009: §23.2c) advierten que su postura en cuanto al aspecto no es “máxima” y que toman en consideración solo algunas de sus posibles aplicaciones al castellano, ponen de manifiesto tanto su importancia como la envergadura de su aplicación en español:

“En esta obra, se considerará que el aspecto desempeña un papel importante en la gramática del verbo – y, en general, de la predicación –, pero se introducirán menos distinciones aspectuales de las que se manejan en otros estudios. (...) Atendiendo a la forma en que se manifiesta, el aspecto verbal se suele dividir en los tres grupos siguientes:

1. Aspecto léxico o modo de acción
2. Aspecto sintáctico o perifrástico
3. Aspecto morfológico o desinencial.”

Por tanto, en esta clasificación salta a la vista que el término *aspecto* se ha convertido en la *NGLE* en una especie de comodín aplicable a los tres niveles del análisis gramatical, o sea, léxico-verbal, sintáctico-perifrástico y morfológico. Analicemos, pues, paso por paso cada uno de estos niveles.

En primer lugar, a nivel léxico verbal, conforme con la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.4a), el aspecto se manifiesta en función de las propiedades de su significación tanto a través de los verbos (o sea, piezas léxicas, recogidas en los diccionarios, como *llover*, *llegar*) como de los predicados (es decir, grupos

sintácticos, como *escribir una carta, ganar la carrera*). Por tanto, se suele denominar *aspecto léxico* o *modo de acción*. Otra nomenclatura sinonímica es *Aktionsart, cualidad de la acción* o *accionalidad*.

En cuanto a su división, según la antigua clasificación binaria, se seleccionan los predicados *atéllicos*, que designan situaciones que no poseen final, no culminan, por ejemplo, *trabajar, correr* o *empujar un carro*, y los predicados *télicos*, que poseen final o límite en función de su propia naturaleza, por ejemplo, *llegar* o *escribir una carta*. Sin embargo, en la actualidad, según su modo de acción los verbos y los predicados verbales se someten a una clasificación cuartipartita que distingue entre (RAE y ASALE, 2009: 23.3a): *actividades*, que son situaciones sujetas a un curso o un desarrollo, sin expresar ni comienzo ni término de la acción designada (*llorar, llover, pasear, trabajar, manejar un auto*, etc.); *realizaciones*, que son situaciones que poseen duración y límite (*escribir una carta, comer un plato, recitar un poema*, etc.), *logros*, que son situaciones que poseen límite, pero carecen de duración (*llegar, caerse, entrar en la casa, ganar la carrera, perder las llaves*, etc.) y *estados*, que son propiedades de las personas o de las cosas que tienen cierta duración (*vivir, creer en alguien, merecer algo, saber algo, residir en un lugar*, etc.)

No obstante, la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.3y) ponen en tela de juicio el concepto de *modo de acción*:

“(...) con el argumento de que son demasiados los casos en los que se produce la recategorización de los eventos, lo que haría de esta noción – en opinión de algunos autores – una propiedad más pragmática o discursiva que estrictamente semántica.”

La recategorización se da, por ejemplo, con el verbo *escribir* que puede pasar de las actividades (*escribir cartas*) a las realizaciones cuando su complemento directo desempeña un papel delimitador (*escribir una carta*). De ahí que la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.4s) tenga el siguiente punto de vista del modo de acción que:

“(...) no puede concebirse como una característica léxica de los verbos, sino, más bien, como una propiedad semántica de los predicados verbales que se obtiene mediante el concurso de varios de sus componentes y que posee numerosas consecuencias sintácticas.”

Por tanto, es necesario destacar que ciertos predicados pueden cambiar de grupo en función de su contexto sintáctico inmediato, por lo que el modo de

acción en español posee la naturaleza composicional, que es uno de sus rasgos más representativos.

Ahora bien, en segundo lugar, a nivel sintáctico-perifrástico, la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.2a) distingue el aspecto sintáctico o perifrástico y corroboran su presencia en castellano a base de la oposición entre las siguientes oraciones:

“En efecto, lo que diferencia la oración *Arturo lee el periódico* de *Arturo está leyendo el periódico* no es el tiempo (*presente* en los dos casos), sino el aspecto. En la primera se puede hablar de cierto suceso repetido, aunque también de un evento particular que pueda verificarse en un intervalo temporal determinado. La interpretación de suceso repetido se descarta en la segunda oración. Como se ve, no cambia en este par de secuencias la localización temporal, sino la forma en que se extiende o se desarrolla en el tiempo la situación descrita.”

Desde el punto de vista sintáctico, el aspecto se expresa en español a través de los verbos auxiliares que forman las perífrasis verbales tales como *empezar a hacer algo*, *dejar de hacer algo*, *seguir haciendo algo*, *estar a punto de hacer algo*, etc. Mediante las perífrasis verbales, el aspecto puede focalizar el inicio, el término, el curso mismo de las situaciones, su interrupción, su reiteración o su cese.

En tercer lugar, desde el punto de vista morfológico, cabe mencionar el aspecto *morfológico* o *desinencial*, llamado también *flexional* o *flexivo*. No obstante, la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.2j) avisan que estos términos calificativos no resultan del todo equivalentes:

“El término *aspecto desinencial* parece menos preciso que *aspecto morfológico*, ya que ciertos sufijos verbales de carácter derivativo – y, de manera especial, el sufijo *-ecer*, como en *floreecer* (...) – aportan información de tipo aspectual, pero no desinencial.”

Por lo demás, el concepto de *aspecto desinencial* restringe demasiado su aplicación, ya que excluye el análisis de los tiempos compuestos. Tampoco resulta acertado sustituirlo por el término *aspecto gramatical*, que se utiliza en ocasiones, dado que no incluye las perífrasis verbales.

A la vista de tanta complejidad terminológica, los academistas se decantan finalmente por usar el término de *aspecto morfológico*. Este aspecto se expresa en la flexión verbal, dando lugar a la oposición de carácter aspectual *perfectivo* /

imperfectivo de las formas verbales *cantó* y *cantaba*, independientemente de la propia naturaleza semántica del predicado, sea télica (*llegar*) o atélica (*trabajar*), los predicados pueden ser *perfectivos* adquiriendo desinencias del pretérito indefinido (*llegó, trabajó*) e *imperfectivos* cuando llevan desinencias propias del pretérito imperfecto (*llegaba, trabajaba*). En su forma verbal *perfectiva*, los verbos focalizan la acción en su curso, sin aludir a su inicio ni a su término. En su forma verbal *imperfectiva*, los verbos presentan la situación como acabada, en su conjunto, de principio a fin.

Siguiendo a la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.2k), cabe añadir que, además de esta oposición clásica de las formas *cantó* / *cantaba*, son formas imperfectivas *cantaba* y *canto*, mientras que son perfectivas *cantó, había cantado* y *habrá cantado*. En cambio, las formas *cantará* y *cantaría* son neutras en cuanto al aspecto. En consecuencia, en ciertos contextos pueden expresar aspecto perfectivo; y en otros, imperfectivo. Por último, resulta difícil determinar el aspecto de la forma *he cantado*, debido a que su perfectividad o imperfectividad depende de varios factores gramaticales y, además, de su variante dialectal. Así pues, según apuntan la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.7c), la oposición entre *canté* y *he cantado* en muchos países centroamericanos es más propiamente aspectual que temporal:

“El pretérito perfecto simple se usa en esos casos para referirse a acciones acabadas en el pasado, mientras que el pretérito perfecto compuesto se reserva para referirse a acciones que continúan en el presente. Así, en *Hoy estuvo más tranquilo (...)*, *estuvo* se construye en pretérito perfecto simple porque la situación de la que se habla ha concluido. En otras áreas, como el español de Chile o de gran parte de la Argentina (...), la oposición se neutraliza a favor del pretérito perfecto simple, con un uso semejante al que se da en el noroeste de España y en las islas Canarias. En estas zonas, el pretérito perfecto simple sustituye al compuesto, con independencia del valor temporal o aspectual de la acción.”

En definitiva, con tal enfoque se interpreta las desinencias de los tiempos pasados en términos de una compleja relación entre tiempo y aspecto³.

³ Cabe añadir que también Alarcos Llorach considera el aspecto como parte del sistema verbal español. Según apunta Rodríguez Espiñeira (1990: nota, 14), en su trabajo del año 1949, Alarcos distingue el aspecto flexional que se divide en aspecto no terminativo y en aspecto terminativo. El primero indica el proceso sin su término y se expresa a través de la forma *cantaba*, y el aspecto terminativo, que indica el proceso con su término, se expresa mediante la forma verbal *canté*. Así pues, los que consideran de índole aspectual la oposición de las formas verbales de los tiempos gramaticales españoles, como resume Fernández Pérez (1993: 76-82), califican de aspecto

Respecto al tiempo gramatical, los académicos (2009: 23.1a y 23.1g) lo definen como una categoría deíctica, por tanto, referencial que permite ubicar directa o indirectamente los acontecimientos en relación con el momento de la enunciación y seleccionan los siguientes criterios según los cuales se clasifican tradicionalmente los tiempos verbales en castellano:

1. Su estructura morfológica
2. Su anclaje temporal
3. Sus características aspectuales

No obstante, lo significativo es subrayar que mientras que los tiempos verbales en español tienen su propio paradigma flexivo, el aspecto no lo tiene, como lo hemos podido observar en la oposición de *cantó* / *cantaba*, en los que se consideran como aspectuales los morfemas flexivos de los tiempos pretérito indefinido y pretérito imperfecto.

Ahora bien, después de esta breve revisión del enfoque adoptado por la *NGLE* a la hora de abordar el tema de aspecto en español, a modo de resumen, recordemos que en función a la forma en que se manifiesta, el aspecto verbal se divide en tres grupos:

1. Aspecto léxico o modo de acción
2. Aspecto sintáctico o perifrástico
3. Aspecto morfológico o desinencial

Por suerte, los académicos (2009: §1.8n) no tienen reparos en reconocer que:

“(...) no todos los gramáticos del español – tradicionales y modernos – admiten esta tercera subcategoría del aspecto en nuestra lengua, que se aceptará, sin embargo, en esta obra. La relación entre tiempo y aspecto en el caso del imperfecto de indicativo (*cantaba*) es sumamente intrincada (...)”

Así las cosas, a continuación vamos a presentar el porqué de tal discordia entre los lingüistas del ámbito castellano, repasando el panorama histórico del estudio de *éidos*, que es precisamente el equivalente nocional del aspecto gramatical, y de la *Aktionsart*, el primer término acuñado para el análisis de modo de acción. Recordemos, pues, que, según Veyrat Rigat (1993: 9), el término de *aspecto* es uno de los de mayor confusión terminológica y conceptual, lo que se debe a su propio desarrollo histórico.

imperfectivo formas de *Pretérito Imperfecto* (*cantaba*) y de aspecto *perfectivo* formas de *Pretérito Indefinido* (*canté*). También García Fernández (1995, 1998, 1999a) analiza las oposiciones de los tiempos gramaticales en términos de la oposición aspectual.

En primer lugar, cabe avisar que seguimos aquí el concepto de que el término de *aspectualidad*, como categoría superior, engloba dos subcategorías principales: la categoría semántica, designada con los términos de *Aktionsart* o *modo de acción*, que está presente en todas las lenguas naturales, y la categoría gramatical, asociada con el término de *aspecto gramatical*, que es propia de un número reducido de lenguas, entre las cuales están, por ejemplo, las lenguas eslavas⁴. Tal enfoque tiene su explicación en la historia, por lo que pasamos ahora a presentar el origen de los estudios sobre el modo de acción y el aspecto gramatical para entender mejor sus bases etimológico-nocionales⁵.

El autor de la primera clasificación de los verbos según el tipo de acción que designan fue Aristóteles. Atendiendo a la inherente naturaleza semántica de los verbos los clasifica en los siguientes grupos: *kinésis* (traducido como *movimiento*, que requiere una meta, un punto final: *llegar, construir, aprender*) y *energeia* (traducido como *actualidad*, que no implica una meta ni punto final: *trabajar, ser feliz, ver*). Este último grupo, a su vez, se divide en *héksis* (traducido como *estados*, que viene ejemplificado por *ser feliz*) y *práksis* (traducido como *actividades*, que se ejemplifica con *ver, trabajar*).

Para distinguir estos grupos, Aristóteles utiliza la prueba de interrupción que consiste en comprobar si al interrumpir la acción denotada por el verbo, esta ha ocurrido o no. Así pues, si interrumpimos la acción denotada por los verbos de *energeia* como *trabajar*, resulta que la acción ha ocurrido: *dejó de trabajar* implica que *trabajó*. Por lo contrario, la interrupción del verbo de *kinésis* hace que la acción no haya ocurrido: *dejó de construir la casa* no quiere decir: *construyó la casa*. Además, los verbos de *kinésis* son incapaces de continuar su acción después de ser interrumpidos. Los verbos de *energeia*, en cambio, pueden hacerlo.

Ahora bien, De Miguel (1992: 18) constata que fue Aristóteles quien empezó los estudios del aspecto:

“Aristóteles (...) observó la existencia de diferentes clases de verbos en relación con el aspecto.”

En consecuencia, la lingüista propone denominar los dos grupos de verbos fijados por Aristóteles de la siguiente manera: ‘delimitados’ o ‘perfectivos’ (*kinésis*),

⁴ Véanse más, a este respecto, Pawlak (2006: 9 y ss).

⁵ Para presentar el repaso histórico de los estudios sobre la aspectualidad nos basamos en las investigaciones de Clements (1989: 2-33), Rodríguez Espiñeira (1990: 176-180), De Miguel (1999), Kortmann (1991), Veyrat Rigat (1993), Marco Martínez (1990: 29) y Rivas Zancarrón (2000), recogidas con más detalle en Pawlak (2006: 11 y ss).

frente a ‘no delimitados’ o ‘no perfectivos’ (*energeia*), considerándolos la base de la oposición aspectual en español.

Por nuestra parte, podemos plantearnos la siguiente pregunta: ¿si de verdad el estudio de Aristóteles es un estudio de aspecto? Pues, la respuesta es no. Al decir lo contrario, llegamos a la fuente de las posibles confusiones terminológicas y conceptuales que tienen lugar precisamente a la hora de hablar de *aspecto léxico* o de *aspecto* en general en las lenguas románicas, puesto que el origen del término *aspecto* no tiene nada que ver con el análisis de Aristóteles. Lo que él establece son los comienzos del análisis de la categoría semántica de la Aktionsart o del modo de acción, puesto que se refiere a la inherente semántica de los verbos⁶.

En cambio, el estudio de así llamado *éidos* se suele considerar como el primer estudio del *aspecto* propiamente dicho. Es Dionisio de Tracia, autor de la primera gramática completa de la lengua griega, quien introduce el término *éidos* (traducido, después, al ruso por *vid* y al francés por *aspect*) para reflejar el fenómeno que existe entre ciertos verbos griegos y sus derivaciones, como *árdo*, que puede significar tanto *regar continuamente* (en polaco: *nawadniać*) como *regar una vez* (*nawodnić*), dependiendo del contexto; ‘regar una vez’ y *ardéuo* que, por lo contrario, denota solamente la acción acabada: *regar una vez* (*nawodnić*).

Ante todo, cabe subrayar que las susodichas formas griegas no son infinitivos, como sugieren sus traducciones al español y al polaco, sino que representan las primeras personas singulares del tiempo presente de la voz activa, puesto que así aparecen en las entradas de los diccionarios. El quid de la cuestión radica en que estas dos formas, *árdo* y *ardéuo*, tienen el mismo infinitivo que es *ardein* (*Infinitivus Presentis Activi*) y son sus derivaciones que se diferencian sólo por su aspecto verbal, puesto que poseen el mismo tiempo (Presente), la misma voz (activa) y la misma persona gramatical.

Cabe poner hincapié, por tanto, en que precisamente este estudio de *éidos*, característico del verbo griego, origina el estudio del aspecto verbal y sirve de patrón para el análisis de los verbos de las lenguas eslavas⁷, donde es posible un

⁶ Clements (1989: 12) confirma que en esta corriente se estudia la Aktionsart y no el aspecto gramatical: “(...) these studies concentrate on verb classes, i.e. Aktionsarten, and do not deal with aspect, whereas aspect is the main point of concentration in the philologico – linguistic tradition”.

⁷ Recalquemos, pues, que en polaco la oposición aspectual se aplica al nivel de infinitivo de los predicados que, en la mayoría de los casos, tienen dos diferentes formas morfológicas y semánticas. Esta característica está ausente, por ejemplo, en el sistema verbal de las lenguas románicas. Bogacki (2002: 8) así ejemplifica la oposición aspectual *imperfectivo* / *perfectivo* de los predicados polacos en comparación con los predicados ingleses: “(...) il existe deux séries de formes (perfective et imperfective) (...): *śpiewać* / *zaśpiewać* (*piosenkę*) – *to sing* (a song), *myć* / *umyc* – *to wash*, *dać* / *dawać* – *to give*, *kupić* / *kupować* – *to buy*, etc.”.

estudio paralelo sobre las diferencias aspectuales a nivel de infinitivo, sin que participen en ello las influencias de los tiempos, de la voz o de los complementos. En las lenguas románicas o en inglés, en cambio, se acude a los complementos sintácticos para expresar una lectura aproximadamente equivalente a la de los infinitivos eslavos, pero no sinónimica.

A la vista de lo presentado, cabe también subrayar que el modo de acción o la Aktionsart, que en polaco equivale a *rodzaj czynności*, está presente en todas las lenguas del mundo e indica la estructura interna de las situaciones. De ahí que la definición del *aspecto* de la RAE y la ASALE (2009: § 1.8n), que volvemos a mencionar abajo, según nuestras consideraciones, se aplica a la categoría semántica del modo de acción y no tiene nada que ver con el aspecto entendido como la herencia gramatical del griego:

“Se llama ASPECTO la categoría que indica la estructura interna de las situaciones. El aspecto informa de la manera en que se manifiestan o se desarrollan los acontecimientos, y también del modo en que surgen, culminan, cesan o se repiten.”

Por consiguiente, sería recomendable aplicar el término *aspecto* solamente a las lenguas que dispongan de esta categoría gramatical que parte del nivel del infinitivo en el que se establece la oposición *perfectivo / imperfectivo*. De hecho, el criterio de distinción de las parejas aspectuales de *imperfectivo / perfectivo*, como en polaco *nawodnić* (regar una vez) y *nawadniać* (regar continuamente), es el contenido de [\pm conclusión procesal]. Este criterio, propuesto por Nowikow⁸ (2002: 180):

“(…) se expresa morfológicamente ya a nivel de infinitivo, p. ej., *jeść pomidory* (‘comer tomates’) a diferencia de *zjeść pomidory* (‘comer todos los tomates’, es decir, concluir la acción en términos reales), sin que las características semánticas del complemento tengan el papel decisivo para el significado de todo el sintagma verbal (frente a lo que ocurre en español)”.

En cambio, la oposición española de *cantó / cantaba* la consideramos de carácter principalmente temporal, debido a que (Nowikow, 2002: 177):

“(…) la diferencia entre *cantó* y *cantaba* consiste en que el primero marca anterioridad con respecto al llamado origen (...), mientras que el segundo

⁸ Sobre el contenido [\pm conclusión procesal] véanse también Nowikow (2004: 409-410).

expresa simultaneidad a una referencia temporal anterior al origen.”

Ahora bien, estas relaciones temporales de simultaneidad, anterioridad y posterioridad pueden coincidir en su interpretación con la oposición aspectual eslava, pero no hay ningún fundamento para proclamar la existencia de la categoría gramatical del aspecto en español. Rojo y Veiga (1999: 2921-22) tajantemente constatan que :

“(...) no existe una base suficientemente sólida para individualizar esta categoría gramatical respecto de la categoría temporal en el núcleo del sistema verbal español (...).”

Es más, al hablar de *aspecto* en el sistema verbal castellano se crean confusiones terminológico-nocionales, sobre todo a la hora del análisis contrastivo de las lenguas románicas y eslavas. Lo confirman las siguientes reflexiones de Nowikow (2002: 178):

“En nuestra opinión, a pesar de ciertas coincidencias, el español y el polaco operan a partir de dos bases semántico-gramaticales distintas. En el primero, la oposición entre los dos tiempos se conforma sobre el rasgo de [±limitación] matizado temporalmente. En cambio, en el segundo, la distinción entre dos subcategorías del aspecto se lleva a cabo a través de la propiedad de [±conclusión] cuyo carácter es procesal, es decir, relativo, en primer lugar, a cómo se desarrolla la acción referida. Si no se toma en consideración esta diferencia, la utilización de etiquetas tales como ‘acción perfectiva’ o ‘imperfectiva’ con relación a los dos idiomas objeto de este estudio no provoca más que confusión: al referirse a dos cosas distintas se piensa que se trata de lo mismo.”

Por lo concerniente a las perífrasis verbales, nos inclinamos por el punto de vista de Clements (1989: nota 5)⁹ y no por el de la *NGLE* anteriormente mencionado, debido a que las perífrasis verbales no presentan características morfológicas propias del aspecto sino del modo de acción.

Esperamos que este brevísimo repaso histórico que hemos presentado haya echado luz sobre el hecho de que la misma terminología sirva erróneamente

⁹ Citamos el texto original de Clements (1989: nota 5): “Thus, Coseriu’s exhaustive account of aspectual differences of the periphrastic verb formations is, in reality, not a classification of different aspects but rather of different Aktionsarten’s”.

de expresar los diferentes conceptos gramaticales en las lenguas románicas y eslavas.

Siguiendo los estudios de Nowikow (2003: 62-63; 2005a: 78), conviene destacar que el español, igual que todas las lenguas románicas, tipológicamente, pertenece a las lenguas del tipo ‘tiempo + artículo’, debido a la presencia de la categoría gramatical de artículo y de un complejo sistema temporal; mientras que las lenguas eslavas, tales como polaco o ruso, pertenecen a las lenguas del tipo ‘aspecto + caso’, puesto que poseen la categoría gramatical de caso y de aspecto, que se manifiesta morfológicamente ya a nivel de infinitivo, como en *robić – zrobić*, que son dos infinitivos traducidos al español mediante uno solo, o sea, *hacer*. En cambio, las lenguas eslavas no poseen en su sistema gramatical el artículo y disponen de pocos tiempos verbales.

Así pues, aunque la RAE y la ASALE (2009: §23.2v) se decantan por considerar que el concepto de *aspecto* se aplica en español a distintas formas gramaticales tales como la raíz verbal, una perífrasis verbal, una desinencia, un tiempo compuesto, etc., dando como ejemplo el concepto aspectual de ‘progresión’ o de ‘evento en curso’, que se manifiesta en el significado del verbo *aumentar*, en la perífrasis «ir + gerundio», en la desinencia *-aba* del imperfecto y en el adverbio *progresivamente*, entre otras manifestaciones, no hacen caso al hecho de que el sistema aspectual que distinguen en español no tenga nada que ver con el aspecto propiamente dicho, originado en el estudio de *éidos*.

Conviene concluir, por tanto, el presente trabajo con las siguientes observaciones de Nowikow (2005b: 134-135), que distinguen claramente estos dos estudios y las lenguas en las que se dan:

“(…) hay lenguas tales como el español que transmiten los contenidos de tipo modoaccional (relacionados éstos con los conceptos de ‘telicidad’, ‘resultatividad’, ‘semelfactividad’, etc.) mediante la combinación de varios factores entre los que destacan las propiedades semánticas del verbo y las de otros elementos del sintagma verbal (argumentos, cuantificadores, etc.). Por otro lado, hay idiomas como el polaco en cuyo caso predominan contenidos propiamente aspectuales (imperfectividad y perfectividad, plasmadas las dos a través de ‘±conclusión procesal’ o ‘realización completa’”).

Bibliografía

- Bogacki K. (2002). Le traitement de l’aspect dans les traducteurs automatiques de Systran. [En:] A. Kacprzak (ed.), *Points communs: linguistique, traductologie, glottodidactique*. Łódź: Wydawnictwo Biblioteka, 7-15 pp.

- Clements J. A. (1989). *Verb classification and verb class change in Spanish*. Michigan: University of Washington, PH.D. 1985, 157 pp.
- De Miguel E. (1992). *El aspecto en la sintaxis del español: perfectividad e impersonalidad*. Madrid, Ediciones de la Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, Cantoblanco, 264 pp.
- (1999). El aspecto léxico. [En:] *I. Bosque, V. Demonte* (eds.) *Gramática Descriptiva de la Lengua Española*. Madrid, Espasa-Calpe, 2977-3060 pp.
- Fernández Pérez M. (1993). Sobre la distinción Aspecto vs. Aktionsart. [En:] *Estudios de Lingüística de la Universidad de Alicante*, 9, 223-251 pp.
- García Fernández L. (1998). *El aspecto gramatical en la conjugación*. Madrid: Arco / Libros S. L., 70 pp.
- Kortmann B. (1991). The Triad “Tense – Aspect – Aktionsart”. Problems and possible solutions. [En:] *Belgian Journal of Linguistics*, 6, 9-30 pp.
- Marco Martínez C. (1990). La categoría de aspecto verbal y su manifestación en diferentes lenguas. Sistema aspectual del chino mandarín. [En:] *Lingüística Española Actual*, XII, 1, 29-43 pp.
- Nowikow W. (2002). Acerca de la distinción entre los conceptos de [±limitación temporal] y [±conclusión procesal]. [En:] *Romanica Cracoviensia*, 2, 177-186 pp.
- (2003). Acerca de las relaciones entre el aspecto y el modo accional desde una perspectiva tipológico-comparada. [En:] *Language Design*, 5, 51-66 pp.
- (2004). Sobre el *status* gramatical del aspecto y sus relaciones con las propiedades temporales y accionales. [En:] *Studia Romanica Posnaniensia*, XXXI, 407-415 pp.
- (2005a). Sobre las diferencias entre el sistema verbal del español y el del polaco: característica temporal. [En:] *Paralelo*, 50, n. 2, 78-83 pp.
- (2005b). Los exponentes de los contenidos aspectuales y modoaccionales como elementos del sintagma verbal. [En:] *Acta Universitatis Wratislaviensis* No 2834. Wrocław, *Estudios Hispánicos*, XIII, 129-136 pp.
- Pawlak A. (2006). La aspectualidad en el español moderno: análisis modoaccional de los predicados de escritura, dibujo y pintura. Tesis doctoral inédita. Universidad de Łódź, 225 pp.
- Real Academia Española y la Asociación de Academias de la Lengua Española (2009). *Nueva gramática de la lengua española. Morfología Sintaxis I*. Madrid: Espasa Libros, 1960 pp.
- Rivas Zancarrón M. (2000). La *Aktionsart*. Algunos intentos de adecuación al sistema verbal español. [En:] *A. Veiga, V. M. Longa, J. Anderson* (eds.) *El verbo entre el léxico y la gramática*. Lugo, Colección Grammaton, Editorial Tris Tram, S.L., 167-175 pp.
- Rojó G. y A. Veiga (1999). El tiempo verbal. Los tiempos simples. [En:] *I. Bosque, V. Demonte* (eds.) *Gramática descriptiva de la lengua española*. Madrid, Espasa Calpe, 2867-2934 pp.
- Rodríguez Espondeira M. J. (1990). Clases de ‘Aktionsart’ y predicaciones habituales en español. [En:] *Verba* 17, 171-210 pp.

Veyrat Rigat M. (1993). *Aspecto, Perífrasis y Auxiliación: un enfoque perceptivo*. Valencia: LynX, Annexa 6, Universitat de València, 220 pp.

Las TIC en la enseñanza del Léxico a estudiantes extranjeros

TIK w nauczaniu słownictwa studentów zagranicznych

Summary

In this article we will focus on the theoretical aspects of teaching and learning vocabulary in class of Spanish as a foreign language using "Technologies of Information and Communication" (TIC). To do this, we will address some issues of vocabulary as a subject of study in learning Spanish and define the Information Society, TIC and New Technologies and their relationship with teaching and learning vocabulary.

Keywords: vocabulary, TIC, spanish, e-learning, internet technologies

Según Wilkins, (1972:111) *“Sin gramática la comunicación es difícil, sin léxico, es imposible”*.

Sin desmerecer a las otras áreas del lenguaje, tras esta frase, se esconde una realidad incuestionable. Para comunicarse en una lengua, tanto propia como adquirida, se necesitan palabras. Esas palabras, por si solas, pueden permitir la comunicación, aunque sea a un nivel primitivo. Sin palabras, la comunicación se hace inexistente. Sin embargo, el uso de esas palabras también debe tener una cierta lógica. La forma de aprender esas palabras y la forma de utilizarlas puede variar enormemente según el contexto educativo.

También vivimos en el pleno siglo veintiuno, en el cual muchos fenómenos comunicativos no podemos entenderlos si no es a través de Internet y todo lo relacionado con la Red de Redes.

En este artículo daremos una visión general del tema que tratamos, por lo tanto, nos centraremos en los aspectos teóricos de la enseñanza y el aprendizaje del léxico en la clase de español como lengua extranjera y la utilización de las denominadas *“Tecnologías de la información y la comunicación”* (TIC). Para ello, abordaremos algunos aspectos de la Léxica como materia de estudio en el aprendizaje del español y definiremos lo que se ha dado en llamar Sociedad de la Información, TIC y Nuevas Tecnologías (NN.TT).

Objetivos de la enseñanza del léxico

El objetivo principal sería dotar al alumno de una competencia léxica suficiente que le permita desenvolverse en la lengua que está aprendiendo. Desde una perspectiva didáctica, el Consejo de Europa, en el Marco de Referencia Europeo, formula la siguiente definición de competencia léxica: *“el conocimiento del vocabulario de una lengua y la capacidad para utilizarlo”* (2002:108). Por lo que es necesario desglosar la competencia léxica en comprensión y producción, que a su vez, engloba otro complejo fenómeno de la competencia léxica: el almacenamiento de los ítems léxicos.

Numerosos estudios psicolingüísticos han concluido que los humanos poseemos un diccionario mental que Aitchison (1997) llama “lexicón mental”. En estudios recientes sobre la competencia léxica, en especial los de Lucas Puerta (2007: 11), se afirma que: *“... las palabras se almacenan en la memoria de manera redundante, es decir, no sólo como elementos aislados, sino también como frases o segmentos incluso más largos, más o menos lexicalizados, por lo que su recuperación para el uso podría seguir esas dos vías.”*

Por lo tanto, la competencia léxica no es exclusivamente el manejo de un grupo de vocablos aislados, sino que también existen unidades formadas por varias palabras que se agrupan formando una unidad léxica entre las que podemos destacar las unidades fraseológicas o las colocaciones léxicas.

El conocimiento del verdadero caudal léxico que poseen los estudiantes, las dificultades que presentan respecto del uso del vocabulario, el crecimiento léxico de cada uno y del grupo en general son requisitos indispensables para una correcta planificación de la enseñanza y para el establecimiento de propuestas didácticas que permitan un tratamiento más efectivo de este aspecto de la lengua. Esto significa que es necesario conocer el vocabulario que traen consigo los estudiantes al iniciar un nuevo período además de comprobar y medir la adquisición léxica a medida que van tratándose las diferentes unidades del vocabulario que aparecen en el currículo. Tanto para la nueva impronta léxica, como para la valoración de lo ya adquirido, es donde las TIC tienen un papel fundamental.

Para hablar, escribir, leer o escuchar, el estudiante de español tiene que llevar a cabo una serie de secuencias con destreza. Debe ser capaz de planear y organizar un mensaje y de formular un enunciado lingüístico hablando o escribiendo. Como oyente o lector debe saber percibir el enunciado, identificar el mensaje lingüístico, comprender el mensaje e interpretarlo según la situación comunicativa en la que se encuentre.

Para conseguir realizar con éxito todas estas actividades de comunicación, el alumno necesita conocer las palabras en la lengua en la que se expresa.

Justamente, lo que más suele faltar en una lengua extranjera es la palabra precisa en el momento adecuado. Si no sabemos una palabra, si no la encontramos cuando la necesitamos o si la tenemos “en la punta de la lengua”, no conseguiremos ser eficaces en la comunicación.

Conocer una palabra o una unidad léxica formada por más de una palabra es un proceso gradual y complejo en el que se aprende no solo la forma y el significado sino también una complicada red de relaciones formales y semánticas entre ese ítem y otras palabras. El conocimiento de una palabra es una representación mental de gran complejidad, que integra diferentes aspectos y componentes cognitivos, algunos más inconscientes y automáticos y otros más conscientes, reflexivos y basados en la propia experiencia.

Cuando conocemos una palabra, sabemos distintos aspectos asociados a ella además de su forma y significado. Podemos simplificar este conocimiento atendiendo a la forma, al significado y al uso de palabra tanto en la lengua oral como en la escrita, así como respecto al emisor como al intérprete. ¿Cómo suena, se escribe o se pronuncia una palabra? ¿Qué partes se reconocen en ella y qué significados señala la forma de esa palabra? ¿Qué otra palabra puede usarse con el mismo significado? ¿Qué otras palabras aparecen con ella, cómo se relacionan, que otras palabras se pueden usar con ella? ¿Dónde, cuándo, con qué frecuencia se puede encontrar o usar esa palabra?

El conocimiento léxico se halla relacionado con otros componentes de la mente relacionados entre sí en los procesos de reconocimiento de la palabra y de su recuperación de la memoria cuando la necesitamos en un acto comunicativo. A diferencia de la gramática de una lengua, el conocimiento del léxico está relacionado con el conocimiento de los hechos y del mundo, por ejemplo, lugares o instituciones, personas y objetos, características geográficas o sociales, vida, costumbres, tradiciones... un amplio abanico que nos pone al alcance de la mano la Sociedad de la Información que, a través de las TIC, nos acerca a casa el mundo por lejano que esté.

Relacionado directamente con el aprendizaje léxico, hay otro componente importante que tiene que ver con las destrezas y las habilidades comunicativas del estudiante, con sus estrategias para aprender, con sus actitudes, motivaciones, estilos cognitivos o personalidad. Nuevamente, la cercanía de las TIC a los estudiantes puede ser un vehículo perfecto de aprendizaje.

¿Qué son las TIC?

La humanidad ha pasado por diferentes revoluciones tecnológicas. La actual adopta como elemento básico de desarrollo las tecnologías de la información.

Lo que, hasta hace unos años, se llamaban tecnologías audiovisuales (el vídeo, la radio, la televisión, el retroproyector, el cine...) con la incorporación de Internet y del nuevo abanico de posibilidades que éste abre, se rebautizaron como “TIC”, Tecnologías de la Información y la Comunicación. En la actualidad, las tecnologías tienen gran presencia y significación: en lo doméstico, en lo cultural y en lo político; uniéndose las tradicionales con las denominadas nuevas.

Para Thorne y Thorne (2000, 31), el cambio radical se produjo en EE.UU., cuando en 1956 el número de funcionarios y empleados superaron al de trabajadores, es decir, se pasó de una economía industrial basada en la mano de obra a otra basada en el conocimiento o el trabajo de la inteligencia.

Su importancia es tal que la propia ONU ha organizado dos Cumbres Mundiales de la Sociedad de la información, en Ginebra (2003) y en Túnez (2005), para analizar su problemática. En general todo gira alrededor de un modelo de sociedad donde la información es la base de su desarrollo y la información está gestionada y movilizada a través de medios telemáticos.

Aplicaciones didácticas de las TIC

Posiblemente uno de los mitos más utilizados sobre la aplicación de las TIC a la formación, consiste en afirmar que con su incorporación se puede alcanzar un *“Modelo democrático de educación, que facilita el acceso a todas las personas. Educación/formación para todos”*. Las herramientas de comunicación sincrónica y asincrónica que incorporan las TIC permiten, por una parte, la comunicación a un colectivo amplio de personas independientemente de su situación geográfica o temporal, y por otra, poner a disposición de todas ellas la información sin limitaciones de lugar de residencia o disponibilidad espacial.

Bajo estos supuestos, por ejemplo, se permitiría llevar una educación de calidad, es decir, una educación apoyada en una cantidad y calidad de información, a los lugares más alejados, salvando de esta forma los problemas existentes por la falta de recursos por ejemplo en las zonas rurales. Al mismo tiempo, también se podría ofrecer a los estudiantes una formación de calidad al no tener que estar supeditados sus conocimientos a los del profesor del aula; de esta forma se ofrece la posibilidad de contar con “ciberprofesores”, expertos en contenidos, que ubicarían su experiencia en la red para que pudieran estar a disposición de cualquier persona interesada. Siempre que uno lógicamente tenga la posibilidad de estar conectado a Internet. La realidad es que no todo el mundo está conectado y, además, no todo el mundo tendrá posibilidades de conectarse a medio plazo. Esto puede suponer que se esté propiciando una discriminación

de los alumnos, ya sea porque su situación económica o porque la zona donde vivan no les permita tener acceso a estas nuevas herramientas.

Tales diferencias pueden estar propiciando lo que Bautista (2001, 195-196) denomina como “hipótesis del distanciamiento” que plantea que *“cuando se incrementa la circulación de la información a través de los medios de comunicación de masas en un sistema social, los segmentos de población más instruidos o con un estatus socio-económico más alto tienden a seleccionar y a procesar dicha información de una manera más ágil y ordenada que aquellos menos instruidos o con un estatus económico más bajo. Por lo tanto el aumento de información, en vez de aproximar, contribuirá a incrementar el distanciamiento en el conocimiento y, consecuentemente, la aparición de brechas socioculturales.”*

La existencia de las TIC provocará que los profesores desempeñen nuevos cometidos que irán desde buscar información en la red para adaptarla a las necesidades generales de sus estudiantes a convertirse en productores de medios y materiales de enseñanza según las características de sus alumnos. Dicho en otros términos, pasar de modelos de enseñanza centrados en el profesor y los recursos a situaciones de enseñanza centrada en los alumnos.

Como hemos visto, el objetivo principal de la enseñanza de la léxica es dotar al alumno de una competencia léxica suficiente que le permita desenvolverse en la lengua que está aprendiendo, que denominaremos L2. Y podemos aprovechar la definición de competencia léxica del Consejo de Europa en el Marco de Referencia Europeo, *“el conocimiento del vocabulario de una lengua y la capacidad para utilizarlo”* (2002:108) por lo que la competencia léxica no es exclusivamente el manejo de un grupo de vocablos aislados sino que también existen unidades formadas por varias palabras que se agrupan formando una unidad léxica. A diferencia de la gramática de una lengua, el conocimiento del léxico está relacionado con el conocimiento de los hechos y del mundo como, por ejemplo, lugares o instituciones, personas y objetos, características geográficas o sociales, vida, costumbres, tradiciones.... un amplio abanico que las TIC nos ponen al alcance de la mano, nos acercan a casa el mundo por lejano que esté. Y esta cercanía de las TIC a los estudiantes puede ser un vehículo perfecto de aprendizaje. Lo que se llamaban tecnologías audiovisuales (el vídeo, la radio, la televisión, el retroproyector, el cine...), con la incorporación de Internet las encontramos íntimamente ligadas a él. Todo el mundo conoce YouTube, Facebook, Twitter y otros portales similares y redes sociales donde intercambiar elementos audiovisuales, información y, también, por qué no, amistad y comunicación interpersonal. Todo ello favorece el acercamiento sociocultural y, por ende, el enriquecimiento léxico.

Conclusiones

Nos hemos referido a la íntima relación de la sociedad actual del conocimiento con el desarrollo y la implementación de las TIC, lo que las hace un elemento ideal de aprendizaje y un vehículo de primera clase para la enseñanza por la cercanía y cotidianidad con la convivimos con ellas. Si bien hemos remarcado algunos tópicos y algunos aspectos negativos, el uso de las TIC se perfila como el elemento pedagógico de un presente y un futuro muy cercano. El léxico es una parte fundamental de los procesos de comunicación y son precisamente las tecnologías que transmiten y favorecen esa comunicación los instrumentos más idóneos de enseñanza y aprendizaje.

Bibliografía

- Aitchison, J. (1997). *Words in the mind: An introduction to the mental lexicon*. Oxford, Blackwell.
- Bautista, A. (2001). *Desigualdades sociales, nuevas tecnologías y política educativa*, en AREA, M. (coord): *Educación en la sociedad de la información*, Bilbao, Desclée, 179-213.
- Cabero, J. (2001). *Tecnología educativa. Diseño y utilización de medios en la enseñanza*, Barcelona, Paidós.
- Cabero, J. y Gisbert, M. (2005). *La formación en Internet. Guía para el diseño de materiales didácticos*, Sevilla, Eduforma/Trillas.
- Consejo de Europa. (2002). *Marco común europeo de referencia para las lenguas*. Consulta en línea <http://cvc.cervantes.es/obref/marco> 25/07/08
- Jiménez Catalán, R.M. (2002). *El concepto de competencia léxica en los estudios de aprendizaje y enseñanza de segundas lenguas*, en Atlantis, 24 (2), 149-162.
- López Morales, H. (1987). *Enseñanza de la lengua materna. Lingüística para maestros de español*. Madrid: Editorial Playor.
- Lucas Puerta, J. (2007). *La competencia léxica en el discurso escrito en E/LE de aprendices francófonos de ascendencia hispanófono*, en Biblioteca Virtual - RedELE, 7 <http://www.mepsyd.es/redele/biblioteca2007/JulianLucas.shtml> 25/07/08
- Tezanos, J.F. (2001). *La sociedad dividida. Estructuras de clases y desigualdades en la sociedad tecnológicas*, Madrid, Biblioteca Nueva
- Thorne, A. y Thorne, C. (2000). *Building bridges on the Web: Using the Internet for cultural studies*, en A Special Interest in Computers: Learning and Teaching with Information and Communication Technologies, Brett, P. y Motteram, G. (Eds.), Whitsable, Kent, iATEFL, 59-73
- Wilkins, D. (1972). *Linguistics and Language Teaching*, Londres, Edward Arnold.